Legislative Assembly of Ontario



Assemblée législative de l'Ontario

Official Report of Debates (Hansard)

Journal des débats (Hansard)

No. 58B

N° 58B

1<sup>st</sup> Session 43<sup>rd</sup> Parliament

Tuesday 28 March 2023 1<sup>re</sup> session 43<sup>e</sup> législature Mardi 28 mars 2023

Speaker: Honourable Ted Arnott Clerk: Todd Decker Président : L'honorable Ted Arnott Greffier : Todd Decker

## Hansard on the Internet

Hansard and other documents of the Legislative Assembly can be on your personal computer within hours after each sitting. The address is:

# Le Journal des débats sur Internet

L'adresse pour faire paraître sur votre ordinateur personnel le Journal et d'autres documents de l'Assemblée législative en quelques heures seulement après la séance est :

https://www.ola.org/

## **Index inquiries**

Reference to a cumulative index of previous issues may be obtained by calling the Hansard Reporting Service indexing staff at 416-325-7400.

# **Renseignements sur l'index**

Adressez vos questions portant sur des numéros précédents du Journal des débats au personnel de l'index, qui vous fourniront des références aux pages dans l'index cumulatif, en composant le 416-325-7400.

House Publications and Language Services Room 500, West Wing, Legislative Building 111 Wellesley Street West, Queen's Park Toronto ON M7A 1A2 Telephone 416-325-7400 Published by the Legislative Assembly of Ontario



Service linguistique et des publications parlementaires Salle 500, aile ouest, Édifice du Parlement 111, rue Wellesley ouest, Queen's Park Toronto ON M7A 1A2 Téléphone, 416-325-7400 Publié par l'Assemblée législative de l'Ontario

ISSN 1180-2987

# CONTENTS / TABLE DES MATIÈRES

Tuesday 28 March 2023 / Mardi 28 mars 2023

# PRIVATE MEMBERS' PUBLIC BUSINESS / AFFAIRES D'INTÉRÊT PUBLIC ÉMANANT DES DÉPUTÉES ET DÉPUTÉS

Supporting Ontario's Community, Rura Agricultural Newspapers Act, 2023, Bil Ms. Ghamari; Mr. Sarrazin / Loi de 20 soutien aux journaux communautaires, agricoles de l'Ontario, projet de loi 73, Mme Ghamari; M. Sarrazin	l 73, 23 sur le
Mr. Stéphane Sarrazin	
MPP Jill Andrew	
Ms. Goldie Ghamari	
Mr. Ric Bresee	
Ms. Laura Smith	
Mr. Stéphane Sarrazin	
Second reading agreed to	

#### LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF ONTARIO

Tuesday 28 March 2023

*Report continued from volume A.* **1800** 

#### PRIVATE MEMBERS' PUBLIC BUSINESS

# SUPPORTING ONTARIO'S COMMUNITY, RURAL AND AGRICULTURAL NEWSPAPERS ACT, 2023

#### LOI DE 2023 SUR LE SOUTIEN AUX JOURNAUX COMMUNAUTAIRES, RURAUX ET AGRICOLES DE L'ONTARIO

Mr. Sarrazin moved second reading of the following bill:

Bill 73, An Act to amend various Acts with respect to the publication of notices in newspapers / Projet de loi 73, Loi modifiant diverses lois en ce qui concerne la publication d'avis dans les journaux.

The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard): Pursuant to standing order 100, the member has 12 minutes for his presentation.

**Mr. Stéphane Sarrazin:** I rise today to sponsor the Supporting Ontario's Community, Rural and Agricultural Newspapers Act, 2023, an amendment that will support local, rural papers and municipalities alike.

I would first like to take a moment to thank the member from Carleton for all of her support and assistance that went into introducing this important legislation. With us both having ridings in eastern rural Ontario, we understand just how beneficial this legislation will be to our communities. Thank you for all the hard work you have put into creating this bill, and I look forward to hearing it be debated here today.

Community is one of the many things that Glengarry– Prescott–Russell is great at. From hosting annual Festival de la Curd, the many, many agricultural fairs—the Russell Fair, the Vankleek Hill agricultural fair, Navan—name it; there's many of them—and many other festivals, like Christmas festivals, we have lots going on, and that builds our sense of community. Should you be in the area, I strongly urge you to attend of our many amazing events and check out our many local businesses, such as the St-Albert Cheese factory and one of the biggest water parks in Ontario, Calypso Water Park. In Glengarry–Prescott– Russell there is always something amazing to do or see.

# ASSEMBLÉE LÉGISLATIVE DE L'ONTARIO

Mardi 28 mars 2023

The key is just finding out what all is going on and being sure not to miss it.

Je m'en voudrais de manquer un de ces événements importants quand je suis dans ma circonscription, mais justement, grâce aux journaux locaux, aux journaux ruraux, on peut se tenir au courant de ces nombreux événements. C'est une bonne source pour promouvoir nos festivals et plusieurs autres événements.

Our local community newspapers support our riding in numerous ways. Whether it be getting the message out regarding upcoming events, supporting our local high school sports team, helping residents find local job opportunities or assisting municipal government in posting meeting times, local newspapers play a critical role in building a sense of community, especially in rural and northern areas where other forms of communication are extremely limited.

Had it not been for our local newspapers, community engagement would be at an all-time low. They do an amazing job in assuring all residents are informed of what is going on in the community and sharing local news. I would like to give a shout-out to many of my local newspapers, and I will name a few; hopefully I won't forget any of them. There's the Review, the Glengarry News, le Régional, le Carillon, Tribune-Express, le Reflet, Vision, l'Agricom.

Il n'y a rien comme les journaux locaux pour nous informer des nouvelles locales. Nous savons que les journaux locaux ont dû se réinventer avec la venue des médias sociaux et l'Internet. Je suis un fier supporteur des médias locaux.

Local newspapers are essential to our communities, and it is completely unrealistic that we ask small newspaper companies to keep up with the weekly posting requirements that papers like the Toronto Star and the Ottawa Sun can.

Throughout my time as mayor of a small township named Alfred and Plantagenet, a rural community in eastern Ontario, I experienced this strict weekly printing regimen when having to get legal notices out to our community. With a limited number of local papers that all faced an extremely tight deadline, it was difficult for me to meet this deadline, and I know that many small businesses and constituents in my community also faced this struggle.

In rural communities such as Alfred and Plantagenet and other similar municipalities in my riding, there are limited methods to post their community events, meeting notices, and any other information to the public.

However, even in communities with a large media presence, many prefer to read about government programs and services in their local newspapers. For instance, when LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF ONTARIO

asked in a poll in 2016, an astounding 72% of respondents echoed this message.

I would also like to clarify that this does not mean such news has to be published in every local paper that meets the new criteria. However, it will provide more options for local businesses and governments to get their news out.

While we are extremely fortunate in Glengarry–Prescott–Russell to have local newspapers—and I mentioned pretty much all of them—they, along with any other smallscale papers, are struggling to meet the weekly publication criteria—specifically in rural and northern Ontario. These newspapers are just not a means of advertising, but assuring that what matters to those in Glengarry–Prescott–Russell can be reported on for locals to read and consume.

What is of great interest in Ottawa or other major cities might not be the case for many of the small villages in my area, and vice versa. For instance, the ongoing project of Les Monuments de la francophonie may not be of significant interest to those in Ottawa or Toronto. However, it is something that matters a great deal to those in my riding.

Many rural and northern newspapers need this biweekly or monthly posting schedule as there is no other alternative. Whether it be due to a lack of funds or a lack of employees or because the newspaper is run by amazing community volunteers, these small businesses cannot stay afloat with this absurd weekly schedule.

These newspapers support our communities and, in turn, need and deserve our support. This is why we are proposing to amend the definition of what a newspaper is to the following: "a document that is printed in sheet form, published at regular intervals of a month or less, and" which "consists primarily of news of current events of general interest." This is what we're proposing as the new definition for what a newspaper is. By changing the regular posting interval to a month, rather than weekly, this will help small local newspapers in rural and northern Ontario to stay in operation and continue to do the amazing work for their communities that they do. Moreover, it will allow for these journals to stay under the definition of what a newspaper is, allowing them to continue to post municipal alerts that they otherwise could not. By changing the definition of a newspaper, we would actively be taking steps to support small businesses and municipal governments. But there are so many more unseen benefits communities would be able to see, and we are not only ones who think so.

#### 1810

The Ontario Community Newspapers Association agrees with this initiative: "The Ontario Community Newspapers Association (OCNA) is in support of ensuring the continued publication of public notices in printed community newspapers and welcomes the redefinition of 'newspaper' under Bill 73 to include papers that publish at least monthly. OCNA currently has 19 members who, in spite of being purveyors of high-quality local news, are currently barred from carrying public notices due to the definitions under the acts mentioned in Bill 73. This does a great disservice to Ontarians. "Community newspapers are often the only source of trustworthy local news in many of Ontario's communities, especially, but not exclusively, in the province's rural and northern areas, several of which do not have reliable highspeed Internet services. Many community newspapers also publish in-language news and information for many of the province's linguistic and cultural communities.

"We believe that it is important for the provincial and municipal governments to connect with Ontarians through trusted and time-tested sources of news and information. Our members invest millions of dollars a year into gathering and disseminating local news. We are often the only independent source of local news in our areas. Our members have deep roots in the places they call home and are wholly focused on what we can bring to a community, rather than what we can take out of it. Our communities look to us to learn about what their local, provincial and national governments are doing and how it will affect them. The revenue derived from public notices and other government advertising helps our members to fulfill their watchdog role and to keep their communities informed.

"As such, OCNA believes that the expansion of the definition of 'newspaper' under Bill 73 is a good first step in ensuring that statutory public notices are read by those who need to read them most."

Dans ma communauté-

La Présidente suppléante (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard): Je suis désolée. On a déjà dépassé le temps de plusieurs secondes, alors je dois vous interrompre.

I'm going to call for further debate.

**MPP Jill Andrew:** I appreciate the goals of PMB Bill 73, An Act to amend various Acts with respect to the publications of notices in newspapers, as this PMB expands the definition of a newspaper and the regulations surrounding its circulation.

Currently, under multiple acts, for a publication to be considered a newspaper, it must be circulated every week or less. This proposed bill would expand it to a month or less to reflect the cuts many small, local newspapers, especially community, rural and agricultural newspapers, most of which are locally owned, have had to make to their frequency of circulation.

It is important to note that publications that have had to change their frequency of circulation to biweekly or a month have had to engage in these cost-cutting efforts as a way of managing the increased costs of production, especially during the pandemic. However, as the preamble of this bill states, "Newspapers that limit the frequency of their publication to bi-weekly or monthly no longer meet the current requirements of the definition of 'newspaper' in section 87 of the Legislation Act, 2006, so municipalities are not able to post certain required legal notices in them."

Under the Development Charges Act, certain municipal councils require public notices be listed in local newspapers. It is a good thing to expand the definition of newspaper so local community-based publications can serve as a public access point to much-needed information that can support these communities—local, rural, northern or even ethnic community newspapers that are critical to the exchange of knowledge and information, especially those that provide local and international news for community members who are multilingual.

On the note of development charges, I'd just like to take a moment to state that I hope the Conservative government really would allow the Toronto District School Board to have access to education development charges. EDCs are funds a school needs or a school board can spend on new developments.

Current regulation establishes that EDCs can be used to purchase land for future school sites, not to support the cost of building new schools or renovating existing ones. Having access to education development charges, something the Ontario NDP official opposition has called for for years, would help our schools, especially as we've seen a multi-billion-dollar repair backlog looming over our schools, only made worse by this Conservative government. Developers should be contributing towards the costs of building and fixing our schools, and there should be provincial legislation—

Mr. Dave Smith: Point of order.

The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard): I apologize to the member.

To the point of order of the member from—

**Mr. Dave Smith:** What we're talking about right now is a private member's bill, Bill 73, about supporting Ontario's community, rural and agricultural newspapers. I think it would be appropriate if the member stayed to what the bill actually is about and discuss that.

The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard): Thank you. I got the point of order. Yes, I will ask the member to direct her comments to the bill that is the subject of debate. Thank you.

**MPP Jill Andrew:** And thank you to the government for caring and listening so intently. As I was saying, the Conservative government has majority power to do this with the stroke of a pen. Budgets and legislation put forward by this government are about choices, after all.

As for newspapers-

Mr. Dave Smith: Point of order.

**MPP Jill Andrew:** If you'd shut your mouth, I could actually—

Interjections.

The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard): I apologize. Stop the clock, please.

**Mr. Dave Smith:** This is a private member's bill about Ontario's community, rural and agricultural newspapers. The member must speak about this bill and not be on a tangent.

The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard): You've made your point.

I'm going to be continuing to listen to the member, and I will again remind the member to speak on the topic; otherwise I will have to interrupt your debate. Thank you. *Interjections*.

The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard): Order. Please continue on the subject. **MPP Jill Andrew:** As for newspapers—thank you very much, Conservative government—it is these very important announcements about new schools, new residential or nonresidential builds and other important municipal public notices that should be easily accessible in newspaper publications, and this bill's extension of the definition of "newspaper" helps to democratize information by making it accessible. Furthermore, it is important to note that, unlike mainstream newspapers, which often hide behind a costprohibitive paywall, it is local community-based newspapers that are often free without cost barriers.

According to one CTV News London story, at the end of January, papers in St. Thomas, Sarnia and Owen Sound scaled back their publications to three days a week. The move is reported as part of a broader initiative by Postmedia, the owner of multiple daily newspapers across Canada. The company cited, in this case, digital transformation and the changes in news consumption patterns of their readers as a rationale. But let's face it, for many other communities, rural and even northern Ontarians, digital consumption remains a luxury with less-than-ideal highspeed Internet available.

Gordon Cameron, the president and interim executive director of the Ontario Community Newspapers Association, is also in support of this bill. We reached out to him for a comment:

"The Ontario Community Newspapers Association (OCNA) is in support of ensuring the continued publication of public notices in printed community newspapers and welcomes the redefinition of 'newspaper' under Bill 73 to include papers that publish at least monthly. OCNA currently has 19 members who, in spite of being purveyors of high-quality local news, are currently barred from carrying public notices due to the definitions under the acts mentioned in Bill 73. This does a great disservice to Ontarians." I would agree with Gordon.

"Community newspapers are often the only source of trustworthy local news in many of Ontario's communities, especially, but not exclusively, in the province's rural and northern areas, several of which do not have reliable highspeed Internet service. Many community newspapers also publish in-language news and information for many of the province's linguistic and cultural communities.

"We believe that is important for the provincial and municipal governments to connect with Ontarians through trusted and time-tested sources of news and information. Our members invest millions of dollars a year into gathering and disseminating local news."

Cameron continues: "Our communities look to us to learn about what their local, provincial and national governments are doing and how it will affect them. The revenue derived from public notices and other government advertising helps our members to fulfill their watchdog role and to keep their communities informed."

#### 1820

I want to also take a moment to thank organizations like the Canadian Ethnic Media Association, formerly the Canadian Ethnic Journalists and Writers Club, their entire team and Chair Madeline Ziniak; and the National Ethnic Press and Media Council of Canada, their entire team and its president and CEO, Mr. Thomas S. Saras. These organizations and their members are critical to our democracy and are leaders in Ontario and to Canada's ethnic community and multilingual news media producers, members and member associations. They represent hundreds of ethnic and community journalists, the ultimate storytellers through print, radio, television and online journalism, as well as creative writing.

CEMA's emphasis is on the exchange of ideas, and CEMA has spoken out on pressing topics such as the exclusion of ethnic journalists from sources of news and information open to mainstream media. I am also proud to share in this House that, as a former news columnist, I was the proud recipient of two Canadian Ethnic Media Association awards for journalistic excellence. Those memories remain some of my fondest memories in my professional career, and I've been very lucky to have had several since.

In 2020, I wrote a letter to the then Minister of Heritage, Sport, Tourism and Culture Industries, the member from Nepean, calling for the Conservative government to fund an ethnic and community media stabilization fund, with allocated advertising dollars for ethnic and community outlets. This was especially necessary as community newspapers and news outlets were experiencing the drying-up of advertising revenue. Many had to shut their doors during COVID and were calling for direct support from the provincial government. I fully supported this call. Sadly, the Conservative government did not respond to our calls.

Ethnic, local and multilingual media producers represent an integral part of who we are as Ontarians. They tell our diverse stories, without ethnocentric or Eurocentric bias, and keep many, including seniors, connected to current news. Community news publishers and producers should have received direct financial provincial support during the pandemic. That was a missed moment by this government to help our community news industry.

Share Newspaper/Share Communications was founded by a visionary, its publisher, Arnold A. Auguste. Located in our Oakwood-Vaughan community, it is a leader in ethnic press and has told our stories and kept Black GTA communities near and far connected to local and international news for decades. On April 9 of this year, they will celebrate 45 years of publication. I was thrilled to see the city of Toronto municipal "Let's Get TO Vaccinated" public notices featured in their content.

As Auguste says, "Unlike most dailies, the focus of community newspapers is primarily to provide positive news about their target markets and to give their readers valuable information and stories they normally would not get in the mainstream media. Share is no different. Most of the stories on local events covered in Share do not appear anywhere else.... That is why there is always such a demand by readers for Share."

Auguste concludes, "Share's mandate has been to encourage, support, represent positively and to defend the community vigorously while educating and sharing information." I also want to take this opportunity this evening to thank Caribbean Camera newspaper publisher Anthony Joseph for their steadfast news coverage of our Black and Caribbean communities for the past 33 years and counting. I also thank Kiffayette Mohammed and Raynier Maharaj, who were seminal to its success back in its earlier years. According to Joseph, the Caribbean Camera is the only ethnic newspaper that has been a member of the Queen's Park press gallery and is often consulted on Canadian politics. I'd like to think that all ethnic newspapers would be welcomed to the Queen's Park press gallery considering the undisputed diversity of our province.

They, too, had to scale back due to the pandemic. They published as an e-paper in the early stages of the pandemic and now, as things have begun to open up a bit, they have continued the weekly e-paper while printing biweekly. This bill will directly support them.

I appreciate Bill 73 as the first step to help our community newspapers, but I hope the government will recognize the needs and formidable impact of local, rural, community and ethnic newspapers to local democracy and civic engagement, and will support them through direct funding. The Minister of Citizenship and Multiculturalism, Mr. Ford, has expressed his love of diversity in Ontario. I say, "Show us the money."

Sadly, the current 2023 Conservative budget provides no direct funding for Ontario's community newspapers, such as some of these ethnic publications I have mentioned today, and I never did hear back from this Conservative government about my request, echoing ethnic community news creators, for an Ontario ethnic and community media stabilization fund. I hope today the government will reconsider.

# The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard): Further debate?

**Ms. Goldie Ghamari:** Madam Speaker, I'm pleased to stand here today in the Legislature to talk about the Supporting Ontario's Community, Rural and Agricultural Newspapers Act. I first introduced this bill back in 2019, and literally four years ago to this day, on March 28, 2019, I spoke about this at second reading. And so I'm pleased to work with MPP Sarrazin, the fantastic member of Parliament for Glengarry–Prescott–Russell, in this session to reintroduce this important piece of legislation.

Community newspapers bring high-value engagement and trust to all levels of government messaging, and some 82% of Ontario citizens read their local community newspapers. Community newspapers like the Manotick Messenger and Ottawa Community Voice in my riding of Carleton are the voice of their community and strong contributors to their local economies.

Madam Speaker, this proposed private member's bill has its roots in my riding of Carleton. This issue was originally brought to my attention by Mr. Jeffrey Morris, who owns two local community papers: the Manotick Messenger and the Barrhaven Independent. I'd like to thank Mr. Morris for bringing this issue to my attention all those years ago and for inspiring me to write my first private member's bill about such an important issue. Community newspapers are vitally important sources of information in Carleton and in other rural and northern communities throughout Ontario. They are also relied upon by many immigrant and new Canadian communities as crucial sources of local, non-traditional English news. The proposed changes will help ensure the viability of these newspapers, enabling them to continue to bring their communities together and to provide residents with crucial local news.

Turning now to the content of the private member's bill: Municipalities are required to post notice to the public for relevant community works, events, consultations and other things. These notices are often required to be tendered to the public via postings in community papers. The current definition of "newspaper" in the Legislation Act reads as follows:

"newspaper', in a provision requiring publication, means a document that,

"(a) is printed in sheet form, published at regular intervals of a week or less and circulated to the general public, and

"(b) consists primarily of news of current events of general interest;"

This definition of a newspaper, contained within the Legislation Act, 2006, is a standard used by municipalities for the purpose of providing public notice in the following acts: the City of Toronto Act, the Development Charges Act, the Environmental Assessment Act, the Municipal Act, the Ontario Heritage Act and the Planning Act.

Increasingly, community papers, particularly those in northern and rural Ontario, are published on a biweekly or monthly basis, because of the disastrous policies made by the previous government, such as increasing red tape, increasing hydro bills, increasing taxes and increasing their overall bottom line, which has led many of them to look at cost-cutting efforts in order to maintain their small, independently owned businesses. By limiting their publications to biweekly or monthly, municipalities are not then able to post notices in these publications anymore, because they do not fit the standard definition of "newspaper," so not only are these community papers losing out on a potential source of revenue that would help support local businesses, but it also makes it difficult for municipalities to inform local populations of relevant local news.

#### 1830

To fix this problem, this legislation is proposing to amend the definition of "newspaper" to mean a publication that is published once a month or more frequently. This way, Madam Speaker, with this amendment, we are able to increase the number of community papers that municipalities will be able to post notices in and communicate with local communities. To clarify, this change does not mandate that municipalities must now provide notice in all of these papers; all it does is broaden the scope of potential newspapers.

The requirement that municipal notices be posted in newspapers with a publishing frequency of weekly or less has prevented many smaller community papers from being able to post these municipal notices, putting them at a competitive disadvantage. Amending the definition of "newspaper" to those which have a publishing frequency of a month or less will help even the playing field for many local community newspapers, like the Manotick Messenger and Ottawa Community Voice, and could add to their bottom line.

We have received broad support for this private member's bill from key stakeholders in Ontario. I'd like to thank Caroline Medwell and everyone from the Ontario Community Newspapers Association for their support.

I'd like to end my speech by thanking Mr. Jeffrey Morris for bringing this issue to me in the first place. I'd like to thank everyone here today for joining me in this debate. I'd like to thank the member from Glengarry– Prescott–Russell for working with me to reintroduce this legislation that I introduced four years ago. I hope that after listening to my comments, everyone in the House can join me and support Supporting Ontario's Community, Rural and Agricultural Newspapers Act.

The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard): Further debate? The member for Hastings–Lennox and Addington.

**Mr. Ric Bresee:** Good evening, Speaker, and thank you. I will be sharing my time this evening with the member from Thornhill.

I rise today in support of Bill 73, Supporting Ontario's Community, Rural and Agricultural Newspapers Act. I want to thank my incredible colleagues the MPP from Carleton and the MPP from Glengarry–Prescott–Russell for bringing forward this important issue.

Newspapers have a very long history and a very important history within our small communities. In fact, in many cases I have to say that they are the histories of these small communities. As we live our day-to-day lives, we don't often take the time to reflect on keeping records of our daily lives, but it is the small local community that records the local Lions Club fish fries or the winners of the Peewee House League. They report that the local firefighters saved the house from burning down on Friday and then rescued the cat from the storm sewer on Saturday. They report on the small town council activities and the passing of some dear community friends.

Speaker, when I was about 11 years old, I had the privilege of being recorded in a then-thriving small-town newspaper, the Amherstview Heritage newspaper. I had my picture on the front cover as I was introduced to the local fire chief because I had made the very best model fire truck out of Play-Doh. By the way, I was also a delivery boy for that newspaper, so I got to walk around the three blocks around my house carrying a newspaper with the front page with my picture on it, and I got to deliver that to all of my neighbours—definitely a high point in my 11-year-old life. No, I don't think it will actually be an historic moment, but I do think that these local small newspapers are a unique historic perspective on the life in and around many small communities.

Unfortunately, by the time I later joined council in that municipality, the Amherstview Heritage had closed its doors and stopped publishing for many years. In that community in Loyalist township, in a municipality of 18,000 people, there is not a single weekly newspaper published within its borders. As such, the staff of the council of Loyalist had to regularly make use of the newspapers in neighbouring jurisdictions, right? We questioned the efficacy of that. Were they being read by most people in the township, the newspaper in the larger city to our west or the smaller town to our east? There was no obvious answer to that question, but the regulations required us to provide such announcements. That was a challenge for Loyalist township, and is a continuing challenge for many of the small-population towns and townships across my riding and right across the province.

For those who don't use the Internet, the traditional communications channels are often reading the local paper when you're stopped at the village gas bar or picking up the paper at the grocery store or even reading pieces of it posted to the bulletin board at your community church.

There are many small newspapers that are published for a targeted audience. In my home area, there's a wonderful little monthly paper—more of a newsletter than a paper called the Amherst Island Beacon. It can be up to 20 pages at times. It is a wonderful publication, and I hope it continues to thrive.

This bill helps to address changes and modernize the publications requirement for government agencies, and in doing so, may, in fact, provide a lifeline to those smalltown papers, a key tool in preserving our history and recording the lives of Ontarians across the province.

I'm happy to support this bill and encourage all members of this House to support it.

At this time, I pass my remaining time to the member from Thornhill.

The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard): The member for Thornhill.

**Ms. Laura Smith:** I'm honoured to stand here before the House to speak to this private member's bill, Supporting Ontario's Community, Rural and Agricultural Newspapers Act.

Locally owned newspapers play a vital role in the functioning of our democracy and they strengthen our communities. They ensure that residents are informed about community events, consultations and announcements in a timely manner, especially following a pandemic. The truth of the matter is that many residents across Ontario rely upon local newspapers as a critical source of information. This is especially the case for newcomers and immigrants to our communities, many of whom find their home in my community of Thornhill.

Every year, Ontario welcomes hundreds of newcomers thousands. Third-language media are an invaluable source of accessible information and help newcomers settle and feel more comfortable in their communities. Many of these small newspapers, especially those in rural communities, are struggling to stay current with the rise of social and emedia. They have to reduce their publishing frequency. This means they no longer meet the current definition of a newspaper as defined in the act.

Though Thornhill is by no means rural, there are still many small printed publications in my riding, such as Kol Echad, which brings news and events to our local community and helps my constituents feel more connected. The disqualification of newspapers based on publication frequency means that they cannot advertise municipal changes, which are critical and crucial pillars of information. Timely access to information on these changes is necessary for the people of our communities to participate actively in the democratic process. It undermines their ability to continue to deliver important information to the hands of residents if we to don't this.

When we support small businesses like these newspapers, we are supporting local communities and we're strengthening our economy—

The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard): We've reached the end of the time. I apologize; I need to interrupt here.

Further debate? The member has two minutes to reply.

**Mr. Stéphane Sarrazin:** This change will provide more access to information by encouraging local papers to stay in operation and will promote the news that is of general interest, which is important to the way of life of people across Ontario, specifically in our rural and northern communities.

It's critical that rural and remote residents in Ontario maintain access to news that is not electronic. This bill does not only support my riding of Glengarry–Prescott– Russell, but it will support all rural and northern communities across Ontario. It is a bill that will be strengthening the fabric of our rural and northern communities, and one that I'm proud to be sponsor of.

En terminant, j'aimerais souligner que, pour moi, c'est un honneur de pouvoir participer à ce que nos journaux locaux puissent prendre plus de place dans nos communautés. Puis, en terminant, j'aimerais dire que je supporte ce projet de loi et j'encourage tous mes collègues à faire de même. Merci.

The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard): The time provided for private members' public business has expired.

Mr. Sarrazin has moved second reading of Bill 73, An Act to amend various Acts with respect to the publication of notices in newspapers. Is it the pleasure of the House that the motion carry? I declare the motion carried.

Second reading agreed to.

The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard): Pursuant to standing order 100(h), the bill is referred to the Committee of the Whole House, unless—

**Mr. Stéphane Sarrazin:** I would like to refer it to the Standing Committee on Heritage, Infrastructure and Cultural Policy.

The Acting Speaker (M<sup>me</sup> Lucille Collard): Is the majority in favour of the bill being referred to the Standing Committee on Heritage, Infrastructure and Cultural Policy? Agreed. The bill is referred to the Standing Committee on Heritage, Infrastructure and Cultural Policy.

All matters relating to private members' public business having been completed, this House stands adjourned until 9 a.m. on Wednesday, March 29, 2023.

The House adjourned at 1840.

# LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF ONTARIO ASSEMBLÉE LÉGISLATIVE DE L'ONTARIO

Lieutenant Governor / Lieutenante-gouverneure: Hon. / L'hon. Elizabeth Dowdeswell, OC, OOnt. Speaker / Président: Hon. / L'hon. Ted Arnott Clerk / Greffier: Todd Decker Deputy Clerk / Sous-greffier: Trevor Day Clerks-at-the-Table / Greffiers parlementaires: Valerie Quioc Lim, Wai Lam (William) Wong, Meghan Stenson, Christopher Tyrell

Temporary Sergeant-at-Arms / Sergent d'armes par intérim: Mike Civil

Member and Party / Député(e) et parti	Constituency / Circonscription	Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités
Anand, Deepak (PC)	Mississauga—Malton	
Andrew, Jill (NDP)	Toronto—St. Paul's	
Armstrong, Teresa J. (NDP)	London—Fanshawe	
Arnott, Hon. / L'hon. Ted (PC)	Wellington—Halton Hills	Speaker / Président de l'Assemblée législative
Babikian, Aris (PC)	Scarborough—Agincourt	
Bailey, Robert (PC)	Sarnia—Lambton	
Barnes, Patrice (PC)	Ajax	Second Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Deuxième vice-présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée législative
Begum, Doly (NDP)	Scarborough Southwest / Scarborough Sud-Ouest	I-Deputy Leader, Official Opposition / Chef adjointe de l'opposition officielle
Bell, Jessica (NDP)	University—Rosedale	
Bethlenfalvy, Hon. / L'hon. Peter (PC)	Pickering—Uxbridge	Minister of Finance / Ministre des Finances
Blais, Stephen (LIB)	Orléans	
Bouma, Will (PC)	Brantford—Brant	
Bourgouin, Guy (NDP)	Mushkegowuk—James Bay / Mushkegowuk—Baie James	
Bowman, Stephanie (LIB)	Don Valley West / Don Valley-Ouest	
Brady, Bobbi Ann (IND)	Haldimand—Norfolk	
Bresee, Ric (PC)	Hastings—Lennox and Addington	
Burch, Jeff (NDP)	Niagara Centre / Niagara-Centre	
Byers, Rick (PC)	Bruce—Grey—Owen Sound	
Calandra, Hon. / L'hon. Paul (PC)	Markham—Stouffville	Minister of Legislative Affairs / Ministre des Affaires législatives Minister of Long-Term Care / Ministre des Soins de longue durée Government House Leader / Leader parlementaire du gouvernement
Cho, Hon. / L'hon. Raymond Sung Joon (PC)	Scarborough North / Scarborough- Nord	Minister for Seniors and Accessibility / Ministre des Services aux aînés et de l'Accessibilité
Cho, Hon. / L'hon. Stan (PC)	Willowdale	Associate Minister of Transportation / Ministre associé des Transports
Clark, Hon. / L'hon. Steve (PC)	and Rideau Lakes / Leeds— Grenville—Thousand Islands et Rideau Lakes	Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing / Ministre des Affaires municipales et du Logement
Coe, Lorne (PC)	Whitby	
Collard, Lucille (LIB)	Ottawa—Vanier	Third Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Troisième vice-présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée législative
Crawford, Stephen (PC)	Oakville	
Cuzzetto, Rudy (PC)	Mississauga—Lakeshore	
Dixon, Jess (PC)	Kitchener South—Hespeler / Kitchener-Sud—Hespeler	
Dowie, Andrew (PC)	Windsor—Tecumseh	
Downey, Hon. / L'hon. Doug (PC)	Barrie-Springwater-Oro-Medonte	Attorney General / Procureur général
Dunlop, Hon. / L'hon. Jill (PC)	Simcoe North / Simcoe-Nord	Minister of Colleges and Universities / Ministre des Collèges et Universités
Fedeli, Hon. / L'hon. Victor (PC)	Nipissing	Chair of Cabinet / Président du Conseil des ministres Minister of Economic Development, Job Creation and Trade / Ministre du Développement économique, de la Création d'emplois et du Commerce
Fife, Catherine (NDP)	Waterloo	
Flack, Rob (PC)	Elgin—Middlesex—London	

Member and Party / Député(e) et parti	Constituency / Circonscription	Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités
Ford, Hon. / L'hon. Doug (PC)	Etobicoke North / Etobicoke-Nord	Minister of Intergovernmental Affairs / Ministre des Affaires intergouvernementales Premier / Premier ministre
		Leader, Progressive Conservative Party of Ontario / Chef du Parti progressiste-conservateur de l'Ontario
Ford, Hon. / L'hon. Michael D. (PC)	York South—Weston / York-Sud– Weston	Minister of Citizenship and Multiculturalism / Ministre des Affaires civiques et du Multiculturalisme
Fraser, John (LIB)	Ottawa South / Ottawa-Sud	1
French, Jennifer K. (NDP)	Oshawa	
Gallagher Murphy, Dawn (PC)	Newmarket—Aurora	
Gates, Wayne (NDP)	Niagara Falls	
Gélinas, France (NDP)	Nickel Belt	
Ghamari, Goldie (PC)	Carleton	
Gill, Hon. / L'hon. Parm (PC)	Milton	Minister of Red Tape Reduction / Ministre de la Réduction des formalités administratives
Glover, Chris (NDP)	Spadina—Fort York	
Gretzky, Lisa (NDP)	Windsor West / Windsor-Ouest	
Grewal, Hardeep Singh (PC)	Brampton East / Brampton-Est	
Hardeman, Ernie (PC)	Oxford	
Harden, Joel (NDP)	Ottawa Centre / Ottawa-Centre	
Harris, Mike (PC)	Kitchener—Conestoga	
Hogarth, Christine (PC)	Etobicoke—Lakeshore	
Holland, Kevin (PC)	Thunder Bay—Atikokan	
Hsu, Ted (LIB)	Kingston and the Islands / Kingston et les Îles	
Hunter, Mitzie (LIB)	Scarborough—Guildwood	
Jama, Sarah (NDP)	Hamilton Centre / Hamilton-Centre	
Jones, Hon. / L'hon. Sylvia (PC)	Dufferin-Caledon	Deputy Premier / Vice-première ministre Minister of Health / Ministre de la Santé
Jones, Trevor (PC)	Chatham-Kent-Leamington	
Jordan, John (PC)	Lanark—Frontenac—Kingston	
Kanapathi, Logan (PC)	Markham—Thornhill	
Karpoche, Bhutila (NDP)	Parkdale—High Park	First Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Première vice-présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée
Ke, Vincent (IND)	Don Valley North / Don Valley-Nord	
Kernaghan, Terence (NDP)	London North Centre / London- Centre-Nord	Deputy Opposition House Leader / Leader parlementaire adjoint de l'opposition officielle
Kerzner, Hon. / L'hon. Michael S. (PC) Khanjin, Andrea (PC)	York Centre / York-Centre Barrie—Innisfil	Solicitor General / Solliciteur général Deputy Government House Leader / Leader parlementaire adjointe du gouvernement
Kusendova-Bashta, Natalia (PC)	Mississauga Centre / Mississauga- Centre	
Leardi, Anthony (PC)	Essex	
Lecce, Hon. / L'hon. Stephen (PC)	King—Vaughan	Minister of Education / Ministre de l'Éducation
Lindo, Laura Mae (NDP)	Kitchener Centre / Kitchener-Centre	
Lumsden, Hon. / L'hon. Neil (PC)	Hamilton East—Stoney Creek / Hamilton-Est–Stoney Creek	Minister of Tourism, Culture and Sport / Ministre du Tourisme, de la Culture et du Sport
MacLeod, Lisa (PC)	Nepean	
Mamakwa, Sol (NDP)	Kiiwetinoong	Deputy Leader, Official Opposition / Chef adjoint de l'opposition officielle
Mantha, Michael (NDP)	Algoma-Manitoulin	
Martin, Robin (PC)	Eglinton—Lawrence	
McCarthy, Todd J. (PC)	Durham	
McGregor, Graham (PC)	Brampton North / Brampton-Nord	
McMahon, Mary-Margaret (LIB)	Beaches—East York / Beaches–East York	
McNaughton, Hon. / L'hon. Monte (PC)	Lambton—Kent—Middlesex	Minister of Labour, Immigration, Training and Skills Development / Ministre du Travail, de l'Immigration, de la Formation et du Développement des compétences
Mulroney, Hon. / L'hon. Caroline (PC)	York—Simcoe	Minister of Francophone Affairs / Ministre des Affaires francophones Minister of Transportation / Ministre des Transports
Oosterhoff, Sam (PC)	Niagara West / Niagara-Ouest	·

Member and Party / Député(e) et parti	Constituency / Circonscription	Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités
Pang, Billy (PC)	Markham—Unionville	
Parsa, Hon. / L'hon. Michael (PC)	Aurora—Oak Ridges—Richmond Hill	Minister of Children, Community and Social Services / Ministre des Services à l'enfance et des Services sociaux et communautaires
asma, Chandra (NDP)	Ottawa West—Nepean / Ottawa- Ouest–Nepean	
iccini, Hon. / L'hon. David (PC)	Northumberland—Peterborough South / Northumberland—Peterborough-Sud	Minister of the Environment, Conservation and Parks / Ministre de l'Environnement, de la Protection de la nature et des Parcs
Pierre, Natalie (PC)	Burlington	
'irie, Hon. / L'hon. George (PC)	Timmins	Minister of Mines / Ministre des Mines
Quinn, Nolan (PC)	Stormont—Dundas—South Glengarry	
Rae, Matthew (PC)	Perth—Wellington	
Rakocevic, Tom (NDP)	Humber River—Black Creek	
Rasheed, Hon. / L'hon. Kaleed (PC)	Mississauga East—Cooksville /	Minister of Public and Business Service Delivery / Ministre des
	Mississauga-Est-Cooksville	Services au public et aux entreprises
Rickford, Hon. / L'hon. Greg (PC)	Kenora—Rainy River	Minister of Indigenous Affairs / Ministre des Affaires autochtones
		Minister of Northern Development / Ministre du Développement du Nord
iddell, Brian (PC)	Cambridge	
lomano, Ross (PC)	Sault Ste. Marie	
abawy, Sheref (PC)	Mississauga—Erin Mills	
andhu, Amarjot (PC)	Brampton West / Brampton-Ouest	
arkaria, Hon. / L'hon. Prabmeet Singh PC)	Brampton South / Brampton-Sud	President of the Treasury Board / Président du Conseil du Trésor
arrazin, Stéphane (PC)	Glengarry-Prescott-Russell	
attler, Peggy (NDP)	London West / London-Ouest	
aunderson, Brian (PC)	Simcoe—Grey	
chreiner, Mike (GRN)	Guelph	
cott, Laurie (PC)	Haliburton—Kawartha Lakes—Brock	
hamji, Adil (LIB)	Don Valley East / Don Valley-Est	
haw, Sandy (NDP)	Hamilton West—Ancaster—Dundas /	
,	Hamilton-Ouest—Ancaster—Dundas	
kelly, Donna (PC)	Flamborough—Glanbrook	Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Vice-présidente et présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée Deputy Speaker / Vice-présidente
Smith, Dave (PC)	Peterborough—Kawartha	1 2 1 1
Smith, David (PC)	Scarborough Centre / Scarborough-	
/	Centre	
mith, Hon. / L'hon. Graydon (PC)	Parry Sound—Muskoka	Minister of Natural Resources and Forestry / Ministre des Richesses naturelles et des Forêts
S <b>mith, Hon. / L'hon. Todd (PC)</b> Smith, Laura (PC)	Bay of Quinte / Baie de Quinte Thornhill	Minister of Energy / Ministre de l'Énergie
Stevens, Jennifer (Jennie) (NDP)	St. Catharines	
Stiles, Marit (NDP)	Davenport	Leader, Official Opposition / Chef de l'opposition officielle
. /	-	Leader, New Democratic Party of Ontario / Chef du Nouveau parti démocratique de l'Ontario
urma, Hon. / L'hon. Kinga (PC) abuns, Peter (NDP)	Etobicoke Centre / Etobicoke-Centre Toronto—Danforth	Minister of Infrastructure / Ministre de l'Infrastructure
Tangri, Hon. / L'hon. Nina (PC)	Mississauga—Streetsville	Associate Minister of Housing / Ministre associée du Logement
aylor, Monique (NDP)	Hamilton Mountain / Hamilton- Mountain	
hanigasalam, Vijay (PC)	Scarborough—Rouge Park	
hompson, Hon. / L'hon. Lisa M. (PC)	Huron—Bruce	Minister of Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs / Ministre de
		l'Agriculture, de l'Alimentation et des Affaires rurales
ibollo, Hon. / L'hon. Michael A. (PC)	Vaughan—Woodbridge	Associate Minister of Mental Health and Addictions / Ministre associé délégué au dossier de la Santé mentale et de la Lutte contre les dépendances
Friantafilopoulos, Effie J. (PC)	Oakville North—Burlington / Oakville-Nord—Burlington	1
Vanthof, John (NDP)	Timiskaming—Cochrane	Opposition House Leader / Leader parlementaire de l'opposition officielle
Vaugeois, Lise (NDP)	Thunder Bay—Superior North / Thunder Bay–Supérieur-Nord	
Wai, Daisy (PC)	Richmond Hill	

Constituency / Circonscription	Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités
Sudbury	
Brampton Centre / Brampton-Centre	Associate Minister of Women's Social and Economic Opportunity / Ministre associée des Perspectives sociales et économiques pour les femmes
(DP) Toronto Centre / Toronto-Centre Renfrew—Nipissing—Pembroke	
	Circonscription Sudbury Brampton Centre / Brampton-Centre Toronto Centre / Toronto-Centre