

Legislative  
Assembly  
of Ontario



Assemblée  
législative  
de l'Ontario

---

**Official Report  
of Debates  
(Hansard)**

No. 29A

**Journal  
des débats  
(Hansard)**

N° 29A

1<sup>st</sup> Session  
43<sup>rd</sup> Parliament  
Thursday  
17 November 2022

1<sup>re</sup> session  
43<sup>e</sup> législature  
Jeudi  
17 novembre 2022

---

Speaker: Honourable Ted Arnott  
Clerk: Todd Decker

Président : L'honorable Ted Arnott  
Greffier : Todd Decker

### **Hansard on the Internet**

Hansard and other documents of the Legislative Assembly can be on your personal computer within hours after each sitting. The address is:

<https://www.ola.org/>

### **Index inquiries**

Reference to a cumulative index of previous issues may be obtained by calling the Hansard Reporting Service indexing staff at 416-325-7400.

### **Le Journal des débats sur Internet**

L'adresse pour faire paraître sur votre ordinateur personnel le Journal et d'autres documents de l'Assemblée législative en quelques heures seulement après la séance est :

### **Renseignements sur l'index**

Adressez vos questions portant sur des numéros précédents du Journal des débats au personnel de l'index, qui vous fourniront des références aux pages dans l'index cumulatif, en composant le 416-325-7400.

---

House Publications and Language Services  
Room 500, West Wing, Legislative Building  
111 Wellesley Street West, Queen's Park  
Toronto ON M7A 1A2  
Telephone 416-325-7400  
Published by the Legislative Assembly of Ontario



Service linguistique et des publications parlementaires  
Salle 500, aile ouest, Édifice du Parlement  
111, rue Wellesley ouest, Queen's Park  
Toronto ON M7A 1A2  
Téléphone, 416-325-7400  
Publié par l'Assemblée législative de l'Ontario

ISSN 1180-2987

# CONTENTS / TABLE DES MATIÈRES

Thursday 17 November 2022 / Jeudi 17 novembre 2022

## ORDERS OF THE DAY / ORDRE DU JOUR

### Better Municipal Governance Act, 2022, Bill 39, Mr. Clark / Loi de 2022 visant à améliorer la gouvernance municipale, projet de loi 39, M. Clark

Hon. Steve Clark .....	1437
Hon. Michael Parsa .....	1440
Mr. Kevin Holland .....	1442
Ms. Catherine Fife .....	1444
Mr. Aris Babikian .....	1445
Ms. Teresa J. Armstrong .....	1445
Mr. Rob Flack .....	1445
Ms. Marit Stiles .....	1446
Mr. Jeff Burch .....	1446
Second reading debate deemed adjourned .....	1447

## MEMBERS' STATEMENTS / DÉCLARATIONS DES DÉPUTÉES ET DÉPUTÉS

### David Murphy

Mr. Nolan Quinn .....	1447
-----------------------	------

### Ogimaa Shining Turtle

Mr. Michael Mantha .....	1447
--------------------------	------

### Homebound Wellness Centre

Ms. Patrice Barnes .....	1448
--------------------------	------

### Poverty and homelessness

Ms. Chandra Pasma .....	1448
-------------------------	------

### Operation Jubilee

Mrs. Daisy Wai .....	1448
----------------------	------

### United Steelworkers

MPP Jamie West .....	1448
----------------------	------

### Volunteers

Mr. Deepak Anand .....	1449
------------------------	------

### Environmental protection

Mr. Ted Hsu .....	1449
-------------------	------

### Oxi Day

Mr. Aris Babikian .....	1449
-------------------------	------

### Cancer Warrior Canada Foundation

Mr. Amarjot Sandhu .....	1449
--------------------------	------

### Special report, Auditor General

The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott) .....	1450
-------------------------------------	------

## INTRODUCTION OF VISITORS / PRÉSENTATION DES VISITEUSES ET VISITEURS

MPP Jill Andrew .....	1450
Hon. Michael A. Tibollo .....	1450
MPP Kristyn Wong-Tam .....	1450
Hon. Graydon Smith .....	1450

Mr. Kevin Holland .....	1450
MPP Kristyn Wong-Tam .....	1450
Mrs. Daisy Wai .....	1450
Mr. Sheref Sabawy .....	1450

## QUESTION PERIOD / PÉRIODE DE QUESTIONS

### Health care

Mr. Peter Tabuns .....	1450
Mrs. Robin Martin .....	1450
Mme France Gélinas .....	1451

### Labour dispute

MPP Jamie West .....	1451
Hon. Stephen Lecce .....	1451

### Municipal government

Mr. Jeff Burch .....	1452
Hon. Steve Clark .....	1453

### Economic development

Mr. Hardeep Singh Grewal .....	1453
Hon. Victor Fedeli .....	1453

### Government accountability

Ms. Jennifer K. French .....	1454
Hon. Steve Clark .....	1454

### Violence against women

Ms. Natalie Pierre .....	1454
Hon. Charmaine A. Williams .....	1455

### Environmental protection

Mr. Peter Tabuns .....	1455
Mr. John Yakabuski .....	1455

### Labour dispute

Ms. Mitzie Hunter .....	1456
Hon. Stephen Lecce .....	1456

### Victims of crime

Ms. Goldie Ghamari .....	1457
Hon. Doug Downey .....	1457

### Food banks

Ms. Doly Begum .....	1457
Hon. Peter Bethlenfalvy .....	1457

### Foreign-trained health care workers

Mr. Vincent Ke .....	1458
Mrs. Robin Martin .....	1458

### Hospital services

Mr. Guy Bourgouin .....	1459
Mrs. Robin Martin .....	1459
Mr. Wayne Gates .....	1459

### Entrepreneuriat francophone

M. Stéphane Sarrazin .....	1459
Mme Natalia Kusendova-Bashta .....	1459

**Health care**

MPP Kristyn Wong-Tam ..... 1460  
Mrs. Robin Martin..... 1460

**Business of the House**

Hon. Paul Calandra ..... 1461

**Committee sittings**

Hon. Paul Calandra ..... 1461

**Correction of record**

Ms. Mitzie Hunter ..... 1461

**DEFERRED VOTES / VOTES DIFFÉRÉS**

**Progress on the Plan to Build Act (Budget Measures), 2022, Bill 36, Mr. Bethlenfalvy / Loi de 2022 sur la progression du plan pour bâtir (mesures budgétaires), projet de loi 36, M. Bethlenfalvy**

Second reading agreed to ..... 1463

**Member's birthday**

Mr. John Yakabuski ..... 1463

LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY  
OF ONTARIO

Thursday 17 November 2022

ASSEMBLÉE LÉGISLATIVE  
DE L'ONTARIO

Jeudi 17 novembre 2022

*The House met at 0900.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Good morning. Let us pray.

*Prières / Prayers.*

ORDERS OF THE DAY

BETTER MUNICIPAL  
GOVERNANCE ACT, 2022

LOI DE 2022 VISANT À AMÉLIORER  
LA GOUVERNANCE MUNICIPALE

Mr. Clark moved second reading of the following bill:

Bill 39, An Act to amend the City of Toronto Act, 2006 and the Municipal Act, 2001 and to enact the Duffins Rouge Agricultural Preserve Repeal Act, 2022 / Projet de loi 39, Loi visant à modifier la Loi de 2006 sur la cité de Toronto et la Loi de 2001 sur les municipalités et à édicter la Loi de 2022 abrogeant la Loi sur la Réserve agricole de Duffins-Rouge.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Would the minister care to lead off the debate?

**Hon. Steve Clark:** I would love to, Speaker. It's a real pleasure and a privilege to rise for second reading of our government's proposed Better Municipal Governance Act, 2022. At the outset of our government's leadoff, I want to indicate to you that I'm going to be sharing my time with two great parliamentarians: the Associate Minister of Housing, the Honourable Michael Parsa; and the parliamentary assistant to the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing, MPP Kevin Holland. Both the associate minister and the parliamentary assistant will be touching on some specific items in the proposed legislation. Speaker, it's great to see you in the chair, and I want to welcome all the members to debate for this very, very important bill for our government.

Speaker, I want to take you back to June. Our government was re-elected with a very strong mandate to help more Ontarians find a home that meets their needs and their budget. Our ministry, the Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing, continues to play an essential role in fulfilling the mandate, under the leadership of Premier Ford, who has made it crystal clear from day one that this issue is an important priority for our government.

Let's talk about the housing crisis. Ontario is a prosperous and growing province—I think we can all agree that it's the best place in Canada to live and to call home—but increased demand for new homes and a lack of supply have been driving prices out of reach for too many

Ontarians who are struggling to find the right home. This is true for younger people eager to start a family in the community of their choosing; for newcomers who are ready to put down roots and begin a new life here in this great province of Ontario; and for seniors who are looking to downsize but wanting to stay near their family, their community and their loved ones. This is not just a big-city crisis. The housing supply shortage affects all Ontarians, whether you live in a rural or urban or suburban community, whether you live in the north or the south, whether you're young or old. Our government knows that we need to tackle this problem, and we know what must be done. We have to get this under control. That's why we remain laser-focused on policies that get more homes built faster.

We've introduced three housing supply action plans: More Homes, More Choice in 2019—this was our first housing supply action plan; More Homes for Everyone, which was put forward in March of this year; and our most recent plan, More Homes Built Faster, which was introduced on October 25 and continues to be debated in committee this week. And over the last four years, our government has introduced over 90 initiatives to build more housing. I think we can all agree that they're working well, because the numbers prove us right.

**Ms. Catherine Fife:** No, we don't.

**Hon. Steve Clark:** Well, again, the best year we've had in over 30 years the New Democrats say isn't a success. I think it is a success to have more housing starts than 1987—to have 100,000 starts, which is far higher than the 30-year average in Ontario of just 67,500. But again, members who are here today, you just heard what we're going to hear from the opposition later today. No matter how many initiatives, no matter what the success, you've got a faction over there that will continue to say no, when we all know, from the election in June, that Ontarians wanted a government that said yes.

Speaker, we've come a long way, but we know more needs to be done. We have to do more for us to reach our goal of 1.5 million new homes to be built over the next 10 years. Even though 100,000 starts last year were great, after all, we can all do the math, and it's not going to be enough to get us to that 1.5 million homes in the coming decade.

The reality in Ontario is that we expect to grow by more than two million people by 2031, with approximately one and a half million of those new residents deciding to come to the greater Golden Horseshoe. The federal government's recent announcement indicating that there would be an enhanced immigration target of a half million new

residents per year will put even further pressure on the existing housing market. We want to be able to welcome those newcomers to Ontario, because we know how important they are to the future of our province, but we also want to make sure that they're able to find a home they can afford. At the same time, we want to acknowledge that that same dream needs to be realized for long-standing residents of our province. That's why the government is going to continue to take decisive action to bring the housing crisis to an end.

I want to go back and talk about More Homes for Everyone. This was the last housing supply plan that was passed by this government, in March 2022. More Homes for Everyone was a suite of concrete actions the province put forward to address Ontario's housing crisis, from protecting homebuyers from unethical development practices to accelerating development time frames to get more homes built faster. More Homes for Everyone was built on a three-part consultation with industry, with municipalities and the public, looking at the lens of creating housing supply and affordability. These included creating the Housing Affordability Task Force, which interacted with a variety of stakeholders and developed a report with recommendations on additional measures to increase housing supply, to increase the supply of market housing, to address the housing crisis. They included meeting with big city mayors, regional chairs and representatives from rural, remote and northern municipalities. These discussions helped us coordinate and work together to build housing faster in our province.

#### 0910

Also, their consultation included an online public consultation on housing affordability. That consultation asked Ontarians, community groups and other stakeholders to share their input on how we can address the province's housing supply.

To support that plan from the task force, we passed legislation that's delivering some near-term solutions and that has made some long-range commitments.

First of all, we made the commitment to put more housing options within reach of Ontario families.

The government also committed—very transparent with Ontarians—to delivering housing supply action plans every year over the next four years, starting in 2022-23. The action plans are going to contain, and will continue to contain, policies and tools that support a number of things—multi-generational homes, gentle density, missing middle housing—and it's going to give us the ability as a government to fine-tune and evolve our approach to ending the housing crisis as circumstances change.

More Homes for Everyone was a plan that included measures to reduce red tape, to reduce bureaucratic inefficiencies that are plaguing development approvals, and to help municipalities move priority projects forward. These measures include our new tool, the new Community Infrastructure and Housing Accelerator. That tool helps municipalities expedite approvals for housing and community infrastructure like hospitals and community centres. Our plan also made changes to streamline site plan

requirements and approval processes that support consistency throughout the province, while taking the politics out of planning.

Now I'm going to talk about More Homes Built Faster. It is still in front of the Legislature. On October 25, we tabled that legislation. It was the next phase of our plan to address the housing supply crisis. As I said, it's in committee now, but those policies would, if they ultimately are passed, represent our boldest, most transformative efforts yet to cut through red tape, to cut through unnecessary costs, to stop bottlenecks that are standing in the way of housing supply that Ontarians need and deserve. The policies would provide the groundwork for growing housing supply by reducing the bureaucratic costs and red tape that are delaying construction, ultimately pushing housing prices higher; promoting the building of more homes near transit and creating more gentle density housing; protecting new home buyers and consulting on ways to help more renters become homeowners; and using provincial lands to build more attainable homes—something that I hear and I know my colleagues hear every time we have a consultation outside of the city of Toronto.

The proposals, if passed, would lay a very strong foundation which we need to build those 1.5 million homes that Ontarians desperately need. We know that if we don't address the barriers that cause housing delays, and we know that if we don't deal with the costs of building homes, to try to lower them so that the price of a home is reduced for the average buyer—these barriers have to be changed, and they include land access in urban areas, due to the complex land use policies, on top of very lengthy planning approvals for new housing.

While gentle density works in some cases, there are other times that bringing more housing, jobs, retail, public amenities close to transit is beneficial for our community—and our province's Transit-Oriented Communities Program will help that. It will help build more housing to address soaring home prices and provide more options for Ontarians. The program is just part of our plan to build new, complete, mixed-use communities near and around public transit. We're proposing to unlock new municipal funding tools so that municipalities can collect the fees and charges needed to participate in transit-oriented community projects. With more housing built closer to transit, more people can get to and from school and work much faster. We know that living closer to work saves money, allows people the opportunity to spend more time with family, and makes Ontarians' lives easier.

It doesn't matter what consultation we put forward; we have tremendous support from Ontarians for building upon the success of this program.

We're proud to be working with municipalities to deliver transit-oriented communities. It stands to reason that creating housing near transit stations delivers a myriad of benefits. We are increasing ridership, reducing traffic congestion, reducing emissions, stimulating economic growth. These projects are also very important because they create much-needed local services and convenience, and increased job opportunities, to improve residents'

quality of life. It means housing closer to where people work, play and shop. And it means less time in traffic, less time commuting, and more time with the people we love.

But to get there, our government needs to remove barriers and build more homes, which brings us here today to Bill 39, the Better Municipal Governance Act. I'm pleased to have presented this legislation in the House yesterday and to have it prioritized by the government today. The legislation builds upon our Strong Mayors, Building Homes Act, which was recently passed by the Legislature, and which the Associate Minister of Housing will expand on in a few minutes.

The Strong Mayors, Building Homes Act, along with the associated regulations, gives the mayors of Toronto and Ottawa the ability to drive policy changes, to select certain municipal department heads, and to bring forward budgets. The changes would help our municipal partners deliver on our shared priorities. And our government has made it clear that increased housing supply is one of those shared priorities.

Our government knows that empowered mayors can help the province and their municipalities work together on housing and other initiatives that are critical for their communities.

We just had a municipal election on October 24. In every council chamber and every election campaign, housing rang as either the top priority or near the top, in every corner of our province. So it makes sense that we build upon our Strong Mayors, Building Homes Act with this next phase in Bill 39 this morning. The new legislation would build on the tools in that first bill, the Strong Mayors, Building Homes Act, by proposing further changes to the Municipal Act and the City of Toronto Act. If this legislation is passed, the heads of council in the city of Toronto and Ottawa would have increased powers to align their municipal decision-making with provincial priorities—priorities like building 1.5 million new homes over the next 10 years, supporting the infrastructure for those new homes, and expanding the footprint of transit-oriented communities so that more people can live, work and play near convenient public transit. These mayors would also do this by proposing municipal bylaws that align with those provincial priorities, which council could then pass if more than one third of the members vote in favour.

Speaker, I know these proposals are bold, but they reflect the severity of the housing crisis that is facing Ontarians today and the need to cut through the harmful “not in my backyard” attitudes. Perhaps we might hear some of those attitudes in a few moments from members of the opposition; we might even hear the feeling that I think we're in Ontario now, and that's the feeling not of NIMBYism, but of BANANAism—“build absolutely nothing anywhere near anyone.” Again, I'm not going to expand on that. Perhaps there are others in the House who will do that today.

We're taking decisive action, as a government, to address the housing crisis as the province considers how best to expand strong-mayor tools to more of Ontario's rapidly growing municipalities.

We're going to appoint provincial facilitators to conduct an assessment of the two-tier regional governments in Durham, Halton, Niagara, Peel, Waterloo and York. These regions are large, with populations of around 500,000 people or more. They represent some of Ontario's fastest-growing communities, where increased housing supply is desperately needed.

**0920**

This assessment will help us determine the best mix of roles and responsibilities between the upper- and lower-tier municipalities in those regions, particularly in the context of the strong-mayor system. This is going to allow municipalities to support our efforts to get shovels in the ground faster so that they can build the housing needed to support their growing communities.

*Interjection.*

**Hon. Steve Clark:** I think, Speaker, I might be hearing some NIMBYism coming from the opposite side.

The legislation that we're proposing would provide the minister, me, with the authority to appoint the regional chairs in Niagara, Peel and York. If these proposals are passed, I intend to reappoint the existing regional chairs. My view is, by reappointing these three chairs, the government can draw on their knowledge and their expertise to work with the provincially appointed facilitator and really provide an accurate assessment of how the regions can best work with the province to adapt the new strong-mayor powers. As you know, Mr. Speaker, Premier Ford has already indicated that the government is looking to expand strong-mayor powers to other municipalities that are shovel-ready, that are committed to growth, and that are also committed to cutting red tape. This proposed continuity at the regional level would help the government determine the best way to do it in the current two-tiered system. Our goal is to ensure that these enhanced powers are rolled out in a manner that reflects local priorities and local concerns, and that draws on the expertise and support of the existing regional chairs, so that municipalities can hit the ground running and provide the housing that Ontarians need without any more delay. I think that's so very important.

As I said earlier, Ontario is expected to grow by more than two million people over the next 10 years. Over two thirds of this growth is expected to take place in the greater Golden Horseshoe, and we need those near- and long-term solutions to address the housing shortage. Our proposed changes in the Better Municipal Governance Act complement the More Homes Built Faster Act, our housing supply action plan, and will help Ontario address the housing crisis by building those 1.5 million homes over the next 10 years.

We're working very hard, Madam Speaker—it's nice to see you in the chair—to ensure that cities, towns and rural communities grow with a mix of ownership and rental housing types that meet the needs of all Ontarians, right from single-family homes, to townhomes, to mid-rise apartments.

We also, as a government, remain committed to supporting our municipal partners as they work with our

government to increase housing supply. If we're going to be successful, we need to ensure that municipalities have what they need to deliver on our shared provincial-municipal priorities. That's what we're doing with Bill 39 today.

I want to thank you for listening to my portion of the morning debate. And now, with his approval, I'll turn it over to the Associate Minister of Housing to continue the debate.

**The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly):** I recognize the Associate Minister of Housing.

**Hon. Michael Parsa:** I want to thank my honourable colleague the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing for sharing his time with me today. I will also be sharing the remaining time we have for second reading with the parliamentary assistant to the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing, the ever all-star MPP for Thunder Bay–Atikokan.

*Interjections.*

**Hon. Michael Parsa:** Yes, he deserves a big round of applause.

Speaker, I'm proud to speak to our government's proposed Better Municipal Governance Act. It is a bill that is necessary, a bill that is timely, and a bill that would, if passed, be yet another step forward in solving Ontario's housing crisis.

As the recent municipal election showed, the housing shortage Ontario is facing is at the top of people's minds in communities right across the province. With many stakeholders pointing out the importance of getting municipal governance right, we need to make sure red tape does not block the housing we need so desperately. Study after study and expert after expert shows us that Ontario is in a housing crisis.

As an example, Kevin Crigger, the president of the Toronto Regional Real Estate Board, said, "Housing affordability is one of the most significant issues facing the greater Toronto area, so it is important that it continues to be given the attention it deserves before municipal election day."

As a member representing parts of the GTA, I can attest to how important the housing supply crisis is to my constituents, many of whom are struggling to find a home they can afford. I have heard time and again about how young people are looking to get into the housing market but simply can't afford it, because they have to balance between saving money and putting a down payment towards a new purchase at the same time—or newcomers to the province who are ready to settle down with their families and plant roots in Ontario but find the lack of available housing a major challenge. When I think about who our government is working for and why we have made tackling the housing supply crisis such a priority, I think about these people, the ones who are only asking for the same opportunity of home ownership that the previous generation has had. We made them a promise that we would put their dream of home ownership back within reach, and as I've said time and time again, we're not going to let them down.

More than one third of Ontario's growth over the next decade is expected to happen in Toronto and in Ottawa. That's why we need to take action to ensure that there's no political delay in hindering the potential that these cities offer. We need the mayors in these municipalities to cut red tape and get housing built faster so more families can realize the dream of attainable home ownership.

Developers and urban planners tell us all the time that the current way projects are approved in Ontario takes far too long and is way too complex. It can take eight to 10 years to go from acquiring undeveloped land to building housing, according to David Amborski, director of the Centre for Urban Research and Land Development at Toronto Metropolitan University. Builders need to obtain multiple approvals, which can take months, if not years, as various government departments conduct reviews and request revisions to meet planning requirements.

Speaker, a 2022 survey by the Canadian Home Builders' Association looked at the time it takes to secure development approvals in 23 Canadian cities. The survey cited Hamilton, Toronto and Ottawa as having some of the longest timelines across Canada, ranging from 20 to 24 months, and that's without even including the time it takes to get a building permit. A follow-up study by the association which was released this past September found that approval times for most greater Toronto area municipalities have only worsened in the years since. Ontarians are counting on us to fix that. Once again, I want to be very clear that we're not going to let them down.

Ontarians were clear, in the last election, that they want us to take bold actions to increase the housing supply.

And let's not forget, the recent federal announcement to increase immigration targets will bring in 500,000 newcomers by 2025. As the Premier has said, it is anticipated that some 300,000 of those newcomers will hope to settle right here in Ontario. That adds to the urgency of our bill and makes it clear why it's so important that we put forward policies that will help us build more homes and build them faster.

If passed, the Better Municipal Governance Act will add to the powers that our Strong Mayors, Building Homes Act gives to the mayors of both Ottawa and Toronto. As the mayors of Ottawa and Toronto begin their new terms of office, they will soon have more powers to break the cycle of delays in the municipal approvals process.

Speaker, this bill builds on the Strong Mayors, Building Homes Act, which was given royal assent just a few short weeks ago. That act and the associated regulations provide the mayors of Toronto and Ottawa with additional governance tools and increased powers to align municipal decision-making with provincial priorities. They empower the mayors of Ottawa and Toronto to build a team that would help bring forward shared municipal and provincial priorities, which will mean that mayors can use their new powers to get shovels in the ground faster for more housing, and that they can get shovels in the ground faster for the infrastructure that would support more residential developments.



**0930**

Now I want to focus on the specifics of how the mayors of both Toronto and Ottawa will be able to do this. First, the act changes the City of Toronto Act to empower the mayor of Toronto, and it changes the Municipal Act, along with the supporting regulation, to empower the mayor of Ottawa. The act also outlines the tools that these mayors could access to take decisive action on our shared priorities.

The Strong Mayors, Building Homes Act gives the mayors of Toronto and Ottawa the power to hire and fire the chief administrative officer of the municipality and certain department heads. However, this does not include positions such as the clerk, the treasurer, the integrity commissioner, the chief of police, the chief building official, the medical officer of health and others set out in the legislation. In addition, the mayors of Ottawa and Toronto will have the power to create and reorganize departments in their cities so they can better address the needs of their communities. As well, the mayors can appoint the chairs and vice-chairs of identified committees and local boards and can also establish identified committees, and they will be able to direct staff to prepare proposals to support them in furthering provincial priorities.

The Strong Mayors, Building Homes Act gives the mayors of Ottawa and Toronto the ability to deliver the budget of their municipality and table it for council to consider. The respective municipal council can then propose changes to the budget if it chooses to do so. An important new power for the mayors is that these amendments would then be subject to a mayor's veto. The system of checks and balances that we've built into the legislation would keep councillors engaged in the process of local government so that they can provide an important restraint on their respective mayors. Let me explain how that would work.

The municipal council of Ottawa and Toronto would be able to override the mayor's veto of council amendments to the budget with a two-thirds majority vote. This can be done within a certain time period. Once that period of time is up, the municipality would have adopted the resulting budget. There is a similar veto-override system with regard to bylaws passed by council. A mayor can use their veto power if they are of the opinion that all or part of a bylaw passed by council could potentially interfere with a provincial priority, as identified in regulation. This could be a provincial priority such as building more housing for Ontarians—or if the bylaw prevented infrastructure needed for more homes from being built.

Speaker, as you can see, the council-override process is a counterweight in this instance. Similar to their power in regard to the budget amendments, Ottawa and Toronto councils can override a mayoral veto of bylaws related to provincial priorities with a two-thirds majority vote.

I want to make one point clear: The mayor's new ability to veto bylaws applies only to those that the mayor believes would potentially interfere with identified provincial priorities. Simply put, we trust Ontarians to elect

the leaders who best reflect the needs and values of their communities. By extension, we trust those leaders to use these new powers fairly when it comes to driving our shared priorities forward. That's why we're holding them accountable for their choices. As an extension of these changes, mayors are required to provide written documentation when using any of these new powers in accordance with any associated regulations.

We also made changes to the Municipal Conflict of Interest Act. First, the mayors of Ottawa and Toronto are now required to declare any financial interests related to the use of their new powers. They would not be able to use the new powers where financial conflict exists. It's also important to remember that council members are already subject to legislated accountability and transparency rules, and that includes the mayor.

Another important point I'd like to raise is that because of these new increased powers for mayors, we must ensure that voters will be able to have their say if a mayor leaves office earlier than expected. That is why a by-election is required to replace a mayor with these increased powers if the office becomes vacant. That's distinct from the current practice in Ottawa and Toronto, or any other Ontario municipality, which is to give the council the choice of either a by-election or an appointment by council, and the existing rules for how by-elections are run would still apply.

This does not impact the flexibility that Ottawa and Toronto currently have in deciding how to fill other vacant council seats. In those cases, they still have the choice to appoint someone or, in fact, have a by-election.

Speaker, as I've mentioned, some of these changes to empower the mayors of Toronto and Ottawa pertain to matters of provincial priority. These provincial priorities are set out in the supporting regulations. Now I'd like to highlight what these proposed provincial priorities are.

One priority is our government's commitment to keeping costs down and building 1.5 million homes over the next 10 years, to address the housing supply crisis. When we build more homes, we also need to consider the infrastructure that will support them.

Another provincial priority would speed up the planning, approval, construction and maintenance of infrastructure to support new and existing residential developments. This is the infrastructure that you use every day, the things that we don't often think about but that we require. Actioning the expansion, construction and maintenance of these services is essential, and we will work to eliminate any barriers or delays that are in the way. This will help us lay the foundation for building homes now and into the future.

As well, another provincial priority involves transit-oriented communities. These are the higher-density mixed-use developments that are next to or within a short walk of transit stations and stops.

The bill we're discussing today, the proposed Better Municipal Governance Act, will help us build on and further support the Strong Mayors, Building Homes Act in meeting the provincial priority to build 1.5 million homes over the next 10 years.

Additionally, we are proposing changes that would enable the mayors of Toronto and Ottawa to propose bylaws related to the provincial priorities that we have set out. These bylaws would be passed if more than one third of the members of council vote in favour of the bylaw, and existing municipal accountability frameworks will continue to apply, including conflict-of-interest rules. As well, heads of council would also be required to provide their rationale when using the proposed powers.

If passed, the proposed legislation would allow the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing to make regulations that establish the rules for the use of this new mayoral bylaw power. For example, the minister could impose limits and conditions or set out procedural rules for proposing a bylaw.

There is no doubt that these proposals seem bold, but that's because our government promised bold action to end the housing supply crisis and to help all Ontarians find a safe place to call home.

Speaker, I began today by saying that our proposed Better Municipal Governance Act is necessary, is timely and, if passed, would be another solid step forward in addressing Ontario's undersupply of housing. Giving strong mayors this enhanced power would allow them to remove barriers and find solutions for the housing supply shortages, and would make them true partners in addressing the housing crisis.

Madam Speaker, I want to thank the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing. I want to thank the Premier. I want to thank the parliamentary assistant to municipal affairs and housing, and every member of our caucus for all the work and the attention that they're giving to making sure that every person in this province has a home to go to every night.

**0940**

As the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing has highlighted on multiple occasions in this chamber, we are in a housing crisis, one that requires bold actions, because we cannot simply leave the people of this province behind. We saw what 15 years of neglect has done to where we are here today.

Through the actions of this minister, since 2018—we saw the results last year: more housing starts than we've had since 1987; purpose-built rentals, 13,000 of them in the province, again, highest since 1991. These are 30-year record highs. But they're not enough. We need to do more, because we cannot let the current generations, future generations—you think about the 500,000 new Canadians who are coming in with hopes and dreams and aspirations, like my family did when they came to Canada. This minister, our government, our Premier, has said on many occasions that letting them down is not an option. We will fight for them every single day to make sure that they have a chance at attainable home ownership.

With that, I would now like to call upon the parliamentary assistant to the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing to further expand on the very necessary piece of proposed legislation, because, as a former mayor himself, I know that his insights into the

legislation will make an important contribution to today's debate.

**The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly):** I recognize the member for Thunder Bay–Atikokan.

**Mr. Kevin Holland:** I would like to start my remarks today by thanking both the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing and the Associate Minister of Housing for sharing their time with me today as we speak about this next important bill in our government's plan.

It is my pleasure to rise for the second reading of the government's proposed Better Municipal Governance Act, and I will echo the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing in saying that Ontario is the best place in the world to call home, yet finding a home is all too challenging for too many people.

I am proud to be speaking on behalf of a government that recognizes this problem and is continuing its work to provide real, timely solutions. We know that if we reduce delays and get the cost of building homes down, we can lower the price of a home for the average buyer, because delays in building housing drive up costs. Delays are contributing to the housing supply shortage, even as we try diligently to make up the time we lost when the pandemic first hit.

Throughout the province, we need to significantly increase the speed of new housing building to meet the demand and lower costs for Ontarians. Study after study has found development approvals and appropriate zoning are often delayed or hindered because of opposition from some members of municipal councils. Some projects are abandoned altogether. Even if the project finally gets the go-ahead, the damage has already been done, and it's ordinary Ontarians in search of a home who are paying the cost.

A study released in September by the Building Industry and Land Development Association reports that costs can increase substantially each month a permit is stuck in the approval system. They found development application timelines in the GTA have gotten 40% longer over the past two years, and that each month of a delay in a typical high-density project amounts to \$2,600 to \$3,300 in additional construction costs per residential unit.

In fact, the Ontario Association of Architects also looked into the cost of delays and concluded that the total cost of site plan review application delays could range between \$300 million and \$900 million every year in Ontario. Think about that, Speaker. This drives up costs for builders, for renters and for homeowners alike.

While our new housing supply action plan currently before the House addresses many of the barriers that cause housing delays, the changes we are proposing in the Better Municipal Governance Act take additional steps. Municipal councils play a crucial role in determining the housing supply. For example, they must approve the zoning changes necessary to increase the density in a given area. We believe that our proposed changes will help municipalities better meet the needs of their rapidly growing communities and help to drive increased housing supply

in some of Ontario's biggest and fastest-growing municipalities.

Speaker, the legislation we are speaking to today is one of the many bold actions our government is taking to address the housing supply crisis. Let's take a few minutes to remind some members of this House of some previous initiatives we've taken to address the housing supply crisis.

Let's go back to May of 2019, when our government announced More Homes, More Choice, our first housing supply action plan. That plan included a full spectrum of legislative changes to increase the supply of housing—housing that is attainable and housing that provides buyers and renters with more meaningful choices on where to live, where to work and where they can raise their families. That plan cut red tape to make it easier to build the right types of housing in the right places. It did all that so we could get much-needed homes built more quickly. From ownership housing to rental housing, whether built by private developers or non-profits, our first action plan and its accompanying legislation helped to give people more choice. It also helped bring costs down from what they would be otherwise. It aimed to make housing more affordable and helped taxpayers keep more of their hard-earned dollars.

We reviewed every step of the development process, every policy, every regulation and every applicable piece of legislation. We did that to eliminate any unnecessary steps, any duplications and any barriers. But we knew that addressing the housing supply crisis required a long-term strategy. It needed a long-term commitment and collaboration at all levels of government. With those thoughts in mind, our government again acted. In December, our government created the Housing Affordability Task Force, which was made up of industry leaders and experts, to recommend additional measures to increase the supply of market housing.

As the task force stated at the beginning of its report, "For many years, the province has not built enough housing to meet the needs of our growing population." The task force noted that many "efforts to cool the housing market have provided only temporary relief to homebuyers." They said, "The long-term trend is clear: house prices are increasing much faster than Ontarians' incomes." They stated, "The time for action is now."

That is why, at around the same time, we convened with our municipal partners at both the Ontario-Municipal Summit and the rural housing round table to seek their input into the province's housing supply crisis. We also heard from more than 2,000 people through a public consultation that we held to gather even more input.

Nonetheless, while we have been creating a record amount of housing, there is still a severe shortage of supply. Rental housing and affordable home ownership are even further out of reach for hard-working Ontarians. We knew more needed to be done. It was clear that without an increase in housing supply to match the housing demand, housing prices will keep going up and affordability will worsen. That's worth repeating. It's a

supply-and-demand issue that we need to address and we are addressing.

We took all the information we gained from our many consultations and created our second housing supply action plan called More Homes for Everyone, which was what launched earlier this year. We wanted to build on the success of More Homes, More Choice. More Homes for Everyone outlined the next steps we're taking to address Ontario's housing crisis—steps such as accelerating approval timelines and protecting homebuyers from unethical business practices.

We also took further steps to make it easier to build transit-oriented communities. As many members of this House will recall, transit-oriented communities are our government's vision for higher-density, mixed-use developments that are next to or within a short walk of transit stations and stops.

As the Associate Minister of Housing previously stated, we also introduced the Strong Mayors, Building Homes Act, which received royal assent in September. That legislation gives the mayors of Ottawa and Toronto more tools to deliver on shared provincial-municipal priorities, including increasing the supply of housing. The changes will help strengthen mayors' ability to reduce timelines for development, standardize processes and address local barriers to increasing the supply of housing in Toronto and Ottawa.

As you will know, Speaker, last month, we introduced the More Homes Built Faster Act in the Legislature. Our goal is to introduce almost 50 new changes to legislation and regulations that will support our newest plan to speed up housing creation in Ontario. These policies would, if passed, represent our boldest efforts yet to cut through red tape, unnecessary costs and other bottlenecks that are standing in the way of the housing supply that Ontario needs. They would create ways for missing middle and low-income Ontarians to enter the housing market.

#### **0950**

The policies would provide the groundwork for growing the housing supply by reducing the bureaucratic costs and red tape that are delaying construction and pushing home prices even higher; promoting the building of more homes near transit and creating more gentleness housing; protecting new home buyers and consulting on ways to help more renters become homeowners; using provincial lands to build more attainable homes; and much more.

More Homes Built Faster supports the commitment that we made in our previous housing supply action plans to further reduce bureaucratic inefficiencies that delay construction and increase costs for homebuyers and renters. It also supports greater density near transit as well as measures to protect and keep homebuyers and use provincial lands as sites for more attainable homes, and to freeze, reduce and exempt government fees to spur new home construction and help address Ontario's housing supply crisis.

So you can see, Speaker, our government is moving quickly to take every step we can to help support the

construction of more homes in the province for hard-working Ontarians.

We just heard the Associate Minister of Housing expound on the Strong Mayors, Building Homes Act and on how we are proposing to build on and further support this act by bringing forward changes that would enable the mayors of Toronto and Ottawa to propose certain municipal bylaws related to provincial priorities.

There's been much discussion and speculation on when or how our government would expand strong-mayor authorities and tools to other municipalities. Toronto and Ottawa will be the first to receive strong-mayor powers, and as they begin to use these new tools we are already turning our attention to other high-growth municipalities which could also benefit from these powers as they look to grow and build more housing.

We began our strong-mayor framework with single-tier municipalities. Specifically, we now want to explore how these powers might work in other jurisdictions with two-tier systems of government.

As the province considers how best to expand the strong-mayor tools to more of Ontario's rapidly growing municipalities, we want to hear from the experts. Provincially appointed facilitators will assess the two-tier regional governments in Durham, Halton, Niagara, Peel, Waterloo and York. With populations of around 500,000 or more, these six regions represent some of Ontario's fastest-growing communities, where increased housing supply is desperately needed.

We want to ensure these communities are ready and prepared for the growth that is coming their way. This assessment will help us determine the best mix of roles and responsibilities between the upper- and lower-tier municipalities in these regions to allow them to get shovels into the ground faster so they can build the housing needed to support their growing communities.

Which brings us back to our legislation and why we are here today. The legislation we are proposing would give the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing the authority to appoint the regional chairs of Niagara, Peel and York. We would do this for the current term of council, while the regional assessment occurs. As the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing said, if the proposals pass, he intends to reappoint the existing regional chairs, drawing on their knowledge and experience to work with the provincially appointed facilitators to provide an accurate assessment of how the regions can best work with our government to adapt to the new strong-mayor powers. This proposed continuity at the regional level would help determine the best way forward for the current two-tier municipalities.

Speaker, municipalities are on the front lines of the housing crisis, and they see the harmful impacts that a lack of homes has on the communities. That is why we need strong local governments to help us to make the dream of home ownership attainable for Ontarians. I know first-hand how important municipalities are to getting homes built, having served previously as a mayor in my riding of Thunder Bay–Atikokan. I know that Ontarians expect

their mayors and councils to get behind new housing and to work with the province to increase the supply of attainable homes. That is precisely what our latest actions propose to do.

Of course, this is not the only time we have worked with our municipal partners to help us address housing supply. Speaker, let me take you back earlier this year. In January, we held an Ontario municipal housing summit. We wanted to find ways to coordinate our efforts with big-city mayors and regional chairs. We have also rolled out programs such as the Streamline Development Approval Fund. This fund is providing more than \$45 million to help large municipalities streamline, digitize and modernize their approach to applications for residential developments.

We are also engaging with all municipalities to discuss ways they can unlock housing. Earlier this year, we also met with smaller, rural, northern and remote municipalities at our rural housing round table. Understanding the full spectrum of experiences with the housing supply crisis, such as the cost of supplies, helps us to align housing and infrastructure needs based on the unique ways Ontario's populations continue to grow and change.

Again, Speaker, let me reiterate by drawing on my experience as a northern MPP and a former mayor, how important it is for our plan to address housing concerns across the province and to keep the lines of communication with municipalities open. This summer, I was honoured to have met with municipal leaders at the Association of Municipalities of Ontario conference. It was a perfect forum to share new ideas and best practices, as well as to promote discussion around policy recommendations that support increasing our housing supply. We are happy to work with our municipal partners at conferences like this, as well as at the Rural Ontario Municipal Association, which happens every January. As a former mayor, we appreciated the opportunities to sit in front of the ministers to discuss the priorities of our region.

Speaker, municipalities remain the driving force in getting housing projects through to the finish line. To address the housing crisis, we're taking decisive action: Action that addresses the housing crisis in Ontario's fastest-growing communities so everyone can find the home they need and can afford. That's what our government promised to do and that's what this proposed legislation does.

**The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly):** It is now time for questions and answers.

**Ms. Catherine Fife:** I just want to say: When the Minister of Municipal Affairs says, "I think we can all agree that the housing file is going well," it would be laughable if it were not so serious.

By your own admission, the fall economic statement has downgraded housing starts from 2023 through to 2027. The government has changed the definition of affordable housing, raising the benchmark well past what most Ontarians can afford. The tenant advocacy group reported a shocking drop in affordable private market rentals from 2016 to 2021. The number of rentals costing \$1,000 a

month or more dropped by 36%, whereas luxury rentals costing \$3,000 a month went up by 87%.

Bill 39 goes further than mayoral vetoes and we all know this. It would allow a mayor to propose and pass bills with only one-third-plus-one of the vote. Will the government admit that this is not about housing; it's about control and legislating minority rule in Ontario?

**The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly):** I recognize the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing.

**Hon. Steve Clark:** Well, I think that the first time the New Democrats are speaking about Bill 39 will, essentially, again show that they're voting against increasing housing supply and giving our mayors the tools they need to get the job done—

**Ms. Marit Stiles:** It's shutting down democracy.

**Ms. Catherine Fife:** Yes.

**Hon. Steve Clark:** And there's the new leader—the acclaimed leader of the party. This is the “Stiles” of the NDP for days to come.

We've indicated—and the Premier has been very transparent that he wanted to expand the strong-mayor powers. We were quite open with the Legislature with our Strong Mayors, Building Homes Act that we were going to focus on Toronto and Ottawa and then move to other municipalities. We believe the six regions of our province are the ideal opportunity to have that conversation, to be able to appoint a facilitator to work collaboratively, but, at the end of the day, have strong mayors with the tools they need to get shovels in the ground faster.

**The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly):** Question?

**Mr. Aris Babikian:** One of the most common concerns I hear from my constituents—and I am sure this is something my colleagues on both sides of the House can relate to—is that Ontarians are being priced out of the housing market and are worried that they will never attain their dream of home ownership. Young families are worried that they will be unable to find their dream home to grow in. Hard-working professionals are worried that they will be unable to find a home to settle down in and lay down roots.

1000

Can the member expand on how this proposed legislation will help Ontarians find a home that meets their needs and budgets, so they can realize their dream of home ownership?

**Hon. Steve Clark:** That's a fantastic question from my friend from Scarborough.

We've got young families, newcomers and those all over the province who—really, the dream of home ownership has been lost to them, so far. They want our government to ensure that they have a home that meets their needs and their budget.

While the province is set to grow by more than two million people in the next decade, you know, representing the good people in Scarborough, that many of those newcomers who the federal government has announced are going to come to our country—probably 60% are going to come to the greater Golden Horseshoe. So we need to ensure that those fast-growing communities and

regions, and our two biggest cities, Toronto and Ottawa, have the tools they need to get shovels in the ground faster. The Strong Mayors, Building Homes Act did that in Toronto and Ottawa, and this Better Municipal Governance Act will extend it to the GTA. It only makes sense.

**The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly):** Further questions?

**Ms. Teresa J. Armstrong:** Since 2018, this Ford government has fought and failed in successive, high-profile lawsuits. Most of the cases involve legal challenges against new policies or legislation. Some of the examples are: carbon pricing, election finance rules, ministerial zoning, cap and trade, gas pumps, failing to consult with First Nations, shielding governments from negligence lawsuits, heritage building demolition, OHIP coverage for snowbirds—you see the trend, Speaker.

Most recently, on November 14, just this Monday, the government had to repeal a bill that stomped on workers' democratic rights.

During this debate, two ministers said, “We must tackle problems and be laser-focused.” Another one said, “We're not going to let them down.” We're debating the bill today—An Act to amend the City of Toronto Act, 2006 and the Municipal Act, 2001 and to enact the Duffins Rouge Agricultural Preserve Repeal Act, 2022.

Speaker, can the minister wrapped in red tape explain how this government and this legislation is letting people down by paving over protected greenbelt and agricultural land?

**Hon. Steve Clark:** Speaker, I'm going to really take the NDP's position and I'm going to put it in one word: BANANA—build absolutely nothing anywhere near anyone. If we listened to the failed NDP policies of the June election, we would precipitate more BANANAism in Ontario.

Ontarians gave us a clear mandate: that, under the leadership of Premier Ford, we were going to present a housing supply action plan that was going to build 1.5 million homes over the next decade.

Despite the NIMBYism and the BANANAism from the New Democrats opposite, we are going to continue to drive important public policy that's going to get shovels in the ground, that's going to eliminate bureaucratic delays that, in the GTA, add about \$116,900 to the cost of an average home. On this side of the House, we want to lower those input costs. We want to create affordable home ownership. The BANANAs across can continue to talk the way they have been.

**The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly):** Further questions?

**Mr. Rob Flack:** Madam Speaker, one of the things I find interesting is how people on the other side don't understand the simplicity of supply and demand. We've got two million people coming into this province. We need houses—it's not only houses; it's communities. People want to live where they work, where their hospitals are, where child care can be afforded and where their social

services are, and not only do existing Ontarians need that; new Ontarians need that.

So I would ask the minister: How would this new legislation, if passed, help continue preparing the future growth and welcome new Ontarians looking to lay down new roots in this province, just like every other Canadian who wants to buy their new house needs to lay down roots?

**Hon. Steve Clark:** Again, that's a fantastic question from the member for Elgin–Middlesex–London. I think he has really hit the nail on the head.

It doesn't matter what study you want to look at—you can look at CMHC numbers, Scotiabank numbers—they all align with our Housing Affordability Task Force asking for 1.5 million homes over the next 10 years. Then, you take what the member has presented, the issue about us welcoming new Canadians, new Ontarians—we know that out of the 500,000 people the federal government has talked about coming here, about 60% probably are going to come. Regardless of our population, we're going to accept the lion's share, and we welcome them. We have to ensure, as the member notes, that we've put a plan in place that's going to actually get shovels in ground.

This plan builds upon the other 90 initiatives the government has done since we've been in office. And we're going to continue to present initiatives every year, under the leadership of Premier Ford.

**The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly):** I recognize the member for Davenport.

**Ms. Marit Stiles:** In Toronto and in Ottawa, voters just elected new councils, including new councillors who were elected to take on the housing crisis that's facing our cities. These elections happened, actually, while this government was in the process of changing the rules to give mayors these veto powers on unnamed provincial priorities. But now, just as those elected councillors are rolling up their sleeves and getting to work and being sworn in, this government is again moving legislation to further disempower those newly elected councillors.

Madam Speaker, I would like to understand from this government how they think, and how this minister thinks, that moving and shifting power from elected officials to essentially a minority rule in the backrooms of power is going to help Toronto.

**Hon. Steve Clark:** Speaker, through you to the potentially acclaimed leader of the New Democrats—I don't know; I personally think Laura Walton would give her a run for her money. To her particular question—we acknowledge that mayors need the tools to get shovels in the ground faster. If you look at the BILD study, it shows there's significant—

**The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly):** Unfortunately, we have run out of time for questions.

Further debate?

**Mr. Jeff Burch:** I'm happy to stand and give comments on Bill 39. It's hard to know what to say when you see a government drop a bill like this while the housing bill is still being debated and we're endeavouring to get people's opinions across the province.

We have committees going on on Bill 23 right now—and I think the public should know that those committee hearings have been shut down. They've been shut down because the standing orders for this House say that you can't talk about the same topic in two different places in this House. So we have all kinds of folks who have come in for Bill 23 hearings, to have their opinions heard—I don't even know if all the members on that side of the House know what their own party, what their own government has done here.

We have people from all across the province who have come here to give their opinion in consultations at the committee hearings which are in this building.

We have 10 people from the city of Toronto who are showing up today to give their opinion, which the government asked for. The government chose for them to come here and give their opinion on the housing bill, and they don't get to present today, and we don't get to hear what they had to say. We could say that it's possibly incompetence on the part of the government and perhaps the government House leader, but I tend to think they must have known what they were doing.

We have all these people showing up for committee, and now the committee is being shut down. We have the C.D. Howe Institute, Canadian mental health—a pretty important group that we want to be hearing from. We're talking about homelessness and housing issues, so you'd think you'd want to hear from them. They've taken the time to come here today, and their voice has been shut down. The Toronto board of trade, the federation of rental housing—you'd think we'd want to hear from them.

Folks in my own riding, the Niagara Peninsula Conservation Authority—they changed the Conservation Authorities Act in the housing bill. We want to hear from conservation authorities. They've come here. They've been shut down. The government doesn't want to hear from them.

**1010**

The town of Blue Mountain—they probably drove here through the snow for committee hearing meetings, and they've been told, "We are not interested in hearing from you."

A lot of the groups that have shown up today, let's be clear, were speaking against Bill 23—but one of them wasn't AMO, the Association of Municipalities Ontario, because they weren't even invited to the hearings by the government. The government didn't want to hear, on a municipal affairs and housing bill, from the Association of Municipalities Ontario. Think about that. All these other people were invited, and many of them showed up, many of them probably drove through the snow, and now the government is saying, "Go home. We don't want to hear from you. We're not interested in what you have to say. We've got this other bill that we are going to drop today—a bill that no one asked for or recommended, that's going to violate local democracy and the rights of municipalities to act in a democratic way. So you can all go home." Let's be clear that that's what has happened this morning here at the Ontario Legislature. Quite frankly, it's a disgusting

manoeuvre by the government and extremely disrespectful.

In committee hearings last week, my colleague from University–Rosedale attempted to add extra days of hearings because AMO hadn't been invited and other people wanted to speak. The government very strictly limited the amount of consultation and the number of hearing dates. So we voted and we got it on the record—we made a motion to have another day of hearings so that everyone could speak, and the government voted against it. They didn't want to hear from more people. Now they don't even want to hear from the people who showed up. That's absolutely disgusting and disrespectful.

The government put forward this bill that no one asked for, that no one recommended—no consultation with anyone. They tabled a bill that will allow them to appoint regional chairs in York, Peel and Niagara. Just four years ago, in the middle of a municipal election campaign, this government cancelled regional chair elections in these regions—elections in which citizens were electing their chair at large because they had gone through a process and decided that it was more democratic, and they had gone through all the motions, so they had elections at large planned.

I know, being from Niagara, that we had folks who were actually raising money, were getting ready for a municipal election where they would be a candidate for chair of Niagara region. After they had already put their name forward, after they had already done all that work and started their campaign, this government came along and said, “No, we don't trust citizens of those regions with free and fair elections.” Now they don't even trust democratically elected councillors to choose their chair, as they did in the past. Now the Premier is going to hand-pick who he wants to rule in his stead and hand them additional powers to do his bidding.

I think we all realize on this side of the House how absolutely ridiculous it is, at a time when the government is failing education workers and children, when pediatric ICUs are over capacity, when we're in an affordable housing crisis, that this Premier is focused on municipal governments and autocratic changes to municipal government. And the Premier isn't just appointing elected positions here—

**The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly):** I apologize; I have to interrupt the member. Unfortunately, we have run out of time for debate.

*Second reading debate deemed adjourned.*

**The Deputy Speaker (Ms. Donna Skelly):** We will now have members' statements.

## MEMBERS' STATEMENTS

### DAVID MURPHY

**Mr. Nolan Quinn:** It is with a heavy heart that I rise today in this House to pay tribute to David Murphy of

Cornwall. Our community is mourning with the news on Sunday of his passing at the age of 50 from lung cancer. He was a non-smoker.

Speaker, 90 seconds will not begin to even explain the impact David had in our region. He was a great community leader, a coach to many youth, a fundraiser for too many causes to name, a friend, and a former municipal councillor. David was a proud lifelong Cornwall resident who dedicated his life to its betterment. David's involvement and leadership in countless fundraising initiatives, not-for-profit organizations and local service clubs is the definition of a true community leader.

After making public that he had lung cancer, David started Team Murphy, with the mission of raising funds to help others with the costs of travel to Ottawa for treatment. In a short time, he raised tens of thousands of dollars for others—such a selfless endeavour during the ultimate fight for his life.

In the last month, David has been inducted into the Cornwall Sports Hall of Fame, as well as being awarded the Cornwall and Area Chamber of Commerce president's award, the Children's Treatment Centre of Cornwall president's award, and a Queen's Platinum Jubilee medallion.

David will be missed by our entire community. We extend our sincere condolences to his daughter and favourite human, Julia, and his friends and family.

### OGIMAA SHINING TURTLE

**Mr. Michael Mantha:** On Saturday, Whitefish River First Nation will be recognizing Ogimaa Shining Turtle for more than 20 years of service as the elected chief for the community. The Ogimaa is stepping down from this role to pursue other opportunities—and I know that I personally will still be looking to him for guidance and insight. Being a leader is no easy task, and being an Ogimaa is significantly more challenging because of the systemic barriers that stand in your way. Therefore, to serve that role for over two decades shows the leadership qualities that he embodies.

Ogimaa Shining Turtle has been known by Premiers, Prime Ministers, ministers and leaders across the country as a steadfast advocate for his community, the Anishinabek Nation, and the rights of Indigenous people across Turtle Island.

During his time in office, Ogimaa oversaw the renovation to the community centre and the updating of the water system to ensure reliable, safe drinking water in Whitefish River First Nation. He helped bring new life to Rainbow Lodge and stood up for his community during the COVID-19 pandemic to ensure the safety of children and elders. He has stood up for the treaty rights of his community by asserting their right to hunt, fish and trap on their traditional territory and playing a major role in the Robinson-Huron Treaty annuities case.

You never say goodbye, as it brings an end, so I say to my friend, baamaapii—until our paths cross again.

### HOMEBOUND WELLNESS CENTRE

**Ms. Patrice Barnes:** I rise today to say it's an honour to represent the constituents of Ajax, and I will continue to be an advocate for them.

I have the privilege of volunteering at the Homebound Wellness Centre. The Homebound Wellness Centre is a not-for-profit organization located in Ajax, servicing the needs of the seniors of Durham. They offer a large range of services for seniors, including mobile day programs, respite care, foot care clinics, support groups and a hot meal program, as well as delivering groceries to seniors during COVID. Their mission statement is to establish, operate and maintain social, recreational and health-related programs and activities for seniors in the community.

After two years of the pandemic, organizations like these are integral to improve the wellness and independence of seniors who are lonely and isolated, and individuals living with various traumas or postpartum depression.

One of my favourite programs to volunteer for is their Thursday night seniors' dinner. It is really an amazing experience, being able to serve the various seniors who attend this program. It's an array of cultures, languages and lived experiences, great conversations and amazing stories. Cerita Miller, the program director, is purposeful in creating and serving amazing meals, accompanied by music, singing and interaction. The seniors work on a project, usually a craft to take home; the last one gifted to me was a thankful pumpkin craft for my door.

These are an amazing time—and I thank that organization for all they do for seniors.

### POVERTY AND HOMELESSNESS

**Ms. Chandra Pasma:** Winter is upon us, and while this time of year is often celebrated and welcomed as a time for holiday get-togethers, hot chocolate and outdoor winter activities, it is also a time of extreme hardship for our neighbours who are experiencing poverty and homelessness. As the temperature drops, it is important to note how this will affect the most vulnerable among us and to take meaningful action to address the systemic causes of poverty and homelessness.

**1020**

My office has received calls from concerned constituents who have noticed an increase in people sleeping rough and in new encampments. As we head into the bitter winter months, they worry about access to housing and supports, and they worry about how government policies like low social assistance rates and lack of rent control are making people homeless.

In addition to being worried about their unhoused neighbours, many people who contact my office are worried about winding up on the streets themselves.

Kevin, who lives in a property owned by a large corporate landlord, has told us that his landlord is already distributing notices informing all of their tenants across all

their properties to expect the rent to increase by at least the maximum amount set by the province. The landlord has also warned tenants that they will be seeking above-guideline increases wherever possible.

At a time of record-breaking inflation, low social assistance rates and a stagnant minimum wage, it is concerning to see corporate landlords attempting to rake in more profits, putting their tenants at risk of eviction.

This holiday season, we need to remember to support those in our communities who are experiencing poverty. That means doubling social assistance rates, raising the minimum wage, enacting real rent control, and building genuinely affordable housing, instead of boosting developer profits to build homes no one can afford.

### OPERATION JUBILEE

**Mrs. Daisy Wai:** On August 19, 1942, there were nine young men from Richmond Hill who landed at the Blue Beach, Dieppe, France, as part of Operation Jubilee. Eight of them did not return alive. It was the biggest single-day loss for Richmond Hill. The heroes who sacrificed their lives in exchange for our freedom were Private George Charles Adams, Private Thomas Millar Armstrong, Private William John Findlay, Lance Corporal Joseph Albert Glover, Private Ernest Albert Goode, Private Charles Hill, Private Roy Alexander Walker, and Private Russell Thomas Wice. Private Adams's older brother, Sergeant William John Adams, was also involved in the raid. He was captured and spent the rest of the war as a prisoner. However, upon returning to Canada, he continued to serve with the York Regional Police.

We should remember and pay respect to them not only on Remembrance Day but every day. We should also remember their family members who sacrificed along with them.

### UNITED STEELWORKERS

**MPP Jamie West:** This year marks the 60th anniversary of my union, USW Local 6500.

I often credit the training support and opportunities I had as a steelworker with my success as a parliamentarian. In fact, during my inaugural speech in 2018, I said, "This world is thirsty for leadership, and my union gave me the training and opportunities to become a leader. They celebrated with me when I was successful and they supported me when I was struggling. I would not be here today if it weren't for the Steelworkers. I wouldn't be in this House, in this chair or in the position I have with my family."

As well, I often say that Steelworkers make great leaders. That's not only a reflection of Local 6500's ongoing commitment to the community, but of the fact that my local, Local 6500, has produced three district 6 directors, a Canadian national director, and an international president.

Closer to home, Local 6500 has always taken a leadership role. Our union members sit on boards, and they



help raise funds for local charities. We develop excellent stewards and committee members, and effective occupational safety, health and environment reps.

Because of Local 6500, Sudbury no longer looks like a moonscape. Our members perform safety investigations and coroner's inquests. We negotiate fair contracts and represent our members at grievances and arbitrations. The list goes on and on—from children's Christmas parties to mental health and addictions, to retiree support with WSIB.

For the past 60 years, USW Local 6500 has been a shining example of the iconic phrase, "The union makes us strong."

Happy anniversary to Local 6500.

### VOLUNTEERS

**Mr. Deepak Anand:** We make our living by what we do, and we make a life by what we give.

Recently, I was touched by the words of Order of Canada recipient Dr. Lucky Lakshmanan: "Life is the art of giving."

While many people have more than they need, some don't even have enough to fulfill their need.

I'm always inspired by the volunteer-based organizations and programs, such as Fueling Healthy Minds, that believe in giving and uplifting the community. In the region of Peel, more than 20% of children come to school with empty stomachs. In 2020, when schools were closed because of COVID-19, lots of these students who were using the school breakfast program were left with need. In direct response, my wife, Aruna Anand, led a 100% volunteer-based breakfast program and served over 225,000 nutritious meals, with the support of Sai Dham Food Bank, the YMCA of GTA, school staff, and many selfless volunteers. Every Friday, through Fueling Healthy Minds, I witnessed the art of giving being the most important ingredient to make our community a better place to live for everyone.

I urge all Canadians, and, as a first-immigration immigrant, especially new Canadians who are working hard to gain a sense of belongingness, to indulge in giving back to the community. Give time, give love, give respect, and give your resources. Together, let's all participate in the art of giving.

### ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

**Mr. Ted Hsu:** I rise today to address the Conservatives' proposed updates to the Ontario Wetland Evaluation System. Their changes encourage skipping over what you don't know when it comes to developing wetlands.

In my science and business career, the following idea has served me well: If you're unsure about something, go ask people who know more than you do.

Just look at some of what the Conservatives are doing in their headlong rush to develop land. "If there is uncertainty about wetland delineation, evaluators are encouraged to consult with MNR"—this is deleted; in

other words, in typical Conservative government fashion, "Don't check with the scientists. They may know something you don't like."

"If an evaluator is uncertain how to proceed with or interpret any component of this evaluation system they should contact the appropriate MNR district office"—this is cut; in other words, "If you're not sure, don't bother checking with the MNR biologist or ecologist and all the expertise they have access to."

To add insult to injury, there is this: "A wetland that has already been evaluated may be re-evaluated," which means now that the MNR scientists are out of the way, somebody can go back, hire another evaluator and try to open up a wetland for development.

Mr. Speaker, the Conservatives are afraid of any informed balance between environmental protection and economic development.

### OXI DAY

**Mr. Aris Babikian:** Every year, on October 28, Greeks all over the world celebrate Oxi Day—No Day. It is the day the Greek people and Greek Prime Minister Ioannis Metaxas rejected the ultimatum made by Benito Mussolini in the 1940s, hence refusing to be subjugated to the tyranny of fascism, and defending their freedom and democracy.

Oxi Day has a special place in modern Greek history. In addition to being the cradle of democracy—it is the destiny of the Greek people through the ages to be the vanguard of the ideas and the principles ancient Greeks gave to humanity. That legacy has continued for the last 5,000 years and has left its indisputable impact on our way of life.

I had the honour of participating in the gala dinner on October 29 and the October 30 parade on Danforth Avenue.

I would like to congratulate the Greek community centre of Toronto, the participating GTHA Greek organizations, thousands of volunteers and the audience for keeping the memory and flame of Oxi alive and passing it to the next generation.

### CANCER WARRIOR CANADA FOUNDATION

**Mr. Amarjot Sandhu:** On the weekend, I had the opportunity to attend Celebrate Life with Lights, an event organized by Navneet Sharma—a cancer survivor and the founder of the Cancer Warrior Canada Foundation—for their fifth Annual Cancer Awareness and Fundraiser Gala. **1030**

Cancer Warrior Canada Foundation is a group of inspired individuals who create awareness about breast cancer, early diagnosis and treatment options. They not only work hard to raise money for research, but they also help to support patients, survivors and their families as they go through this journey.

Every year, thousands of women are diagnosed with breast cancer—our mothers, our grandmothers, our sisters

and friends. A diagnosis can be devastating, not only physically, but emotionally and financially.

I want to commend all the great work Navneet Sharma and the amazing team at Cancer Warrior Canada Foundation are doing, and for their dedication in raising awareness about breast cancer, early diagnosis and treatment options. Events like this help fight and address the stigma that breast cancer has. They're the true community heroes.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** That concludes our members' statements for this morning.

#### SPECIAL REPORT, AUDITOR GENERAL

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** I beg to inform the House that the following document has been tabled: a special report on Laurentian University from the Office of the Auditor General of Ontario.

#### INTRODUCTION OF VISITORS

**MPP Jill Andrew:** I would like to welcome Kristie Kennedy to the House. She's a fantastic parent from our community of Toronto–St. Paul's. Kristie is also the parent to a trans child, and she is here today as an advocate, supporting our gender-affirming health care act.

Thank you, Kristie, for being here in your House.

**Hon. Michael A. Tibollo:** I'd like to welcome to the House this morning two very distinguished groups. From Thunder Bay in northern Ontario, with the Ontario Native Women's Association: Coralee McGuire-Cyrette, executive director; Cheryl Bagnall, director of community services; and Andre Morriseau, communications manager. And from Lazio, some people who are here doing documentary work on Ontario and on Toronto: Iolanda Russo and Mikaela Tatangelo. Welcome to our House.

**MPP Kristyn Wong-Tam:** I'm happy and very proud to rise today to acknowledge some esteemed guests who've joined our House for Trans Awareness Week and also to support the gender-affirming health care advisory act: Stefanie Pest from the riding of Essex; Heath Salazar and Kristie Kennedy from Toronto–St. Paul's; Lisa Delcol from University–Rosedale; Monika Gontarska from Scarborough–Guildwood; and Anne Creighton from Toronto–Danforth.

I also want to also acknowledge three members of my esteemed team who are here from Toronto Centre: Vharshaa Punithchelvan, Tara Bijan and Doga Koroglu. Two of them are interns from TMU University, and one of them is from the Toronto Centre riding association.

**Hon. Graydon Smith:** I want to welcome Ontario Trillium Foundation board member and Parry Sound–Muskoka business owner and great friend Andy Blenkarn to Queen's Park. Welcome, and thank you for the work you do.

**Mr. Kevin Holland:** I'd like to welcome members who are here today from the Ontario Native Women's Association in Thunder Bay. I know the minister has already introduced them, but I just want to acknowledge

Coralee, Cheryl and Andre. They're doing fantastic work on important issues in Thunder Bay.

I thank you for what you're doing.

**MPP Kristyn Wong-Tam:** I didn't realize that Catherine Nesmith is here. She's from the Architectural Conservancy of Ontario. She and I worked together to save the historic postcard view of Queen's Park about five or six years ago.

Welcome, Catherine.

**Mrs. Daisy Wai:** I'm happy to introduce my dream team of staff, who I have taken time to select, to form a strong team to support me. I'm happy to introduce Amanda McFarlane, executive assistant and office manager from our constituency office; Jason Leung, a legislative assistant working with me at Queen's Park; Nicole Wang, community relations officer, working at the constituency office; and Tarun Saroya, executive assistant for my position as parliamentary assistant to the Ministry for Seniors and Accessibility. Welcome to Queen's Park.

**Mr. Sheref Sabawy:** I have the honour to welcome the consul general of Morocco in Toronto, His Excellency Mr. Rachid Zein, as well as Ms. Leila Fateh and Mr. Abdellah Messaoudi from the Moroccan Association of Toronto.

The independence day of Morocco was celebrated this week, and there will be a flag-raising at 3. You are all welcome.

Welcome to Queen's Park.

#### QUESTION PERIOD

##### HEALTH CARE

**Mr. Peter Tabuns:** It is now clear that the Premier has decided to ignore his medical officer of health and his advice to address the health care crisis faced by our children. That decision is clear to anyone who has seen him every day since the public health officials in this province urged adults to wear masks indoors to protect children.

Without saying a thing, the Premier has told parents that they're on their own and they can only hope that the over-stretched doctors, nurses and health care workers can protect their children as we go through this hospital crisis.

When did the Premier decide that the children of Ontario were expendable?

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** To respond, the parliamentary assistant to the Minister of Health, the member for Eglinton–Lawrence.

**Mrs. Robin Martin:** As we've said many times, the difficult and complex fall that was predicted has materialized, and we have three viral threats. It's changing with every wave. Initially, we had personal protective equipment, adult ICUs and adult ward beds that needed attention; now it is pediatric ICUs—and, frankly, it is not because of COVID, but because of RSV and influenza. That is why we planned for that. We've said this many times. We made investments in the NICU units. We made investments in pediatric hospitals. And we expanded our

health human resources and beds, across the board, in hospitals.

As Dr. Simpson noted, it's not unusual for 14- and 16-year-old patients to be looked after in adult ICU beds. That is commonly done. That is what is happening now.

We're making sure that we have the resources for our children and that they get the best care possible, and we know our health care workers will deliver it.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary question.

**Mr. Peter Tabuns:** Again to the Premier: The Minister of Health, yesterday, told us the province had planned for this surge of illness and put policies in place to protect our children. We just heard that repeated. But if this was a plan, it was a terrible one. Pediatric emergency rooms are bursting at the seams. Hospital CEOs are desperately calling for help, and they've had to implement emergency measures, including moving children who need intensive care into adult hospitals. The minister's "plan" has created chaos and put children at risk.

Will the Premier finally speak up and tell us how he can possibly defend this mismanagement?

**Mrs. Robin Martin:** I understand the member opposite may have prepared his question before he heard my answer, but I actually addressed that very concern. Dr. Simpson, the public health officer for Ontario Health, said that it's not unusual for 14- and 16-year-old patients "to be looked after in adult ICUs. That is commonly done." And that is what is happening now.

As Dr. Simpson also noted, "What is important to emphasize is that all pediatric patients will be seen when they come to a hospital. If they require admission, then we will look after them."

Like Dr. Simpson said, I have great faith and confidence in our health care providers across the province. They are expertly trained to support all of our health care needs and will do whatever it takes to make sure our children get the care that they need.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Final supplementary. The member for Nickel Belt.

**M<sup>me</sup> France Gélinas:** To the Premier: We all know the Premier will use the long wait times, the overcrowding, the emergency room closures to justify bringing in US-style health care to Ontario. He'll say we need to innovate, just like Mike Harris did when he privatized our home care system. The private home care providers were going to do things better, faster, cheaper. Remember that, Speaker? Well, today, we all know that none of that happened.

1040

Why is this government so determined to dismantle our publicly funded, publicly delivered health care system?

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Member for Eglinton-Lawrence.

**Mrs. Robin Martin:** I just have to say, I thought the opposition was trying to ask questions about what is going on in hospitals today, not some fantasy that they think might be happening in the future.

Let's just talk about what's happening in our health care system and what has happened in the past.

In the 2012 Auditor General's report on health human resources, it was revealed that northern Ontario had a shortage of 200 physicians or 40,000 hours of care, and yet little was done. Who held the balance of power at that time? I think that was these guys, the opposition, the NDP.

The former Premier admitted that she was freezing hospital spending for years, and in 2015 she eliminated 50 medical residency positions from Ontario. They defended that decision, when 800,000 Ontarians were without a family doctor, by saying, "We are scaling back to make better use of our health care dollars." This reduction came in the same year when 250 nurses were being laid off. You supported them every step of the way.

We're fixing the system—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you. I'll remind members to make their comments through the Chair.

The next question.

#### LABOUR DISPUTE

**MPP Jamie West:** My question is for the Minister of Education. I'll get the page to pass over these CUPE education support workers forms to him as well.

Students deserve an ECE in every classroom.

Parents need an EA for every student who needs personal care to attend school.

People across Ontario depend on custodians and cleaners to protect the health of our children.

Instead of money for ECEs in every classroom or additional funds for EAs, the government passes the burden to parents to hunt down scarce private resources.

Why doesn't the Conservative government think that it's worth properly investing in the people and the public school supports that parents already have available in our schools to help their children catch up and be successful?

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Stop the clock for a moment.

I'm just going to remind the House that we're not going to ask the pages to deliver notes during question period anymore.

Start the clock.

Minister of Education.

**Hon. Stephen Lecce:** What I can confirm to the member opposite is that under our Progressive Conservative government we have hired nearly 7,000 additional education workers, supporting our kids within our schools—and not only have we hired more, but we pledged to continue funding 1,800 additional education workers and 800 teachers, who will support our kids within our schools, as part of our program before the union.

Mr. Speaker, we fulfilled our end of the bargain—we said we would repeal Bill 28, and that was the biggest barrier to getting a deal, and then 48 hours after us doing so in good faith, they announced a strike notice. We said we would increase pay—335 million more dollars this week compared to last week, a material improvement for every worker, especially for the lowest-paid—and they've still rejected the offer. We have now moved to a flat rate,

a demand of the union—not to differentiate wages for lower and higher incomes—and we still don't have a deal.

It is abundantly clear what the fault line is preventing the union from accepting a deal; it is a desire for higher wages.

Our kids should be in school on Monday.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The supplementary question.

**MPP Jamie West:** Speaker, I don't mind delivering these to the minister myself, because it's important that he hears from the actual workers, instead of ignoring them.

Sean and Julia are the parents of two children with autism in my riding. They reached out to my office to express how much our education support workers mean to them and to their children:

"These workers keep June and Chaz safe. They help them to learn and be successful and happy at school each and every day.

"More support workers are needed to help support kids like ours to integrate into mainstream classes. When schools don't have the staff, parents like us have to pay ABA staff out of pocket or our kids can't go to mainstream class to work on integration.

"When your family relies on education support workers for the well-being and safety of your child and this government creates conditions that drive them from the profession it's really scary.

"These workers are truly essential."

This is not about money. This is about knowing that the workers that children get to know, workers that parents trust and depend on, will not only be here for their kids today but will continue to be there for the kids in the future.

My question is, when will the Premier admit that wanting kids with exceptional needs to have support for the entire school day—not just a fraction of the day—is not about money but it's about kids?

**Hon. Stephen Lecce:** Mr. Speaker, if we're going to highlight stories of the impact on children with special-education needs, then I'd hope the member opposite would accept that that child who depends on routine should be in school on Monday and should not be out of school again, just two weeks later.

This is what's becoming a casual invocation of a strike notice every few weeks in this province—every few years. That's not acceptable.

The NDP wants to normalize strikes because they were standing with the union when kids were out of school. They should be standing up for parents.

Stand with this government. Let's get a deal. Let's keep kids in class.

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Order.

Final supplementary.

**MPP Jamie West:** Frankly, enough is enough. The minister makes more than \$160,000 a year. He's calling workers who have to feed their children—

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** I'm going to ask the government side not to do that again.

Start the clock.

The member for Sudbury has the floor.

**MPP Jamie West:** The minister makes more than \$160,000 a year, and he's calling workers who have to feed their children at food banks greedy. The minister says his offer is generous, but it doesn't keep up with inflation, let alone let them get ahead. The minister calls \$1,600 a year a generous offer, but it's one tenth of what every backbench MPP got when they were promoted to parliamentary assistant.

The minister says there have been 2,246 lost days since 1988, but in terms of school years, that's 11 and a half years—

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Stop the clock.

*Interjection.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The member will take his seat.

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The government House leader will come to order. The Minister of Economic Development, Job Creation and Trade will come to order. The member for Kitchener–Conestoga will come to order. The member for St. Catharines will come to order. The government House leader will come to order.

Start the clock.

The member for Sudbury still has some time.

**MPP Jamie West:** Thank you, Speaker. It made them touchy when I talked about how much money they make.

The minister has been saying there have been 2,246 lost days since 1988; in terms of school years, that would be 11 and a half years. Nobody is buying the spin.

People are tired of the minister's games. Parents saw through what the Conservatives did last time.

My question is, when will the Conservative government take the time and energy they waste on spin and just sit down and negotiate a fair deal that will put education support workers in every class and keep them there?

**Hon. Stephen Lecce:** Mr. Speaker, it isn't about the money—but the hashtag was #39KIsNotOK, and this entire campaign has been under the guise of insisting upon higher pay on the backs of kids.

We have significantly increased the pay—\$335 million more in a week. We provided a flat rate. We are maintaining the best benefits and pensions and sick leave—and even still, the never-ending, moving yardstick and goalpost of CUPE.

Accept the deal before us, and make sure kids in this province stay in school every single day.

## MUNICIPAL GOVERNMENT

**Mr. Jeff Burch:** Speaker, through you to the Premier: Yesterday, in a move no one asked for or recommended, this government, with absolutely no consultation, tabled a bill that would allow them to appoint regional chairs in Niagara, York and Peel. Just four years ago, in the middle of the municipal election campaign, this government cancelled regional chair elections in these regions—

elections in which citizens were electing their chairs-at-large. They didn't trust citizens with free and fair elections. Now they don't even trust democratically elected councillors to choose a chair. Now the Premier is going to hand-pick who he wants to rule in his stead, as he hands them additional powers to do his bidding.

Why is the Premier showing such disdain for municipalities and turning local democracy into his own personal sandbox?

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing.

**Hon. Steve Clark:** I'd like to know why Jeff Burch doesn't support a great parliamentarian like Jim Bradley.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** I'm going to ask the minister to refer to his colleagues across the floor by their riding as opposed to their personal name. He can complete his answer.

1050

**Hon. Steve Clark:** Premier Ford made it crystal clear to Ontarians that the Strong Mayors, Building Homes Act was just the start, that we wanted to ensure that by the time those two new mayors were sworn in in Ontario's two largest cities, Toronto and Ottawa—he made it crystal clear that that was the start.

The announcement yesterday, in Bill 39, which it's pretty obvious New Democrats don't support—just to add to the litany of housing initiatives this government has done; we've done over 90 since 2018. And every single time we try to increase housing supply and actually provide an opportunity for a young person to realize the dream of home ownership, New Democrats vote against it. So it's no surprise that this member and their party, under the leadership of Marit Stiles, is going to not support—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Once again, I'm going to ask the minister to refer to members by their riding names—the same courtesy that each of us would expect of each other.

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Order.  
Supplementary question.

**Mr. Jeff Burch:** It's absolutely ludicrous that at a time when he is failing education workers and children, pediatric ICUs are over capacity and we're in an affordable housing crisis, this Premier is laser-focused on autocratic changes to municipal government.

The Premier isn't just appointing elected positions; he's also expanding strong-mayor powers to allow for minority rule while removing environmental protections and gutting conservation authorities.

Here's what AMO said about the government's recent housing bill: "The province has offered no evidence that the radical elements of the bill will improve housing affordability. It is more likely that the bill will enhance the profitability of the development industry at the expense of taxpayers and the natural environment." That's AMO, who were not even invited to the Bill 23 hearings that the government just shut down this morning.

Speaker, will the Premier admit that he sees municipalities and local democracy as nothing more than a delivery system for his decisions and a way to shop around farmland and green space to his wealthy friends?

**Hon. Steve Clark:** Speaker, I think there's one word that really articulates what New Democrats' position on housing in Ontario is, and that's "BANANA"—build absolutely nothing anywhere near anyone. That's what New Democrats want. They want high housing prices. They want young people to have no vision, no dream of home ownership. Again and again and again, New Democrats stand up for BANANAs.

We're going to stand up for the dream of home ownership.

## ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

**Mr. Hardeep Singh Grewal:** My question is for the Minister of Economic Development, Job Creation and Trade.

The 2021 census listed the city of Brampton as Canada's fastest-growing urban centre. Yet for over a decade, under the previous Liberal government, citizens of Brampton felt abandoned. We would continuously raise our health care challenges and increasing unemployment rate.

After a decade of empty Liberal promises, last year our government delivered on the long-promised second hospital for the people of Brampton.

The people of my riding are finally starting to see that Brampton is getting its fair share, but questions remain about employment and jobs in the city.

Speaker, what is our government doing to ensure that my constituents have good, secure, well-paying jobs not only for themselves but for generations to come?

**Hon. Victor Fedeli:** Brampton has been a key auto-assembly jurisdiction for decades, which is why our government led the Stellantis conversion to EV, shoring up thousands of jobs for further decades. We also fund the parts makers through our Ontario Automotive Modernization Program. In Brampton East, O-AMP supported Nahanni Steel, Tipco, RPPL and SHW Pumps, with more than \$385,000 in funding. This boosts our supply chain competitiveness, getting them ready to build the cars of the future.

Since 2019, O-AMP has leveraged \$36 million in private investments from 150 companies, creating over 820 jobs.

To the member from Brampton East: Let your businesses know that O-AMP has opened another intake just this week to assist even more businesses in Brampton to create good-paying jobs.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary?

**Mr. Hardeep Singh Grewal:** Thank you to the minister for his answer.

It's great to hear that our government is focusing on Brampton's automotive sector, but these are big investments which only apply to a small number of large businesses. While these large businesses provide employment

for hundreds of people in my riding—what about small businesses and start-ups? Small businesses and start-ups bring dreams to a reality. I personally know many constituents who rely on their small businesses to provide food for their families. We all know that starting a business is hard work and filled with risk.

What is our government doing to help entrepreneurs in the city of Brampton to start and grow their businesses?

**Hon. Victor Fedeli:** Sadly, the Liberals made starting a business and then running a business almost impossible in the province of Ontario. Mountains of red tape, unaffordable hydro and high taxes—all a recipe for disaster.

That's why our government has consistently reduced red tape, lowered taxes and fixed that hydro debacle. Businesses are now saving \$7 billion in costs every single year. Now we provide entrepreneurs all the tools they need to grow their business.

In Brampton, we fund their small business centre with over half a million dollars annually. We provide over \$200,000 to their Summer Company and Starter Company Plus, to help students and young entrepreneurs start their businesses. We've provided over \$165,000—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you very much. The next question.

#### GOVERNMENT ACCOUNTABILITY

**Ms. Jennifer K. French:** My question is to the Premier.

Do you remember when the Premier promised up and down that he would never touch the greenbelt? I do, too.

Yesterday this government tabled a bill to repeal the Duffins Rouge Agricultural Preserve Act. This repeal will end the protection of 4,500 acres of prime greenbelt farmland in Durham. About one third of this land is reportedly owned or controlled by the powerful landowner Silvio DeGasperis, who acquired these farm properties for next to nothing two decades ago. Mr. DeGasperis has donated boatloads to the PC Party since the Premier's election, including to the Premier's leadership campaign and his riding association. The only thing standing in the way of Mr. DeGasperis's ability to make untold millions of dollars is the Duffins Rouge Agricultural Preserve Act, and the Premier's government just made that go away. Mr. DeGasperis is about to get much, much richer from land that until yesterday was protected in perpetuity. Does the Premier understand how shady this looks?

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing to reply.

**Hon. Steve Clark:** This section of Bill 39 is the legislative piece of the consultation that we began with Ontarians a couple of weeks ago. We posted on the registry our intent to have 15 properties that will provide a minimum of 50,000 housing units. In exchange, we are also growing the greenbelt. We are ensuring that over 2,400 acres of prime agricultural land and significant land like woodlots and wetlands are part of the greenbelt. At the end of the day, the greenbelt will be expanded. And I

want to put those 50,000 homes in perspective. These are all properties that are either serviced or close to being serviced. They are exactly beside an existing urban area.

Speaker, in the supplementary, I will talk about the significance of that minimum of 50,000 homes in relationship to our 1.5 million homes.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary question.

**Ms. Jennifer K. French:** Mr. DeGasperis has also donated to the riding association of the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing—the same minister who yesterday tabled the bill to repeal the Duffins Rouge Agricultural Preserve Act.

The damning articles from the Toronto Star and the Narwhal highlight just how rotten things have gotten.

In addition to the Durham agricultural lands, Mr. DeGasperis and his well-connected family are poised to profit immensely from other lands that are also being removed from the greenbelt. According to the CBC, the DeGasperis family owns three parcels of land in Richmond Hill that the Premier wants to remove from the greenbelt. And just last year, a company controlled by the DeGasperis family bought greenbelt land in Vaughan that is also being removed—remarkably lucky timing.

This Premier has frequently accused the previous government of political corruption.

So my question is, what does the Premier think we should make of these questionable greenbelt deals?

1100

**Hon. Steve Clark:** Again, the land the member talked about in the first part of the question will provide a significant opportunity for housing. It's a property that has been discussed for many, many years. The outgoing mayor of Pickering actually wrote to the government and suggested that this property should be part of a future development. This property has been debated in public since the early 2000s, regarding its opportunity to provide housing. The specific Cherrywood property will provide up to 25,000 of the 50,000 homes that the government is proposing with this posting on the greenbelt. To put it into perspective, the best housing start year since 1987 was last year, with 100,000 homes. The average amount of homes being built in Ontario, over 30 years, is 67,500.

So I think the member can understand the significance of why we—

**Interjection:** All about the money.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Order.

The next question.

#### VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN

**Ms. Natalie Pierre:** My question is for the Associate Minister of Women's Social and Economic Opportunity. The COVID-19 pandemic has left many families across Ontario dealing with many challenges. Sadly, the pandemic has increased the frequency and severity of domestic violence for many women in our province.

According to the Ontario Association of Interval and Transition Houses, there have been 43 femicides in Ontario within the past year.

Living a life free from violence is a fundamental human right, but gender-based violence continues to be a significant barrier to achieving gender equality in Ontario. Can the minister update this House on our government's work to end gender-based violence?

**Hon. Charmaine A. Williams:** I want to thank the parliamentary assistant to the Minister of Colleges and Universities for your commendable work in providing wraparound supports in mental health for our youth.

Mr. Speaker, over the break, I had the privilege of attending the 40th annual meeting of the Federal, Provincial and Territorial Ministers Responsible for the Status of Women, which was capped by the announcement of the first National Action Plan to End Gender-Based Violence.

Ontario's endorsement of the 10-year National Action Plan to End Gender-Based Violence includes a framework for anyone facing GBV to have reliable and timely access to protection and services, no matter where they live. The action plan is anchored by five pillars: support for victims and survivors and their families; prevention; a responsive justice system; implementing Indigenous-led approaches; and social infrastructure and enabling environment. I'm really happy that this agreement marks a milestone investment on Ontario's path to ending gender-based violence.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The supplementary question.

**Ms. Natalie Pierre:** Speaker, the pandemic has disproportionately impacted women. Women's experiences at home, their health, their work and their economic well-being have all been negatively impacted. We also know that women already bear a disproportionate role in child care and caregiving responsibilities. That's why I support our government expanding the Investing in Women's Futures program to more communities across our province. It opens the door to financial freedom and economic security for these women and is foundational in violence prevention.

Can the associate minister please share further details on how the Investing in Women's Futures program expansion will proceed?

**Hon. Charmaine A. Williams:** Thank you again to the member from Burlington for the question. The member is correct; financial empowerment and security is the foundation in violence prevention.

That's why I was really proud to be able to announce, alongside the Minister of Finance and my colleagues from Durham, that our government will expand the Investing in Women's Futures program by up to 10 additional service sites. The call for proposals has just closed, and I can share with the House that we received about 136 applications. My ministry is currently reviewing those applications.

Building programs that give women wraparound supports to overcome barriers, build their skills and gain

employment is a key step for women entering and re-entering the workforce.

This investment of \$6.9 million over the next three years for the—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you very much.

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Order.

The next question.

## ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

**Mr. Peter Tabuns:** My question is to the Minister of the Environment.

This House hasn't heard much from the Minister of the Environment lately, and no wonder; his government's record on the environment and climate change has sunk to new lows. This government is gutting conservation authorities. It's going to allow development on flood plains during a climate crisis. It's ramping up greenhouse gas emissions from our electricity system. It's doubling down on unnecessary highways that will make congestion and emissions worse. And it's destroying the greenbelt on behalf of a few powerful landowners and PC donors.

What wisdom can the environment minister share at the climate conference in Egypt when he's enabling some of the worst attacks on the environment I've ever seen here in Ontario?

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The member for Renfrew–Nipissing–Pembroke.

**Mr. John Yakabuski:** I'd like to respond to His Majesty's opposition—he has greetings from the minister from COP27. He's glad to be there representing Ontario and, indeed, Canada.

I will take no lessons from the opposition when it comes to our climate change plan. We're very proud of our climate change plan. In fact, we are on target to meet or exceed our commitment for 2030, reducing emissions by 30% below 2005 levels.

Some of the things we have done, for example—electric vehicle production in Ontario. We're going to lead the world. We have massive investments in EV battery production taking place in the Windsor-Essex area. We are changing furnaces to arc electric at the Sault Ste. Marie and Hamilton steel mills, which will be the equivalent of taking two million cars off the road.

So I say to the Leader of the Opposition, we are well on target to meet or exceed our guarantees for 2030, and we're very proud of our made-in-Ontario climate change plan.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The supplementary question.

**Mr. Peter Tabuns:** The Minister of the Environment has been silent during his government's lobbyist-driven attacks on climate, on the greenbelt, on conservation authorities, on farmland, on wetlands, and on and on.

After the minister returns from Egypt and is back on the job, will anyone in Ontario even notice?

**Mr. John Yakabuski:** Thanks again to the leader of His Majesty's loyal opposition.

I want to expand on that. Yes, we are making sure that the environment is a number one priority. However, let's be clear: We were elected in a massive majority by answering the call that Ontarians gave us to build Ontario—and we're going to. I say to the leader: The two are not mutually exclusive. We are able to build Ontario and provide what is needed for the increase in population coming over the next couple of decades, and we are able to do that while respecting and protecting the environment. We're able to walk and chew gum at the same time.

I understand the people on the other side—unfortunately, all they want to talk about is blocking our efforts to do what is necessary to make sure that Ontario continues to lead.

We will get both done, and we'll protect the environment at the—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you.  
*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Stop the clock.  
Start the clock. Next question.

#### LABOUR DISPUTE

**Ms. Mitzie Hunter:** My question is to the Premier. The Premier and his Minister of Education have created ongoing chaos in our education system, and confusion for everyone. They have put students, parents—everyone—through the ringer. Their heavy-handed approach with the “notwithstanding” clause to force an agreement upon CUPE was shameful and heavy-handed.

1110

This government did the right thing with the repeal of Bill 28, and our faith in democracy has been restored. But now we need to see a fair deal that is reached at the table. CUPE asked for \$100 million to improve the conditions in the classrooms. This is so that they can have more ECEs in every kindergarten classroom and improve the learning environment in our schools that is so desperately needed.

Speaker, will the Premier be willing to work for the majority of Ontarians and put an offer to CUPE that increases the services to our students so that we can have peace in our public schools?

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Minister of Education.

**Hon. Stephen Lecce:** I can confirm to the member opposite that we've increased funding in public education by \$3 billion since the Liberals were in power. We've hired nearly 7,000 more workers from when the Liberals were in power. We have another 1,000 educators in our schools from the last time the Liberals were in power. We've done that, Speaker, because our government and our party believe in publicly funded schools.

It's why we are increasing investment each and every year. And it's why, in this proposal before the union, we're increasing their salaries by \$335 million more. We're increasing opportunities for benefits, for compensation, for pensions and, of course, for sick leave, which we know

is generous in this province, especially when compared to the other provinces. It leads the nation. We are hiring more staff. We are increasing wages.

As the member opposite rightfully recognized, we've withdrawn Bill 28. We did our part. It's now up to the union to do theirs: to stay at the table and not walk away from our kids so the children in this province can stay in school.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary question.

**Ms. Mitzie Hunter:** Speaker, back to the Premier: In my riding of Scarborough–Guildwood, Helen says, “My grandson in grade 3 is behind. He is in grade 4. There are no EAs in the whole school!!! I am sure there are many who could use extra support. After COVID, many are behind. Many will get lost. Yet we never hear about this in the news. We need to support education workers for all children. Tutors are not the answer.”

Speaker, this minister just said that they believe in public education, but that is not what their actions confirm. In fact, this government, on the morning of an election, gave Ontarians who have cars \$2 billion in cheques issued to them. Recently, in your fall economic statement, \$1.2 billion was returned in the gas tax.

So, Speaker, if this—

*Interjections.*

**Ms. Mitzie Hunter:** If this government believes in public education, why is it that you are shamefully putting political tactics and wedging parents against education workers instead of making the classroom investments in public education that are required right now so that our students can catch up and our students can learn? What is required is to get a fair deal at the table. Are you going to get it done?

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Once again, I'll ask the government side not to interrupt opposition members with applause during their questions.

Minister of Education.

**Hon. Stephen Lecce:** The only way for students to get ahead and catch up, as the member opposite noted, is for them to be in class on Monday. And we believe so strongly that children should be in school.

It is always perplexing when I don't hear the Liberals or New Democrats raise a question to the government about the impact on children, families and the economy when strikes take place. It's as if you could decouple the impact on children from all of your questions this entire week, and yet we know the impact on children, on special education families, and on those who need physical or mental access benefits from our schools. That's why, Speaker, we brought forth a plan, as we committed to the people of Ontario, to withdraw Bill 28, to increase funding and spending for wages by \$335 million more week over week. We've also committed to a flat rate, which they required, which we have moved on. And we are maintaining their sick leave, their pensions and their health benefits, which few in the private economy can say they have as well. We're brought forth a program that's



designed to respect our workers and keep kids in the classroom.

### VICTIMS OF CRIME

**Ms. Goldie Ghamari:** Mr. Speaker, when people become victims of crime, they can face tremendous harm and trauma, which extends into all facets of their lives. These effects can persist for years and, in some instances, can have lifelong negative implications. Many victims feel isolated and will withdraw from their families, friends, work and community. Our government must stand up for victims of crime by providing them with the needed support and intervention.

Mr. Speaker, through you, could the Attorney General please share with us the importance of recognizing individuals and organizations that support people who have faced victimization due to crime?

**Hon. Doug Downey:** I want to thank my friend and colleague for the chance to highlight and honour the contributions of individuals and organizations across Ontario who have been recognized through the Attorney General's Victim Services Awards of Distinction.

We all know, in the face of unprecedented challenges, dedicated professionals around Ontario—generous volunteers, outstanding organizations—they've all demonstrated an irrepressible drive to raise awareness of victims' issues, increase access to crisis intervention services, and provide compassionate service and support in times of need. This esteemed recognition highlights the dedication and compassion of professionals, organizations and volunteers working to support people who have experienced victimization due to crime. The award also recognizes the courageous efforts of individuals who have been personally impacted by crime and are now working to raise the profile of victims' issues in this province, including in rural, northern and Indigenous communities.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The supplementary.

**Ms. Goldie Ghamari:** Thank you to the Attorney General for recognizing the individuals and organizations who continue to dedicate themselves to supporting victims of crime. Our government must understand that providing support to victims and their families is crucial in their recovery and contributes to overall community well-being. The people of my riding of Carleton are grateful for the work carried out by the dedicated individuals and organizations who assist victims of crime throughout the national capital region and all of Ontario.

Mr. Speaker, through you, can the Attorney General please share with the House an example of leadership demonstrated by a previous recipient of the victim services awards in support of their community?

**Hon. Doug Downey:** I'm thrilled—we have posted on the website the previous winners from last year and the year before, but here's the good news: I invite all of my colleagues from across the aisle and on this side to bring to the attention of individuals and organizations who have done great work for victims, who are supporting them and providing services, that the nomination deadline has been

extended to December 9 of this year. Further information is available, obviously, on the web page, it's available on the Attorney General's Twitter feed, and I'd just ask you to highlight for individuals—often they provide service and they don't feel they're worthy of recognition, but they are, and I would encourage you to encourage them to make sure they get the nomination in.

Last year we gave awards to individuals and organizations in Thunder Bay, Hamilton, Toronto, Ottawa, Oshawa, Sarnia, Thornhill, St. Catharines, Burlington and Whitby; this year, I hope and expect that we'll have nominations from as broad a field again.

### FOOD BANKS

**Ms. Doly Begum:** The 2022 Daily Bread Food Bank report paints an alarming picture for the city, but especially for Scarborough. We have seen a 29% increase in food bank visits in Scarborough; that's over 554,000 visits in 2021. Some 28% of adults reported missing a day's meal because they did not have enough money for food—

*Interjections.*

**Ms. Doly Begum:** I'm not sure why you're laughing.

Some 49% were skipping meals to make up for the cost of housing or transportation. This is one of the richest provinces—

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Order.

**Ms. Doly Begum:** I'm talking about over 554,000 people who went to the food bank last year—

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Order. Stop the clock.

The government House leader will come to order.

Start the clock.

The Minister of Finance can reply.

**Hon. Peter Bethlenfalvy:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker, through you to the member opposite for that question. I'm sure the member opposite was here in the House on Monday when we tabled the fall economic statement, which is helping many people who are struggling. Many people are feeling the pinch at the grocery store. Many people are feeling the pinch at the pumps, feeling the pinch with rent and with mortgage rates going up on housing.

**1120**

That's why we moved early to provide relief, increasing minimum wage, increasing the income tax rebate so that people making a lower income can take more money in their pockets. It's why we gave the licence plate stickers back. It's why the Minister of Housing is getting houses built so there can be affordable housing in Ontario. It's why we doubled the Guaranteed Annual Income System for over 200,000 low-income seniors in this province. It's why we increased the earning exemptions for people on Ontario disability from \$200 to \$1,000, many of whom said that is a game-changer for people on disability.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The supplementary question.

**Ms. Doly Begum:** If the minister thinks that the licence plate sticker rebate helps those people in those food bank lineups, he needs to come to Scarborough and I will take him to the Bluffs Food Bank, and I will take him to the Feed Scarborough Food Bank and show him what's happening there, because those rebates do not support the people.

Yes, that lineup has seniors. It has children. It has people who are on ODSP. You know, ODSP recipients are among the top demographic being forced to rely on food banks because we have legislated poverty. Government after government—not just this government; I know it's the previous government as well—has legislated poverty policies. From children to seniors to BIPOC communities and communities in my riding of Scarborough Southwest, people are relying on food banks. Poverty costs, and the minister knows that. It costs our health care system, it costs our labour force and it's costing our province.

The report also highlighted that guaranteed income security and the elimination of systemic poverty is a solution. My question is simple. Will the government—and I know the fiscal update does not address it. It does not address the crisis that we're facing in our province. It does not address the crisis that we're facing with the wage suppression—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you.

*Interjection.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The member has placed her question. The Minister of Finance can respond.

**Hon. Peter Bethlenfalvy:** Let's go back in time a little bit. Many will remember in 2011 what happened. The NDP supported the Liberal government for three years. If they really believed that they needed to support disability, let me ask you this, Mr. Speaker—let me ask all of Ontario this question: Did they index ODSP payments to inflation? No, they did not, when they had an opportunity to do that.

This is a government that is acting. That is why we increased the ODSP payments by 5%. It's why for the first time since the program was set up over 20 years ago that it's getting indexed to inflation. That's why we increased the earning exemption for the hard-working people of Ontario.

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The House will come to order. The next question.

#### FOREIGN-TRAINED HEALTH CARE WORKERS

**Mr. Vincent Ke:** The COVID-19 pandemic highlighted gaps in our health care system caused by the neglect and indifference of the previous Liberal government. We cannot afford to repeat the mistakes of the past. We must ensure that people in our province can access the health care services they need when they need them.

We know that internationally educated nurses in every community are eager to work, but have expressed concern over the lengthy registration process. Can the Minister of Health update this House on what our government is doing

to make it easier for internationally educated nurses to work here in Ontario?

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Member for Eglinton–Lawrence.

**Mrs. Robin Martin:** Thank you to the hard-working member from Don Valley North for the question and for his advocacy on behalf of internationally educated health care workers.

This government is breaking down long-standing barriers so that health professionals can work here in Ontario, no matter where they come from. These changes will finally bring more internationally educated health care workers into our health care system faster, helping to care for Ontarians when they need it. So far this year, through our Supervised Practice Experience Partnership program, over 900 internationally educated nurses have been matched with hospitals, and in total the college of nurses has registered 5,848 internationally educated nurses.

Working in partnership with the College of Nurses of Ontario and the College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario, these changes will support our record-breaking, historic recruitment plan and make it easier and faster for health care professionals to be trained in Ontario.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary.

**Mr. Vincent Ke:** Thank you to the parliamentary assistant for that response.

It is great to hear that changes are being made to have internationally educated nurses work in Ontario much sooner, but as a government, we must do more.

Speaker, retired nurses in my riding of Don Valley North want to return to work and assist those in need once again, but unfortunately, they have faced barriers in applying for reinstatement. Our government must act now to find a solution to bring these nurses and others with medical expertise back into practice.

Speaker, can the minister provide more details on what else our government is doing to expand our health care workforce?

**Mrs. Robin Martin:** Thank you again to the member for that question.

The important changes that will come into effect immediately include allowing internationally educated nurses to register in a temporary class and begin working sooner while they work toward full registration; making it easier for non-practising or retired nurses to return to the field by introducing flexibility to the requirement that they need to have practised nursing within a certain period of time before applying for reinstatement; and creating a new temporary independent-practice registration class for physicians from other provinces and territories, making it easier for them to work up to 90 days in Ontario.

Additionally, even more changes will come into effect on January 1, including requiring health regulatory colleges to comply with time limits to make registration decisions, prohibiting health regulatory colleges from requiring Canadian work experience for the purpose of registration, and accepting language tests provided under the Immigration and Refugee Protection Act to reduce

duplicate language-proficiency testing for immigrants who want to practise here.

Together, these changes are going to help make sure we have the health care workers we need in Ontario.

### HOSPITAL SERVICES

**Mr. Guy Bourgouin:** Ma question est pour la ministre de la Santé.

The health minister asked for ideas from our health providers to alleviate the burdens they face. The Hearst hospital had made a proposal in March 2021 for an extra anesthesiologist. My office sent two follow-up letters for a response; I have given two letters in person to the minister.

Now the Hearst hospital is facing another crisis: They need a minimum of 10 doctors; presently they have six, and two are retiring soon.

My question: Minister, if we can't get an answer for an extra anesthesiologist, will the minister agree today to meet with the Hearst hospital in the next two weeks to address these two crises so that we can find a solution so desperately needed for the Hearst area?

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The member for Eglinton–Lawrence.

**Mrs. Robin Martin:** Thank you to the member opposite for the question.

I haven't seen the letters you referred to, and I can't speak to the minister's schedule, but our government does understand the unique health care challenges in the north. We're committed to ensuring that everyone in Ontario has access to the health care that they need.

While physician supply across Ontario is projected to consistently exceed population growth—leading to an average annual net increase of approximately 581 physicians each year until 2029—we know that there are still some northern communities that have trouble recruiting and retaining doctors, which is why our government is investing in initiatives to help improve access to physician services across the north.

This includes, for example, \$32 million this year for residents' salaries and benefits, medical education and training, allied health professionals and remote First Nations family residency programs at the northern Ontario medical school.

We'll continue working to make sure everyone in Ontario has the health care that they need.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary question. The member for Niagara Falls.

**Mr. Wayne Gates:** My question is to the Premier.

The government can't ignore our health care crisis any longer.

In Niagara, only 17% of patients are receiving MRIs within the provincial target times. The average wait time in Niagara is 164 days. A constituent in my community has informed my office that their 90-year-old mother, Joyce, who requires an MRI for severe back issues, will have to wait until August 2023. The Niagara community rallied to raise funds for another MRI machine. Niagara

Health received funding to run the Niagara MRI machines. So why is this happening? We know that Niagara has not been spared from the provincial health care staffing crisis.

**1130**

When will the Premier work with Niagara Health, address our health care staffing issues in this province, reduce our outrageous MRI wait times, repeal Bill 124—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Question?

**Mr. Wayne Gates:** —and at least ensure Joyce can get an MRI in a reasonable time frame and not have to wait until August—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you. The member for Eglinton–Lawrence.

**Mrs. Robin Martin:** Thank you to the member opposite for the question.

Our government has got a record investment in recruitment, retaining and training new health care providers, and we're making sure we have health care providers all across the system.

The College of Nurses of Ontario has reported that in the first eight months of this year they registered 12,800 nurses. That is a record. So our changes and our investments are having an effect.

I understand that nobody likes to wait for diagnostic imaging, and diagnostic imaging has caught up—our surgical backlog. We've had the diagnostic imaging actually exceeding targets that existed before—although there may be one reason why this individual is waiting. I understand that Niagara has just gotten a new MRI machine. So I hope she gets her MRI very shortly.

### ENTREPRENEURIAT FRANCOPHONE

**M. Stéphane Sarrazin:** Ma question est pour la ministre des Affaires francophones. La COVID-19 a eu un impact important sur l'économie de l'Ontario et du Québec, qui représentent ensemble plus de la moitié du PIB total du Canada. C'est pourquoi il est impératif de créer de solides réseaux commerciaux internes pour soutenir les efforts de reprise économique.

Pas plus tard que mardi, les lauréats du Prix du commerce Ontario-Québec en francophonie ont été annoncés. Je suis fier d'apprendre que la Ferme Avicole Laviolette, située dans ma circonscription de Glengarry–Prescott–Russell, est lauréate de ce prix.

Monsieur le Président, la ministre des Affaires francophones peut-elle nous en dire un peu plus à propos de la deuxième édition du prix et son importance pour encourager le commerce interprovincial?

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The member for Mississauga Centre.

**M<sup>me</sup> Natalia Kusendova-Bashta:** Je tiens à remercier le député de Glengarry–Prescott–Russell pour cette question importante, et j'ai hâte de travailler avec lui, de faire rayonner la francophonie ontarienne de son comté et, aussi, partout en Ontario.

Je tiens aussi à féliciter la Ferme Avicole Laviolette, lauréate de ce prix. Avec un personnel 100 % bilingue et des produits de qualité, cette entreprise témoigne de la

qualité de l'entrepreneuriat franco-ontarien et de son rôle de moteur de croissance pour la francophonie.

Le Prix du commerce Ontario-Québec en francophonie est une manière de récompenser l'excellence et l'innovation de nos entreprises francophones.

La promotion du commerce interprovincial et l'innovation sont au coeur des efforts de coopération de nos deux gouvernements, et ce prix fait rayonner les entreprises qui mettent l'atout francophone au coeur de leurs stratégies d'exportation et de développement.

**M. Stéphane Sarrazin:** Merci à l'adjointe parlementaire à la ministre pour cette réponse.

Je suis heureux d'entendre parler d'initiatives qui contribuent à promouvoir l'entrepreneuriat francophone. Dans ma circonscription de Glengarry-Prescott-Russell, nous avons une communauté franco-ontarienne dynamique qui contribue à notre économie locale. Nous, en tant que gouvernement, devons promouvoir ces entreprises et veiller à ce qu'elles demeurent prospères.

Monsieur le Président, est-ce que l'adjointe parlementaire à la ministre des Affaires francophones peut nous en dire davantage sur ce prix, ainsi que sur l'immense valeur de la francophonie comme avantage économique?

**M<sup>me</sup> Natalia Kusendova-Bashta:** Merci pour cette question. Oui, c'est le but de la ministre des Affaires francophones de faire rayonner l'atout économique de notre francophonie. Nous savons que l'avenir de la langue française, la belle langue de Molière, est grandement lié à la prospérité des entreprises francophones. À travers ce prix, nous témoignons de la richesse du talent francophone et de l'envergure des ambitions des milieux d'affaires ontariens et québécois.

Les entreprises lauréates de cette deuxième édition du Prix du commerce Ontario-Québec en francophonie nous rappellent l'excellence de l'entrepreneuriat francophone. En desservant une clientèle ontarienne et québécoise, ce prix contribue à renforcer les liens d'affaires entre nos deux provinces.

Les entrepreneurs et entreprises francophones contribuent à la prospérité de l'Ontario, et je rappelle que notre gouvernement considère que la francophonie est un atout économique essentiel.

## HEALTH CARE

**MPP Kristyn Wong-Tam:** My question is to the Premier. I know that he has arrived, so his timing is perfect. Because—

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Stop the clock.

Yes, that statement did, in fact, cross the line in terms of making reference to the absence of a member. Again, I don't know why I have to keep explaining this. It's in all of our interests not to do that. Let's not do it again.

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Order.

Start the clock.

The member for Toronto Centre has the floor.

**MPP Kristyn Wong-Tam:** Thank you, Speaker. My question is still for the Premier.

Because of the changes to billing that are coming under the physician services act that will come into effect on December 1, 2022, physicians like those who are actually practising at virtual-only care clinics such as Connect-Clinic will have to stop delivering gender-affirming care. Gender-affirming care, as many will know, is life-saving care—care that Connect-Clinic's 1,500 patients, as well as 2,000 wait-listed patients, will then lose access to by the end of this month. Many of those patients live in rural communities. They are without access to a family doctor. Many of them are actually reliant on virtual care; it's the only access to care that they have.

Will the government commit to an alternative funding plan in order to meet the needs of trans and gender-diverse people in Ontario?

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The member for Eglinton-Lawrence.

**Mrs. Robin Martin:** Thank you very much for the question.

On March 28, 2022, a three-year physician services agreement was ratified by the Ontario Medical Association and its members. It's a true milestone, as it is the first time that a deal has been reached in over a decade without an arbitrator. Under the new virtual care framework, the ministry and the OMA are implementing a new pricing structure for virtual care—something which didn't really exist before the pandemic—that ensures that patients are receiving services through the avenue that best reflects a patient-physician relationship, video versus telephone.

We want to be clear: All medically necessary virtual care services, including initial patient visits by telephone, will continue to be insured under OHIP. Patients will continue to have access to clinically appropriate virtual care where virtual care is the appropriate service, like in rural and remote mental health services. We're going to make sure that Ontarians get the care they need, and we're making virtual care permanent for the first time ever.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary question.

**MPP Kristyn Wong-Tam:** Unfortunately, that did not answer the question.

My second question is to the Premier. The patients waiting for gender-affirming care want a concrete answer; they're hoping to have it today. Yesterday, I tabled a private member's bill, Gender Affirming Health Care Advisory Committee Act. This House, on numerous occasions, and previous governments, have actually created working groups, advisory committees, round tables to inform the government on their work. It actually helps them build better programs and services and legislation for the people of Ontario. Will this government support that bill? Will this government stand for the trans and gender-diverse community? November 20 is the Trans Day of Remembrance. It's coming up. Many of the members will be attending those events. Will you be able to pass this bill today?

**Mrs. Robin Martin:** Thank you for the question.

This government wants to make sure that every Ontarian has the health care they need and deserve. Ontario funds team-based care, such as community centres and family health teams, to improve access to primary care for vulnerable populations and trans populations. Many primary care teams run primary care programs as part of their LGBTQ+ services, or specific clinics for trans populations, providing interdisciplinary primary care services, including mental health services, for their clients.

1140

In addition to the many groups that provide services to the trans community, there are two specific family health teams that have dedicated trans programs: the Couchiching Family Health Team for trans health services, and the Queen Square Family Health Team in Brampton for trans health/gender health in the community. There is also the Sherbourne community health centre, which provides guidance and resources that could be used by all primary care providers when caring for transgender individuals.

Ontario also funds over 500 community-based mental health and addictions providers across the province. These are services targeted to LGBTQ+ and available through many of the agencies free of charge.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** That concludes our question period for this morning.

#### BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The government House leader has a point of order.

**Hon. Paul Calandra:** Thank you, Speaker. I'm just rising on standing order 59 to lay out the business for the coming week.

On Monday, November 21, in the afternoon: opposition day number 3 and, further into the afternoon, Bill 39, the Better Municipal Governance Act, 2022.

On Tuesday morning, November 22, we will continue on with Bill 39. In the afternoon, there will be tributes to deceased members of provincial Parliament. In the evening, we will be dealing with Bill 15, standing in the name of the member for Oshawa.

On Wednesday, November 23, in the morning, we'll continue with Bill 23. In the afternoon, we will again continue with Bill 23. In the evening, we will deal with the motion for Bill 24, standing in the name of the member for Nickel Belt.

On Thursday, we'll continue with Bill 23 again. And before question period, I will note that we will observe a moment of silence for the Trans Day of Remembrance, in accordance with the legislation that was passed in a previous Parliament. In the afternoon, we will deal with Bill 23, and in the evening we will deal with Bill 4, standing in the name of the member for London West.

#### COMMITTEE SITTINGS

**Hon. Paul Calandra:** Speaker, with your indulgence, I do have a unanimous-consent request. As you may know,

inadvertently some individuals were not able to present in front of committee this morning, so I am seeking the following consent from colleagues:

I'm seeking unanimous consent that, notwithstanding standing order 74(b), the Standing Committee on Heritage, Infrastructure and Cultural Policy be authorized to conduct public hearings on Bill 23, An Act to amend various statutes, to revoke various regulations and to enact the Supporting Growth and Housing in York and Durham Regions Act, 2022, this afternoon.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The government House leader is seeking unanimous consent of the House that, notwithstanding standing order 74(b), the Standing Committee on Heritage, Infrastructure and Cultural Policy be authorized to conduct public hearings on Bill 23, An Act to amend various statutes, to revoke various regulations and to enact the Supporting Growth and Housing in York and Durham Regions Act, 2022, this afternoon. Agreed? Agreed.

#### CORRECTION OF RECORD

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The member for Scarborough–Guildwood has a point of order.

**Ms. Mitzie Hunter:** Point of order, Speaker: I do want to correct my record. When speaking on behalf of Helen from my riding of Scarborough–Guildwood, I said that her grandson was in grade 3. Actually, her grandson "is three grades behind. He is in grade 4. There are no EAs in the whole school!!! I am sure there are many who could use extra support. After COVID, many are behind. Many will get lost."

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you. Members are allowed to correct their record.

**MPP Kristyn Wong-Tam:** Point of order, Speaker.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Point of order, the member for Toronto Centre.

**MPP Kristyn Wong-Tam:** On a point of order: I seek unanimous consent that, notwithstanding any standing order or special order of the House, the order for second reading of Bill 42, the Gender Affirming Health Care Advisory Committee Act, a bill that will save trans, gender-diverse and intersex lives, as we are about to mark the Trans Day of Remembrance, shall be immediately called, and the Speaker shall immediately put the question on the motion for second reading without debate and amendment; and

That the bill should be ordered for third reading; and

That the order for third reading shall be immediately called, and the Speaker shall immediately put the question on the motion for third reading without debate or amendment.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The member for Toronto Centre is seeking the unanimous consent of the House that, notwithstanding any standing order or special order of the House, the order for second reading of Bill 42, the Gender Affirming Health Care Advisory Committee Act, a bill that will save trans, gender-diverse and intersex

lives, as we are about to mark the Trans Day of Remembrance, shall be immediately called, and the Speaker shall immediately put the question on the motion for second reading without debate and amendment; and

That the bill should be ordered for third reading; and

That the order for third reading shall be immediately called and the Speaker shall immediately put the question on the motion for third reading without debate or amendment. Agreed? I heard some noes.

**Hon. Paul Calandra:** Point of order, Speaker.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Point of order, the government House leader.

**Hon. Paul Calandra:** I think it's just worth noting, Speaker, that I will again, for the 14th or 15th time, make it abundantly clear to all members on all sides of the House that on a motion like that for private members' business, unanimous consent will not be accepted by this House leader. It is up to this House and the members of the House to have the opportunity to review bills. That is the process, and that will continue to be the process.

## DEFERRED VOTES

### PROGRESS ON THE PLAN TO BUILD ACT (BUDGET MEASURES), 2022

### LOI DE 2022 SUR LA PROGRESSION DU PLAN POUR BÂTIR (MESURES BUDGÉTAIRES)

Deferred vote on the motion that the question now be put on the motion for second reading of the following bill:

Bill 36, An Act to implement Budget measures and to enact and amend various statutes / Projet de loi 36, Loi visant à mettre en oeuvre les mesures budgétaires et à édicter et à modifier diverses lois.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Call in the members. This is a five-minute bell.

*The division bells rang from 1146 to 1151.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Members will please take their seats.

On November 15, 2022, Mr. Bethlenfalvy moved second reading of Bill 36, An Act to implement Budget measures and to enact and amend various statutes.

On November 16, 2022, Ms. Fullerton moved that the question be now put.

All those in favour of Ms. Fullerton's motion, please rise one at a time and be recognized by the Clerk.

Cho, Raymond Sung Joon	Ke, Vincent	Saunderson, Brian
Cho, Stan	Kerzner, Michael S.	Scott, Laurie
Clark, Steve	Khanjin, Andrea	Skelly, Donna
Coe, Lorne	Kusendova-Bashta, Natalia	Smith, Dave
Crawford, Stephen	Leardi, Anthony	Smith, David
Cuzzetto, Rudy	Lecce, Stephen	Smith, Graydon
Dixon, Jess	Lumsden, Neil	Smith, Laura
Dowie, Andrew	Martin, Robin	Smith, Todd
Downey, Doug	McCarthy, Todd J.	Surma, Kinga
Dunlop, Jill	McGregor, Graham	Thanigasalam, Vijay
Fedeli, Victor	McNaughton, Monte	Thompson, Lisa M.
Flack, Rob	Oosterhoff, Sam	Tibollo, Michael A.
Ford, Doug	Pang, Billy	Wai, Daisy
Fullerton, Merrilee	Pierre, Natalie	Williams, Charmaine A.
Gallagher Murphy, Dawn	Pirie, George	Yakubski, John
Ghamari, Goldie	Quinn, Nolan	

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** All those opposed to Ms. Fullerton's motion, please rise one at a time and be recognized by the Clerk.

## Nays

Andrew, Jill	French, Jennifer K.	McMahon, Mary-Margaret
Armstrong, Teresa J.	Gates, Wayne	Pasma, Chandra
Begum, Doly	Glover, Chris	Sattler, Peggy
Blais, Stephen	Gretzky, Lisa	Schreiner, Mike
Bourgouin, Guy	Harden, Joel	Shamji, Adil
Bowman, Stephanie	Hsu, Ted	Stevens, Jennifer (Jennie)
Burch, Jeff	Hunter, Mitzie	Stiles, Marit
Collard, Lucille	Kernaghan, Terence	Tabuns, Peter
Fife, Catherine	Mamakwa, Sol	Vanthof, John
Fraser, John	Mantha, Michael	Wong-Tam, Kristyn

**The Clerk of the Assembly (Mr. Todd Decker):** The ayes are 74; the nays are 30.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** I declare the motion carried.

Mr. Bethlenfalvy has moved second reading of Bill 36, An Act to implement Budget measures and to enact and amend various statutes. Is it the pleasure of the House that the motion carry? I heard some noes.

All those in favour of the motion will please say "aye."

All those opposed will please say "nay."

In my opinion, the ayes have it.

Call in the members. This is a five-minute bell.

*The division bells rang from 1155 to 1156.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** On November 15, 2022, Mr. Bethlenfalvy moved second reading of Bill 36, An Act to implement Budget measures and to enact and amend various statutes.

All those in favour of the motion will please rise one at a time and be recognized by the Clerk.

## Ayes

Ayes		
Anand, Deepak	Gill, Parm	Rae, Matthew
Babikian, Aris	Grewal, Hardeep Singh	Rasheed, Kaleed
Bailey, Robert	Hardeman, Ernie	Rickford, Greg
Barnes, Patrice	Harris, Mike	Riddell, Brian
Bethlenfalvy, Peter	Hogarth, Christine	Romano, Ross
Bouma, Will	Holland, Kevin	Sabawy, Sheref
Bresee, Ric	Jones, Trevor	Sandhu, Amarjot
Byers, Rick	Jordan, John	Sarkaria, Prabmeet Singh
Calandra, Paul	Kanapathi, Logan	Sarrazin, Stéphane

Anand, Deepak	Gill, Parm	Rae, Matthew
Babikian, Aris	Grewal, Hardeep Singh	Rasheed, Kaleed
Bailey, Robert	Hardeman, Ernie	Rickford, Greg
Barnes, Patrice	Harris, Mike	Riddell, Brian
Bethlenfalvy, Peter	Hogarth, Christine	Romano, Ross
Bouma, Will	Holland, Kevin	Sabawy, Sheref
Bresee, Ric	Jones, Trevor	Sandhu, Amarjot
Byers, Rick	Jordan, John	Sarkaria, Prabmeet Singh
Calandra, Paul	Kanapathi, Logan	Sarrazin, Stéphane
Cho, Raymond Sung Joon	Ke, Vincent	Saunderson, Brian
Cho, Stan	Kerzner, Michael S.	Scott, Laurie

Clark, Steve	Khanjin, Andrea	Skelly, Donna
Coe, Lorne	Kusendova-Bashta, Natalia	Smith, Dave
Crawford, Stephen	Leardi, Anthony	Smith, David
Cuzzetto, Rudy	Lecce, Stephen	Smith, Graydon
Dixon, Jess	Lumsden, Neil	Smith, Laura
Dowie, Andrew	Martin, Robin	Smith, Todd
Downey, Doug	McCarthy, Todd J.	Surma, Kinga
Dunlop, Jill	McGregor, Graham	Thanigasalam, Vijay
Fedeli, Victor	McNaughton, Monte	Thompson, Lisa M.
Flack, Rob	Oosterhoff, Sam	Tibollo, Michael A.
Ford, Doug	Pang, Billy	Wai, Daisy
Fullerton, Merrilee	Pierre, Natalie	Williams, Charmaine A.
Gallagher Murphy, Dawn	Pirie, George	Yakabuski, John
Ghamari, Goldie	Quinn, Nolan	

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** All those opposed to the motion will please rise one at a time and be recognized by the Clerk.

#### Nays

Andrew, Jill	French, Jennifer K.	McMahon, Mary-Margaret
Armstrong, Teresa J.	Gates, Wayne	Pasma, Chandra
Begum, Doly	Glover, Chris	Sattler, Peggy
Blais, Stephen	Gretzky, Lisa	Schreiner, Mike
Bourgouin, Guy	Harden, Joel	Shamji, Adil
Bowman, Stephanie	Hsu, Ted	Stevens, Jennifer (Jennie)
Burch, Jeff	Hunter, Mitzie	Stiles, Marit
Collard, Lucille	Kernaghan, Terence	Tabuns, Peter
Fife, Catherine	Mamakwa, Sol	Vanthof, John
Fraser, John	Mantha, Michael	Wong-Tam, Kristyn

**The Clerk of the Assembly (Mr. Todd Decker):** The ayes are 74; the nays are 30.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** I declare the motion carried.

*Second reading agreed to.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Shall the bill be ordered for third reading? Minister of Finance.

**Hon. Peter Bethlenfalvy:** I will send it to the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Affairs.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The bill is referred to the Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Affairs.

#### MEMBER'S BIRTHDAY

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The member for Renfrew–Nipissing–Pembroke on a point of order.

**Mr. John Yakabuski:** Yes, thank you, Speaker. In addition to the member for Don Valley North having a birthday today, the Minister for Seniors and Accessibility will be having a birthday tomorrow: number 86.

*Applause.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** There being no further business, this House stands in recess until 1 p.m.

*The House recessed from 1200 to 1300.*

*Afternoon meeting reported in volume B.*





**LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF ONTARIO**  
**ASSEMBLÉE LÉGISLATIVE DE L'ONTARIO**

Lieutenant Governor / Lieutenante-gouverneure: Hon. / L'hon. Elizabeth Dowdeswell, OC, OOnt.

Speaker / Président: Hon. / L'hon. Ted Arnott

Clerk / Greffier: Todd Decker

Deputy Clerk / Sous-greffier: Trevor Day

Clerks-at-the-Table / Greffiers parlementaires: Valerie Quioc Lim, Wai Lam (William) Wong,

Meghan Stenson, Christopher Tyrell

Sergeant-at-Arms / Sergente d'armes: Jacquelyn Gordon

Member and Party / Député(e) et parti	Constituency / Circonscription	Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités
Anand, Deepak (PC)	Mississauga—Malton	
Andrew, Jill (NDP)	Toronto—St. Paul's	
Armstrong, Teresa J. (NDP)	London—Fanshawe	
<b>Arnott, Hon. / L'hon. Ted (PC)</b>	Wellington—Halton Hills	Speaker / Président de l'Assemblée législative
Babikian, Aris (PC)	Scarborough—Agincourt	
Bailey, Robert (PC)	Sarnia—Lambton	
<b>Barnes, Patrice (PC)</b>	Ajax	Second Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Deuxième vice-présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée législative
Begum, Doly (NDP)	Scarborough Southwest / Scarborough- Sud-Ouest	Deputy Leader, Official Opposition / Chef adjointe de l'opposition officielle
Bell, Jessica (NDP)	University—Rosedale	
<b>Bethlenfalvy, Hon. / L'hon. Peter (PC)</b>	Pickering—Uxbridge	Minister of Finance / Ministre des Finances
Blais, Stephen (LIB)	Orléans	
Bouma, Will (PC)	Brantford—Brant	
Bourgouin, Guy (NDP)	Mushkegowuk—James Bay / Mushkegowuk—Baie James	
Bowman, Stephanie (LIB)	Don Valley West / Don Valley-Ouest	
Brady, Bobbi Ann (IND)	Haldimand—Norfolk	
Bresee, Ric (PC)	Hastings—Lennox and Addington	
Burch, Jeff (NDP)	Niagara Centre / Niagara-Centre	
Byers, Rick (PC)	Bruce—Grey—Owen Sound	
<b>Calandra, Hon. / L'hon. Paul (PC)</b>	Markham—Stouffville	Minister of Legislative Affairs / Ministre des Affaires législatives Minister of Long-Term Care / Ministre des Soins de longue durée Government House Leader / Leader parlementaire du gouvernement
<b>Cho, Hon. / L'hon. Raymond Sung Joon (PC)</b>	Scarborough North / Scarborough- Nord	Minister for Seniors and Accessibility / Ministre des Services aux aînés et de l'Accessibilité
<b>Cho, Hon. / L'hon. Stan (PC)</b>	Willowdale	Associate Minister of Transportation / Ministre associé des Transports
<b>Clark, Hon. / L'hon. Steve (PC)</b>	Leeds—Grenville—Thousand Islands and Rideau Lakes / Leeds— Grenville—Thousand Islands et Rideau Lakes	Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing / Ministre des Affaires municipales et du Logement
Coe, Lorne (PC)	Whitby	
<b>Collard, Lucille (LIB)</b>	Ottawa—Vanier	Third Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Troisième vice-présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée législative
Crawford, Stephen (PC)	Oakville	
Cuzzetto, Rudy (PC)	Mississauga—Lakeshore	
Dixon, Jess (PC)	Kitchener South—Hespeler / Kitchener-Sud—Hespeler	
Dowie, Andrew (PC)	Windsor—Tecumseh	
<b>Downey, Hon. / L'hon. Doug (PC)</b>	Barrie—Springwater—Oro-Medonte	Attorney General / Procureur général
<b>Dunlop, Hon. / L'hon. Jill (PC)</b>	Simcoe North / Simcoe-Nord	Minister of Colleges and Universities / Ministre des Collèges et Universités
<b>Fedeli, Hon. / L'hon. Victor (PC)</b>	Nipissing	Chair of Cabinet / Président du Conseil des ministres Minister of Economic Development, Job Creation and Trade / Ministre du Développement économique, de la Création d'emplois et du Commerce
Fife, Catherine (NDP)	Waterloo	
Flack, Rob (PC)	Elgin—Middlesex—London	

<b>Member and Party / Député(e) et parti</b>	<b>Constituency / Circonscription</b>	<b>Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités</b>
<b>Ford, Hon. / L'hon. Doug (PC)</b>	Etobicoke North / Etobicoke-Nord	Minister of Intergovernmental Affairs / Ministre des Affaires intergouvernementales Premier / Premier ministre Leader, Progressive Conservative Party of Ontario / Chef du Parti progressiste-conservateur de l'Ontario
<b>Ford, Hon. / L'hon. Michael D. (PC)</b>	York South—Weston / York-Sud—Weston	Minister of Citizenship and Multiculturalism / Ministre des Affaires civiques et du Multiculturalisme
Fraser, John (LIB)	Ottawa South / Ottawa-Sud	
French, Jennifer K. (NDP)	Oshawa	
<b>Fullerton, Hon. / L'hon. Merrilee (PC)</b>	Kanata—Carleton	Minister of Children, Community and Social Services / Ministre des Services à l'enfance et des Services sociaux et communautaires
Gallagher Murphy, Dawn (PC)	Newmarket—Aurora	
Gates, Wayne (NDP)	Niagara Falls	
Gélinas, France (NDP)	Nickel Belt	
Ghamari, Goldie (PC)	Carleton	
<b>Gill, Hon. / L'hon. Parm (PC)</b>	Milton	Minister of Red Tape Reduction / Ministre de la Réduction des formalités administratives
Glover, Chris (NDP)	Spadina—Fort York	
Gretzky, Lisa (NDP)	Windsor West / Windsor-Ouest	Deputy Opposition House Leader / Leader parlementaire adjointe de l'opposition officielle
Grewal, Hardeep Singh (PC)	Brampton East / Brampton-Est	
Hardeman, Ernie (PC)	Oxford	
Harden, Joel (NDP)	Ottawa Centre / Ottawa-Centre	
Harris, Mike (PC)	Kitchener—Conestoga	
Hogarth, Christine (PC)	Etobicoke—Lakeshore	
Holland, Kevin (PC)	Thunder Bay—Atikokan	
Hsu, Ted (LIB)	Kingston and the Islands / Kingston et les Îles	
Hunter, Mitzie (LIB)	Scarborough—Guildwood	
<b>Jones, Hon. / L'hon. Sylvia (PC)</b>	Dufferin—Caledon	Deputy Premier / Vice-première ministre Minister of Health / Ministre de la Santé
Jones, Trevor (PC)	Chatham-Kent—Leamington	
Jordan, John (PC)	Lanark—Frontenac—Kingston	
Kanapathi, Logan (PC)	Markham—Thornhill	
<b>Karpoche, Bhutla (NDP)</b>	Parkdale—High Park	First Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Première vice-présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée
Ke, Vincent (PC)	Don Valley North / Don Valley-Nord	
Kernaghan, Terence (NDP)	London North Centre / London-Centre-Nord	
<b>Kerzner, Hon. / L'hon. Michael S. (PC)</b>	York Centre / York-Centre	Solicitor General / Solliciteur général
Khanjin, Andrea (PC)	Barrie—Innisfil	Deputy Government House Leader / Leader parlementaire adjointe du gouvernement
Kusendova-Bashta, Natalia (PC)	Mississauga Centre / Mississauga-Centre	
Leardi, Anthony (PC)	Essex	
<b>Lecce, Hon. / L'hon. Stephen (PC)</b>	King—Vaughan	Minister of Education / Ministre de l'Éducation
Lindo, Laura Mae (NDP)	Kitchener Centre / Kitchener-Centre	
<b>Lumsden, Hon. / L'hon. Neil (PC)</b>	Hamilton East—Stoney Creek / Hamilton-Est—Stoney Creek	Minister of Tourism, Culture and Sport / Ministre du Tourisme, de la Culture et du Sport
MacLeod, Lisa (PC)	Nepean	
Mamakwa, Sol (NDP)	Kiiwetinoong	Deputy Leader, Official Opposition / Chef adjoint de l'opposition officielle
Mantha, Michael (NDP)	Algoma—Manitoulin	
Martin, Robin (PC)	Eglinton—Lawrence	
McCarthy, Todd J. (PC)	Durham	
McGregor, Graham (PC)	Brampton North / Brampton-Nord	
McMahon, Mary-Margaret (LIB)	Beaches—East York / Beaches—East York	
<b>McNaughton, Hon. / L'hon. Monte (PC)</b>	Lambton—Kent—Middlesex	Minister of Labour, Immigration, Training and Skills Development / Ministre du Travail, de l'Immigration, de la Formation et du Développement des compétences
<b>Mulroney, Hon. / L'hon. Caroline (PC)</b>	York—Simcoe	Minister of Francophone Affairs / Ministre des Affaires francophones Minister of Transportation / Ministre des Transports

<b>Member and Party / Député(e) et parti</b>	<b>Constituency / Circonscription</b>	<b>Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités</b>
Oosterhoff, Sam (PC)	Niagara West / Niagara-Ouest	
Pang, Billy (PC)	Markham—Unionville	
<b>Parsa, Hon. / L'hon. Michael (PC)</b>	Aurora—Oak Ridges—Richmond Hill	Associate Minister of Housing / Ministre associé du Logement
Pasma, Chandra (NDP)	Ottawa West—Nepean / Ottawa-Ouest—Nepean	
<b>Piccini, Hon. / L'hon. David (PC)</b>	Northumberland—Peterborough South	Minister of the Environment, Conservation and Parks / Ministre de l'Environnement, de la Protection de la nature et des Parcs
Pierre, Natalie (PC)	Burlington	
<b>Pirie, Hon. / L'hon. George (PC)</b>	Timmins	Minister of Mines / Ministre des Mines
Quinn, Nolan (PC)	Stormont—Dundas—South Glengarry	
Rae, Matthew (PC)	Perth—Wellington	
Rakocevic, Tom (NDP)	Humber River—Black Creek	
<b>Rasheed, Hon. / L'hon. Kaleed (PC)</b>	Mississauga East—Cooksville / Mississauga-Est—Cooksville	Minister of Public and Business Service Delivery / Ministre des Services au public et aux entreprises
<b>Rickford, Hon. / L'hon. Greg (PC)</b>	Kenora—Rainy River	Minister of Indigenous Affairs / Ministre des Affaires autochtones Minister of Northern Development / Ministre du Développement du Nord
Riddell, Brian (PC)	Cambridge	
Romano, Ross (PC)	Sault Ste. Marie	
Sabawy, Sheref (PC)	Mississauga—Erin Mills	
Sandhu, Amarjot (PC)	Brampton West / Brampton-Ouest	
<b>Sarkaria, Hon. / L'hon. Prabmeet Singh (PC)</b>	Brampton South / Brampton-Sud	President of the Treasury Board / Président du Conseil du Trésor
Sarrazin, Stéphane (PC)	Glengarry—Prescott—Russell	
Sattler, Peggy (NDP)	London West / London-Ouest	Opposition House Leader / Leader parlementaire de l'opposition officielle
Saunderson, Brian (PC)	Simcoe—Grey	
Schreiner, Mike (GRN)	Guelph	
Scott, Laurie (PC)	Haliburton—Kawartha Lakes—Brock	
Shamji, Adil (LIB)	Don Valley East / Don Valley-Est	
Shaw, Sandy (NDP)	Hamilton West—Ancaster—Dundas / Hamilton-Ouest—Ancaster—Dundas	
<b>Skelly, Donna (PC)</b>	Flamborough—Glanbrook	Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Vice-présidente et présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée Deputy Speaker / Vice-présidente
Smith, Dave (PC)	Peterborough—Kawartha	
Smith, David (PC)	Scarborough Centre / Scarborough-Centre	
<b>Smith, Hon. / L'hon. Graydon (PC)</b>	Parry Sound—Muskoka	Minister of Natural Resources and Forestry / Ministre des Richesses naturelles et des Forêts
<b>Smith, Hon. / L'hon. Todd (PC)</b>	Bay of Quinte / Baie de Quinte	Minister of Energy / Ministre de l'Énergie
Smith, Laura (PC)	Thornhill	
Stevens, Jennifer (Jennie) (NDP)	St. Catharines	
Stiles, Marit (NDP)	Davenport	
<b>Surma, Hon. / L'hon. Kinga (PC)</b>	Etobicoke Centre / Etobicoke-Centre	Minister of Infrastructure / Ministre de l'Infrastructure
Tabuns, Peter (NDP)	Toronto—Danforth	Leader, Official Opposition / Chef de l'opposition officielle Leader, New Democratic Party of Ontario / Chef du Nouveau parti démocratique de l'Ontario
Tangri, Nina (PC)	Mississauga—Streetsville	
Taylor, Monique (NDP)	Hamilton Mountain / Hamilton-Mountain	
Thanigasalam, Vijay (PC)	Scarborough—Rouge Park	
<b>Thompson, Hon. / L'hon. Lisa M. (PC)</b>	Huron—Bruce	Minister of Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs / Ministre de l'Agriculture, de l'Alimentation et des Affaires rurales
<b>Tibollo, Hon. / L'hon. Michael A. (PC)</b>	Vaughan—Woodbridge	Associate Minister of Mental Health and Addictions / Ministre associé délégué au dossier de la Santé mentale et de la Lutte contre les dépendances
Triantafilopoulos, Effie J. (PC)	Oakville North—Burlington / Oakville-Nord—Burlington	
Vanthof, John (NDP)	Timiskaming—Cochrane	
Vaugeois, Lise (NDP)	Thunder Bay—Superior North / Thunder Bay—Supérieur-Nord	
Wai, Daisy (PC)	Richmond Hill	

<b>Member and Party / Député(e) et parti</b>	<b>Constituency / Circonscription</b>	<b>Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités</b>
West, Jamie (NDP)	Sudbury	
<b>Williams, Hon. / L'hon. Charmaine A. (PC)</b>	Brampton Centre / Brampton-Centre	Associate Minister of Women's Social and Economic Opportunity / Ministre associée des Perspectives sociales et économiques pour les femmes
Wong-Tam, Kristyn (NDP)	Toronto Centre / Toronto-Centre	
Yakabuski, John (PC)	Renfrew—Nipissing—Pembroke	
Vacant	Hamilton Centre / Hamilton-Centre	