

Legislative
Assembly
of Ontario



Assemblée
législative
de l'Ontario

43RD PARLIAMENT, 1ST SESSION 43E LÉGISLATURE, 1RE SESSION

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

PROCÈS-VERBAUX

No. 120

N° 120

Tuesday
December 5, 2023

Mardi
5 décembre 2023

Hon. Ted Arnott
Speaker

L'hon. Ted Arnott
le président

9:00 A.M.

Prayers

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Second Reading of **Bill 157**, An Act to amend various Acts in relation to the courts and other justice matters.

Debate resumed and after some time, the debate adjourned at 10:12 a.m.

10:15 A.M.

The Speaker informed the House,

That pursuant to Standing Order 9(g), the Clerk received written notice from the Government House Leader indicating that a temporary change in the weekly meeting schedule of the House is required, and therefore, the Afternoon Routine on Wednesday, December 6, 2023 shall commence at 1:00 p.m. (Sessional Paper No. 444).

DEFERRED VOTES

Amendment to the amendment to the motion for allocation of time on Bill 136, An Act to amend the Greenbelt Act, 2005 and certain other Acts, to enact the Duffins Rouge Agricultural Preserve Act, 2023, to repeal an Act and to revoke various regulations, Bill 150, An Act to enact the Official Plan Adjustments Act, 2023 and to amend the Planning Act with respect to remedies, and Bill 154, An Act to enact the Recovery Through Growth Act (City of Toronto), 2023 and the Rebuilding Ontario Place Act, 2023.

John Vanthof moved,

That the amendment be amended by replacing the words "five minutes" with "one hour".

Lost on the following division:

Ayes/pour (0)

Nays/contre (100)

Anand	Armstrong	Barnes	Bell
Bethlenfalvy	Blais	Bouma	Bourgouin
Bowman	Brady	Bresee	Calandra
Cho (Scarborough North)	Cho (Willowdale)	Clark	Coe
Collard	Crawford	Cuzzetto	Dixon
Dowie	Downey	Dunlop	Fedeli

9 H

Prières

ORDRES DU JOUR

Deuxième lecture du **projet de loi 157**, Loi modifiant diverses lois en ce qui concerne les tribunaux et d'autres questions relatives à la justice.

Le débat a repris et après quelque temps, à 10 h 12, le débat était ajourné.

10 H 15

Le Président a informé l'Assemblée,

Que, conformément à l'article 9 g) du Règlement, le greffier a reçu un avis écrit du leader parlementaire du gouvernement indiquant qu'une modification temporaire doit être apportée à l'horaire hebdomadaire des séances de l'Assemblée et, par conséquent, les affaires de l'après-midi du mercredi 6 décembre 2023 commenceront à 13 h. (Document parlementaire n° 444).

VOTES DIFFÉRÉS

John Vanthof a proposé,

Rejeté par le vote suivant :

Fife	Flack	Ford (Etobicoke North)	Ford (York South— Weston)
Fraser	French	Gallagher Murphy	Gates
Gélinas	Ghamari	Gill	Glover
Grewal	Hardeman	Harden	Harris
Hazell	Hogarth	Holland	Hsu
Jones (Chatham-Kent— Leamington)	Jones (Dufferin— Caledon)	Jordan	Kanapathi
Karpoche	Ke	Kernaghan	Kerzner
Leardi	Lecce	Lumsden	MacLeod
Mamakwa	Mantha	McCarthy	McCrimmon
McGregor	McMahon	Mulroney	Oosterhoff
Pang	Parsa	Pasma	Pierre
Quinn	Rae	Rakocevic	Rickford
Romano	Sabawy	Sandhu	Sarkaria
Sarrazin	Sattler	Saunderson	Schreiner
Scott	Shamji	Shaw	Skelly
Smith (Parry Sound— Muskoka)	Smith (Peterborough— Kawartha)	Smith (Scarborough Centre)	Smith (Thornhill)
Stevens	Stiles	Tangri	Taylor
Thompson	Tibollo	Vanthof	Vaugeois
Wai	Williams	Wong-Tam	Yakabuski

The question was then put on the amendment.

La question sur l'amendement a ensuite été mise aux voix.

Amendment to the motion for allocation of time on Bill 136, An Act to amend the Greenbelt Act, 2005 and certain other Acts, to enact the Duffins Rouge Agricultural Preserve Act, 2023, to repeal an Act and to revoke various regulations, Bill 150, An Act to enact the Official Plan Adjustments Act, 2023 and to amend the Planning Act with respect to remedies, and Bill 154, An Act to enact the Recovery Through Growth Act (City of Toronto), 2023 and the Rebuilding Ontario Place Act, 2023.

Hon. Todd J. McCarthy moved,

L'hon. Todd J. McCarthy a proposé,

That the motion be amended by adding, "and that, in the case of any division relating to any proceedings on the Bills, the division bells shall be limited to five minutes" at the end of the motion.

Carried on the following division:

Adopté par le vote suivant :

Ayes/pour (65)

Anand	Barnes	Bethlenfalvy	Bouma
Bresee	Calandra	Cho (Scarborough North)	Cho (Willowdale)
Clark	Coe	Crawford	Cuzzetto
Dixon	Dowie	Downey	Dunlop

Fedeli	Flack	Ford (Etobicoke North)	Ford (York South— Weston)
Gallagher Murphy	Ghamari	Gill	Grewal
Hardeman	Harris	Hogarth	Holland
Jones (Chatham-Kent— Leamington)	Jordan	Kanapathi	Ke
Kerzner	Leardi	Lecce	Lumsden
MacLeod	McCarthy	McGregor	Mulroney
Oosterhoff	Pang	Parsa	Pierre
Quinn	Rae	Rickford	Romano
Sabawy	Sandhu	Sarkaria	Sarrazin
Saunderson	Scott	Skelly	Smith (Parry Sound— Muskoka)
Smith (Peterborough— Kawartha)	Smith (Scarborough Centre)	Smith (Thornhill)	Tangri
Thompson	Tibollo	Wai	Williams
Yakabuski			

Nays/contre (34)

Armstrong	Bell	Blais	Bourgouin
Bowman	Brady	Collard	Fife
Fraser	French	Gates	Gélinas
Glover	Harden	Hazell	Hsu
Karpoche	Kernaghan	Mamakwa	Mantha
McCrimmon	McMahon	Pasma	Rakocevic
Sattler	Schreiner	Shamji	Shaw
Stevens	Stiles	Taylor	Vanthof
Vaugeois	Wong-Tam		

The question was then put on the motion, as amended.

La question sur la motion, telle que modifiée, a ensuite été mise aux voix.

Hon. Todd J. McCarthy moved,

L'hon. Todd J. McCarthy a proposé,

That, pursuant to Standing Order 50 and notwithstanding any other Standing Order or special Order of the House relating to **Bill 136**, An Act to amend the Greenbelt Act, 2005 and certain other Acts, to enact the Duffins Rouge Agricultural Preserve Act, 2023, to repeal an Act and to revoke various regulations, **Bill 150**, An Act to enact the Official Plan Adjustments Act, 2023 and to amend the Planning Act with respect to remedies, and **Bill 154**, An Act to enact the Recovery Through Growth Act (City of Toronto), 2023 and the Rebuilding Ontario Place Act, 2023;

That when Bill 136 and Bill 150 are called for Third Reading, one hour of debate shall be allotted to the Third Reading stages of each Bill, with 30 minutes apportioned to the members of His Majesty's Government and 30 minutes to the members of His Majesty's Loyal Opposition; and at the end of this time, the Speaker shall interrupt the proceedings and shall put every question necessary to dispose of this stage of each Bill, without further debate or amendment; and

That when Bill 154 is next called as a Government Order, the Speaker shall immediately put every question necessary to dispose of the Second Reading stage of the Bill without further debate or amendment; and

That Bill 154 shall be Ordered for Third Reading, which Order shall be immediately called; and

That when the Order for Third Reading is called the Speaker shall put every question necessary to dispose of the Third Reading stage of Bill 154 without further debate or amendment; and

That no deferral be permitted on any votes on Bill 136, Bill 150, or Bill 154; and

That, in the case of any division relating to any proceedings on the Bills, the division bells shall be limited to five minutes.

Carried on the following division:

Adoptée par le vote suivant :

Ayes/pour (65)

Anand	Barnes	Bethlenfalvy	Bouma
Bresee	Calandra	Cho (Scarborough North)	Cho (Willowdale)
Clark	Coe	Crawford	Cuzzetto
Dixon	Dowie	Downey	Dunlop
Fedeli	Flack	Ford (Etobicoke North)	Ford (York South— Weston)
Gallagher Murphy	Ghamari	Gill	Grewal
Hardeman	Harris	Hogarth	Holland
Jones (Chatham-Kent— Leamington)	Jordan	Kanapathi	Ke
Kerzner	Learidi	Lecce	Lumsden
MacLeod	McCarthy	McGregor	Mulroney
Oosterhoff	Pang	Parsa	Pierre
Quinn	Rae	Rickford	Romano
Sabawy	Sandhu	Sarkaria	Sarrazin
Saunderson	Scott	Skelly	Smith (Parry Sound— Muskoka)
Smith (Peterborough— Kawartha)	Smith (Scarborough Centre)	Smith (Thornhill)	Tangri
Thompson Yakabuski	Tibollo	Wai	Williams

Nays/contre (34)

Armstrong	Bell	Blais	Bourgouin
Bowman	Brady	Collard	Fife
Fraser	French	Gates	Gélinas
Glover	Harden	Hazell	Hsu
Karpoche	Kernaghan	Mamakwa	Mantha
McCrimmon	McMahon	Pasma	Rakocevic

Sattler	Schreiner	Shamji	Shaw
Stevens	Stiles	Taylor	Vanthof
Vaugeois	Wong-Tam		

Ordered, That, pursuant to Standing Order 50 and notwithstanding any other Standing Order or special Order of the House relating to **Bill 136**, An Act to amend the Greenbelt Act, 2005 and certain other Acts, to enact the Duffins Rouge Agricultural Preserve Act, 2023, to repeal an Act and to revoke various regulations, **Bill 150**, An Act to enact the Official Plan Adjustments Act, 2023 and to amend the Planning Act with respect to remedies, and **Bill 154**, An Act to enact the Recovery Through Growth Act (City of Toronto), 2023 and the Rebuilding Ontario Place Act, 2023;

That when Bill 136 and Bill 150 are called for Third Reading, one hour of debate shall be allotted to the Third Reading stages of each Bill, with 30 minutes apportioned to the members of His Majesty's Government and 30 minutes to the members of His Majesty's Loyal Opposition; and at the end of this time, the Speaker shall interrupt the proceedings and shall put every question necessary to dispose of this stage of each Bill, without further debate or amendment; and

That when Bill 154 is next called as a Government Order, the Speaker shall immediately put every question necessary to dispose of the Second Reading stage of the Bill without further debate or amendment; and

That Bill 154 shall be Ordered for Third Reading, which Order shall be immediately called; and

That when the Order for Third Reading is called the Speaker shall put every question necessary to dispose of the Third Reading stage of Bill 154 without further debate or amendment; and

That no deferral be permitted on any votes on Bill 136, Bill 150, or Bill 154; and

That, in the case of any division relating to any proceedings on the Bills, the division bells shall be limited to five minutes.

The House recessed at 11:57 a.m.

À 11 h 57, l'Assemblée a suspendu la séance.

3:00 P.M.

15 H

PETITIONS

PÉTITIONS

No./N°	Petition title/Titre de la pétition	Presented by/Présentée par
P-2	Social assistance rates	France Gélinas
P-6	Multiple sclerosis specialized clinic	France Gélinas
P-8	Winter road maintenance	Guy Bourgouin
P-21	Health care privatization	France Gélinas
P-23	Organ donation	France Gélinas
P-31	Replacement workers	France Gélinas
P-39	Public service funding and withdrawal of Bill 124	France Gélinas
P-42	Northern Health Travel Grant	France Gélinas

P-78	Le système d'éducation francophone en Ontario	France Gélinas
P-88	Occupational Exposure Limit for Diesel emissions	France Gélinas

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Third Reading of **Bill 136**, An Act to amend the Greenbelt Act, 2005 and certain other Acts, to enact the Duffins Rouge Agricultural Preserve Act, 2023, to repeal an Act and to revoke various regulations.

Debate arose and after some time,

Pursuant to the Order of the House passed earlier today,

The question was then put.

Carried.

The Bill passed.

Second Reading of **Bill 154**, An Act to enact the Recovery Through Growth Act (City of Toronto), 2023 and the Rebuilding Ontario Place Act, 2023.

Pursuant to the Order of the House passed earlier today,

The question was then put.

Carried on the following division:

Ayes/pour (61)

Anand	Barnes	Bethlenfalvy	Bouma
Bresee	Byers	Calandra	Cho (Scarborough North)
Cho (Willowdale)	Clark	Coe	Crawford
Cuzzetto	Dowie	Downey	Dunlop
Fedeli	Flack	Ford (York South— Weston)	Gallagher Murphy
Ghamari	Gill	Grewal	Hardeman
Harris	Hogarth	Holland	Jones (Chatham-Kent— Leamington)
Jones (Dufferin— Caledon)	Jordan	Kerzner	Leardi
Lecce	Lumsden	MacLeod	McCarthy
McGregor	Mulroney	Oosterhoff	Pang
Parsa	Pierre	Quinn	Rae

ORDRES DU JOUR

Troisième lecture du **projet de loi 136**, Loi modifiant la Loi de 2005 sur la ceinture de verdure et d'autres lois, édictant la Loi de 2023 sur la Réserve agricole de Duffins-Rouge et abrogeant une loi et divers règlements.

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps,

Conformément à l'ordre de l'Assemblée adopté plus tôt aujourd'hui,

La question a ensuite été mise aux voix.

Adoptée.

Le projet de loi est adopté.

Deuxième lecture du **projet de loi 154**, Loi édictant la Loi de 2023 sur la relance portée par la croissance (cité de Toronto) et la Loi de 2023 sur la reconstruction de la Place de l'Ontario.

Conformément à l'ordre de l'Assemblée adopté plus tôt aujourd'hui,

La question a ensuite été mise aux voix.

Adoptée par le vote suivant :

Romano	Sabawy	Sandhu	Sarkaria
Sarrazin	Saunderson	Scott	Skelly
Smith (Peterborough— Kawartha)	Smith (Scarborough Centre)	Smith (Thornhill)	Tangri
Thompson	Tibollo	Wai	Williams
Yakabuski			

Nays/contre (24)

Armstrong	Bell	Blais	Bourgouin
Bowman	Fraser	French	Gates
Gélinas	Glover	Hsu	Karpoche
Kernaghan	Mamakwa	McCrimmon	McMahon
Pasma	Rakocevic	Sattler	Schreiner
Shamji	Shaw	Taylor	Vanthof

Pursuant to the Order of the House passed earlier today,

Ordered for Third Reading.

Third Reading of **Bill 154**, An Act to enact the Recovery Through Growth Act (City of Toronto), 2023 and the Rebuilding Ontario Place Act, 2023.

Pursuant to the Order of the House passed earlier today,

The question was then put.

Carried on the following division:

Conformément à l'ordre de l'Assemblée adopté plus tôt aujourd'hui,

Ordonné pour la troisième lecture.

Troisième lecture du **projet de loi 154**, Loi édictant la Loi de 2023 sur la relance portée par la croissance (cité de Toronto) et la Loi de 2023 sur la reconstruction de la Place de l'Ontario.

Conformément à l'ordre de l'Assemblée adopté plus tôt aujourd'hui,

La question a ensuite été mise aux voix.

Adoptée par le vote suivant :

Ayes/pour (63)

Anand	Barnes	Bethlenfalvy	Bouma
Bresee	Byers	Calandra	Cho (Scarborough North)
Cho (Willowdale)	Clark	Coe	Crawford
Cuzzetto	Dixon	Dowie	Downey
Dunlop	Fedeli	Flack	Ford (York South— Weston)
Gallagher Murphy	Ghamari	Gill	Grewal
Hardeman	Harris	Hogarth	Holland
Jones (Chatham-Kent— Leamington)	Jones (Dufferin— Caledon)	Jordan	Kerzner
Leardi	Lecce	Lumsden	MacLeod
McCarthy	McGregor	Mulroney	Oosterhoff
Pang	Parsa	Pierre	Quinn

Rae	Romano	Sabawy	Sandhu
Sarkaria	Sarrazin	Saunderson	Scott
Skelly	Smith (Parry Sound— Muskoka)	Smith (Peterborough— Kawartha)	Smith (Scarborough Centre)
Smith (Thornhill)	Tangri	Thompson	Tibollo
Wai	Williams	Yakabuski	

Nays/contre (28)

Andrew	Armstrong	Bell	Blais
Bourgouin	Bowman	Fife	Fraser
French	Gates	Gélinas	Glover
Harden	Hsu	Karpoche	Kernaghan
Mamakwa	McCrimmon	McMahon	Pasma
Rakocevic	Sattler	Schreiner	Shamji
Shaw	Stevens	Taylor	Vanthof

The Bill passed.

Third Reading of **Bill 150**, An Act to enact the Official Plan Adjustments Act, 2023 and to amend the Planning Act with respect to remedies.

Debate arose and after some time,

Pursuant to the Order of the House passed earlier today,

The question was then put.

Carried.

The Bill passed.

With unanimous consent,

Ordered, That notwithstanding Standing Order 9(a), the House agreed to commence Private Members' Public Business before 6:00 p.m. today.

PRIVATE MEMBERS' PUBLIC BUSINESS

No business was designated for Ballot item No. 79.

ADJOURNMENT DEBATE

At 5:40 p.m., the following matter was considered in an adjournment debate.

Le projet de loi est adopté.

Troisième lecture du **projet de loi 150**, Loi édictant la Loi de 2023 sur les modifications apportées aux plans officiels et modifiant la Loi sur l'aménagement du territoire en ce qui concerne les recours.

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps,

Conformément à l'ordre de l'Assemblée adopté plus tôt aujourd'hui,

La question a ensuite été mise aux voix.

Adoptée.

Le projet de loi est adopté.

Avec le consentement unanime,

Ordonné, que nonobstant l'article 9 a) du Règlement, l'Assemblée a accepté de commencer les affaires d'intérêt public émanant des députées et députés avant 18 h aujourd'hui.

AFFAIRES D'INTÉRÊT PUBLIC ÉMANANT DES DÉPUTÉES ET DÉPUTÉS

Aucune affaire désignée pour le billet de député n° 79.

DÉBAT SUR LA MOTION D'AJOURNEMENT

À 17 h 40, la question suivante a été examinée dans un débat d'ajournement.

Member for Ottawa South (John Fraser) to the Parliamentary Assistant to the Minister of Health (Dawn Gallagher Murphy) – Defibrillators.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Second Reading of **Bill 157**, An Act to amend various Acts in relation to the courts and other justice matters.

Debate resumed and after some time,

The question was then put.

Carried.

Referred to the Standing Committee on Justice Policy.

At 9:04 p.m., pursuant to Standing Order 9(e), the Minister of Children, Community and Social Services indicated that no further business would be called and therefore the House adjourned.

ORDRES DU JOUR

Deuxième lecture du **projet de loi 157**, Loi modifiant diverses lois en ce qui concerne les tribunaux et d'autres questions relatives à la justice.

Le débat a repris et après quelque temps,

La question a ensuite été mise aux voix.

Adoptée.

Renvoyé au Comité permanent de la justice.

À 21 h 04, conformément à l'article 9 e) du Règlement, le ministre des Services à l'enfance et des Services sociaux et communautaires a indiqué qu'aucune autre affaire ne serait à l'ordre du jour et par conséquent, l'Assemblée a ajourné ses travaux.

PETITIONS TABLED PURSUANT TO STANDING ORDER 42(A)

No./N°	Petition title/Titre de la pétition	Presented by/Présentée par
P-26	Vaping and youth	France Gélinas
P-38	ODSP Rates	Adil Shamji
P-53	Greenbelt expansion	France Gélinas
P-83	Chronic pain	Sol Mamakwa
P-174	Driver test practices in residential neighbourhoods	Adil Shamji

PÉTITIONS DÉPOSÉES CONFORMÉMENT À L'ARTICLE 42 A) DU RÈGLEMENT

SESSIONAL PAPERS PRESENTED PURSUANT TO STANDING ORDER 43

No., Suffix/N°, Suffixe	Title/Titre	Date tabled/Date de dépôt
445	Judicial Appointments Advisory Committee, 2020-2021 Annual Report	December 5, 2023
446	Home and Community Care Support Services, 2022-2023 Annual Report/Services de soutien à domicile et en milieu communautaire, Rapport annuel 2022-2023	December 5, 2023

DOCUMENTS PARLEMENTAIRES DÉPOSÉES CONFORMÉMENT À L'ARTICLE 43 DU RÈGLEMENT

**RESPONSES TO WRITTEN
QUESTIONS****RÉPONSES AUX QUESTIONS
ÉCRITES**

No./N°	Submitted by/Présentée par	Outcome/Résultat
138	Ted Hsu	Final answer tabled December 5, 2023
139	Ted Hsu	Final answer tabled December 5, 2023

RESPONSES TO PETITIONS**RÉPONSES AUX PÉTITIONS**

No./N°	Petition title/Titre de la pétition	Presented by/Présentée par	Date tabled/Date de dépôt
P-21	Health care privatization/Privatisation des soins de santé	Catherine Fife	November 1, 2023
		Bhutila Karpoche	October 18, 2023
		Terence Kernaghan	October 16, 2023
			October 30, 2023
		Chandra Pasma	November 15, 2023
		Sandy Shaw	November 15, 2023
			November 20, 2023
		Jennifer (Jennie) Stevens	November 20, 2023
		Peter Tabuns	November 15, 2023
		Lise Vaugeois	October 26, 2023
P-149	Land Lease Homeowners	Brian Saunderson	October 16, 2023