



No. 147

N° 147

---

## Votes and Proceedings

## Procès-verbaux

Legislative Assembly  
of Ontario

Assemblée législative  
de l'Ontario

**Tuesday**  
**May 17, 2005**

**Mardi**  
**17 mai 2005**

Daytime Meeting - Sessional Day 211

Séance de l'après-midi - jour de session 211

**1<sup>st</sup> Session,**  
**38<sup>th</sup> Parliament**

**1<sup>re</sup> session**  
**38<sup>e</sup> législature**

---

**PRAYERS  
1:30 P.M.**

**PRIÈRES  
13 H 30**

**REPORTS BY COMMITTEES**

Mrs. Jeffrey from the Standing Committee on General Government presented the Committee's Report which was read as follows and adopted:-

Your Committee begs to report the following Bill as amended:-

Bill 155, An Act to amend the Family Responsibility and Support Arrears Enforcement Act, 1996 and to make consequential amendments to the Fish and Wildlife Conservation Act, 1997.

Ordered for Third Reading.

**RAPPORTS DES COMITÉS**

M<sup>me</sup> Jeffrey du Comité permanent des affaires gouvernementales présente le rapport du comité qui est lu comme suit et adopté:-

Votre comité propose qu'il soit permis de faire rapport sur le projet de loi suivant avec des amendements:-

Projet de loi 155, Loi modifiant la Loi de 1996 sur les obligations familiales et l'exécution des arriérés d'aliments et apportant des modifications corrélatives à la Loi de 1997 sur la protection du poisson et de la faune.

Ordonné pour la troisième lecture.

**INTRODUCTION OF BILLS**

The following Bills were introduced and read the first time:-

Bill 200, An Act to amend the Greenbelt Act, 2005 by establishing the Niagara Greenbelt Advisory Committee and the Holland Marsh Greenbelt Advisory Committee. Mr. Hudak.

Bill 201, An Act to amend the Health Insurance Act. Mr. Mauro.

**DÉPÔT DES PROJETS DE LOI**

Les projets de loi suivants sont présentés et lus une première fois:-

Projet de loi 200, Loi modifiant la Loi de 2005 sur la ceinture de verdure en créant le Comité consultatif de la ceinture de verdure du Niagara et le Comité consultatif de la ceinture de verdure du marais Holland. M. Hudak.

Projet de loi 201, Loi modifiant la Loi sur l'assurance-santé. M. Mauro.

**MOTIONS**

Mr. Duncan moved,

That pursuant to Standing Order 9(c)(i), the House shall meet from 6:45 p.m. to 9:30 p.m. on Tuesday, May 17, 2005, for the purpose of considering government business.

The question being put on the motion, it was carried on the following division:-

**MOTIONS**

M. Duncan propose,

La motion, mise aux voix, est adoptée par le vote suivant:-

**AYES / POUR - 52**

Arthurs	Colle	Gravelle	Mitchell	Ramsay
Bartolucci	Cordiano	Hoy	Mossop	Rinaldi
Bentley	Craitor	Jeffrey	Oraziotti	Smith
Berardinetti	Crozier	Kennedy	Peters	Smitherman
Bountrogianni	Delaney	Lalonde	Peterson	Van Bommel
Bradley	Di Cocco	Levac	Phillips	Watson
Brotten	Dombrowsky	Marsales	Pupatello	Wilkinson
Brownell	Duguid	Mauro	Qaadri	Wong
Bryant	Duncan	Meilleur	Racco	Wynne
Caplan	Fonseca	Milloy	Ramal	Zimmer
Chambers	Gerretsen			

## NAYS / CONTRE - 27

Arnott	Hardeman	Marchese	O'Toole	Tascona
Baird	Horwath	Martel	Ouellette	Tory
Barrett	Hudak	Martiniuk	Prue	Wilson
Bisson	Jackson	Miller	Runciman	Witmer
Chudleigh	Klees	Murdoch	Scott	Yakabuski
Dunlop	Kormos			

Mr. Duncan moved,

M. Duncan propose,

That pursuant to Standing Order 9(c)(i), the House shall meet from 6:45 p.m. to 9:30 p.m. on Wednesday, May 18, 2005, for the purpose of considering government business.

The question being put on the motion, it was carried on the following division:-

La motion, mise aux voix, est adoptée par le vote suivant:-

## AYES / POUR - 56

Arthurs	Colle	Gravelle	Milloy	Ramsay
Bartolucci	Cordiano	Hoy	Mitchell	Rinaldi
Bentley	Craiton	Jeffrey	Mossop	Smith
Berardinetti	Crozier	Kennedy	Oraziotti	Smitherman
Bountrogianni	Delaney	Kwinter	Patten	Sorbara
Bradley	Di Cocco	Lalonde	Peters	Takhar
Brotten	Dombrowsky	Leal	Peterson	Van Bommel
Brown	Duguid	Levac	Phillips	Watson
Brownell	Duncan	Marsales	Pupatello	Wilkinson
Bryant	Fonseca	Mauro	Qaadri	Wong
Caplan	Gerretsen	Meilleur	Ramal	Wynne
Chambers				

## NAYS / CONTRE - 28

Arnott	Hardeman	Marchese	O'Toole	Tascona
Baird	Horwath	Martel	Ouellette	Tory
Barrett	Hudak	Martiniuk	Prue	Wilson
Bisson	Jackson	Miller	Runciman	Witmer
Chudleigh	Klees	Munro	Scott	Yakabuski
Dunlop	Kormos	Murdoch		

Mr. Duncan moved,

M. Duncan propose,

That pursuant to Standing Order 9(c)(i), the House shall meet from 6:45 p.m. to 9:30 p.m. on Thursday, May 19, 2005, for the purpose of considering government business.

The question being put on the motion, it was carried on the following division:-

La motion, mise aux voix, est adoptée par le vote suivant:-

## AYES / POUR - 62

Arthurs	Colle	Jeffrey	Mossop	Rinaldi
Bartolucci	Cordiano	Kennedy	Oraziotti	Sandals
Bentley	Craiton	Kwinter	Parsons	Smith
Berardinetti	Crozier	Lalonde	Patten	Smitherman
Bountrogianni	Delaney	Leal	Peters	Sorbara
Bradley	Di Cocco	Levac	Peterson	Takhar
Brotten	Dombrowsky	Marsales	Phillips	Van Bommel
Brown	Duguid	Mauro	Pupatello	Watson

## AYES / POUR - Continued

Brownell	Duncan	McMeekin	Qaadri	Wilkinson
Bryant	Fonseca	Meilleur	Racco	Wong
Cansfield	Gerretsen	Milloy	Ramal	Wynne
Caplan	Gravelle	Mitchell	Ramsay	Zimmer
Chambers	Hoy			

## NAYS / CONTRE - 29

Arnott	Dunlop	Kormos	Murdoch	Tascona
Baird	Hardeman	Marchese	O'Toole	Tory
Barrett	Horwath	Martel	Ouellette	Wilson
Bisson	Hudak	Martiniuk	Prue	Witmer
Chudleigh	Jackson	Miller	Runciman	Yakabuski
Churley	Klees	Munro	Scott	

---

The Speaker recessed the House for 5 minutes.

Le Président ordonne une pause de 5 minutes à l'Assemblée.

---

**PETITIONS**

Petition relating to consulting with farmers to develop a long-term strategy to ensure the viability of agriculture in Ontario (Sessional Paper No. P-243) Mr. Hardeman.

Petition relating to enforcing environmental rules and other actions to halt all noxious emissions and odours from the Halton Recycling Plant (Sessional Paper No. P-274) Mrs. Munro.

Petition relating to bed count at the Credit Valley hospital (Sessional Paper No. P-278) Mr. Delaney.

Petition relating to enacting Bill 164 and banning smoking in public places in Ontario (Sessional Paper No. P-287) Mr. Delaney.

Petition relating to the re-development of Highway 26 (Sessional Paper No. P-294) Mr. Wilson.

Petition relating to the recruitment and retention of physicians in Haliburton-Victoria-Brock (Sessional Paper No. P-295) Ms. Scott.

Petition relating to penalties under the Highway Traffic Act for drivers involved in fatal accidents (Sessional Paper No. P-296) Mr. Brown.

---

At 4:00 p.m., pursuant to Standing Order 30(b), the Speaker interrupted the proceedings and called Orders of the Day.

À 16 heures, conformément à l'article 30(b) du Règlement, le Président interrompt les délibérations et passe à l'ordre du jour.

---

**ORDERS OF THE DAY**

Debate was resumed on the Amendment to the motion that this House approves in general the Budgetary Policy of the Government.

After some time,

Mr. Baird moved that the Amendment to the motion be amended by adding, after the word "jeopardy" in the third paragraph, the words:

**ORDRE DU JOUR**

Le débat reprend sur l'amendement à la motion portant que la présente Assemblée adopte en général la politique budgétaire du gouvernement.

Après quelque temps,

“including the grossly inadequate funding last year to the Queensway-Carleton Hospital and the Ottawa Hospital”.

After some time, Mr. Baird moved the adjournment of the debate, which motion was lost on the following division:-

AYES - 18 NAYS - 58

The debate continued and, after some time, Mr. Baird moved the adjournment of the House, which motion was lost on the following division:-

AYES - 18 NAYS - 61

Après quelque temps, M. Baird propose l'ajournement du débat et cette motion est rejetée par le vote suivant:-

POUR - 18 CONTRE - 58

Le débat se poursuit et après quelque temps, M. Baird propose l'ajournement des débats de l'Assemblée et cette motion est rejetée par le vote suivant:-

POUR - 18 CONTRE - 61

After some time, the Amendment to the Amendment to the motion having been put, was lost on the following division:-

AYES / POUR - 18

Baird	Hudak	Munro	Scott	Tory
Barrett	Jackson	Murdoch	Sterling	Wilson
Chudleigh	Martiniuk	O'Toole	Tascona	Yakabuski
Dunlop	Miller	Runciman		

NAYS / CONTRE - 63

Arthurs	Colle	Jeffrey	Mossop	Sandals
Bartolucci	Cordiano	Kennedy	Oraziotti	Sergio
Bentley	Craitor	Kular	Parsons	Smith
Berardinetti	Crozier	Lalonde	Patten	Smitherman
Bountrogianni	Delaney	Leal	Peters	Sorbara
Bradley	Dhillon	Levac	Peterson	Takhar
Brotten	Di Cocco	Marsales	Pupatello	Van Bommel
Brown	Dombrowsky	Mauro	Qaadri	Watson
Brownell	Duguid	McMeekin	Racco	Wilkinson
Bryant	Duncan	McNeely	Ramal	Wong
Cansfield	Fonseca	Meilleur	Ramsay	Wynne
Caplan	Gerretsen	Milloy	Rinaldi	Zimmer
Chambers	Hoy	Mitchell		

The Amendment to the motion as follows:-

That the motion moved by the Minister of Finance on May 11, 2005: “That the House approves in general the budgetary policy of this government” be amended by deleting the words after “That this House” and adding thereto the following:

“Recognize that this budget is the latest in a series of ever-changing fiscal plans and that:

The government has provided inadequate support to Ontario’s hospitals, putting timely access to care in jeopardy;

The government is failing Ontario’s farmers by cutting funding by 23.1% this year, on top of the 20% budget cut last year;

That the government has laid out no specific plan for meeting Ontario’s infrastructure needs, and has not explicitly budgeted for those needs;

That taxpayers will pay double the amount in health taxes this year, despite a promise by the Premier not to raise taxes at all;

That the government has done little to nothing specific to meaningfully attack waste and mismanagement in the government on a budget of \$80 billion; and

That these failures, these broken promises, these high taxes, high deficits, wasteful spending and burdensome regulations will harm Ontario's economy and create a climate which will discourage investment and jobs in Ontario.

Therefore, this House has lost confidence in this government.”

having been put, was lost on the following division:-

#### AYES / POUR - 18

Baird	Hudak	Munro	Scott	Tory
Barrett	Jackson	Murdoch	Sterling	Wilson
Chudleigh	Martiniuk	O'Toole	Tascona	Yakabuski
Dunlop	Miller	Runciman		

#### NAYS / CONTRE - 65

Arthurs	Colle	Jeffrey	Mitchell	Rinaldi
Bartolucci	Cordiano	Kennedy	Mossop	Sandals
Bentley	Craitor	Kular	Oraziotti	Sergio
Berardinetti	Crozier	Lalonde	Parsons	Smith
Bountrogianni	Delaney	Leal	Patten	Smitherman
Bradley	Dhillon	Levac	Peters	Sorbara
Brotten	Di Cocco	Marsales	Peterson	Takhar
Brown	Dombrowsky	Mauro	Phillips	Van Bommel
Brownell	Duguid	McGuinty	Pupatello	Watson
Bryant	Duncan	McMeekin	Qaadri	Wilkinson
Cansfield	Fonseca	McNeely	Racco	Wong
Caplan	Gerretsen	Meilleur	Ramal	Wynne
Chambers	Hoy	Milloy	Ramsay	Zimmer

The Main motion having been put was carried on the following division:-

#### AYES / POUR - 64

Arthurs	Colle	Jeffrey	Mitchell	Rinaldi
Bartolucci	Cordiano	Kennedy	Mossop	Sandals
Bentley	Craitor	Kular	Oraziotti	Sergio
Berardinetti	Crozier	Lalonde	Parsons	Smith
Bountrogianni	Delaney	Leal	Patten	Smitherman
Bradley	Dhillon	Levac	Peters	Sorbara
Brotten	Di Cocco	Marsales	Peterson	Takhar
Brown	Dombrowsky	Mauro	Phillips	Watson
Brownell	Duguid	McGuinty	Pupatello	Wilkinson
Bryant	Duncan	McMeekin	Qaadri	Wong
Cansfield	Fonseca	McNeely	Racco	Wynne
Caplan	Gerretsen	Meilleur	Ramal	Zimmer
Chambers	Hoy	Milloy	Ramsay	

## NAYS / CONTRE - 23

Baird	Horwath	Martiniuk	Prue	Tascona
Barrett	Hudak	Miller	Runciman	Tory
Bisson	Jackson	Munro	Scott	Wilson
Chudleigh	Kormos	Murdoch	Sterling	Yakabuski
Dunlop	Martel	O'Toole		

And it was,

Resolved, That this House approves in general the Budgetary Policy of the Government.

The House then adjourned at 7: 05 p.m.

À 19 h 05, la chambre a ensuite ajourné ses travaux.

---

le président

**ALVIN CURLING**

Speaker

**SESSIONAL PAPERS PRESENTED  
PURSUANT TO STANDING ORDER 39(a)**

**DOCUMENTS PARLEMENTAIRES  
DÉPOSÉS CONFORMÉMENT À L'ARTICLE  
39(a) DU RÈGLEMENT**

**QUESTIONS ANSWERED (SEE SESSIONAL PAPER NO. 5):-**

Final Answers to Question Numbers: 173 and 190.

---

**RESPONSES TO PETITIONS**

**RÉPONSES AUX PÉTITIONS**

Petition relating to more funding for rural hospitals in Grey-Bruce (Sessional Paper No. P-224).

(Tabled February 16, 2005) Mr. Murdoch.

Petition relating to consulting with farmers to develop a long-term strategy to ensure the viability of agriculture in Ontario (Sessional Paper No. P-243).

(Tabled April 12, 2005) Mr. Barrett.

Petition relating to postponing renovations to the Windsor Casino (Sessional Paper No. P-266).

(Tabled April 5, 2005) Mr. O'Toole.

---