

Legislative  
Assembly  
of Ontario



Assemblée  
législative  
de l'Ontario

43RD PARLIAMENT, 1ST SESSION

43E LÉGISLATURE, 1RE SESSION

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

PROCÈS-VERBAUX

No. 28

N° 28

Wednesday  
November 16, 2022

Mercredi  
16 novembre 2022

Hon. Ted Arnott  
Speaker

L'hon. Ted Arnott  
le président

**9:00 A.M.**

Prayers

**ORDERS OF THE DAY**

Second Reading of **Bill 36**, An Act to implement Budget measures and to enact and amend various statutes.

Debate resumed and after some time, the debate adjourned at 10:15 a.m.

---

The House recessed at 11:50 a.m.

---

**9 H**

Prières

**ORDRES DU JOUR**

Deuxième lecture du **projet de loi 36**, Loi visant à mettre en oeuvre les mesures budgétaires et à édicter et à modifier diverses lois.

Le débat a repris et après quelque temps, à 10 h 15, le débat était ajourné.

---

À 11 h 50, l'Assemblée a suspendu la séance.

---

**1:00 P.M.****INTRODUCTION OF GOVERNMENT BILLS**

The following bill was introduced and read the first time:-

**Bill 39**, An Act to amend the City of Toronto Act, 2006 and the Municipal Act, 2001 and to enact the Duffins Rouge Agricultural Preserve Repeal Act, 2022. Hon. Steve Clark (Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing).

**INTRODUCTION OF BILLS**

The following bills were introduced and read the first time:-

**Bill 40**, An Act to amend the Highway Traffic Act to provide for consequences to those who cause injury or death to certain road users. Joel Harden; Doly Begum; Jessica Bell; Bhutila Karpoche.

**13 H****DÉPÔT DE PROJETS DE LOI ÉMANANT DU GOUVERNEMENT**

Le projet de loi suivant est présenté et lu une première fois :-

**Projet de loi 39**, Loi visant à modifier la Loi de 2006 sur la cité de Toronto et la Loi de 2001 sur les municipalités et à édicter la Loi de 2022 abrogeant la Loi sur la Réserve agricole de Duffins-Rouge. L'hon. Steve Clark (Ministre des Affaires municipales et du Logement).

**DÉPÔT DE PROJETS DE LOI**

Les projets de loi suivants sont présentés et lus une première fois :-

**Projet de loi 40**, Loi modifiant le Code de la route pour prévoir les conséquences qu'encourent les personnes qui causent des blessures à certains usagers de la route ou leur décès. Joel Harden; Doly Begum; Jessica Bell; Bhutila Karpoche.

**Bill 41**, An Act to amend the Consumer Reporting Act and the Prevention of and Remedies for Human Trafficking Act, 2017 with respect to certain debts incurred in relation to human trafficking. Lucille Collard; Chris Glover; Mike Schreiner; Laurie Scott.

**Bill 42**, An Act to establish the Gender Affirming Health Care Advisory Committee. Kristyn Wong-Tam; Jill Andrew; Terence Kernaghan; Lise Vaugois.

**Bill Pr10**, An Act to revive Maizal Tortilleria Inc. Chris Glover.

**Projet de loi 41**, Loi modifiant la Loi sur les renseignements concernant le consommateur et la Loi de 2017 sur la prévention de la traite de personnes et les recours en la matière à l'égard de certaines dettes contractées dans un contexte de traite de personnes. Lucille Collard; Chris Glover; Mike Schreiner; Laurie Scott.

**Projet de loi 42**, Loi créant le Comité consultatif des soins de santé axés sur l'affirmation de genre. Kristyn Wong-Tam; Jill Andrew; Terence Kernaghan; Lise Vaugois.

## ORDERS OF THE DAY

Opposition Day

France Gélinas moved,

Whereas staffing shortages in Ontario have forced emergency room and ICU closures across Ontario, reducing access to complex and potentially life-saving care in many communities; and

Whereas other hospitals have been forced to close units, redirect patients to other facilities and reduce beds, contributing to ER wait times of up to 36 hours for patients that require a hospital stay; and

Whereas health care job vacancies have more than quadrupled since 2015, resulting in more than 45,000 openings in primary care, and research by the Financial Accountability Office of Ontario underscores the urgent need to train and hire tens of thousands of extra nurses, PSWs and allied health professionals to meet the government's own 2024-2025 LTC targets for hands-on-staffing-care, while the College of Nurses of Ontario reports over 15,000 nurses in Ontario are licensed and not practicing; and

Whereas health care workers are overworked, underpaid, subject to violence, and distressed by their inability to provide the care patients need due to poor working conditions and inadequate staffing, driving many to leave the profession in record numbers; and

Whereas Ford government policies such as the *Protecting a Sustainable Public Sector for Future Generations Act, 2019* (previously Bill 124) and other stopgap measures have failed to fix the problem, leaving nurses, allied health professionals and other frontline health care workers with wages falling far short of inflation, while the Government of Ontario chose not to invest over one billion dollars of the money allocated for hospitals in the 2021-2022 Budget; and

Whereas this government allowed the health human resource crisis to persist while billions of dollars in unspent public funds have been allocated to discretionary funds instead of Ontario hospitals that are struggling to maintain quality of care because they are dramatically understaffed; and

Whereas the Ford government has failed to develop a comprehensive health care staffing plan to train,

## ORDRES DU JOUR

Jour de l'opposition

France Gélinas propose,

recruit and retain sufficient numbers of health care workers and have ignored the advice of health care professionals on how to solve the staffing crisis in hospital and primary care; and

Whereas the Ministry of Health's inadequate temporary retention bonus for nurses fails to address systemic issues in the sector and falls far short of the efforts to retain, retrain and recruit front-line health care staff in Quebec, British Columbia, and Atlantic Canada; and

Whereas the Minister of Health's recent directives on internationally trained health care professionals fails to provide the funding, education spaces and internships needed to help address the staffing shortfall, and fails to implement many of the painful lessons learned during the pandemic; and

Whereas nursing vacancies in Ontario hospitals increased by almost 300% between March 2020 and March 2022, the turnover rate for nurses has increased by 72% since 2020, and the turnover rate for RPNs, PSWs, and other healthcare workers more than doubled since 2016;

Therefore the Legislative Assembly calls on the Ford Government to create, in consultation with unions and other health sector stakeholders, a multi-layer Healthcare Worker Recruitment and Retention incentive package that includes short, medium, and long-term solutions to recruit, retain, and return workers across the health sector with full-time, public, unionized positions and immediately repeals Bill 124, restoring workers' right to bargain for wages that reflect their worth and the significant impact of rising inflation.

Debate arose and after some time,

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps,

The question was then put.

La question a ensuite été mise aux voix.

Lost on the following division:-

Réjetée par le vote suivant :-

*Ayes/pour (28)*

Andrew	Armstrong	Begum	Bell
Bourgouin	Bowman	Collard	Fife
Fraser	French	Gates	Gélinas
Harden	Hsu	Kernaghan	Mamakwa
Mantha	McMahon	Pasma	Sattler
Schreiner	Shamji	Stevens	Stiles
Tabuns	Vanthof	West	Wong-Tam

*Nays/contre (74)*

Anand	Babikian	Bailey	Bethlenfalvy
Bouma	Bresee	Byers	Calandra
Cho (Scarborough North)	Cho (Willowdale)	Clark	Coe
Crawford	Cuzzetto	Dixon	Dowie
Downey	Dunlop	Fedeli	Flack
Fullerton	Gallagher Murphy	Ghamari	Gill
Grewal	Hardeman	Harris	Hogarth

Holland	Jones (Chatham-Kent— Leamington)	Jones (Dufferin— Caledon)	Jordan
Kanapathi	Ke	Kerzner	Khanjin
Kusendova-Bashta	Leardi	Lecce	Lumsden
Martin	McCarthy	McGregor	McNaughton
Oosterhoff	Pang	Parsa	Pierre
Pirie	Quinn	Rae	Rasheed
Rickford	Riddell	Romano	Sabawy
Sandhu	Sarkaria	Sarrazin	Saunderson
Scott	Skelly	Smith (Bay of Quinte)	Smith (Parry Sound— Muskoka)
Smith (Peterborough— Kawartha)	Smith (Scarborough Centre)	Smith (Thornhill)	Surma
Tangri	Thanigasalam	Thompson	Wai
Williams	Yakabuski		

With unanimous consent,

That notwithstanding Standing Order 9(a), the House agreed to commence Private Members' Public Business before 6:00 p.m. today.

### **PRIVATE MEMBERS' PUBLIC BUSINESS**

Kevin Holland moved,

Private Members' Notice of Motion No. 16:-

That, in the opinion of this House, the Government of Ontario should implement a 12-hour bare pavement standard during the Winter season on Highways 11 and 17, the new Ontario TransCanada Highway designation.

Debate arose and after some time,

The question was then put.

Carried.

Resolved, That, in the opinion of this House, the Government of Ontario should implement a 12-hour bare pavement standard during the Winter season on Highways 11 and 17, the new Ontario TransCanada Highway designation.

Avec le consentement unanime,

Que nonobstant l'article 9 a) du Règlement, l'Assemblée a accepté de commencer les affaires d'intérêt public émanant des députées et députés avant 18 h aujourd'hui.

### **AFFAIRES D'INTÉRÊT PUBLIC ÉMANANT DES DÉPUTÉES ET DÉPUTÉS**

Kevin Holland propose,

Avis de motion émanant des députées et députés no 16 :-

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps,

La question a ensuite été mise aux voix.

Adoptée.

**ADJOURNMENT DEBATE****DÉBAT SUR LA MOTION  
D'AJOURNEMENT**

At 3:31 p.m., the following matter was considered in an adjournment debate.

Member for Ottawa South (John Fraser) to the Parliamentary Assistant to the Minister of Health – Children's Health.

**ORDERS OF THE DAY****ORDRES DU JOUR**

Second Reading of **Bill 36**, An Act to implement Budget measures and to enact and amend various statutes.

Deuxième lecture du **projet de loi 36**, Loi visant à mettre en oeuvre les mesures budgétaires et à édicter et à modifier diverses lois.

Debate resumed, during which the Acting Speaker (Patrice Barnes) interrupted the proceedings and announced that there had been six and one-half hours of debate and that the debate would be deemed adjourned.

Le débat a repris. La Présidente suppléante (Patrice Barnes) a interrompu les travaux et a annoncé qu'il y avait eu six heures et demie de débat et que le débat est réputé ajourné.

The Deputy Government House Leader directed that the debate should continue.

La leader parlementaire adjointe du gouvernement a indiqué que le débat devrait se poursuivre.

Debate resumed and after some time,

Le débat a repris et après quelque temps,

Hon. Merrilee Fullerton moved, under Standing Order 51 "That this question be now put".

L'hon. Merrilee Fullerton propose, conformément à l'article 51 du Règlement « Que cette question soit maintenant mise aux voix ».

Vote deferred.

Le vote est différé.

At 8:07 p.m., pursuant to Standing Order 9(e), the Government House Leader indicated that no further business would be called and therefore the House adjourned.

À 20 h 07, conformément à l'article 9 e) du Règlement, le leader parlementaire du gouvernement a indiqué qu'aucune autre affaire ne serait à l'ordre du jour et par conséquent, l'Assemblée a ajourné ses travaux.

**SESSIONAL PAPERS PRESENTED  
PURSUANT TO STANDING ORDER  
43**

**DOCUMENTS PARLEMENTAIRES  
DÉPOSÉES CONFORMÉMENT À  
L'ARTICLE 43 DU RÈGLEMENT**

No., Suffix/N°, Suffixe	Title/Titre	Date tabled/Date de dépôt
-------------------------------	-------------	---------------------------

<b>114</b>	Compendia: Hon. Steve Clark, <b>Bill 39</b> , An Act to amend the City of Toronto Act, 2006 and the Municipal Act, 2001 and to enact the Duffins Rouge Agricultural Preserve Repeal Act, 2022/L'hon. Steve Clark, <b>Projet de loi 39</b> , Loi visant à modifier la Loi de 2006 sur la cité de Toronto et la Loi de 2001 sur les municipalités et à édicter la Loi de 2022 abrogeant la Loi sur la Réserve agricole de Duffins-Rouge	November 16, 2022
------------	---	-------------------

**RESPONSES TO PETITIONS****RÉPONSES AUX PÉTITIONS**

No./N°	Petition title/Titre de la pétition	Presented by/Présentée par	Date tabled/Date de dépôt
<b>P-1</b>	Optometry	France Gélinas	August 25, 2022
		Terence Kernaghan	August 22, 2022
		Peggy Sattler	August 22, 2022
		Monique Taylor	August 18, 2022
		Effie J. Triantafilopoulos	August 10, 2022
		Jamie West	September 1, 2022
<b>P-14</b>	Paid sick days	Jill Andrew	August 18, 2022
		Peggy Sattler	September 6, 2022