

Legislative
Assembly
of Ontario



Assemblée
législative
de l'Ontario

Votes and Proceedings

No. 55

Procès-verbaux

N° 55

2nd Session
41st Parliament

Tuesday
March 21, 2017

2^e session
41^e législature

Mardi
21 mars 2017

PRAYERS
9:00 A.M.

PRIÈRES
9 H

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Second Reading of Bill 96, An Act to enact the Human Trafficking Awareness Day Act, 2017 and the Prevention of and Remedies for Human Trafficking Act, 2017.

Debate arose and after some time the House recessed at 10:13 a.m.

ORDRE DU JOUR

Deuxième lecture du projet de loi 96, Loi édictant la Loi de 2017 sur la Journée de sensibilisation à la traite de personnes et la Loi de 2017 sur la prévention de la traite de personnes et les recours en la matière.

Il s'élève un débat et après quelque temps, à 10 h 13, la Chambre a suspendu la séance.

10:30 A.M.

10 H 30

The Speaker delivered the following ruling:-

Le Président a rendu la décision suivante :-

On March 20, 2017, the Member for Prince Edward—Hastings (Mr. Smith) gave written notice of his intention to raise a point of privilege with respect to certain answers by the Minister of Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs to the Member's written questions on the Order Paper. I am now prepared to rule on this matter without hearing further from the Member, as Standing Order 21(d) permits me to do.

According to the Member, the Minister's answers did not provide specific information, thereby obstructing the Member's ability to participate in a proceeding in Parliament on certain topics; moreover, the Member states that because the Minister declined to provide information that would instead only be given to officials of the municipalities affected by the government's decisions - effectively cutting him out of representing those municipalities, even though they are in his riding he has been obstructed in his ability to perform his parliamentary functions.

In response, let me say first that when the Member for Prince Edward—Hastings tabled his written questions and when the Minister answered them they were both carrying out a parliamentary responsibility. Second, it is a Minister's prerogative to answer written questions as the Minister sees fit; the Speaker does not review the adequacy of such answers. (On this point, please see the Speakers' rulings at page 61 of the *Journals* for March 15, 1935, page 194 of the *Journals* for November 4, 1980, and page 1604 of the *Hansard* for May 18, 2010.)

A Member may ask questions, but a Minister is not obliged to make a response that is entirely and always satisfactory to the Member. Let me equate this to the daily Question Period. I have reviewed the written answers to the Member's questions and am quite confident that if those were answers to oral questions in Question Period, those would have been perfectly orderly responses (though perhaps the Member might not have been satisfied with them, just as he is not satisfied with the written responses.) If the Speaker would have been procedurally unconcerned with the responses had they been made to an oral question, why ought the Speaker be procedurally concerned with the very same responses to written questions?

Now, more specifically on the issue of the Minister declining to disclose information to the Member and saying he would only do so with officials of a specific municipality, I have to say that there is nothing about the inherent status of a Member of Provincial Parliament that entitles a Member to private or proprietary information that any other third party would not be entitled to have. It is not a breach of a Member's privileges to have this kind of information withheld from them. While the House collectively could resolve to order production of such information, and the Minister would be compelled to provide it, no individual member has the authority to do so.

For the foregoing reasons, I find that a *prima facie* case of contempt has not been made out.

I thank the Member for raising his concern with me in the proper way.

ORAL QUESTIONS**QUESTIONS ORALES**

During “Oral Questions”, the Member for Prince Edward—Hastings (Mr. Smith), having disregarded the authority of the Chair, was named by the Speaker and directed to withdraw from the service of the House for the balance of the sessional day.

Pendant la période des « Questions orales », le député de Prince Edward—Hastings (M. Smith), ayant passé outre à l'autorité du Président, celui-ci l'a désigné par son nom et lui a ordonné de se retirer du service de l'Assemblée pour le reste de ce jour de session.

The House recessed at 11:49 a.m.

À 11 h 49, la Chambre a suspendu la séance.

3:00 P.M.

15 H

REPORTS BY COMMITTEES**RAPPORTS DES COMITÉS**

The Speaker informed the House,

Le Président a informé la Chambre,

That the Clerk received the Report on Intended Appointments dated March 21, 2017 of the Standing Committee on Government Agencies. Pursuant to Standing Order 108(f)(9), the Report is deemed to be adopted by the House (Sessional Paper No. 185).

Standing Committee on Public Accounts:-

Comité permanent comptes publiques :-

Report on Electricity Power System Planning (Section 3.05, 2015 Annual Report of the Office of the Auditor General) (Sessional Paper No. 186).

Rapport sur Planification du réseau d'électricité (Rapport annuel 2015 du Bureau de la vérificatrice générale de l'Ontario, section 3.05) (document parlementaire n°. 186).

Report presented and adoption of recommendations moved.

Rapport présenté et adoption des recommandations proposée.

Mr. Hardeman moved adjournment of the debate.

M. Hardeman propose l'ajournement du débat.

Carried.

Adoptée.

Standing Committee on General Government:-

Comité permanent des affaires gouvernementales :-

Bill 92, An Act to amend the School Boards Collective Bargaining Act, 2014 and make related amendments to other statutes.

Projet de loi 92, Loi modifiant la Loi de 2014 sur la négociation collective dans les conseils scolaires et apportant des modifications connexes à d'autres lois.

Reported as amended.

Rapport est fait du projet de loi modifié.

Pursuant to the Order of the House dated March 2, 2017,

Conformément à l'ordre de l'Assemblée du 2 mars 2017,

Ordered for Third Reading.

Ordonnée à la troisième lecture.

PETITIONS

Global adjustment (Sessional Paper No. P-8) Mr. McDonell.

Sale of Hydro One (Sessional Paper No. P-9) Mr. Hatfield.

Group Education Sessions (Sessional Paper No. P-22) Mr. McDonell.

Steps to reduce the cost of energy (Sessional Paper No. P-35) Mr. Hatfield.

Le prix de l'essence (document parlementaire n° P-37) M. Mantha.

Oral health services (Sessional Paper No. P-51) Ms. Hoggarth.

Rural public schools (Sessional Paper No. P-58) Mr. McDonell.

Rail line to city of Cambridge (Sessional Paper No. P-78) Mr. Potts.

Ontario Northland intercity transportation service (Sessional Paper No. P-103) M^{me} Gélinas.

À investir dans les équipes de collaboration interprofessionnelle en soins (document parlementaire n° P-131) M. Crack.

Timely and meaningful engagement with constituents (Sessional Paper No. P-154) Mr. Clark.

PÉTITIONS**ORDERS OF THE DAY**

Second Reading of Bill 68, An Act to amend various Acts in relation to municipalities.

Debate resumed and during the debate, the Member for Renfrew—Nipissing—Pembroke (Mr. Yakabuski), having disregarded the authority of the Chair, was named by the Acting Speaker (Mr. Nicholls) and directed to withdraw from the service of the House for the balance of the sessional day.

Debate resumed and after some time,

At 5:54 p.m., the following matters were considered in an adjournment debate.

Member for Whitby—Oshawa (Mr. Coe) to the Parliamentary Assistant to the Minister of Advanced Education and Skills Development – Skills mismatch.

Member for Nepean—Carleton (Ms. MacLeod) to the Minister of Energy – Greenhouse energy.

The House adjourned at 6:16 p.m.

ORDRE DU JOUR

Deuxième lecture du projet de loi 68, Loi modifiant diverses lois en ce qui concerne les municipalités.

Le débat a repris et pendant le débat, le député de Renfrew—Nipissing—Pembroke (M. Yakabuski), ayant passé outre à l'autorité du Président par intérim, M. Nicholls, celui-ci l'a désigné par son nom et lui a ordonné de se retirer du service de l'Assemblée pour le reste de ce jour de session.

Le débat a repris et après quelque temps,

À 17 h 54, les questions suivantes ont été examinées dans un débat d'ajournement.

À 17 h 54, les questions suivantes ont été examinées dans un débat d'ajournement.

À 17 h 54, les questions suivantes ont été examinées dans un débat d'ajournement.

À 18 h 16, la Chambre a ajourné ses travaux.

le président

DAVE LEVAC

Speaker

RESPONSES TO WRITTEN QUESTIONS**RÉPONSES AUX QUESTIONS ÉCRITES**

Final Answers to Question Numbers: 165, 173, 174 and 175.

RESPONSES TO PETITIONS**RÉPONSES AUX PÉTITIONS**

Certified Crop Advisors (Sessional Paper No. P-7):

(Tabled November 29, 2016) Ms. Thompson.

Institutional ice machines (Sessional Paper No. P-41):

(Tabled February 22, 2017) Mr. Bradley.

(Tabled November 29, 2016; February 21, 2017) Ms. Hoggarth.

Motorized snow vehicles and high rates of speed (Sessional Paper No. P-42):

(Tabled November 22, 2016) M^{me} Gélinas.

Home inspection industry (Sessional Paper No. P-53):

(Tabled November 22, 2016) Mr. Dickson.

(Tabled November 29, 2016) Mr. Milczyn.

Ontario Dementia Plan (Sessional Paper No. P-56):

(Tabled November 29, 2016) Mr. Hatfield.

(Tabled November 22, 2016) Mr. McDonell.

Continuous Glucose Monitors (Sessional Paper No. P-62):

(Tabled November 29; December 6, 2016) Mr. Clark.

Shale Beach (Sessional Paper No. P-66):

(Tabled November 22; December 6, 2016; February 21; March 7, 2017) Mr. Wilson.

Shingles Vaccine (Sessional Paper No. P-67):

(Tabled November 29, 2016) Mr. Hatfield.

Hazel McCallion Day Act, 2016 (Sessional Paper No. P-107):

(Tabled November 22, 2016) Mrs. Mangat.

Retirement homes, long-term care facilities (Sessional Paper No. P-108):

(Tabled November 22, 2016) Mr. Cho.

Family Responsibility Office (Sessional Paper No. P-114):

(Tabled November 28, 2016) Mr. Yurek.

Class Allocation System for Global Adjustment charges for non-profit associations (Sessional Paper No. P-116):

(Tabled November 29, 2016) Mr. Clark.

Déraillement d'un train CN près de Gogama (document parlementaire n° P-117):

(Déposée le 29 novembre 2016) M^{me} Gélinas.