

Legislative
Assembly
of Ontario



Assemblée
législative
de l'Ontario

43RD PARLIAMENT, 1ST SESSION 43E LÉGISLATURE, 1RE SESSION

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

PROCÈS-VERBAUX

No. 110

N° 110

Thursday
November 16, 2023

Jeudi
16 novembre 2023

Hon. Ted Arnott
Speaker

L'hon. Ted Arnott
le président

9:00 A.M.

Prayers

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Amendment to the motion regarding taxes on fuels for home heating.

Debate resumed and after some time,

Hon. Paul Calandra moved,

That the amendment be amended by deleting everything after “remove” and replacing it with “the carbon tax on fuels and inputs for home heating”.

Debate arose and after some time, the debate adjourned at 10:15 a.m.

10:15 A.M.

The Speaker informed the House,

That the following document was tabled:

Report titled *Ontario's Credit Rating: Fall 2023 Update* from the Financial Accountability Office of Ontario (Sessional Paper No. 399).

DEFERRED VOTES

Second Reading of **Bill 146**, An Act to implement Budget measures and to enact and amend various statutes.

Carried on the following division:

Ayes/pour (95)

Anand	Andrew	Armstrong	Babikian
Bailey	Barnes	Begum	Bell
Blais	Bouma	Bowman	Brady
Bresee	Byers	Calandra	Clark
Coe	Collard	Crawford	Cuzzetto
Dixon	Dowie	Downey	Dunlop
Fedeli	Fife	Flack	Ford (Etobicoke North)
Ford (York South— Weston)	Fraser	French	Gallagher Murphy
Gates	Gélinas	Ghamari	Gill
Gretzky	Grewal	Hardeman	Harden
Harris	Hazell	Hogarth	Holland

9 H

Prières

ORDRES DU JOUR

Amendement à la motion concernant les taxes sur les combustibles à chauffage résidentiel.

Le débat a repris et après quelque temps,

L'hon. Paul Calandra a proposé,

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps, à 10 h 15, le débat était ajourné.

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps, à 10 h 15, le débat était ajourné.

10 H 15

Le Président a informé l'Assemblée,

Que le document suivant a été déposé :

Rapport intitulé *La cote de crédit de l'Ontario : Mise à jour de l'automne 2023* du Bureau de la responsabilité financière de l'Ontario (Document parlementaire n° 399).

VOTES DIFFÉRÉS

Deuxième lecture du **projet de loi 146**, Loi visant à mettre en oeuvre les mesures budgétaires et à édicter et à modifier diverses lois.

Adoptée par le vote suivant :

Jones (Chatham-Kent— Leamington)	Jordan	Kanapathi	Karpoche
Ke	Kernaghan	Kerzner	Khanjin
Kusendova-Bashta	Leardi	Lecce	MacLeod
Mamakwa	Martin	McCarthy	McCrimmon
McMahon	Mulroney	Pang	Parsa
Pasma	Pirie	Quinn	Rae
Rakocevic	Riddell	Romano	Sabawy
Sandhu	Sarrazin	Sattler	Saunderson
Schreiner	Scott	Shaw	Skelly
Smith (Bay of Quinte)	Smith (Parry Sound— Muskoka)	Smith (Scarborough Centre)	Smith (Thornhill)
Stiles	Surma	Tabuns	Thanigasalam
Triantafilopoulos	Vanthof	Vaugeois	Wai
West	Williams	Yakabuski	

Nays/contre (0)

Referred to the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Affairs.

Renvoyé au Comité permanent des finances et des affaires économique.

With unanimous consent to move a motion without notice,

Avec le consentement unanime de proposé une motion sans préavis,

Stephen Blais moved,

Stephen Blais a proposé,

That, in the opinion of this House, the Government of Canada, in conjunction with the Government of Ontario, remove the Harmonized Sales Tax on fuels and inputs for home heating.

Debate arose and after some time,

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps,

Karen McCrimmon moved,

Karen McCrimmon a proposé,

That the motion be amended by adding at the end "for Ontario".

Debate arose and after some time,

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps,

Mary-Margaret McMahon moved,

Mary-Margaret McMahon a proposé,

That the amendment be amended by adding at the end " 's families".

Debate arose and after some time, the debate adjourned at 1:00 p.m.

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps, à 13 h, le débat était ajourné.

1:00 P.M.

13 H

REPORTS BY COMMITTEES

RAPPORTS DE COMITÉS

The Speaker informed the House,

Le Président a informé l'Assemblée,

That the Clerk received the *Report on Intended Appointments dated November 16, 2023* of the Standing Committee on Government Agencies. Pursuant to Standing Order 110(f)(9), the Report is deemed to be adopted by the House (Sessional Paper No. 401).

Que le greffier a reçu le *Rapport sur les nominations prévues daté le 16 novembre 2023* du Comité permanent des organismes gouvernementaux. Conformément à l'article 110 f) 9) du Règlement, le rapport est réputé adopté par l'Assemblée (Document parlementaire n° 401).

John Jordan from the **Standing Committee on Social Policy** reported the following Resolutions:

Resolved, that Supply in the following amounts and to defray the expenses of the following Ministries be granted to His Majesty for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024:

MINISTRY OF CHILDREN, COMMUNITY AND SOCIAL SERVICES

701	Ministry Administration	\$	94,092,300
702	Children and Adult Services		19,254,107,900
704	Children, Community and Social Services Capital		183,006,300

MINISTRY OF COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES

3001	Ministry Administration	\$	15,012,000
3002	Postsecondary Education		7,167,552,700
3005	Research		317,539,100

MINISTRY OF EDUCATION

1001	Ministry Administration	\$	21,416,100
1002	Elementary and Secondary Education		29,803,229,900
1003	Community Services Information and Information Technology Cluster		56,232,200
1004	Child Care and Early Years Programs		4,685,338,700

MINISTRY OF HEALTH

1401	Ministry Administration	\$	98,899,500
1402	Health Policy and Research		1,090,277,100
1403	Digital Health and Information Management		189,182,200
1405	Ontario Health Insurance		25,086,958,200
1406	Population and Public Health		1,939,299,500
1407	Health Capital		2,340,819,600
1412	Provincial Programs and Stewardship		2,879,548,100
1413	Information Systems		242,420,900
1416	Health Services and Programs		34,714,209,800

MINISTRY OF LONG-TERM CARE

4501	Ministry Administration	\$	7,132,100
4502	Long-Term Care Homes		8,396,387,200

MINISTRY FOR SENIORS AND ACCESSIBILITY

3501	Ministry Administration	\$	7,564,700
3502	Policy, Program, and Strategic Partnerships		169,378,600
3503	Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities		7,932,700

Goldie Ghamari from the **Standing Committee on Justice Policy** reported the following Resolutions:

Resolved, That Supply in the following amounts and to defray the expenses of the following Ministries be granted to His Majesty for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024:

MINISTRY OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

301	Ministry Administration	\$	327,274,100
302	Prosecuting Crime		350,897,400
303	Policy, Justice and Agencies		511,452,800
304	Legal Services		32,210,000
305	Court Services		569,988,700
306	Victims and Vulnerable Persons		158,018,100
307	Political Contribution Tax Credit		9,654,700
308	Alcohol and Gaming Commission of Ontario		65,129,700

MINISTRY OF FRANCOPHONE AFFAIRS

1301	Francophone Affairs	\$	7,731,600
------	---------------------	----	-----------

MINISTRY OF INDIGENOUS AFFAIRS

2001	Indigenous Affairs	\$	132,132,600
------	--------------------	----	-------------

MINISTRY OF PUBLIC AND BUSINESS SERVICE DELIVERY

1801	Ministry Administration	\$	32,354,800
1809	Enterprise Information, Privacy, Archives and Digital Delivery		100,877,200
1811	Enterprise Business and Financial Services		327,767,600
1814	ServiceOntario		249,740,700
1816	Consumer Services		17,933,900
1817	Government Services Integration Cluster		74,089,300
1821	Enterprise Information Technology Services		280,122,500

MINISTRY OF THE SOLICITOR GENERAL

2601	Ministry Administration	\$	21,798,200
2603	Public Safety Division		437,459,600
2604	Ontario Provincial Police		1,499,548,800
2605	Correctional Services		1,089,501,800
2606	Justice Technology Services		96,431,500
2607	Agencies, Boards and Commissions		892,600
2609	Emergency Planning and Management		93,663,200
2610	Strategic Policy Research and Innovation		6,839,300
2612	Inspectorate		8,669,100
2614	Emergency Services Telecommunications		554,750,100
2615	Data Insights and Strategic Initiatives		6,098,300
2616	Health Services		28,095,200
2617	Infrastructure		523,169,100

Laurie Scott from the **Standing Committee on Heritage, Infrastructure and Cultural Policy** reported the following Resolutions:

Resolved, That Supply in the following amounts and to defray the expenses of the following Ministries be granted to His Majesty for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024:

MINISTRY OF CITIZENSHIP AND MULTICULTURALISM

4601	Ministry Administration	\$	759,800
4602	Anti-Racism Directorate		27,346,900
4603	Citizenship, Inclusion and Heritage		35,927,500

MINISTRY OF INFRASTRUCTURE

4001	Ministry Administration	\$	8,846,600
4003	Infrastructure Policy, Planning and Projects		1,737,456,500
4006	Government Real Estate		827,531,800
4007	Infrastructure Partnerships Projects & Agency Oversight		613,537,300

MINISTRY OF MUNICIPAL AFFAIRS AND HOUSING

1901	Ministry Administration	\$	20,327,900
1902	Municipal Services		48,487,400
1903	Local Government and Planning Policy		25,042,200
1904	Housing		1,354,710,100

MINISTRY OF TOURISM, CULTURE AND SPORT

3801	Ministry Administration	\$	23,555,300
3803	Sport, Recreation and Community		57,814,200
3804	Tourism and Culture Capital		42,668,400
3805	Tourism and Culture		91,536,400
3806	Ontario Trillium Foundation		103,557,000
3808	Ontario Cultural Media Tax Credits		906,067,300
3811	Agency		223,532,300

MINISTRY OF TRANSPORTATION

2701	Ministry Administration	\$	61,708,100
2702	Transit		7,523,266,000
2703	Transportation Safety		197,095,300
2704	Transportation Infrastructure Management		2,631,897,200
2705	Labour and Transportation Cluster		66,487,000
2706	Integrated Policy and Planning		27,256,600
2707	Operations		653,685,300
2708	Oversight and Agency Governance		101,920,200

Ernie Hardeman from the **Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Affairs** reported the following Resolutions:

Resolved, That Supply in the following amounts and to defray the expenses of the following Ministries and Offices be granted to His Majesty for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024:

MINISTRY OF ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT, JOB CREATION AND TRADE

901	Ministry Administration	\$	23,140,900
902	Economic Development, Job Creation and Trade		1,394,537,200

MINISTRY OF FINANCE

1201	Ministry Administration	\$	34,689,700
1202	Regulatory Policy and Agency Relations		18,405,200
1203	Economic, Fiscal, and Financial Policy		369,325,900
1209	Tax, Benefits and Local Finance		1,180,311,100

MINISTRY OF LABOUR, IMMIGRATION, TRAINING AND SKILLS DEVELOPMENT

1601	Ministry Administration	\$	22,743,400
1602	Pay Equity Commission		3,462,300
1603	Labour Relations		24,539,200
1604	Occupational Health and Safety		267,924,000
1605	Employment Rights and Responsibilities		45,094,600
1607	Employment Ontario		1,677,073,100
1608	Global Talent and Settlement Services		114,259,800

CABINET OFFICE

401	Cabinet Office	\$	55,456,800
-----	----------------	----	------------

OFFICE OF THE PREMIER

2401	Office of the Premier	\$	2,326,800
------	-----------------------	----	-----------

TREASURY BOARD SECRETARIAT

3401	Ministry Administration	\$	25,781,500
3402	Labour Relations and Compensation		85,169,300
3403	Employee and Pensioner Benefits (Employer Share)		1,367,000,000
3404	Treasury Board Support		4,065,096,400
3405	Centre for People, Culture and Talent		76,902,800
3409	Central Agencies Cluster		36,933,800
3411	Bulk Media Buy		51,949,200
3412	Office of the Comptroller General		53,479,200
3415	Emergency Management Ontario		64,118,600
3416	Supply Chain		58,887,500

Ric Bresee from the **Standing Committee on the Interior** reported the following Resolutions:

Resolved, That Supply in the following amounts and to defray the expenses of the following Ministries be granted to His Majesty for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2024:

MINISTRY OF AGRICULTURE, FOOD AND RURAL AFFAIRS

101	Ministry Administration	\$	22,462,900
107	Better Public Health and Environment		102,093,300
108	Strong Agriculture, Food and Bio-product Sectors and Strong Rural Communities		488,056,800
109	Policy Development		16,247,300

MINISTRY OF ENERGY

2901	Ministry Administration	\$	12,955,700
2902	Energy Development and Management		171,786,600
2905	Electricity Price Mitigation		6,516,836,600

MINISTRY OF THE ENVIRONMENT, CONSERVATION AND PARKS

1101	Ministry Administration	\$	66,155,200
1112	Environmental Policy		22,180,900
1114	Environmental Sciences and Standards		59,147,200
1116	Environmental Compliance and Operations		115,039,200
1118	Environmental Assessment and Permissions		31,275,500
1119	Climate Change and Resiliency		14,619,500
1120	Land and Water		122,193,800
1121	Emissions Performance Standards		3,000

MINISTRY OF MINES

4901	Ministry Administration	\$	6,012,200
4902	Mines and Minerals		170,026,800

MINISTRY OF NATURAL RESOURCES AND FORESTRY

2101	Ministry Administration	\$	38,030,000
2103	Natural Resource Management		447,006,100
2104	Public Protection		203,351,600
2105	Land and Resources Information and Information Technology Cluster		30,911,000

MINISTRY OF NORTHERN DEVELOPMENT

2201	Ministry Administration	\$	6,518,800
2202	Northern Development		905,552,700

INTRODUCTION OF GOVERNMENT BILLS

The following Bills were introduced and read the first time:

Bill 150, An Act to enact the Official Plan Adjustments Act, 2023 and to amend the Planning Act with respect to remedies. Hon. Paul Calandra (Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing).

Bill 151, An Act to amend various statutes regarding infrastructure. Hon. Kinga Surma (Minister of Infrastructure).

MOTIONS

On motion by Trevor Jones,

Ordered, That, pursuant to Standing Order 77(a), the Order for Second Reading of **Bill 141**, an Act respecting life leases, be discharged and the Bill be referred to the Standing Committee on Heritage, Infrastructure and Cultural Policy.

PETITIONS

No./N°	Petition title/Titre de la pétition	Presented by/Présentée par
P-28	Rent control	Bhutila Karpoche

DÉPÔT DE PROJETS DE LOI ÉMANANT DU GOUVERNEMENT

Les projets de loi suivants sont présentés et lus une première fois :

Projet de loi 150, Loi édictant la Loi de 2023 sur les modifications apportées aux plans officiels et modifiant la Loi sur l'aménagement du territoire en ce qui concerne les recours. L'hon. Paul Calandra (Ministre des Affaires municipales et du Logement).

Projet de loi 151, Loi modifiant diverses lois relatives aux infrastructures. L'hon. Kinga Surma (Ministre de l'Infrastructure).

MOTIONS

Sur la motion de Trevor Jones,

PÉTITIONS

P-38	ODSP Rates	Bhutila Karpoche
P-38	ODSP Rates	Kristyn Wong-Tam
P-58	Vulnerable road users	Joel Harden
P-58	Vulnerable road users	Bhutila Karpoche
P-58	Vulnerable road users	Sandy Shaw
P-101	Ontario Place	Bhutila Karpoche
P-139	Renewable energy and conservation technologies	Bhutila Karpoche
P-139	Renewable energy and conservation technologies	Kristyn Wong-Tam
P-164	Conservation of protected lands	Anthony Leardi
P-165	Metrolinx Chief Executive Officer	Bhutila Karpoche

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Amendment to the amendment to the motion regarding taxes on fuels for home heating.

Debate resumed and after some time,
John Jordan moved, under Standing Order 51 “That this question be now put”.

Vote deferred.

Third Reading of **Bill 139**, An Act to amend various Acts.

Debate arose and after some time,
Anthony Leardi moved adjournment of the debate.

Carried on the following division – Ayes 49, Nays 0

Second Reading of **Bill 149**, An Act to amend various statutes with respect to employment and labour and other matters.

Debate arose and after some time, the debate adjourned.

ORDRES DU JOUR

Sous-amendement à la motion concernant les taxes sur les combustibles à chauffage résidentiel.

Le débat a repris et après quelque temps,
John Jordan a proposé, conformément à l'article 51 du Règlement « Que cette question soit maintenant mise aux voix ».

Le vote est différé.

Troisième lecture du **projet de loi 139**, Loi modifiant diverses lois.

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps,
Anthony Leardi a proposé l'ajournement du débat.

Adoptée par le vote suivant – pour 49, contre 0

Deuxième lecture du **projet de loi 149**, Loi modifiant diverses lois en ce qui concerne l'emploi, le travail et d'autres questions.

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps, le débat était ajourné.

6:00 P.M.

PRIVATE MEMBERS' PUBLIC BUSINESS

Joel Harden moved,

Second Reading of **Bill 40**, An Act to amend the Highway Traffic Act to provide for consequences to those who cause injury or death to certain road users.

Debate arose and after some time,

The question was then put.

Vote deferred.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Amendment to the amendment to the motion regarding the removal of the Harmonized Sales Tax on fuels for home heating.

Debate resumed and after some time,

Hon. Paul Calandra moved adjournment of the debate.

Carried on the following division – Ayes 42, Nays 0

Third Reading of **Bill 139**, An Act to amend various Acts.

Debate resumed and after some time,

Stephanie Bowman moved adjournment of the debate.

Lost.

Debate resumed and after some time,

Stephanie Bowman moved adjournment of the House.

Lost on the following division – Ayes 0, Nays 52

Debate resumed and after some time,

Hon. Paul Calandra moved adjournment of the debate.

Carried on the following division – Ayes 46, Nays 0

18 H

AFFAIRES D'INTÉRÊT PUBLIC ÉMANANT DES DÉPUTÉES ET DÉPUTÉS

Joel Harden a proposé,

Deuxième lecture du **projet de loi 40**, Loi modifiant le Code de la route pour prévoir les conséquences qu'encourent les personnes qui causent des blessures à certains usagers de la route ou leur décès.

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps,

La question a ensuite été mise aux voix.

Le vote est différé.

ORDRES DU JOUR

Sous-amendement à la motion concernant la révocation de la taxe de vente harmonisée sur les combustibles à chauffage résidentiel.

Le débat a repris et après quelque temps,

L'hon. Paul Calandra a proposé l'ajournement du débat.

Adoptée par le vote suivant – pour 42, contre 0

Troisième lecture du **projet de loi 139**, Loi modifiant diverses lois.

Le débat a repris et après quelque temps,

Stephanie Bowman a proposé l'ajournement du débat.

Rejetée.

Le débat a repris et après quelque temps,

Stephanie Bowman a proposé l'ajournement de l'Assemblée.

Rejetée par le vote suivant – pour 0, contre 52

Le débat a repris et après quelque temps,

L'hon. Paul Calandra a proposé l'ajournement du débat.

Adoptée par le vote suivant – pour 46, contre 0

Anthony Leardi moved,

That, in the opinion of this House, the Government of Canada should take immediate steps to eliminate the carbon tax on gasoline.

Debate arose and after some time,

Anthony Leardi moved adjournment of the debate.

Carried on the following division – Ayes 44, Nays 0

Second Reading of **Bill 149**, An Act to amend various statutes with respect to employment and labour and other matters.

Debate resumed and after some time, the debate adjourned.

Anthony Leardi a proposé,

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps,

Anthony Leardi a proposé l'ajournement du débat.

Adoptée par le vote suivant – pour 44, contre 0

Deuxième lecture du **projet de loi 149**, Loi modifiant diverses lois en ce qui concerne l'emploi, le travail et d'autres questions.

Le débat a repris et après quelque temps, le débat était ajourné.

The House adjourned at 12:00 a.m.

À 00 h 00, l'Assemblée a ajourné ses travaux.

SESSIONAL PAPERS PRESENTED PURSUANT TO STANDING ORDER 43

DOCUMENTS PARLEMENTAIRES DÉPOSÉES CONFORMÉMENT À L'ARTICLE 43 DU RÈGLEMENT

No., Suffix/N°, Suffixe	Title/Titre	Date tabled/Date de dépôt
400	Ontario Northland Transportation Commission, 2022-2023 Annual Report/Commission de transport Ontario Northland, Rapport annuel 2022-2023	November 16, 2023
402	Compendia: Hon. Paul Calandra, Bill 150 , An Act to enact the Official Plan Adjustments Act, 2023 and to amend the Planning Act with respect to remedies/L'hon. Paul Calandra, Projet de loi 150 , Loi édictant la Loi de 2023 sur les modifications apportées aux plans officiels et modifiant la Loi sur l'aménagement du territoire en ce qui concerne les recours	November 16, 2023
403	Compendia: Hon. Kinga Surma, Bill 151 , An Act to amend various statutes regarding infrastructure/L'hon. Kinga Surma, Projet de loi 151 , Loi modifiant diverses lois relatives aux infrastructures	November 16, 2023

RESPONSES TO WRITTEN QUESTIONS

RÉPONSES AUX QUESTIONS ÉCRITES

No./N°	Submitted by/Présentée par	Outcome/Résultat
120	Chandra Pasma	Final answer tabled November 16, 2023
121	Chandra Pasma	Final answer tabled November 16, 2023

No./N°	Submitted by/Présentée par	Outcome/Résultat
122	Chandra Pasma	Final answer tabled November 16, 2023
123	Chandra Pasma	Final answer tabled November 16, 2023
124	Chandra Pasma	Final answer tabled November 16, 2023
125	Chandra Pasma	Final answer tabled November 16, 2023

RESPONSES TO PETITIONS**RÉPONSES AUX PÉTITIONS**

No./N°	Petition title/Titre de la pétition	Presented by/Présentée par	Date tabled/Date de dépôt
P-101	Ontario Place	Bhutila Karpoche	June 7, 2023
P-131	Disabled parking fees	Ted Hsu	June 7, 2023
P-132	Safety in bars and restaurants	Peggy Sattler	June 7, 2023 October 30, 2023
P-133	Des services et besoins des victimes d'agression sexuelle	Lucille Collard	June 7, 2023
P-134	Ontario Science Centre	Adil Shamji	June 7, 2023