

Legislative  
Assembly  
of Ontario



Assemblée  
législative  
de l'Ontario

---

**Official Report  
of Debates  
(Hansard)**

No. 62B

**Journal  
des débats  
(Hansard)**

N° 62B

1<sup>st</sup> Session  
43<sup>rd</sup> Parliament

Tuesday  
4 April 2023

1<sup>re</sup> session  
43<sup>e</sup> législature

Mardi  
4 avril 2023

---

Speaker: Honourable Ted Arnott  
Clerk: Todd Decker

Président : L'honorable Ted Arnott  
Greffier : Todd Decker

### **Hansard on the Internet**

Hansard and other documents of the Legislative Assembly can be on your personal computer within hours after each sitting. The address is:

<https://www.ola.org/>

### **Index inquiries**

Reference to a cumulative index of previous issues may be obtained by calling the Hansard Reporting Service indexing staff at 416-325-7400.

### **Le Journal des débats sur Internet**

L'adresse pour faire paraître sur votre ordinateur personnel le Journal et d'autres documents de l'Assemblée législative en quelques heures seulement après la séance est :

### **Renseignements sur l'index**

Adressez vos questions portant sur des numéros précédents du Journal des débats au personnel de l'index, qui vous fourniront des références aux pages dans l'index cumulatif, en composant le 416-325-7400.

---

House Publications and Language Services  
Room 500, West Wing, Legislative Building  
111 Wellesley Street West, Queen's Park  
Toronto ON M7A 1A2  
Telephone 416-325-7400  
Published by the Legislative Assembly of Ontario



Service linguistique et des publications parlementaires  
Salle 500, aile ouest, Édifice du Parlement  
111, rue Wellesley ouest, Queen's Park  
Toronto ON M7A 1A2  
Téléphone, 416-325-7400  
Publié par l'Assemblée législative de l'Ontario

ISSN 1180-2987

## **CONTENTS / TABLE DES MATIÈRES**

**Tuesday 4 April 2023 / Mardi 4 avril 2023**

### **PRIVATE MEMBERS' PUBLIC BUSINESS / AFFAIRES D'INTÉRÊT PUBLIC ÉMANANT DES DÉPUTÉES ET DÉPUTÉS**

#### **Enhancing Public Transit Accessibility Act, 2023, Bill 82, Ms. Begum / Loi de 2023 sur l'amélioration de l'accessibilité des transports en commun, projet de loi 82, Mme Begum**

Ms. Doly Begum.....	3407
Mrs. Daisy Wai.....	3409
Ms. Jessica Bell .....	3410
MPP Lise Vaugeois .....	3410
Mr. Joel Harden .....	3411
Ms. Doly Begum.....	3412
Second reading vote deferred .....	3412



LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY  
OF ONTARIO

Tuesday 4 April 2023

ASSEMBLÉE LÉGISLATIVE  
DE L'ONTARIO

Mardi 4 avril 2023

*Report continued from volume A.*  
1756

PRIVATE MEMBERS'  
PUBLIC BUSINESS

ENHANCING PUBLIC TRANSIT  
ACCESSIBILITY ACT, 2023

LOI DE 2023 SUR  
L'AMÉLIORATION DE L'ACCESSIBILITÉ  
DES TRANSPORTS EN COMMUN

Ms. Begum moved second reading of the following bill:  
Bill 82, An Act respecting accessible public transit /  
Projet de loi 82, Loi concernant des transports en commun  
accessibles.

**The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard):** Pursuant to standing order 100, the member has 12 minutes to make a presentation.

**Ms. Doly Begum:** Thank you very much, Speaker. And to all those watching from the Ontario Legislative Assembly broadcasting, good evening everyone, and thank you so much for all the love and support that you've given in putting together this piece of legislation.

I want to start by also thanking some advocacy groups and individuals who have been advising us and showing their support. Let me start by saying thank you to Lauri Sue Robertson, a constituent and a disability advocate from Scarborough Southwest. Mr. Moyeen Chowdhury—I call him uncle. Like many elders in our community who do amazing work, this constituent of mine does amazing work as a disability advocate and for seniors' rights. Also thank you to Chris Yaccato and the team at Variety—the Children's Charity of Ontario. Thank you for your work and for the support that you've shown. Also thank you to Shelagh Pizey-Allen. Shelagh has been wonderful, the executive director at TTC Riders—and along with her team at TTCriders, I want to thank Adam Cohoon, the co-chair of the TTCriders accessibility committee, as well as Jennifer Conroy, who have been incredible advocates for this as well.

I also want to thank the AODA Alliance and the ARCH Disability Law Centre for their remarks and feedback, as well as my colleagues on this side, who have been incredible allies and support in helping me throughout the process of this legislation. So as I begin, I want to show my gratitude to those.

And there's one person that I have to give a big, big shout-out to, and I feel emotional saying this: a big thank

you to my constituency assistant Mayeesha Chowdhury, who did a lot of work, a lot of research, I would say over the past couple of months, actually years, when I first thought about this issue in my riding of Scarborough Southwest. I'm a little torn because she just moved on to the media team, to our communications team. She's been a valuable member of my Scarborough Southwest team, incredibly dedicated. I know that the communications team is very lucky to have her. We will miss you, Mayeesha, but thank you very much for all your work, for everything that you've done. I know that the SW team misses you and loves you very, very much.

Speaker, this bill has been the product of a lot of different conversations. In fact, when I first got elected, this was one of the things that I heard from a lot of seniors and the disability community, who talked about the need for accessible transit.

Now, imagine getting out of your home to come to work, let's just say from Scarborough Southwest to Queen's Park, and what that looks like. First, you go to the bus shelter to get on a bus or the streetcar, then you would go to the bus bay, then to the train. You get on the train, then you get off the train and then you repeat, and then either you take a bus or you walk, let's say, to Queen's Park, for example.

Now, that's for somebody who's able-bodied. Imagine somebody in a wheelchair, Speaker. You get out of your home, so you would have to figure out if the side streets are gravel. Are you able to actually get to the bus shelter properly? That's the first hurdle.

Then you think about whether the bus shelter is accessible and then when the bus comes, if it is actually accessible to pick you up. Thankfully to the TTC and the work they have done, there are a lot of buses that are now accessible, and I thank them for that work that they have done. However, if there is somebody already in a wheelchair in that bus, then you have to wait for the next one because it only takes one person with a wheelchair. So you wait.

Once you get on the bus, you go to the bus bay—and let's say you live close to Warden station, Speaker; that's in my riding of Scarborough Southwest. Well, too bad because from the bus bay at Warden station, you cannot go up to go to the trains because that subway station is not accessible. I know the TTC has a goal to make that subway station accessible and that work is being done. Unfortunately, it's been delayed for a while. We had a target, I believe, of 2014, then 2020, and now the new target is 2025, and from I'm hearing from some advocates, that may not even happen because of the lack of investment, the lack of funding.

So, let's say for this individual in that wheelchair, you do get on the bus, but you decide because Warden station is not accessible, you're going to go to a different station. You've just added on the time you need. Then from that station, let's say you go to Main Street station or Victoria Park, which are accessible; you go there and you have to now find out where the closest elevator is that will take you to the right platform for you to get on the train to come westbound, for example. If you're lucky, you'll find the elevator that's close enough, but for some stations you will have to go around to a different side, which is another 10 or 15 minutes for that person in the wheelchair to be able to access that elevator and finally get on the platform to go westbound, for example. That is the reality for so many people.

Once you get on the train, you have to then figure out whether you're going to get off at which station because, based on that, you calculate—and there are about 16 stations just in the city that are not accessible. So you calculate: “Well, if I get off at this station there, it's not accessible, then I can't do this. So I have to figure out this station, but this is actually far away from my destination so I have to figure out buses that will take me from the further-away station that I've just gotten off at because it's accessible to get to the bus to get to my destination.” Do you see, colleagues, the dilemma that someone went through, the hurdles and amount of effort and time you've added for this individual?

One of the main things that we talk about when we talk about people with disabilities is, are we allowing them to be able to contribute and be their best selves? Unfortunately, if we don't make transit accessible, then we're not.

This legislation that I have is a very simple piece of legislation, Speaker, because there are bus shelters, buses and vehicles that are not accessible. When we looked at the AODA from 2005, and we looked at the work that's been done with the AODA and the incredible work by advocates, as well as the reports on the AODA which show that we have been lacking in actually meeting the standards the AODA set out, as well as the 15 recommendations by late Lieutenant Governor David Onley and the incredible work he's done—and I want to thank them. I also want to thank David Lepofsky for the work he's done with the AODA Alliance because they have set out a lot of these standards, but unfortunately we're not meeting these standards.

So when I look at this legislation, one of the things that we're hoping to do with the support of the government is that this bill will amend the Ontarians with Disabilities Act to provide the Minister of Transportation and the Minister for Seniors and Accessibility to jointly conduct a review of the standards of public transportation organizations with respect to accessibility of existing transit stations, stops and vehicles; and no more than 12 months will be given to do that because we need a timeline. We have delayed, delayed and delayed. We have forgotten about this entire community of those needing the support, who are facing those barriers. We need to support them. For that, we need to be able to put a deadline so that we actually say, “You

know what? Let's take action. Let's actually put our foot down and say we're going to do something about it.” These Ontarians deserve that, Speaker.

This bill, the first section of it, asks for that. It's a very simple ask. I don't see anything partisan about it. I don't see anything wrong about it that the government could not do. The second part of that is to amend and to provide that every public transportation organization shall ensure that all stops and shelters are accessible to persons with disabilities—Speaker, a very simple ask—that persons with disabilities can access, let's say, bus bays—so I just gave you an example—without having to leave the premises and that persons with disabilities can access all trains, light rail, GO trains, streetcars, train stations etc. without actually going about.

When we talk about accessibility, let's not make it about a tick mark, so that you can just put in an elevator and say, “You know what? That's it.” You can just put in signage and say, “You know what? That's it.” Or you can just make one announcement and say, “You know what? That's it.” Those are not the ways to go about it.

One of the recommendations that David Onley made during his review was: Let's look at the design of transit and have people who are dealing with disabilities, for example, who need that extra support, who need to address those barriers, be part of that. So if you have an architect, for example, or if you have an engineer who is designing a station, let's make sure that that conversation of removing those disability barriers is part of that design from the get-go.

That is very important, Speaker, because let's say you have an announcement being made. For someone who is relying on that voice, that public announcement, if it's not clear, it doesn't matter if you've made that announcement or not. For that person, they have to wait and they could have missed that bus, for example, if that bus didn't make that announcement. For someone who is standing with a wheelchair, if they don't have the elevator in the right spot, that's it. They're going around and adding another 10 or 15 minutes to be able to get access.

That happens a lot in areas like Scarborough which are forgotten when we talk in general terms about transit, Speaker. And this is not just in Scarborough. I should also add a few other examples. When we looked across the province, we found a lot of different municipalities, like Waterloo, like Thunder Bay, like Sudbury, for example, where you talk about transit and what percentage of transit is accessible. Let me give you an example. Let's say Thunder Bay, where just a little over 60% of transit is accessible. In Waterloo, for example, it's just over 70%. But even within that accessible amount, that percentage, there are barriers that exist. Even within that 70%, there is about 13% of barriers that exist because of things like there's gravel on the sidewalks so you cannot actually access the transit station.

These are some examples across the province. I haven't even gotten to the north yet. The north of this province, northern Ontario, Speaker—guess what? They can't even address accessibility in transit. They only have door-to-

door services because they are not able to have the funding or the ability to change that. They would need a lot of work to rebuild and make sure they're able to provide accessible transit where people who are facing disability become a part of the community that's able to take transit on a regular basis. Instead, they have to have bookable services. If you don't have anything bookable, let's say, for today at 8 o'clock, too bad, you wait for the next day.

That is not making this huge community become engaged, become a participating member of our province. This is not what Ontarians, regardless of their abilities, deserve. So I'm asking this government, Speaker, to just look at the bill. It's a very simple ask. The fact that we're still asking for it in 2023 is something to be ashamed of, but I know that we can do better. A little political will, a little bit of investment can take us far, and we can work together to make sure that we pass this bill.

**The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard):** Further debate?

**Mrs. Daisy Wai:** Thank you to the member opposite for your presentation. Madam Speaker, this bill is calling for all transit to be accessible for everyone and for ministers to report to the House annually on the progression of this. Thanks to the leadership of our Premier, we are already doing this.

1810

Thanks to the Premier, we have made historic investments in transit, including the Ontario Line, the Northlander and the Scarborough subway extension. Madam Speaker, we do care about getting things accessible for Ontarians. We are making transit accessible for everyone. And thanks to the leadership of the Minister for Seniors and Accessibility and the Minister of Transportation, all GO buses and all GO trains are becoming accessible. This government is ensuring that no matter where you are, everyone has a chance to commute around.

We can appreciate the hard work and dedication our journalists and reporters do on a daily basis. In February, Radio-Canada reported that Toronto has now succeeded Montreal when it comes to accessible transit. I want to congratulate the Toronto Transit Commission. The TTC is in the process of making sure all of its TTC subway stations are fully accessible in the next few years.

The Lansdowne subway station in the west of the city of Toronto is now accessible. This is one of the many upgrades that the TTC is doing to make sure that all 75 of their stations are fully accessible to everyone. As reported by Radio-Canada on February 26, Toronto is pulling ahead of Montreal when it comes to accessible transit.

Thanks to the leadership of the Premier, Ontario is working with the federal government and its municipal partners like the city of Toronto, making historic investments in fully accessible transit in the province. Once again, I'd like to congratulate the TTC and the city of Toronto on their leadership.

Madam Speaker, the city of Ottawa is also showing leadership when it comes to accessibility. All the stations on Line 1 in the city of Ottawa are now accessible for people with limited mobility. The member opposite's bill calls for everyone to be able to access trains, light-rail transit

and streetcars. Not only can you see this already happening, the Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act already requires all municipalities to make transportation and transit accessible. And once again, they are already doing it. We are ensuring all 444 municipalities are equipped with the tools and supports that are needed to ensure everyone can get around in their beautiful communities.

Madam Speaker, it doesn't stop in Ottawa and Toronto. In December, the province announced that the Ontario Northland is back. Our government announced \$139 million for new trains as part of the plan to bring back Ontario Northland passenger trains. All of these trains will be fully accessible with built-in wheelchair lifts, storage space for mobility devices and fully accessible washrooms. Thanks to the leadership of the Associate Minister of Transportation and the Minister of Northern Development, we are not only bringing rail transportation back to the north but will make it fully accessible for everyone.

Over the next 10 years, Ontario has planned overall investments of more than \$158.8 billion to support access to quality, reliable high-speed Internet and the construction, rehabilitation and modernization of new schools, hospitals, public transit, roads and bridges. Since 2018, Ontario has committed to investing a total of \$10.2 billion to improve public transit infrastructure; community, culture and recreation; green infrastructure; rural and northern communities' infrastructure; and COVID-19 resilience. The program includes accessibility upgrades that support people who use mobility devices.

Through the ICIP Public Transit stream, more than 2,200 transit vehicles are expected to be purchased through approved—or under-review—projects, to replace aging vehicles or expand transit fleets across Ontario. All transit vehicles purchased through ICIP are fully compliant.

Through the Public Transit infrastructure stream of ICIP, Ontario invested close to \$3 million to support accessibility improvements to Peel region's public transit system. This funding enabled Peel region to purchase 69 specialized buses equipped with side-mounted lifts that are capable of carrying up to six wheelchair passengers and also made it easier to pay fares across TransHelp fleet by implementing Presto and installing up to 145 portable, tablet-based payment devices.

Madam Speaker, I'd like to address the member opposite's call for both the Minister of Transportation and the Minister for Seniors and Accessibility to jointly conduct a review of standards for public transportation organizations with respect to the accessibility of existing transit stations and stops. The government has already established standards development committees that review the standards and make recommendations on how Ontario can become more accessible for everyone. Bill 82 calls for changes that this province is already doing.

This government is helping to make transportation and transit services more accessible, convenient and safe. Through the leadership of the Minister of Transportation, we are ensuring:

—accessible washrooms at all rest areas and ONroute centres;

—accessible pedestrian signals are included in new highway infrastructure;

—building AODA-compliant signalized intersections that comply with the Design of Public Spaces Standard addresses the needs of pedestrians with cognitive and/or sensory disabilities and enhances the safety, mobility, and independence of Ontarians with disabilities;

—traffic control signals with accessible pedestrian signal features are being inspected every six months to ensure signal operations are in compliance with MTO standards and IASR regulations.

Since 2018, thanks to the leadership of the Minister of Transportation, the ministry has completed over 100 AODA-compliant signalized intersections that meet the accessibility standards under the IASR DOPS, and more are planned for construction in 2023. The work includes installing accessible pedestrian signals, tactile features, audible push buttons and dropped curbs.

This government continues to ensure everyone has a chance to get around, including seniors and persons with disabilities. Through the Community Transportation Grant Program, we are providing up to \$44 million over seven years to 38 municipalities to deliver 43 local and intercommunity transportation projects in areas across Ontario that are unserved or underserved by such services.

Madam Speaker, the new Kingston-area ferry vessels and terminals are now built. As a result, the new vessels, shore constructions and services launched in 2020 are accessible to users. This includes features like:

—separate, accessible pedestrian boarding ramps on vessels;

—accessible seating on vessels and in buildings;

—use of video-display terminals in buildings to provide information normally spoken live by staff or pre-recorded announcements in a visual format like text, symbols, videos to support users who are deaf, deafened, hard of hearing or who have learning or intellectual disabilities.

**1820**

Madam Speaker, this government will continue to ensure that everyone, anywhere, has access to transportation.

Our investments for accessibility don't stop at transit. This government is ensuring that everyone has the opportunity of full participation in this province. We've invested over \$2 million since 2018 into the Inclusive Community Grants Program to help municipalities across the province develop accessible infrastructure in their communities. Our government believes that all Ontarians deserve an equal opportunity to engage in our society.

Madam Speaker, in conclusion, Bill 82 shows a redundancy of what the government is already doing and will continue to do.

**The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard):** Further debate?

**Ms. Jessica Bell:** I want to thank the member for Scarborough Southwest for bringing this important bill, Bill 82, to come up with a plan to review and to make the amendments necessary to ensure that all public transit across Ontario is accessible. It is a sensible, compassionate and practical motion. And it is a surprise to hear that the members

opposite are feeling some reluctance to demonstrate their commitment to accessibility.

Transit has been in the news a lot lately, especially in Toronto. We've seen a fare hike that came in yesterday, one of a whole series of fare hikes that have been taking place over the last decade. We have seen service cuts, and I fear that we are going to be seeing more service cuts in the coming months, because the provincial government and the federal government have made a decision that transit operations and maintenance are not a priority for them, and that is a shame.

But today we're here to talk about accessibility. Accessibility is an issue that isn't talked about and isn't debated enough, especially since it affects thousands and thousands and thousands of people. I'm always struck by that statistic and that reminder that, at one time or another, every single one of us is going to have accessibility challenges at some point in our lives. This bill in some way or another, this motion in some way or another, affects us.

When I think about the TTC, which is the transit system which serves University–Rosedale, and I think about accessibility, I always notice how many stations still are not accessible for people. I notice how many elevators are out for repair, and escalators are out for repair, and how long it takes—sometimes months—to get some basic maintenance done to ensure that people who are using a wheelchair, who have accessibility challenges can just use the TTC to get around: to get to the doctor, to go to work, to go to school, to study, to visit friends—basic things, just to access our city, to have the key to our city and to use public transit to do it.

When I first moved to this city—the TTC has these little signs. It says, these signs, that if this elevator is not working, then what you can do is you can go onto the other side of the station and then take this bus and then take this other bus to get to this other station where the elevator is working, where it is accessible. And it always struck me as absurd, because when I calculated how long it would take to get to that accessible station, it could take upwards of an hour. That's not accessible.

And then I also think about Wheel-Trans, which is that service that people who cannot use the TTC can take. When I was the executive director of TTCriders, we would always get complaints from people, and people continue to complain to this day, that Wheel-Trans denies people who are eligible to use Wheel-Trans. They deny them, and I think that's a shame.

I support this motion. This is about accessibility and ensuring that everyone has access to our city and our province and can get around. It's practical; it makes sense. I urge you to support it as well. Thank you to the member for Scarborough Southwest for bringing it forward today.

**The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard):** Further debate?

**MPP Lise Vaugeois:** I'm speaking in favour of this motion and really wish that the government would vote in favour of this bill, because we need a means—I was hoping to hear that you would set up a survey, a means for people with disability to give you feedback on what it's actually like to move through the transit system.



So, I have a few examples. I live not far from Yonge and Bloor. Well, I cannot find the accessible entrance. I'm dragging a suitcase around with me everywhere I go these days. I still—I've tried several different entrances; I can't find it.

When I'm travelling through the subway system, I'm always looking for the elevator, and most times I can't find it. Then I look for the sign and there's a tiny little sign way down at the other end of the platform on it that has a wheelchair on it, so hopefully that's it. But can I get there? Well, there are a million people between me and that sign.

The other place you see the sign is flat against the wall. So if you come off one train, you will see that sign. If you come off any other part of the subway, you won't see it.

I find it very, very difficult, and I'm able-bodied. I have good vision. English is my first language. This should not be a problem, but it's very difficult—it is. It is. And I can't imagine, if I needed, absolutely needed, that elevator, what would I do?

Another thing that's kind of interesting is salt. You wouldn't think salt would be a problem, but I take the GO train. I take the bus to Appleby and I take the GO train from there. I go back and forth on that, with my wheeled suitcase. There's salt, which is good. Normally you'd think salt is great, okay? The snow has been cleared; there's salt on the ground. You should try dragging a suitcase across large chunks of salt. It doesn't work. Now, if I were in an electric wheelchair or any kind of wheelchair, I imagine that salt is actually going to totally gum up my machine. It's not a good thing.

So that's the kind of feedback—I mean, who would know, if you didn't have that problem, that salt actually is not the best solution? Maybe there's something else that could be done, put down instead.

Then there's—let's see, what did I have here? GO transit: Do you know how many stations where the elevator is at the opposite end of the building to where the car is that is accessible? If you get the accessible car, there is somebody who staffs that car, who puts down a ramp, and you can get on there with your wheelchair or with any other kind of mobility device—or a buggy, or a suitcase. But you've got to make it from the far end of the platform, again through everybody else who is waiting to take the train or getting off the train, to get to the accessible section. That's basic information, and that's the kind of information that the government needs to be hearing from people who need to use those services.

Union Station: Has anybody tried to find their way around Union Station? I'm embarrassed to say that—I've been going back and forth; this is nine months now—I still routinely get lost trying to make my way around Union Station. There are multiple signs that say the same thing, often going in different directions. Again, English is my first language. I've lived in Toronto. I lived in Toronto before; I live in Toronto now. And yet, I constantly struggle to understand the signage in Union Station. Imagine if you are struggling with your mobility or language or anything else, and you're in this very, very busy place and unable to figure out where to go.

So, I think it's crucial that the government actually have a mechanism where they can gather information from people who really need these services. We will all be better off with these services corrected. They can't do that without listening to people. For this reason, I really urge the government to please support this bill.

**The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard):** Further debate?

**Mr. Joel Harden:** I want to thank the member for Scarborough Southwest for putting this forward. I had the great pleasure recently to share a digital platform with her and many of the advocates who are putting this piece of legislation forward. So thank you to you, and thank you to all those people who've done that.

**1830**

Speaker, if I may, I want to try to succinctly express what I think this debate is really about. This debate is really about how much more prejudice we're willing to tolerate against disabled persons in the province of Ontario in the year 2023. I say that because, before the member from Thunder Bay–Superior North, I had the privilege to serve as the critic for persons with disabilities and accessibility from 2018 until the end of the last Parliament. I had occasion to meet the great David Onley, who we've talked about; David Lepofsky; so many advocates who have told me pointedly that we are past deadline.

So when I hear my friend from Richmond Hill say—I've had occasion to be at disability rights events with her, and I know she's passionate; I know members of this government are passionate about disability rights—that “we're working on it,” well, I'm sorry; I've seen this debate now for going on five years. If there are still subway stations in the wealthiest city in Ontario that are not open to persons with disabilities, then we are de facto saying prejudice is okay.

When David Onley in his report said to us that we are living in an Ontario where persons with disabilities live with “soul-crushing barriers,” and when he talked about ableism as being one of the last publicly acceptable forms of prejudice, he was using very bold language to get our attention. When so many of us gathered to honour Mr. Onley's passing—I had to gather virtually in Ottawa, Speaker—I want to believe that what we are gathering to celebrate is someone who was telling us that we had to be better.

So the member for Scarborough Southwest is telling us we need a deadline. We need a deadline of a year to review with the AODA standards committee that the member for Richmond Hill spoke about, so we are very clear that we aren't just using words in this place; we are on a deadline to accessibility; we're drawing not just on the AODA, but the ODA and other relevant pieces of legislation. Because we do not believe in house-bound confinement in this province. We believe everybody should have the freedom of movement to do what they want.

For people in this great city—someone I was reading about as I prepped for debate, Speaker, is Mr. Mark Moore in Orillia, who loves to get on accessible transit in the great city of Orillia and go to the community centre. Why? So he can be with his friends and have the pleasure of great

community services at the Orillia community centre. But Mr. Moore struggles with the schedule of the accessible transit service. It's not Toronto; it's Orillia.

In Ottawa, we are fighting desperately for same-day bookings for people who want to use the accessible transit system in our city, Para Transpo. You cannot do it. Speaker, what they do right now is they tell you, "This is the window when you can expect a Para Transpo bus to arrive." And I've talked to constituents who have waited for hours sometimes for it to arrive. They have to book that two hours before a doctor's appointment, or something critical. How can one plan their life? That is an unacceptable form of discrimination and prejudice, but I salute the member for encouraging us to stand behind. It is great when we see the moments in this Legislature when we all get behind something, and we all say human rights matter for everyone. So, thank you very much, member for Scarborough South-west.

Thank you to this Legislature for caring about disability rights, but words are great; actions are better. Please support this motion.

**The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard):** The member has two minutes to reply.

**Ms. Doly Begum:** Thank you to all my colleagues for your remarks—on this side of the House, for your passionate remarks. I am a little bit—actually, I'm a little shocked because I thought this was a common-sense bill. I didn't think there would be any opposition to it at all. I don't—I'm out of words.

I'm going to actually ignore my notes here and say that I believe every single person in this province, regardless of their abilities, regardless of how differently abled they are, visually-impaired, hearing impairment, any ability, someone who is dealing with language accessibility, someone who sits in a wheelchair—I've had the pleasure of meeting a wonderful woman, Lauri Sue Robertson, who joined me yesterday in Queen's Park in her wheelchair.

Anybody in this province regardless of their abilities should be able, should have the right, to go to wherever they want, across this province, without barriers. I believe that. I hope that everyone in this House believes that, Speaker.

It is not up to us to continue to keep those barriers that exist right now in our province. It was 20 years ago when the Ontario disability act was established, and it was more than 15 years ago when the AODA was established. And it was about 10 years ago when we had those recommendations that talked about how we are failing in accessibility measures in our province. And yet the fact that we're in 2023 right now and we're having to debate this is absurd. It's something we should be ashamed of.

If this government thinks that they're already doing the work, if they're already investing, if they're already doing the accessibility measures that are required, then what's the harm in actually voting for this, right? If you're already doing this, if you're already committed, then what's the harm—

**The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard):** Thank you. The time provided for private members' public business has expired.

Ms. Begum has moved second reading of Bill 82, An Act respecting accessible public transit. Is it the pleasure of the House that the motion carry? I heard a no.

All those in favour, please say "aye."

All those opposed, please say "nay."

In my opinion, the nays have it.

A recorded vote being required, it will be deferred until the next instance of deferred votes.

*Second reading vote deferred.*

**The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard):** All matters related to private members' public business having been completed, this House stands adjourned until Wednesday, April 5, 2023, at 9 a.m.

*The House adjourned at 1836.*





**LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF ONTARIO**  
**ASSEMBLÉE LÉGISLATIVE DE L'ONTARIO**

Lieutenant Governor / Lieutenante-gouverneure: Hon. / L'hon. Elizabeth Dowdeswell, OC, OOnt.

Speaker / Président: Hon. / L'hon. Ted Arnott

Clerk / Greffier: Todd Decker

Deputy Clerk / Sous-greffier: Trevor Day

Clerks-at-the-Table / Greffiers parlementaires: Valerie Quioc Lim, Wai Lam (William) Wong,

Meghan Stenson, Christopher Tyrell

Temporary Sergeant-at-Arms / Sergent d'armes par intérim: Mike Civil

Member and Party / Député(e) et parti	Constituency / Circonscription	Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités
Anand, Deepak (PC)	Mississauga—Malton	
Andrew, Jill (NDP)	Toronto—St. Paul's	
Armstrong, Teresa J. (NDP)	London—Fanshawe	
<b>Arnott, Hon. / L'hon. Ted (PC)</b>	Wellington—Halton Hills	Speaker / Président de l'Assemblée législative
Babikian, Aris (PC)	Scarborough—Agincourt	
Bailey, Robert (PC)	Sarnia—Lambton	
<b>Barnes, Patrice (PC)</b>	Ajax	Second Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Deuxième vice-présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée législative
Begum, Doly (NDP)	Scarborough Southwest / Scarborough- Sud-Ouest	Deputy Leader, Official Opposition / Chef adjointe de l'opposition officielle
Bell, Jessica (NDP)	University—Rosedale	
<b>Bethlenfalvy, Hon. / L'hon. Peter (PC)</b>	Pickering—Uxbridge	Minister of Finance / Ministre des Finances
Blais, Stephen (LIB)	Orléans	
Bouma, Will (PC)	Brantford—Brant	
Bourgouin, Guy (NDP)	Mushkegowuk—James Bay / Mushkegowuk—Baie James	
Bowman, Stephanie (LIB)	Don Valley West / Don Valley-Ouest	
Brady, Bobbi Ann (IND)	Haldimand—Norfolk	
Bresee, Ric (PC)	Hastings—Lennox and Addington	
Burch, Jeff (NDP)	Niagara Centre / Niagara-Centre	
Byers, Rick (PC)	Bruce—Grey—Owen Sound	
<b>Calandra, Hon. / L'hon. Paul (PC)</b>	Markham—Stouffville	Minister of Legislative Affairs / Ministre des Affaires législatives Minister of Long-Term Care / Ministre des Soins de longue durée Government House Leader / Leader parlementaire du gouvernement
<b>Cho, Hon. / L'hon. Raymond Sung Joon (PC)</b>	Scarborough North / Scarborough- Nord	Minister for Seniors and Accessibility / Ministre des Services aux aînés et de l'Accessibilité
<b>Cho, Hon. / L'hon. Stan (PC)</b>	Willowdale	Associate Minister of Transportation / Ministre associé des Transports
<b>Clark, Hon. / L'hon. Steve (PC)</b>	Leeds—Grenville—Thousand Islands and Rideau Lakes / Leeds— Grenville—Thousand Islands et Rideau Lakes	Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing / Ministre des Affaires municipales et du Logement
Coe, Lorne (PC)	Whitby	
<b>Collard, Lucille (LIB)</b>	Ottawa—Vanier	Third Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Troisième vice-présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée législative
Crawford, Stephen (PC)	Oakville	
Cuzzetto, Rudy (PC)	Mississauga—Lakeshore	
Dixon, Jess (PC)	Kitchener South—Hespeler / Kitchener-Sud—Hespeler	
Dowie, Andrew (PC)	Windsor—Tecumseh	
<b>Downey, Hon. / L'hon. Doug (PC)</b>	Barrie—Springwater—Oro-Medonte	Attorney General / Procureur général
<b>Dunlop, Hon. / L'hon. Jill (PC)</b>	Simcoe North / Simcoe-Nord	Minister of Colleges and Universities / Ministre des Collèges et Universités
<b>Fedeli, Hon. / L'hon. Victor (PC)</b>	Nipissing	Chair of Cabinet / Président du Conseil des ministres Minister of Economic Development, Job Creation and Trade / Ministre du Développement économique, de la Création d'emplois et du Commerce
Fife, Catherine (NDP)	Waterloo	
Flack, Rob (PC)	Elgin—Middlesex—London	

<b>Member and Party / Député(e) et parti</b>	<b>Constituency / Circonscription</b>	<b>Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités</b>
<b>Ford, Hon. / L'hon. Doug (PC)</b>	Etobicoke North / Etobicoke-Nord	Minister of Intergovernmental Affairs / Ministre des Affaires intergouvernementales Premier / Premier ministre Leader, Progressive Conservative Party of Ontario / Chef du Parti progressiste-conservateur de l'Ontario
<b>Ford, Hon. / L'hon. Michael D. (PC)</b>	York South—Weston / York-Sud—Weston	Minister of Citizenship and Multiculturalism / Ministre des Affaires civiles et du Multiculturalisme
Fraser, John (LIB)	Ottawa South / Ottawa-Sud	
French, Jennifer K. (NDP)	Oshawa	
Gallagher Murphy, Dawn (PC)	Newmarket—Aurora	
Gates, Wayne (NDP)	Niagara Falls	
Gélinas, France (NDP)	Nickel Belt	
Ghamari, Goldie (PC)	Carleton	
<b>Gill, Hon. / L'hon. Parm (PC)</b>	Milton	Minister of Red Tape Reduction / Ministre de la Réduction des formalités administratives
Glover, Chris (NDP)	Spadina—Fort York	
Gretzky, Lisa (NDP)	Windsor West / Windsor-Ouest	
Grewal, Hardeep Singh (PC)	Brampton East / Brampton-Est	
Hardeman, Ernie (PC)	Oxford	
Harden, Joel (NDP)	Ottawa Centre / Ottawa-Centre	
Harris, Mike (PC)	Kitchener—Conestoga	
Hogarth, Christine (PC)	Etobicoke—Lakeshore	
Holland, Kevin (PC)	Thunder Bay—Atikokan	
Hsu, Ted (LIB)	Kingston and the Islands / Kingston et les Îles	
Hunter, Mitzie (LIB)	Scarborough—Guildwood	
Jama, Sarah (NDP)	Hamilton Centre / Hamilton-Centre	
<b>Jones, Hon. / L'hon. Sylvia (PC)</b>	Dufferin—Caledon	Deputy Premier / Vice-première ministre Minister of Health / Ministre de la Santé
Jones, Trevor (PC)	Chatham-Kent—Leamington	
Jordan, John (PC)	Lanark—Frontenac—Kingston	
Kanapathi, Logan (PC)	Markham—Thornhill	
<b>Karpoche, Bhutla (NDP)</b>	Parkdale—High Park	First Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Première vice-présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée
Ke, Vincent (IND)	Don Valley North / Don Valley-Nord	
Kernaghan, Terence (NDP)	London North Centre / London-Centre-Nord	Deputy Opposition House Leader / Leader parlementaire adjoint de l'opposition officielle
<b>Kerzner, Hon. / L'hon. Michael S. (PC)</b>	York Centre / York-Centre	Solicitor General / Solliciteur général
Khanjin, Andrea (PC)	Barrie—Innisfil	Deputy Government House Leader / Leader parlementaire adjointe du gouvernement
Kusendova-Bashta, Natalia (PC)	Mississauga Centre / Mississauga-Centre	
Leardi, Anthony (PC)	Essex	
<b>Lecce, Hon. / L'hon. Stephen (PC)</b>	King—Vaughan	Minister of Education / Ministre de l'Éducation
Lindo, Laura Mae (NDP)	Kitchener Centre / Kitchener-Centre	
<b>Lumsden, Hon. / L'hon. Neil (PC)</b>	Hamilton East—Stoney Creek / Hamilton-Est—Stoney Creek	Minister of Tourism, Culture and Sport / Ministre du Tourisme, de la Culture et du Sport
MacLeod, Lisa (PC)	Nepean	
Mamakwa, Sol (NDP)	Kiwiwinoong	Deputy Leader, Official Opposition / Chef adjoint de l'opposition officielle
Mantha, Michael (IND)	Algoma—Manitoulin	
Martin, Robin (PC)	Eglinton—Lawrence	
McCarthy, Todd J. (PC)	Durham	
McGregor, Graham (PC)	Brampton North / Brampton-Nord	
McMahon, Mary-Margaret (LIB)	Beaches—East York / Beaches—East York	
<b>McNaughton, Hon. / L'hon. Monte (PC)</b>	Lambton—Kent—Middlesex	Minister of Labour, Immigration, Training and Skills Development / Ministre du Travail, de l'Immigration, de la Formation et du Développement des compétences
<b>Mulroney, Hon. / L'hon. Caroline (PC)</b>	York—Simcoe	Minister of Francophone Affairs / Ministre des Affaires francophones Minister of Transportation / Ministre des Transports
Oosterhoff, Sam (PC)	Niagara West / Niagara-Ouest	

<b>Member and Party / Député(e) et parti</b>	<b>Constituency / Circonscription</b>	<b>Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités</b>
Pang, Billy (PC)	Markham—Unionville	
<b>Parsa, Hon. / L'hon. Michael (PC)</b>	Aurora—Oak Ridges—Richmond Hill	Minister of Children, Community and Social Services / Ministre des Services à l'enfance et des Services sociaux et communautaires
Pasma, Chandra (NDP)	Ottawa West—Nepean / Ottawa-Ouest—Nepean	
<b>Piccini, Hon. / L'hon. David (PC)</b>	Northumberland—Peterborough South / Northumberland—Peterborough-Sud	Minister of the Environment, Conservation and Parks / Ministre de l'Environnement, de la Protection de la nature et des Parcs
Pierre, Natalie (PC)	Burlington	
<b>Pirie, Hon. / L'hon. George (PC)</b>	Timmins	Minister of Mines / Ministre des Mines
Quinn, Nolan (PC)	Stormont—Dundas—South Glengarry	
Rae, Matthew (PC)	Perth—Wellington	
Rakocevic, Tom (NDP)	Humber River—Black Creek	
<b>Rasheed, Hon. / L'hon. Kaleed (PC)</b>	Mississauga East—Cooksville / Mississauga-Est—Cooksville	Minister of Public and Business Service Delivery / Ministre des Services au public et aux entreprises
<b>Rickford, Hon. / L'hon. Greg (PC)</b>	Kenora—Rainy River	Minister of Indigenous Affairs / Ministre des Affaires autochtones Minister of Northern Development / Ministre du Développement du Nord
Riddell, Brian (PC)	Cambridge	
Romano, Ross (PC)	Sault Ste. Marie	
Sabawy, Sheref (PC)	Mississauga—Erin Mills	
Sandhu, Amarjot (PC)	Brampton West / Brampton-Ouest	
<b>Sarkaria, Hon. / L'hon. Prabmeet Singh (PC)</b>	Brampton South / Brampton-Sud	President of the Treasury Board / Président du Conseil du Trésor
Sarrazin, Stéphane (PC)	Glengarry—Prescott—Russell	
Sattler, Peggy (NDP)	London West / London-Ouest	
Saunderson, Brian (PC)	Simcoe—Grey	
Schreiner, Mike (GRN)	Guelph	
Scott, Laurie (PC)	Haliburton—Kawartha Lakes—Brock	
Shamji, Adil (LIB)	Don Valley East / Don Valley-Est	
Shaw, Sandy (NDP)	Hamilton West—Ancaster—Dundas / Hamilton-Ouest—Ancaster—Dundas	
<b>Skelly, Donna (PC)</b>	Flamborough—Glanbrook	Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Vice-présidente et présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée Deputy Speaker / Vice-présidente
Smith, Dave (PC)	Peterborough—Kawartha	
Smith, David (PC)	Scarborough Centre / Scarborough-Centre	
<b>Smith, Hon. / L'hon. Graydon (PC)</b>	Parry Sound—Muskoka	Minister of Natural Resources and Forestry / Ministre des Richesses naturelles et des Forêts
<b>Smith, Hon. / L'hon. Todd (PC)</b>	Bay of Quinte / Baie de Quinte	Minister of Energy / Ministre de l'Énergie
Smith, Laura (PC)	Thornhill	
Stevens, Jennifer (Jennie) (NDP)	St. Catharines	
Stiles, Marit (NDP)	Davenport	Leader, Official Opposition / Chef de l'opposition officielle Leader, New Democratic Party of Ontario / Chef du Nouveau parti démocratique de l'Ontario
<b>Surma, Hon. / L'hon. Kinga (PC)</b>	Etobicoke Centre / Etobicoke-Centre	Minister of Infrastructure / Ministre de l'Infrastructure
Tabuns, Peter (NDP)	Toronto—Danforth	
<b>Tangri, Hon. / L'hon. Nina (PC)</b>	Mississauga—Streetsville	Associate Minister of Housing / Ministre associée du Logement
Taylor, Monique (NDP)	Hamilton Mountain / Hamilton-Mountain	
Thanigasalam, Vijay (PC)	Scarborough—Rouge Park	
<b>Thompson, Hon. / L'hon. Lisa M. (PC)</b>	Huron—Bruce	Minister of Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs / Ministre de l'Agriculture, de l'Alimentation et des Affaires rurales
<b>Tibollo, Hon. / L'hon. Michael A. (PC)</b>	Vaughan—Woodbridge	Associate Minister of Mental Health and Addictions / Ministre associé délégué au dossier de la Santé mentale et de la Lutte contre les dépendances
Triantafilopoulos, Effie J. (PC)	Oakville North—Burlington / Oakville-Nord—Burlington	
Vanthof, John (NDP)	Timiskaming—Cochrane	Opposition House Leader / Leader parlementaire de l'opposition officielle
Vaugeois, Lise (NDP)	Thunder Bay—Superior North / Thunder Bay—Supérieur-Nord	
Wai, Daisy (PC)	Richmond Hill	

<b>Member and Party / Député(e) et parti</b>	<b>Constituency / Circonscription</b>	<b>Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités</b>
West, Jamie (NDP)	Sudbury	
<b>Williams, Hon. / L'hon. Charmaine A. (PC)</b>	Brampton Centre / Brampton-Centre	Associate Minister of Women's Social and Economic Opportunity / Ministre associée des Perspectives sociales et économiques pour les femmes
Wong-Tam, Kristyn (NDP)	Toronto Centre / Toronto-Centre	
Yakabuski, John (PC)	Renfrew—Nipissing—Pembroke	
Vacant	Kanata—Carleton	