

Legislative
Assembly
of Ontario



Assemblée
législative
de l'Ontario

Votes and Proceedings

No. 152

Procès-verbaux

N° 152

1st Session
42nd Parliament

Thursday
March 5, 2020

1^{re} session
42^e législature

Jeudi
5 mars 2020

9:00 A.M.
PRAYERS

9 H
PRIÈRES

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Second Reading of Bill 161, An Act to enact the Legal Aid Services Act, 2019 and to make various amendments to other Acts dealing with the courts and other justice matters.

Debate resumed and after some time,

Ms. Skelly moved, under Standing Order 51 “That this question be now put”.

Vote deferred.

Second Reading of Bill 175, An Act to amend and repeal various Acts respecting home care and community services.

Debate resumed and after some time the debate adjourned at 10:15 a.m.

ORDRE DU JOUR

Deuxième lecture du projet de loi 161, Loi visant à édicter la Loi de 2019 sur les services d'aide juridique et apportant diverses modifications à des lois traitant des tribunaux et d'autres questions relatives à la justice.

Le débat a repris et après quelque temps,

M^{me} Skelly propose, conformément à l'article 51 du Règlement « Que cette question soit maintenant mise aux voix ».

Le vote est différé.

Deuxième lecture du projet de loi 175, Loi modifiant et abrogeant diverses lois en ce qui concerne les services de soins à domicile et en milieu communautaire.

Le débat a repris et après quelque temps, à 10 h 15, le débat était ajourné.

10:15 A.M.

10 H 15

QUESTION PERIOD

PÉRIODE DE QUESTIONS

DEFERRED VOTES

Motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care (including supplementaries).

Carried on the following division:-

VOTES DIFFÉRÉS

Motion portant l'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère de la Santé et des Soins de longue durée (avec les supplémentaires).

Adoptée par le vote suivant :-

AYES / POUR - 66

Anand
Baber
Babikian
Bailey
Barrett
Bethlenfalvy
Bouma
Calandra
Cho (Scarborough North)
Cho (Willowdale)
Clark
Coe
Crawford
Cuzzeto

Fraser
Fullerton
Ghamari
Gill
Hardeman
Harris
Hogarth
Kanapathi
Karahalios
Ke
Kramp
Kusendova
Lecce
Martin

McNaughton
Miller (Parry Sound—Muskoka)
Mulroney
Nicholls
Oosterhoff
Pang
Park
Parsa
Pettapiece
Phillips
Piccini
Rasheed
Roberts
Romano

Sarkaria
Scott
Simard
Skelly
Smith (Bay of Quinte)
Smith (Peterborough—Kawartha)
Surma
Tangri
Thanigasalam
Thompson
Tibollo
Triantafilopoulos
Wai
Walker

AYES / POUR - Continued

Downey	Martow	Sabawy	Wynne
Fedeli	McDonell	Sandhu	Yakabuski
Ford	McKenna		

NAYS / CONTRE - 37

Andrew	French	Mantha	Singh (Brampton Centre)
Armstrong	Gates	Miller (Hamilton East—Stoney Creek)	Singh (Brampton East)
Arthur	Glover	Monteith-Farrell	Stevens
Begum	Gretzky	Morrison	Stiles
Bell	Harden	Natyshak	Tabuns
Berns-McGown	Hassan	Rakocevic	Taylor
Bisson	Hatfield	Sattler	Vanhof
Bourgouin	Kernaghan	Schreiner	West
Burch	Mamakwa	Shaw	Yarde
Fife			

And supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

Motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Education (including supplementaries).

Motion portant l'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère de l'Éducation (avec les supplémentaires).

Carried on the following division:-

Adoptée par le vote suivant :-

AYES / POUR - 66

Anand	Fraser	McNaughton	Sarkaria
Baber	Fullerton	Miller (Parry Sound—Muskoka)	Scott
Babikian	Ghamari	Mulroney	Simard
Bailey	Gill	Nicholls	Skelly
Barrett	Hardeman	Oosterhoff	Smith (Bay of Quinte)
Bethlenfalvy	Harris	Pang	Smith (Peterborough—Kawartha)
Bouma	Hogarth	Park	Surma
Calandra	Kanapathi	Parsa	Tangri
Cho (Scarborough North)	Karahalios	Pettapiece	Thanigasalam
Cho (Willowdale)	Ke	Phillips	Thompson
Clark	Kramp	Piccini	Tibollo
Coe	Kusendova	Rasheed	Triantafilopoulos
Crawford	Lecce	Roberts	Wai
Cuzzeto	Martin	Romano	Walker
Downey	Martow	Sabawy	Wynne
Fedeli	McDonell	Sandhu	Yakabuski
Ford	McKenna		

NAYS / CONTRE - 37

Andrew	French	Mantha	Singh (Brampton Centre)
Armstrong	Gates	Miller (Hamilton East—Stoney Creek)	Singh (Brampton East)
Arthur	Glover	Monteith-Farrell	Stevens
Begum	Gretzky	Morrison	Stiles
Bell	Harden	Natyshak	Tabuns
Berns-McGown	Hassan	Rakocevic	Taylor
Bisson	Hatfield	Sattler	Vanhof
Bourgouin	Kernaghan	Schreiner	West

NAYS / CONTRE - Continued

Burch	Mamakwa	Shaw	Yarde
Fife			
And supply was accordingly concurred in.		En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.	

Motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Transportation.	Motion portant l'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère des Transports.
Carried on the following division:-	Adoptée par le vote suivant :-

AYES / POUR - 66

Anand	Fraser	McNaughton	Sarkaria
Baber	Fullerton	Miller <small>(Parry Sound—Muskoka)</small>	Scott
Babikian	Ghamari	Mulroney	Simard
Bailey	Gill	Nicholls	Skelly
Barrett	Hardeman	Oosterhoff	Smith <small>(Bay of Quinte)</small>
Bethlenfalvy	Harris	Pang	Smith <small>(Peterborough—Kawartha)</small>
Bouma	Hogarth	Park	Surma
Calandra	Kanapathi	Parsa	Tangri
Cho <small>(Scarborough North)</small>	Karahalios	Pettapiece	Thanigasalam
Cho <small>(Willowdale)</small>	Ke	Phillips	Thompson
Clark	Kramp	Piccini	Tibollo
Coe	Kusendova	Rasheed	Triantafilopoulos
Crawford	Lecce	Roberts	Wai
Cuzzeto	Martin	Romano	Walker
Downey	Martow	Sabawy	Wynne
Fedeli	McDonell	Sandhu	Yakabuski
Ford	McKenna		

NAYS / CONTRE - 37

Andrew	French	Mantha	Singh <small>(Brampton Centre)</small>
Armstrong	Gates	Miller <small>(Hamilton East—Stoney Creek)</small>	Singh <small>(Brampton East)</small>
Arthur	Glover	Monteith-Farrell	Stevens
Begum	Gretzky	Morrison	Stiles
Bell	Harden	Natyshak	Tabuns
Berns-McGown	Hassan	Rakocevic	Taylor
Bisson	Hatfield	Sattler	Vanthof
Bourgouin	Kernaghan	Schreiner	West
Burch	Mamakwa	Shaw	Yarde
Fife			

And supply was accordingly concurred in.	En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.
--	--

Motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Infrastructure.	Motion portant l'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère de l'Infrastructure.
Carried on the following division:-	Adoptée par le vote suivant :-

AYES / POUR - 66

Anand	Fraser	McNaughton	Sarkaria
Baber	Fullerton	Miller (Parry Sound—Muskoka)	Scott
Babikian	Ghamari	Mulroney	Simard
Bailey	Gill	Nicholls	Skelly
Barrett	Hardeman	Oosterhoff	Smith (Bay of Quinte)
Bethlenfalvy	Harris	Pang	Smith (Peterborough—Kawartha)
Bouma	Hogarth	Park	Surma
Calandra	Kanapathi	Parsa	Tangri
Cho (Scarborough North)	Karahalios	Pettapiece	Thanigasalam
Cho (Willowdale)	Ke	Phillips	Thompson
Clark	Kramp	Piccini	Tibollo
Coe	Kusendova	Rasheed	Triantafilopoulos
Crawford	Lecce	Roberts	Wai
Cuzzeto	Martin	Romano	Walker
Downey	Martow	Sabawy	Wynne
Fedeli	McDonell	Sandhu	Yakabuski
Ford	McKenna		

NAYS / CONTRE - 37

Andrew	French	Mantha	Singh (Brampton Centre)
Armstrong	Gates	Miller (Hamilton East—Stoney Creek)	Singh (Brampton East)
Arthur	Glover	Monteith-Farrell	Stevens
Begum	Gretzky	Morrison	Stiles
Bell	Harden	Natyshak	Tabuns
Berns-McGown	Hassan	Rakocevic	Taylor
Bisson	Hatfield	Sattler	Vanhof
Bourgouin	Kernaghan	Schreiner	West
Burch	Mamakwa	Shaw	Yarde
Fife			

And supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

Motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Children, Community and Social Services (including supplementaries).

Motion portant l'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère des Services à l'enfance et des Services sociaux et communautaires (avec les supplémentaires).

Carried on the following division:-

Adoptée par le vote suivant :-

AYES / POUR - 66

Anand	Fraser	McNaughton	Sarkaria
Baber	Fullerton	Miller (Parry Sound—Muskoka)	Scott
Babikian	Ghamari	Mulroney	Simard
Bailey	Gill	Nicholls	Skelly
Barrett	Hardeman	Oosterhoff	Smith (Bay of Quinte)
Bethlenfalvy	Harris	Pang	Smith (Peterborough—Kawartha)
Bouma	Hogarth	Park	Surma
Calandra	Kanapathi	Parsa	Tangri
Cho (Scarborough North)	Karahalios	Pettapiece	Thanigasalam
Cho (Willowdale)	Ke	Phillips	Thompson
Clark	Kramp	Piccini	Tibollo
Coe	Kusendova	Rasheed	Triantafilopoulos

AYES / POUR - Continued

Crawford	Lecce	Roberts	Wai
Cuzzeto	Martin	Romano	Walker
Downey	Martow	Sabawy	Wynne
Fedeli	McDonell	Sandhu	Yakabuski
Ford	McKenna		

NAYS / CONTRE - 37

Andrew	French	Mantha	Singh (Brampton Centre)
Armstrong	Gates	Miller (Hamilton East—Stoney Creek)	Singh (Brampton East)
Arthur	Glover	Monteith-Farrell	Stevens
Begum	Gretzky	Morrison	Stiles
Bell	Harden	Natyshak	Tabuns
Berns-McGown	Hassan	Rakocevic	Taylor
Bisson	Hatfield	Sattler	Vanthof
Bourgouin	Kernaghan	Schreiner	West
Burch	Mamakwa	Shaw	Yarde
Fife			

And supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

Motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks.

Motion portant l'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère de l'Environnement, de la Protection de la nature et des Parcs.

Carried on the following division:-

Adoptée par le vote suivant :-

AYES / POUR - 66

Anand	Fraser	McNaughton	Sarkaria
Baber	Fullerton	Miller (Parry Sound—Muskoka)	Scott
Babikian	Ghamari	Mulroney	Simard
Bailey	Gill	Nicholls	Skelly
Barrett	Hardeman	Oosterhoff	Smith (Bay of Quinte)
Bethlenfalvy	Harris	Pang	Smith (Peterborough—Kawartha)
Bouma	Hogarth	Park	Surma
Calandra	Kanapathi	Parsa	Tangri
Cho (Scarborough North)	Karahalios	Pettapiece	Thanigasalam
Cho (Willowdale)	Ke	Phillips	Thompson
Clark	Kramp	Piccini	Tibollo
Coe	Kusendova	Rasheed	Triantafilopoulos
Crawford	Lecce	Roberts	Wai
Cuzzeto	Martin	Romano	Walker
Downey	Martow	Sabawy	Wynne
Fedeli	McDonell	Sandhu	Yakabuski
Ford	McKenna		

NAYS / CONTRE - 37

Andrew	French	Mantha	Singh (Brampton Centre)
Armstrong	Gates	Miller (Hamilton East—Stoney Creek)	Singh (Brampton East)
Arthur	Glover	Monteith-Farrell	Stevens
Begum	Gretzky	Morrison	Stiles
Bell	Harden	Natyshak	Tabuns
Berns-McGown	Hassan	Rakocevic	Taylor

NAYS / CONTRE - Continued

Bisson	Hatfield	Sattler	Vanthof
Bourgouin	Kernaghan	Schreiner	West
Burch	Mamakwa	Shaw	Yarde
Fife			

And supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

Motion for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs (including supplementaries).

Motion portant l'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère de l'Agriculture, de l'Alimentation et des Affaires rurales (avec les supplémentaires).

Carried on the following division:-

Adoptée par le vote suivant :-

AYES / POUR - 66

Anand	Fraser	McNaughton	Sarkaria
Baber	Fullerton	Miller (Parry Sound—Muskoka)	Scott
Babikian	Ghamari	Mulroney	Simard
Bailey	Gill	Nicholls	Skelly
Barrett	Hardeman	Oosterhoff	Smith (Bay of Quinte)
Bethlenfalvy	Harris	Pang	Smith (Peterborough—Kawartha)
Bouma	Hogarth	Park	Surma
Calandra	Kanapathi	Parsa	Tangri
Cho (Scarborough North)	Karahalios	Pettapiece	Thanigasalam
Cho (Willowdale)	Ke	Phillips	Thompson
Clark	Kramp	Piccini	Tibollo
Coe	Kusendova	Rasheed	Triantafilopoulos
Crawford	Lecce	Roberts	Wai
Cuzzeto	Martin	Romano	Walker
Downey	Martow	Sabawy	Wynne
Fedeli	McDonell	Sandhu	Yakabuski
Ford	McKenna		

NAYS / CONTRE - 37

Andrew	French	Mantha	Singh (Brampton Centre)
Armstrong	Gates	Miller (Hamilton East—Stoney Creek)	Singh (Brampton East)
Arthur	Glover	Monteith-Farrell	Stevens
Begum	Gretzky	Morrison	Stiles
Bell	Harden	Natyshak	Tabuns
Berns-McGown	Hassan	Rakocevic	Taylor
Bisson	Hatfield	Sattler	Vanthof
Bourgouin	Kernaghan	Schreiner	West
Burch	Mamakwa	Shaw	Yarde
Fife			

And supply was accordingly concurred in.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

Motion for closure on Second Reading of Bill 161, An Act to enact the Legal Aid Services Act, 2019 and to make various amendments to other Acts dealing with the courts and other justice matters.

Carried on the following division:-

Adoptée par le vote suivant :-

AYES / POUR - 64

Anand	Fedeli	McDonell	Sabawy
Baber	Ford	McKenna	Sandhu
Babikian	Fullerton	McNaughton	Sarkaria
Bailey	Ghamari	Miller (Parry Sound—Muskoka)	Scott
Barrett	Gill	Mulroney	Skelly
Bethlenfalvy	Hardeman	Nicholls	Smith (Bay of Quinte)
Bouma	Harris	Oosterhoff	Smith (Peterborough—Kawartha)
Calandra	Hogarth	Pang	Surma
Cho (Scarborough North)	Kanapathi	Park	Tangri
Cho (Willowdale)	Karahalios	Parsa	Thanigasalam
Clark	Ke	Pettapiece	Thompson
Coe	Kramp	Phillips	Tibollo
Crawford	Kusendova	Piccini	Triantafilopoulos
Cuzzeto	Lecce	Rasheed	Wai
Downey	Martin	Roberts	Walker
Dunlop	Martow	Romano	Yakubski

NAYS / CONTRE - 40

Andrew	Fraser	Mantha	Singh (Brampton Centre)
Armstrong	French	Miller (Hamilton East—Stoney Creek)	Singh (Brampton East)
Arthur	Gates	Monteith-Farrell	Stevens
Begum	Glover	Morrison	Stiles
Bell	Gretzky	Natyshak	Tabuns
Berns-McGown	Harden	Rakocevic	Taylor
Bisson	Hassan	Sattler	Vanthof
Bourgouin	Hatfield	Schreiner	West
Burch	Kernaghan	Shaw	Wynne
Fife	Mamakwa	Simard	Yarde

The question was then put.

La question a ensuite été mise aux voix.

Second Reading of Bill 161, An Act to enact the Legal Aid Services Act, 2019 and to make various amendments to other Acts dealing with the courts and other justice matters.

Deuxième lecture du projet de loi 161, Loi visant à édicter la Loi de 2019 sur les services d'aide juridique et apportant diverses modifications à des lois traitant des tribunaux et d'autres questions relatives à la justice.

Carried on the following division:-

Adoptée par le vote suivant :-

AYES / POUR - 64

Anand	Fedeli	McDonell	Sabawy
Baber	Ford	McKenna	Sandhu
Babikian	Fullerton	McNaughton	Sarkaria
Bailey	Ghamari	Miller (Parry Sound—Muskoka)	Scott
Barrett	Gill	Mulroney	Skelly
Bethlenfalvy	Hardeman	Nicholls	Smith (Bay of Quinte)
Bouma	Harris	Oosterhoff	Smith (Peterborough—Kawartha)
Calandra	Hogarth	Pang	Surma
Cho (Scarborough North)	Kanapathi	Park	Tangri
Cho (Willowdale)	Karahalios	Parsa	Thanigasalam

AYES / POUR - Continued

Clark	Ke	Pettapiece	Thompson
Coe	Kramp	Phillips	Tibollo
Crawford	Kusendova	Piccini	Triantafilopoulos
Cuzzeto	Lecce	Rasheed	Wai
Downey	Martin	Roberts	Walker
Dunlop	Martow	Romano	Yakabuski

NAYS / CONTRE - 40

Andrew	Fraser	Mantha	Singh (Brampton Centre)
Armstrong	French	Miller (Hamilton East—Stoney Creek)	Singh (Brampton East)
Arthur	Gates	Monteith-Farrell	Stevens
Begum	Glover	Morrison	Stiles
Bell	Gretzky	Natyshak	Tabuns
Berns-McGown	Harden	Rakocevic	Taylor
Bisson	Hassan	Sattler	Vanthof
Bourgouin	Hatfield	Schreiner	West
Burch	Kernaghan	Shaw	Wynne
Fife	Mamakwa	Simard	Yarde

Referred to the Standing Committee on Justice Policy.

Renvoyé au Comité permanent de la justice.

The House recessed at 11:57 a.m.

À 11 h 57, l'Assemblée a suspendu la séance.

1:00 P.M.

13 H

PETITIONS

PÉTITIONS

Highway of Heroes tree campaign (Sessional Paper No. P-110) Mr. Hatfield.

Full-day kindergarten (Sessional Paper No. P-112) Mr. Tabuns.

Winter road maintenance on Highways 11 and 17 (Sessional Paper No. P-169) Mr. Mantha.

Housing and shelter support in London (Sessional Paper No. P-179) Ms. Armstrong.

Transit infrastructure projects (Sessional Paper No. P-213) Mr. Baber, Ms. Hogarth, Ms. Kusendova and Mr. Sandhu.

Phone access for prisoners (Sessional Paper No. P-215) Ms. Berns-McGown and Mr. Harden.

Food Day Ontario (Sessional Paper No. P-220) Mr. Babikian and Mrs. Karahalios.

**PRIVATE MEMBERS' PUBLIC
BUSINESS**

**AFFAIRES D'INTÉRÊT PUBLIC
ÉMANANT DES DÉPUTÉES ET
DÉPUTÉS**

Ms. Park moved,

Private Members' Notice of Motion No. 91:-

M^{me} Park propose,

Avis de motion émanant des députées et députés n° 91 :-

That, in the opinion of this House, the Government of Ontario should include nuclear energy and the development of Small Modular Reactors as a clean energy option in its environment, climate change and clean energy planning and policies.

Debate arose and after some time,

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps,

Carried on the following division:-

Adoptée par le vote suivant :-

AYES / POUR - 59

Baber	Gill	McNaughton	Sarkaria
Babikian	Hardeman	Miller (Parry Sound—Muskoka)	Scott
Bailey	Harris	Mulroney	Skelly
Barrett	Hogarth	Nicholls	Smith (Peterborough—Kawartha)
Bethlenfalvy	Kanapathi	Oosterhoff	Surma
Bouma	Karahalios	Pang	Tangri
Calandra	Ke	Park	Thanigasalam
Cho (Scarborough North)	Khanjin	Parsa	Thompson
Cho (Willowdale)	Kusendova	Pettapiece	Tibollo
Clark	Lecce	Piccini	Triantafilopoulos
Coe	MacLeod	Rasheed	Wai
Crawford	Martin	Roberts	Walker
Cuzzeto	Martow	Romano	Wynne
Downey	McDonell	Sabawy	Yakabuski
Ghamari	McKenna	Sandhu	

NAYS / CONTRE - 18

Berns-McGown	Hassan	Sattler	Stevens
Bisson	Hatfield	Schreiner	Stiles
Bourgouin	Mamakwa	Shaw	Tabuns
Glover	Morrison	Singh (Brampton Centre)	Vanthof
Harden	Rakocevic		

Mr. Barrett moved,

Second Reading of Bill 166, An Act to amend the Great Lakes Protection Act, 2015.

Debate arose and after some time,

Carried.

Referred to the Standing Committee on Regulations and Private Bills.

M. Barrett propose,

Deuxième lecture du projet de loi 166, Loi modifiant la Loi de 2015 sur la protection des Grands Lacs.

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps,

Adoptée.

Renvoyé au Comité permanent des règlements et des projets de loi d'intérêt privé.

Mr. Hillier moved,

Private Members' Notice of Motion No. 93:-

M. Hillier propose,

Avis de motion émanant des députées et députés n° 93 :-

That, in the opinion of this House, the Standing Orders of the Legislative Assembly be amended to provide for the establishment of a Standing Committee on Indigenous Relations to investigate matters related to Indigenous affairs, address complaints and provide recommendations on Indigenous policy; and

That the membership of the Committee include members from all recognized parties, including Independent Members; and

That the Chair of the Committee shall not be a member of the governing party; and

That the Committee shall focus on specific issues of concern, including but not limited to:

1. Indigenous land claims;
2. Indigenous treaties;
3. Provision of provincial services on reserves;
4. Indigenous impact benefit agreements;
5. Development of resources on native lands;
6. Education and curriculum; and

That all Bills and regulations that affect Indigenous peoples be referred to this Committee; and

That the House is excluded from referring Bills at Second Reading that do not relate to Indigenous policy to the Committee; and

That the Committee shall be empowered to review and report to the House its observations, opinions and recommendations on any issues relating to Indigenous policy.

Debate arose and after some time,

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps,

Carried.

Adoptée.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Second Reading of Bill 159, An Act to amend various statutes in respect of consumer protection.

Debate arose and after some time the House adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

ORDRE DU JOUR

Deuxième lecture du projet de loi 159, Loi modifiant diverses lois en ce qui concerne la protection du consommateur.

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps, à 18 h, l'Assemblée a ajourné ses travaux.

le président

TED ARNOTT

Speaker

RESPONSES TO PETITIONS

Ontario Disability Support Program (Sessional Paper No. P-5):
(Tabled November 21, 2019) Miss Taylor.

911 Emergency response coverage (Sessional Paper No. P-72):
(Tabled November 21, 2019) M^{me} Gélinas.

Post secondary education (Sessional Paper No. P-130):
(Tabled November 21, 2019) Ms. Berns-McGown.

Animal welfare (Sessional Paper No. P-178):
(Tabled November 21, 2019) Ms. Hogarth.

RÉPONSES AUX PÉTITIONS