



No. 33

N° 33

## **Votes and Proceedings**

Legislative Assembly  
of Ontario

## **Procès-verbaux**

Assemblée législative  
de l'Ontario

**Tuesday**  
**December 13, 2005**

Daytime Meeting - Sessional Day 47  
Evening Meeting - Sessional Day 48

**Mardi**  
**13 décembre 2005**

Séance de l'après-midi - jour de session 47  
Séance du soir – jour de session 48

**2<sup>nd</sup> Session,**  
**38<sup>th</sup> Parliament**

**2<sup>e</sup> session**  
**38<sup>e</sup> législature**

**PRAVERS  
1:30 P.M.**

Ms. Pupatello delivered to the Speaker a message from His Honour the Lieutenant Governor signed by his own hand, and the said message was read by the Speaker and is as follows:-

JAMES K. BARTLEMAN

The Lieutenant Governor transmits Estimates of certain sums required for the services of the Province for the year ending 31<sup>st</sup> March 2006 and recommends them to the Legislative Assembly.

Toronto, 13<sup>th</sup> December 2005.

(Sessional Paper No. 41, Assembly, Office of the; Auditor General, Office of the; Chief Election Officer, Office of the; Ombudsman Ontario.)

Ordered, That the message of the Lieutenant Governor together with the Estimates accompanying same be deemed to be referred to the Standing Committee on Estimates pursuant to Standing Order 58.

---

**INTRODUCTION OF BILLS**

The following Bill was introduced and read the first time:-

Bill 52, An Act to amend the Education Act respecting pupil learning to the age of 18 or equivalent learning and to make complementary amendments to the Highway Traffic Act. Hon. Mr. Kennedy.

Le lieutenant-gouverneur transmet les prévisions des dépenses visant les montants nécessaires au fonctionnement de la province pour l'exercice se terminant le 31 mars 2006 et les recommande à l'Assemblée législative.

Toronto, le 13 décembre 2005.

(Document parlementaire n° 41, Bureau de l'Assemblée législative; Bureau du vérificateur général; Bureau du directeur général des élections; Ombudsman Ontario.)

---

**DÉPÔT DES PROJETS DE LOI**

Le projet de loi suivant est présenté et lu une première fois :-

Projet de loi 52, Loi modifiant la Loi sur l'éducation concernant l'apprentissage des élèves jusqu'à l'âge de 18 ans et l'apprentissage équivalent et apportant des modifications complémentaires au Code de la route. L'hon. M. Kennedy.

---

**MOTIONS**

With unanimous consent, on motion by Mr. Bradley,

Ordered, That notwithstanding Standing Order 96(g), notice for ballot item 16 be waived.

---

**MOTIONS**

Avec le consentement unanime, sur la motion de M. Bradley,

On motion by Mr. Bradley,

Sur la motion de M. Bradley,

Ordered, That the following amendments be made to the membership of certain Committees:

On the Standing Committee on General Government:  
Ms. Horwath replaces Ms. Churley.

On the Standing Committee on Government Agencies:  
Mr. Bisson replaces Ms. Horwath.

On the Standing Committee on Regulations and Private Bills:  
Ms. Horwath replaces Ms. Churley.

**PRIÈRES  
13 H 30**

On motion by Mr. Bradley,

Sur la motion de M. Bradley,

Ordered, That the following committees be authorized to meet during the Winter Adjournment, in accordance with meeting dates as determined by the respective sub-committees, to examine and enquire into the following matters:

Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Affairs to consider matters relating to pre-budget consultations 2006;

Standing Committee on General Government to consider Bill 206, An Act to revise the Ontario Municipal Employees Retirement System Act, upon its referral from the House;

Standing Committee on Justice Policy to consider Bill 21, An Act to enact the Energy Conservation Leadership Act, 2005 and to amend the Electricity Act, 1998, the Ontario Energy Board Act, 1998 and the Conservation Authorities Act, upon its referral from the House;

and,

Standing Committee on Social Policy to consider Bill 36, An Act to provide for the integration of the local system for the delivery of health services.

And that the committees be authorized to release their reports during the Winter Adjournment by depositing a copy of any report with the Clerk of the Assembly, and upon the resumption of the meetings of the House the Chairs of such committees shall bring any such reports before the House in accordance with the Standing Orders.

Mr. Bradley moved,

M. Bradley propose,

That pursuant to Standing Order 9(c)(i), the House shall meet from 6:45 p.m. to 9:30 p.m. on Tuesday, December 13, 2005, for the purpose of considering government business..

The question being put on the motion, it was carried on the following division:-

La motion, mise aux voix, est adoptée par le vote suivant :-

#### AYES / POUR - 67

Arnott	Craitor	Lalonde	Mossop	Sandals
Arthurs	Delaney	Leal	Munro	Scott
Balkisoon	Dombrowsky	Levac	O'Toole	Sergio
Barrett	Duguid	Marsales	Ouellette	Smith
Bentley	Flynn	Martiniuk	Peters	Tascona
Berardinetti	Gerretsen	Matthews	Peterson	Tory
Bradley	Gravelle	Mauro	Pupatello	Van Bommel
Broten	Hardeman	McMeekin	Qaadri	Watson
Brownell	Hoy	McNeely	Racco	Wilkinson
Cansfield	Jeffrey	Meilleur	Ramsay	Witmer
Caplan	Kennedy	Miller	Rinaldi	Wong
Chambers	Klees	Milloy	Runciman	Yakabuski
Chudleigh	Kular	Mitchell	Ruprecht	Zimmer
Colle	Kwinter			

#### NAYS / CONTRE - 6

Bisson	Kormos	Marchese	Murdoch	Pruie
Horwath				

## DEFERRED VOTES

The deferred vote on the motion for Second Reading of Bill 21, An Act to enact the Energy Conservation Leadership Act, 2005 and to amend the Electricity Act, 1998, the Ontario Energy Board Act, 1998 and the Conservation Authorities Act, was carried on the following division:-

## VOTES DIFFÉRÉS

La motion portant deuxième lecture du projet de loi 21, Loi édictant la Loi de 2005 sur le leadership en matière de conservation de l'énergie et apportant des modifications à la Loi de 1998 sur l'électricité, à la Loi de 1998 sur la Commission de l'énergie de l'Ontario et à la Loi sur les offices de protection de la nature, mise aux voix sur le vote différé, est adoptée par le vote suivant:-

### AYES / POUR - 54

Arthur	Colle	Kennedy	Meilleur	Rinaldi
Balkisoon	Cordiano	Kular	Milloy	Ruprecht
Bartolucci	Craitor	Kwinter	Mitchell	Sandals
Bentley	Delaney	Lalonde	Mossop	Sergio
Berardinetti	Dombrowsky	Leal	Patten	Smith
Bradley	Duguid	Levac	Peters	Takhar
Brownell	Flynn	Marsales	Phillips	Van Bommel
Bryant	Gerretsen	Matthews	Pupatello	Watson
Cansfield	Gravelle	Mauro	Racco	Wilkinson
Caplan	Hoy	McMeekin	Ramal	Zimmer
Chambers	Jeffrey	McNeely	Ramsay	

### NAYS / CONTRE - 25

Arnott	Hardeman	Marchese	O'Toole	Sterling
Barrett	Horwath	Martiniuk	Ouellette	Tascona
Bisson	Jackson	Miller	Prue	Tory
Chudleigh	Klees	Munro	Runciman	Witmer
Hampton	Kormos	Murdoch	Scott	Yakabuski

And the Bill was accordingly read the second time and Ordered referred to the Standing Committee on Justice Policy.

En conséquence, ce projet de loi est lu une deuxième fois et renvoyé au Comité permanent de la justice.

---

The deferred vote on the motion for Third Reading of Bill 214, An Act to amend the Election Act, the Election Finances Act and the Legislative Assembly Act, to repeal the Representation Act, 1996 and to enact the Representation Act, 2005, was carried on the following division:-

La motion portant troisième lecture du projet de loi 214, Loi modifiant la Loi électorale, la Loi sur le financement des élections et la Loi sur l'Assemblée législative, abrogeant la Loi de 1996 sur la représentation électorale et édictant la Loi de 2005 sur la représentation électorale, mise aux voix sur le vote différé, est adoptée par le vote suivant:-

### AYES / POUR - 60

Arthur	Colle	Jeffrey	McNeely	Ramal
Balkisoon	Cordiano	Kennedy	Meilleur	Ramsay
Bartolucci	Craitor	Kular	Milloy	Rinaldi
Bentley	Delaney	Kwinter	Mitchell	Ruprecht
Berardinetti	Dombrowsky	Lalonde	Mossop	Sandals
Bisson	Duguid	Leal	Patten	Sergio
Bradley	Flynn	Levac	Peters	Smith

## AYES / POUR - Continued

Brownell	Gerretsen	Marchese	Peterson	Takhar
Bryant	Gravelle	Marsales	Phillips	Van Bommel
Cansfield	Hampton	Matthews	Prue	Watson
Caplan	Horwath	Mauro	Pupatello	Wilkinson
Chambers	Hoy	McMeekin	Racco	Zimmer

## NAYS / CONTRE - 19

Arnett	Jackson	Munro	Runciman	Tory
Barrett	Klees	Murdoch	Scott	Witmer
Chudleigh	Martiniuk	O'Toole	Sterling	Yakabuski
Hardeman	Miller	Ouellette	Tascona	

And the Bill was accordingly read the third time and was passed.

En conséquence, ce projet de loi est lu une troisième fois et adopté.

**PETITIONS****PÉTITIONS**

Petition relating to providing access to Velcade and other intravenous cancer chemotherapy drugs (Sessional Paper No. P-7) Mr. Ruprecht.

Petition relating to funding to community agencies to ensure quality support and services to people who have an intellectual disability (Sessional Paper No. P-15) Mr. Wong.

Petition relating to amending the Limitation Act, 2002, to provide an exemption for victims of wrongdoing claims of financial services (Sessional Paper No. P-64) Mr. Tascona.

Petition relating to the practical examination for the handling of firearms as part of the Hunter Education Safety Course for Ontarians (Sessional Paper No. P-101) Mr. Miller.

---

At 4:00 p.m., pursuant to Standing Order 30(b), the Speaker interrupted the proceedings and called Orders of the Day.

À 16 heures, conformément à l'article 30 b) du Règlement, le Président interrompt les délibérations et passe à l'ordre du jour.

**ORDERS OF THE DAY****ORDRE DU JOUR**

Debate was resumed on the motion for Second Reading of Bill 206, An Act to revise the Ontario Municipal Employees Retirement System Act.

Le débat reprend sur la motion portant deuxième lecture du projet de loi 206, Loi révisant la Loi sur le régime de retraite des employés municipaux de l'Ontario.

After some time, the motion was declared carried and the Bill was accordingly read the second time and Ordered referred to the Standing Committee on General Government.

Après quelque temps, la motion est déclarée adoptée et en conséquence, ce projet de loi est lu une deuxième fois et renvoyé au Comité permanent des affaires gouvernementales.

---

At 6:00 p.m., the question "That this House do now adjourn" was deemed to have been proposed pursuant to Standing Order 37(b).

À 18 h, la motion portant «Que la présente Assemblée ajourne les débats maintenant» est réputée avoir été proposée conformément à l'article 37(b) du Règlement.

After three matters were considered, the question was deemed to have been adopted.

Après l'étude de trois questions, la motion d'ajournement des débats est réputée avoir été adoptée.

---

The House then adjourned at 6:30 p.m.

---

À 18 h 30, la chambre a ensuite ajourné ses travaux.

---

**6:45 P.M.**

#### **ORDERS OF THE DAY**

A debate arose on the motion for Third Reading of Bill 18, An Act to implement 2005 Budget measures and amend various Acts.

After some time, the question having been put, the Acting Speaker (Mr. Arnott) declared his opinion that the Ayes had it, and a recorded vote having been demanded,

The Acting Speaker directed that the Members be called in, for which purpose the division bells were rung.

During the ringing of the bells, the Acting Speaker addressed the House as follows:-

I have received a request from the Chief Government Whip, under Standing Order 28(h), that the vote on the motion for Third Reading of Bill 18, An Act to implement 2005 Budget measures and amend various Acts, be deferred until December 14, 2005.

Therefore the vote is accordingly deferred.

---

With unanimous consent, on motion by Mr. Bradley,

Ordered, That notwithstanding any Standing Order, Government Orders 5 through 16, inclusive, and Government Notice of Motion number 56, may be called concurrently; and

That when such Orders are called, time shall be allotted until 9:20 p.m. for concurrent consideration in a single debate of all of these Orders, which time shall be divided equally among the Recognized Parties; and

That at the conclusion of the debate the Speaker shall put every question necessary to dispose of the Order for Concurrence in Supply for each of the ministries named in Government Orders 5 through 16, inclusive, and to dispose of Government Notice of Motion number 56.

---

**18 H 45**

#### **ORDRE DU JOUR**

Il s'élève un débat sur la motion portant troisième lecture du projet de loi 18, Loi mettant en oeuvre certaines mesures énoncées dans le Budget de 2005 et modifiant diverses lois.

Après quelque temps, la motion mise aux voix, le président par intérim, M. Arnott déclare qu'à son avis les voix favorables l'emportent et un vote par appel nominal a été demandé.

Le Président par intérim donne des directives pour convoquer les députés et la sonnerie d'appel se fait entendre.

Pendant la sonnerie d'appel, le Président par intérim s'adresse à l'Assemblée en ces mots:-

J'ai reçu une requête du Whip en chef du gouvernement, conformément à l'article 28 h) du Règlement, que le vote sur la motion portant troisième lecture du projet de loi 18, Loi mettant en oeuvre certaines mesures énoncées dans le Budget de 2005 et modifiant diverses lois, soit différé jusqu'au 14 décembre 2005.

En conséquence, le vote est différé.

A debate arose on the Orders for Concurrence in Supply for the following ministries:-

Ministry of Public Infrastructure Renewal;

Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care;

Ministry of Children and Youth Services;

Ministry of Natural Resources;

Ministry of Training, College and Universities;

Ministry of Citizenship and Immigration;

Ministry of Agriculture and Food;

Ministry of Transportation;

Ministry of Education;

Ministry of Energy;

Ministry of Tourism and Recreation;

Ministry of Northern Development and Mines

And, on the motion by Mr. Duncan,

That the Minister of Finance be authorized to pay the salaries of the civil servants and other necessary payments pending the voting of supply for the period commencing January 1, 2006 and ending June 30, 2006.

Payments for the period January 1, 2006 to March 31, 2006 to be charged to the proper appropriation following the voting of supply for the 2005/06 fiscal year and payments for the period April 1, 2006 to June 30, 2006 to be charged to the proper appropriation following the voting of supply for the 2006/07 fiscal year.

After some time, the question having been put on the Order for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Public Infrastructure Renewal, it was declared carried.

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

The question having been put on the Order for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care, it was declared carried.

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

Il s'élève un débat sur les ordres d'adoption des budgets des dépenses des ministères suivants:-

Ministère du Renouvellement de l'infrastructure publique ;

Ministère de la Santé et des Soins de longue durée ;

Ministère des Services à l'enfance et à la jeunesse ;

Ministère des Richesses naturelles ;

Ministère de la Formation, Collèges et Universités ;

Ministère des Affaires civiques et Immigration ;

Ministère de l'Agriculture et de l'Alimentation ;

Ministère des Transports ;

Ministère de l'Éducation ;

Ministère de l'Énergie ;

Ministère du Tourisme et des Loisirs ;

Ministère du Développement du Nord et des Mines;

Après quelques temps, la motion portant sur l'ordre d'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère du Renouvellement de l'infrastructure publique, mise aux voix, est déclarée adoptée.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

---

La motion portant sur l'ordre d'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère de la Santé et des Soins de longue durée, mise aux voix, est déclarée adoptée.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

The question having been put on the Order for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Children and Youth Services, it was declared carried.

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

---

The question having been put on the Order for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Natural Resources, it was declared carried.

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

---

The question having been put on the Order for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Training, College and Universities, it was declared carried.

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

---

The question having been put on the Order for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Citizenship and Immigration, it was declared carried.

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

---

The question having been put on the Order for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Agriculture and Food, it was declared carried.

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

---

The question having been put on the Order for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Transportation, it was declared carried.

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

---

La motion portant sur l'ordre d'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère des Services à l'enfance et à la jeunesse, mise aux voix, est déclarée adoptée.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

---

La motion portant sur l'ordre d'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère des Richesses naturelles, mise aux voix, est déclarée adoptée.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

---

La motion portant sur l'ordre d'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère de la Formation, Collèges et Universités, mise aux voix, est déclarée adoptée.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

---

La motion portant sur l'ordre d'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère des Affaires civiques et Immigration, mise aux voix, est déclarée adoptée.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

---

La motion portant sur l'ordre d'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère de l'Agriculture et de l'Alimentation, mise aux voix, est déclarée adoptée.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

---

La motion portant sur l'ordre d'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère des Transports, mise aux voix, est déclarée adoptée.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

---

The question having been put on the Order for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Education, it was declared carried.

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

The question having been put on the Order for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Energy, it was declared carried.

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

The question having been put on the Order for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Tourism and Recreation, it was declared carried.

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

The question having been put on the Order for Concurrence in Supply for the Ministry of Northern Development and Mines, it was declared carried.

And Supply was accordingly concurred in.

The question having been put on Government Notice of Motion number 56, it was declared carried,

And it was,

Resolved, that the Minister of Finance be authorized to pay the salaries of the civil servants and other necessary payments pending the voting of supply for the period commencing January 1, 2006 and ending June 30, 2006.

Payments for the period January 1, 2006 to March 31, 2006 to be charged to the proper appropriation following the voting of supply for the 2005/06 fiscal year and payments for the period April 1, 2006 to June 30, 2006 to be charged to the proper appropriation following the voting of supply for the 2006/07 fiscal year.

Mr. Bradley moved, That the House do now adjourn.

The question, having been put on the motion, was declared carried.

La motion portant sur l'ordre d'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère de l'Éducation, mise aux voix, est déclarée adoptée.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

La motion portant sur l'ordre d'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère de l'Énergie, mise aux voix, est déclarée adoptée.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

La motion portant sur l'ordre d'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère du Tourisme et des Loisirs, mise aux voix, est déclarée adoptée.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

La motion portant sur l'ordre d'adoption du budget des dépenses du ministère du Développement du Nord et des Mines, mise aux voix, est déclarée adoptée.

En conséquence, le budget des dépenses est adopté.

M. Bradley propose que l'Assemblée ajourne les débats maintenant.

Cette motion, mise aux voix, est déclarée adoptée.

The House then adjourned at 8:55 p.m.

À 20 h 55, la chambre a ensuite ajourné ses travaux.

---

le président

**MIKE BROWN**

Speaker

---

#### **PETITIONS TABLED PURSUANT TO STANDING ORDER 38(a)**

Petition relating to rescinding the Joint Board's decision approving the applications of Dufferin Aggregates to expand its mining license (Sessional Paper No. P-81) Mr. Flynn.

---

**SESSIONAL PAPERS PRESENTED  
PURSUANT TO STANDING ORDER 39(a)**

**DOCUMENTS PARLEMENTAIRES  
DÉPOSÉS CONFORMÉMENT À L'ARTICLE  
39(a) DU RÈGLEMENT**

COMPENDIA:

Bill 52, An Act to amend the Education Act respecting pupil learning to the age of 18 or equivalent learning and to make complementary amendments to the Highway Traffic Act (No. 40)

**QUESTIONS ANSWERED (SEE SESSIONAL PAPER NO. 5):-**

Final Answers to Question Numbers: 3, 25, 26, and 27.

---

**RESPONSES TO PETITIONS**

Petition relating to ensuring the re-development of Highway 26 is completed immediately (Sessional Paper No. P-12):

(Tabled October 17, 2005) Mr. Wilson.

(Tabled October 19, 2005) Mr. Wilson.

Petition relating to disabled person parking permits (Sessional Paper No. P-29):

(Tabled October 20, 2005) Mr. Prue.

---

**RÉPONSES AUX PÉTITIONS**