

Legislative  
Assembly  
of Ontario



Assemblée  
législative  
de l'Ontario

---

**Official Report  
of Debates  
(Hansard)**

No. 18

**Journal  
des débats  
(Hansard)**

N° 18

1<sup>st</sup> Session  
42<sup>nd</sup> Parliament

Monday  
13 August 2018

1<sup>re</sup> session  
42<sup>e</sup> législature

Lundi  
13 août 2018

---

Speaker: Honourable Ted Arnott  
Clerk: Todd Decker

Président : L'honorable Ted Arnott  
Greffier : Todd Decker

### **Hansard on the Internet**

Hansard and other documents of the Legislative Assembly can be on your personal computer within hours after each sitting. The address is:

<https://www.ola.org/>

### **Index inquiries**

Reference to a cumulative index of previous issues may be obtained by calling the Hansard Reporting Service indexing staff at 416-325-7400.

### **Le Journal des débats sur Internet**

L'adresse pour faire paraître sur votre ordinateur personnel le Journal et d'autres documents de l'Assemblée législative en quelques heures seulement après la séance est :

### **Renseignements sur l'index**

Adressez vos questions portant sur des numéros précédents du Journal des débats au personnel de l'index, qui vous fourniront des références aux pages dans l'index cumulatif, en composant le 416-325-7400.

---

Hansard Reporting and Interpretation Services  
Room 500, West Wing, Legislative Building  
111 Wellesley Street West, Queen's Park  
Toronto ON M7A 1A2  
Telephone 416-325-7400; fax 416-325-7430  
Published by the Legislative Assembly of Ontario



ISSN 1180-2987

Service du Journal des débats et d'interprétation  
Salle 500, aile ouest, Édifice du Parlement  
111, rue Wellesley ouest, Queen's Park  
Toronto ON M7A 1A2  
Téléphone, 416-325-7400; télécopieur, 416-325-7430  
Publié par l'Assemblée législative de l'Ontario

## CONTENTS / TABLE DES MATIÈRES

Monday 13 August 2018 / Lundi 13 août 2018

### INTRODUCTION OF VISITORS / PRÉSENTATION DES VISITEURS

Mr. Sheref Sabawy.....	769
Mr. Faisal Hassan.....	769
Hon. Doug Ford .....	769
Ms. Suze Morrison.....	769
Mr. Toby Barrett .....	769
Mr. Stephen Lecce .....	769
Mr. Kaleed Rasheed.....	769
Hon. Monte McNaughton .....	769
Hon. John Yakabuski .....	769
Ms. Goldie Ghamari.....	769
Mr. Robert Bailey .....	769
Mrs. Amy Fee .....	770
<b>Attack in Fredericton</b>	
Ms. Andrea Horwath.....	770

### ORAL QUESTIONS / QUESTIONS ORALES

#### Municipal elections

Ms. Andrea Horwath.....	770
Hon. Doug Ford .....	770

#### Municipal elections

Ms. Andrea Horwath.....	771
Hon. Doug Ford .....	771

#### Opioid abuse

Ms. Andrea Horwath.....	771
Hon. Christine Elliott .....	772

#### Community safety

Ms. Christine Hogarth.....	772
Hon. Michael A. Tibollo .....	772

#### Municipal elections

Mr. Peter Tabuns.....	773
Hon. Steve Clark .....	773

#### Community safety

Mr. Stephen Crawford.....	773
Hon. Michael A. Tibollo .....	773

#### Curriculum

Ms. Marit Stiles.....	774
Hon. Lisa M. Thompson .....	774

#### Social assistance

Ms. Mitzie Hunter.....	774
Hon. Doug Ford .....	774

#### Taxation

Mr. Dave Smith.....	775
Hon. Rod Phillips.....	775

#### Community safety

Mr. Chris Glover.....	775
Hon. Michael A. Tibollo .....	776

#### Municipal elections

Mr. Aris Babikian.....	776
Hon. Steve Clark .....	776

#### Automobile insurance

Mr. Gurratan Singh .....	776
Hon. Victor Fedeli.....	777

#### Sir John A. Macdonald statue

Ms. Goldie Ghamari.....	777
Hon. Sylvia Jones.....	777

#### Social assistance

Mr. Jamie West .....	777
Hon. Christine Elliott .....	777

#### Taxation

Mrs. Belinda Karahalios.....	778
Hon. Caroline Mulroney .....	778

#### Northern transportation

Mr. Guy Bourgouin.....	778
Hon. John Yakabuski .....	779

#### Municipal elections

Mr. Stephen Lecce.....	779
Hon. Steve Clark .....	779

#### Visitors

Ms. Catherine Fife.....	780
Hon. Todd Smith.....	780

#### Attack in Fredericton

Hon. Todd Smith.....	780
----------------------	-----

### MEMBERS' STATEMENTS / DÉCLARATIONS DES DÉPUTÉS

#### Pat Noonan

Mr. Percy Hatfield.....	780
-------------------------	-----

#### Markham-Milliken Children's Festival

Mr. Logan Kanapathi .....	780
---------------------------	-----

#### Beverage alcohol sales

Mr. Terence Kernaghan.....	781
----------------------------	-----

#### Burl's Creek Event Grounds

Mr. Doug Downey .....	781
-----------------------	-----

#### Social assistance

Ms. Laura Mae Lindo.....	781
--------------------------	-----

#### Opioid abuse

Mr. John Fraser .....	781
-----------------------	-----

#### Sindhi community

Ms. Natalia Kusendova .....	782
-----------------------------	-----

<b>Sir John A. Macdonald statue</b>	
Mr. Sol Mamakwa.....	782
<b>Peter Van Loan</b>	
Ms. Andrea Khanjin.....	782
<b>Challenger baseball in Whitby</b>	
Mr. Lorne Coe.....	782

**INTRODUCTION OF BILLS /  
DÉPÔT DES PROJETS DE LOI**

<b>Alternate Land Use and Services Program for Agricultural Land Act, 2018, Bill 28, Mr. Barrett / Loi de 2018 sur un programme de diversification des modes d'utilisation des terres agricoles et des services produits sur ces terres, projet de loi 28, M. Barrett</b>	
First reading agreed to.....	783
Mr. Toby Barrett .....	783
<b>An Act to require the Minister of the Environment, Conservation and Parks to discharge the responsibilities under subsection 15(1) of the Ontario Water Resources Act, Mr. Bisson</b>	
First reading negatived.....	784
<b>Protecting Waterways from Zebra Mussels Act, 2018, Bill 29, Mr. Bisson / Loi de 2018 sur la protection des cours d'eau contre les moules zébrées, projet de loi 29, M. Bisson</b>	
First reading agreed to.....	784
Mr. Gilles Bisson .....	784

**MOTIONS**

<b>House sittings</b>	
Hon. Todd Smith.....	784
Motion agreed to .....	785

Mr. Gilles Bisson .....	785
The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott).....	785

**PETITIONS / PÉTITIONS**

<b>Employment standards</b>	
Ms. Marit Stiles .....	785
<b>Social assistance</b>	
Ms. Laura Mae Lindo.....	785
<b>Celiac disease</b>	
Mme France Gélinas .....	786
<b>Employment standards</b>	
Ms. Sara Singh .....	786
<b>Correctional services</b>	
Ms. Jennifer K. French.....	786
<b>Curriculum</b>	
Ms. Laura Mae Lindo.....	787
<b>Pharmacare</b>	
Mr. Terence Kernaghan.....	787
<b>Curriculum</b>	
Mme France Gélinas .....	787
<b>Pharmacare</b>	
Mr. Tom Rakocovic.....	787
<b>Curriculum</b>	
Ms. Laura Mae Lindo.....	788

**ORDERS OF THE DAY / ORDRE DU JOUR**

<b>Time allocation</b>	
Mr. John Vanthof .....	788
Vote deferred.....	789

## LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF ONTARIO

Monday 13 August 2018

## ASSEMBLÉE LÉGISLATIVE DE L'ONTARIO

Lundi 13 août 2018

*The House met at 1030.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** We will begin with a moment of silence for inner thought and personal reflection.

*Prayers.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** This being the first sitting Monday of the month, I wish to acknowledge this territory as the traditional gathering place for many Indigenous nations, most recently the Mississaugas of the New Credit.

Please join me in singing the national anthem.  
*Singing of O Canada.*

### INTRODUCTION OF VISITORS

**Mr. Sheref Sabawy:** Mr. Speaker, today we make history for being the first to introduce members of the Coptic clergy and community in the Parliament of Queen's Park. It is my honour and privilege to welcome to the House this morning two distinguished guests and several members of our proud and vibrant Canadian Coptic community.

Firstly, I'm honoured to introduce His Grace Bishop Mina. As our pastoral leader, Bishop Mina has blessed his community with pastoral care and leadership, and serves as Bishop of the Diocese of Mississauga, Vancouver and Western Canada. Bishop Mina is the most senior spiritual authority of the Coptic Church in Canada and the first ordained bishop to serve the church in our nation's history.

Bishop Mina, I thank you for your remarkable service to the Canadian Coptic community and for your leadership of the church.

For the last 40 years, our second guest of honour has served his church, community and province as an ordained priest of the Coptic Orthodox Church. He was ordained as a priest on Sunday, September 3, 1978, and has served in ordained ministries in Alexandria, Egypt; Seattle, USA; and then in Mississauga since September 1989.

He is chairman of the board of directors and senior priest of the Church of Virgin Mary and St. Athanasius, president of the Canadian Coptic Centre and Aghabi, providing non-profit housing for low-income families. He also is the chairman of the board of directors of Anba Abraam Charity, which services more than 20,000 people in need annually in Mississauga and elsewhere. AAC currently operates three food banks in Mississauga and services a significant percentage of users of the food bank system in Peel.

He established and manages two private schools and Philopateer Christian College, and established and man-

ages two daycare centres for over 250 children. Currently, he is establishing two youth centres and churches to focus on young couples and youth in Mississauga. Among his many other areas of service, the Coptic community centre—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you very much for the introduction. I appreciate it very much. Welcome to the Ontario Legislature.

**Mr. Faisal Hassan:** I'm proud today to welcome Abdulhamid Mohamed, a scholar and activist, to Queen's Park.

**Hon. Doug Ford:** They're my first visitors, and, Mr. Speaker, they're from your home riding. From Wellington-Halton Hills, I want to welcome Scott and Steve Smith.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Welcome to the Ontario Legislature.

**Ms. Suze Morrison:** Today, I'd like to welcome Ben Donato-Woodger and Emma Beattie, who have joined me in the gallery over here. They're my brand new constituency assistants, so please join me in welcoming them to Queen's Park for the first time.

**Mr. Toby Barrett:** I wish to introduce two summer students rotating in my various offices: Ezri Chernak and Jessie Dhillon.

**Mr. Stephen Lecce:** I'd like to introduce a dear friend and a brother from another mother, Ritesh Malik, who is with us from the riding of King-Vaughan, and his daughter Buhvia. I also want to welcome Jack Fazzari, who is here all the way from Niagara. Thank you for joining us today in the Legislature.

**Mr. Kaled Rasheed:** Good morning, Mr. Speaker. It is my honour to welcome my parents, Moid and Sabiha; and my uncle and aunt—Kalmuddin and Rehana—to our Legislature.

**Hon. Monte McNaughton:** I'm honoured to welcome to Queen's Park today a good friend of mine, Gus Koroneos, who is also running for town council in Niagara-on-the-Lake.

**Hon. John Yakabuski:** I'd like to welcome to Queen's Park today two people working in my office: Lindsay Manna, who has been assisting with the transition, and Justine Lewkowicz, who is my new press secretary. Welcome to Queen's Park.

**Ms. Goldie Ghamari:** It's an honour and privilege to introduce to the House my husband, Dr. Wayne Stanley Horn. He's my better half, and he's the reason that I'm here today. I couldn't do it without his love and support.

**Mr. Robert Bailey:** In the east members' gallery, I would like to introduce my wife, Elizabeth, and my granddaughter, Janessa Labadie, here from Sarnia-Lambton, visiting the Legislature.

**Ms. Amy Fee:** I'd like to welcome a family friend and big supporter of mine, Steve Darrough, and also Marian Gagné from my riding. She was a very big volunteer on my campaign. Most importantly, my daughter Sarah is here with me today for a mother-daughter day. She's been asking what it's like to be an MPP, so I wanted to bring her so she could see what we do.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** We welcome all of our other guests as well.

1040

#### ATTACK IN FREDERICTON

**Ms. Andrea Horwath:** Before I ask my first question, I just want to say, on behalf of Ontario's New Democrats and, I'm sure, all members of the House, our hearts go out to the two police officers and the two civilians who were killed in New Brunswick. It is a terrible, terrible tragedy. I'm sure their whole province as well as their community is suffering greatly. Our hearts go out to them.

#### ORAL QUESTIONS

##### MUNICIPAL ELECTIONS

**Ms. Andrea Horwath:** My first question is for the Premier. In less than a day, over 1,600 people made calls to the municipal affairs minister and to Conservative MPPs. They were telling the Premier to stop his undemocratic election meddling. Will the Premier listen to them?

**Hon. Doug Ford:** Day after day, we come down here and the Leader of the Opposition wants to constantly talk about spending more money, adding more politicians—and adding more politicians without any consultation. They wanted to go from 44 up to 47.

We consulted the people, and on June 7 they spoke loud and clear. They spoke loud and clear that they want us to reduce the size and the cost of government.

It's ironic that the Leader of the Opposition has not come down here once to say, "I want to reduce hydro rates. I want to create good-paying jobs. I want to lower gas rates." All the Leader of the Opposition wants to do is get more politicians to do the bidding of her downtown NDP councillors, Joe Cressy, Mike Layton and the rest of the cronies downtown.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary?

**Ms. Andrea Horwath:** Speaker, the Premier did not run on an election platform to meddle in democratic elections. He did not run on a plan to meddle in democratic elections—and that's the worrisome thing: He doesn't believe that the people's right to vote for their representatives should be protected.

I do think they should be protected. I didn't vote for Joe Cressy and I didn't vote for Michael Layton, but people certainly did, and they deserve to have the opportunity to vote for their elected representatives.

Not a single member of his caucus actually ran on a plan to meddle in democratic elections. The people of Ontario are telling him clearly to stop election meddling. Will he?

**Hon. Doug Ford:** Mr. Speaker, we ran on reducing the size and the cost of government. We ran on making sure we respected the taxpayers.

The last time I did a little count, in the city of Toronto, we won 11 seats—half—and actually, if you add up all the votes, it was more votes than the Liberals and the NDP combined. My friends, actually—

*Interjections.*

**Hon. Doug Ford:** We ran on making sure that we save the taxpayers money.

Everyone knows that the city of Toronto is dysfunctional. Nothing gets done. The Scarborough subway has been up for vote—eight different times it's changed. There's absolute gridlock on our streets and there's gridlock at city hall.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Final supplementary.

**Ms. Andrea Horwath:** Well, Speaker, we'll send the real facts over to the Premier around the voting that happened in the downtown Toronto area.

Look, despite the Premier's shutting out of the people of Ontario by not allowing committee hearings on Bill 5, people filled the lawns of Queen's Park telling the Premier to stop election meddling. In a single day, more than 1,600 calls were made telling the Premier to stop interfering.

Will the Premier respect the people of Ontario and pull Bill 5, or will he behave like a dictator by using undemocratic legislation—

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** I'd ask the Leader of the Opposition to withdraw.

**Ms. Andrea Horwath:** Withdraw, Speaker.

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Put your question, please.

**Ms. Andrea Horwath:** —or will he behave so inappropriately, as people have been criticizing him of doing for the last number of weeks, by using undemocratic legislation to settle personal beefs and go after his political foes?

**Hon. Doug Ford:** We can sit here and debate on how we can increase taxes, as the NDP wants to do; how we can increase more politicians, as the NDP wants to do; how to increase the gas prices, as members of her party want the highest gas prices in North America and the highest carbon taxes.

Our party is for reducing the size and cost of government, reducing gas prices, and making sure we eliminate the carbon tax, the worst tax you could put on any business or the people of Ontario. We believe in respecting the taxpayers. There are 25 MPs, 25 MPPs, and there are going to be 25 city councillors.

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Stop the clock. Before I ask for the next question, I'm going to remind all members that it's against the standing orders and the conventions and traditions of this House to impute motive, and I would ask all members to observe that rule.

**Ms. Andrea Horwath:** I hope he heard you, Speaker.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** All members.

Next question.

#### MUNICIPAL ELECTIONS

**Ms. Andrea Horwath:** My next question is also for the Premier. Last week, the Minister of Municipal Affairs dodged a question about whether the Premier had personally meddled in the Peel regional chair election, so I'm going to ask again: Did the Premier table Bill 5, cancelling the Peel regional chair election, because he wasn't able to recruit a candidate to run against Patrick Brown?

**Hon. Doug Ford:** Again, through you, Mr. Speaker: Leader of the Opposition, we ran on two different platforms. The Leader of the Opposition ran on increasing taxes again and making big government. Rather than come down here—just once, I wish I could see the Leader of the Opposition come down here with something that would respect the taxpayer, some cost savings, maybe just a few cents of cost savings.

Mr. Speaker, we've done a lot of things in politics over the years, but nothing has been more popular for the people of Toronto and outside of Toronto than to make sure that we reduce the size and cost of government.

In the regions, people don't want another layer of government. They don't want another layer of elected officials. Even the mayor of Mississauga wrote numerous—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you. Supplementary?

**Ms. Andrea Horwath:** Speaker, the Premier did not campaign on meddling or interfering in local elections. This is about settling personal scores. Before tabling Bill 5—

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Once again, I will ask all members to stop imputing motive with statements they're making, on both sides of the House.

I recognize the member to put her question.

**Ms. Andrea Horwath:** Before tabling Bill 5, did the Premier personally reach out to prospective candidates to run against Patrick Brown for Peel regional chair? Yes or no?

**Hon. Doug Ford:** Through you—

**Hon. Sylvia Jones:** Defending more politicians. That's rich.

**Hon. Doug Ford:** Yes.

Mr. Speaker, it was unanimous: When Peel region voted, when Mississauga council voted, they did not want this. The previous government rammed it through. They also rammed through additional council members at the city of Toronto to make it even larger and more dysfunctional.

I can assure you that the mayor of Toronto is quite happy. I can guarantee that. He's quite happy to deal with less people. He knows good governance is not 47 people around the table. He can get a lot more done with 25.

By the way, Mr. Speaker, we're saving \$25 million. That can go right to the police to start fighting crime.

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Stop the clock. One more time, I will remind members: We're not imputing motive in our questions and responses.

Start the clock. Final supplementary.

**Ms. Andrea Horwath:** There are rumours that the Premier personally tried to recruit Charles Sousa to run against Patrick Brown for regional chair. Sousa did not run, and instead the Premier decided to table Bill 5—

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The government side will please come to order. I can't hear the Leader of the Opposition.

Once again, I have to ask the Leader of the Opposition not to impute motive. Will the Leader of the Opposition please put her question?

**Ms. Andrea Horwath:** And instead, the Premier decided to table Bill 5, which cancels the election altogether. So my question is: Does this Premier think it's justifiable to table legislation and cancel local elections whenever he can't pick the winner?

1050

**Hon. Doug Ford:** Mr. Speaker, the Leader of the Opposition ran on a lot of rumours. There were rumours she made a mistake of \$5 billion, but it wasn't a rumour; it was the truth. It was the absolute truth. There were rumours they can't do math, but it's actual fact that they can't do math.

There were a lot of rumours during the election, but the people voiced their opinion. They voiced their opinion on electing 76 members across the province to make sure we turn this province around—that we get ourselves out of the \$340 billion of debt that we're facing. People are sick and tired of paying the highest hydro rates in North America. We're going to change that. We're reducing hydro rates by 12%, reducing gas prices by 10 cents a litre, and we're going to put money back into the taxpayer's pocket—

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Stop the clock. The House will come to order.

*Interjection.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Member for Timmins, please come to order.

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The government side will come to order.

Okay, next question. Start the clock.

#### OPIOID ABUSE

**Ms. Andrea Horwath:** My next question is also for the Premier. Late on Friday, the government ordered a

halt to overdose prevention sites that the government had previously approved. The Premier is interfering with local health care experts and front-line workers who have been crystal clear that these sites save lives. Why is the Premier putting lives at risk?

**Hon. Doug Ford:** Minister of Health and Long-Term Care.

**Hon. Christine Elliott:** I'd really like to thank the leader of the official opposition for the question—in fact, the concern with respect to opioids and other overdoses of drugs is of major concern to us. Patient safety is critical.

What happened last week in response to a question from your member from London was that we extended one clinic to September 30, from the middle of August to the end of September, which puts it in alignment with all of the other supervised injection sites in Ontario, which close down unless federal approval is then granted. So we are putting them in alignment with that.

Are we going to open new sites until we have reviewed the evidence to see what the evidence suggests? No, we're not. That just makes sense. We're not going to put them into operation. In fact, a decision is going to be made not to continue with them. What we want to do is make sure we keep open those that are open until a decision is made, but we're putting a pause on—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you. Supplementary.

**Ms. Andrea Horwath:** Speaker, people can't get treatment if they're dead. Dr. David Juurlink, head of clinical pharmacology and toxicology at the University of Toronto, has said this: "These places save lives, connect people to addiction care, reduce the spread of HIV and hepatitis C, and save the health system money."

Save the health system money: We need more of these sites, not fewer. How much more evidence does this Premier and his health minister need, and how many people will they let die until they're satisfied?

**Hon. Christine Elliott:** The fact remains, there are a number of these clinics that are already open. The ones that are not being opened, in Thunder Bay, St. Catharines and Toronto, will have to wait until a review is done, because there is evidence on both sides. We need to make sure that we review all of the evidence to understand what is happening. What is happening that is saving lives? What else can we do to save more lives? Are there other examples that we should be looking at besides supervised injection clinics?

Patient safety is important to every single member of this House, and we want to make sure that if we do go ahead with more supervised injection sites, we're doing it using the best possible evidence and the best possible practices.

#### COMMUNITY SAFETY

**Ms. Christine Hogarth:** My question today is for the Minister of Community Safety and Correctional Services.

Our government for the people campaigned on a promise to improve public safety in this province and provide the brave men and women of our police services the resources they need to perform the duties safely and effectively. Tackling gun violence and gang violence requires that men and women of our police services are listened to and that they receive the tools and resources we committed to providing them.

To the minister: How will the new funding being provided to our police services help tackle the problem of gang and gun violence?

**Hon. Michael A. Tibollo:** Thank you to the member from Etobicoke–Lakeshore for her question this morning. First of all, Mr. Speaker, safety is of paramount concern to our government. Recently we announced \$25 million in new funding to support the Toronto Police Service in its efforts to combat gun violence, disrupt gun activity and crack down on the trafficking of illegal guns in the city of Toronto.

Too many people and too many neighbourhoods are living in fear of gang and gun violence. Mr. Speaker, our government is listening to police and investing real money to help them keep their community safe from gun and gang violence. This problem is bigger than just Toronto. Organized crime that starts in Toronto ends up spilling over into other communities. The time for talk is over. It's time for action. Promises made, promises kept.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary question.

**Ms. Christine Hogarth:** I would like to thank the minister for his response to this incredibly important topic, not just for the people of Etobicoke–Lakeshore but for people all across this province. This announcement of additional funding for the Toronto Police Service is needed to address the problem of gun- and gang-related violence in Ontario, especially within the city of Toronto.

Mr. Speaker, the brave men and women of our police services desperately need the necessary tools and resources to address gun violence, and I know the minister will continue to deliver on these government commitments to ensure public safety across our great province. Again to the minister: What actions will your ministry be taking to ensure that the streets of Toronto and all of Ontario's communities remain safe?

**Hon. Michael A. Tibollo:** Again, I want to thank the member for her question. Our government is taking the necessary steps to help combat gun- and gang-related violence so we can restore public confidence in our police services and ensure our streets and communities are safe. Tackling gun- and gang-related violence requires the brave men and women of our police services to have access to innovative investigation tools and technologies. This new funding will provide our police with cutting-edge digital investigative and analytical tools that our police need to fight guns and gangs in 2018.

Mr. Speaker, I have stated before in this Legislature that the status quo has failed, and we are the only party in this House that is prepared and remains committed to doing something about it. Promises made, promises kept.

## MUNICIPAL ELECTIONS

**Mr. Peter Tabuns:** My question is for the Minister of Finance. Not once during the campaign did the Premier come forward and detail his plan to slash Toronto city council and cancel regional chair elections. Nobody heard it during the campaign from the Premier or any candidate. This is a decision that was arrived at quickly, with no consultation, in a backroom.

The government claims that the Premier consulted people on this policy. Can the minister confirm whether or not the Premier consulted with any former members of this House about regional chair elections?

**Hon. Victor Fedeli:** Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing.

**Hon. Steve Clark:** Before I address the question for Toronto–Danforth, I want to recognize in the public gallery a great parliamentarian: the honourable Peter Van Loan. Welcome to Queen’s Park.

Speaker, I am very pleased to take the question. As I’ve stated in this House many, many times, the Premier consulted tens of thousands of Ontarians and Torontonians during the election. Our government was brought to this House with a clear mandate to reduce the size and cost of government, and that’s exactly what we’re doing in regard to Toronto city council. We believe that having 25 MPs, 25 MPPs, and again having that same electoral district for the 25 city councillors is a good thing. That’s exactly what’s in Bill 5, Speaker.

1100

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary?

**Mr. Peter Tabuns:** I’m surprised the Minister of Finance wouldn’t answer a question, but I’m going to try it again. Before this piece of policy suddenly appeared in the House, there were reports that the Premier’s people were trying to get someone—anyone—to run against Patrick Brown, who, by the way, wasn’t running in Toronto.

Is the minister aware if the Premier or his inner circle attempted to recruit Charles Sousa to run for Peel region chair against Patrick Brown?

**Hon. Steve Clark:** Speaker, I tried to do this on Thursday. I want to correct my record from Thursday in response to a question from the member for Toronto–Danforth. I used the word “10%.” I meant to say “10 cents a litre” on gas prices. So I want to correct my record. The Speaker in the chair at the time on Thursday afternoon wouldn’t allow me to correct the record.

However, I think our record—we were straight with Ontarians. Again, reducing the size and cost of government is exactly what we’re doing with Bill 5. We believe, again, that having the same electoral district that federal MPs—the 25 of them represent that jurisdiction in the city of Toronto. It’s the same electoral district that we on this side and on that side of the House represent.

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The opposition will come to order.

**Hon. Steve Clark:** There is no reason why 25 city councillors cannot represent the same electoral district. The opposition, the NDP—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you.

## COMMUNITY SAFETY

**Mr. Stephen Crawford:** My question is for the Minister of Community Safety and Correctional Services. Speaker, gun violence remains a concern for many Ontarians. During this election, our government for the people remained committed to providing the brave men and women of our province’s police services with the resources and tools they need to perform their jobs safely and effectively in order to restore public safety within our communities. Our government for the people remains committed to ensuring that our police services are listened to and are able to restore and enhance public safety throughout this great province.

Will the minister please explain to the members of this Legislature what actions his ministry is taking in order to ensure we tackle this problem of gang-and-gun-related violence?

**Hon. Michael A. Tibollo:** I thank the member from Oakville for his question this morning.

During the election campaign, our government for the people promised to restore the \$12 million in funding that the previous Liberal government cut from the fight against gang-and-gun-related violence within the province. Our government for the people has not only kept its promise but we have doubled our commitment. This new \$25 million is not only the vital first step towards tackling gun and gang violence in this province, but it will ensure that our police services are provided with the necessary tools and resources that we have committed to providing for them to do their work.

With this new funding, Mr. Speaker, we will ensure that all Ontarians are able to feel safe and secure within their own communities. Gun violence is a menace to our communities and will never be tolerated by this government.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary question?

**Mr. Stephen Crawford:** I would like to thank the minister for his response. With the most recent announcement by our government for the people, I am certain we can effectively tackle the issue of gun-and-gang-related violence in this province. Our government for the people is listening to the brave men and women of our police services, who deserve to have the necessary tools and resources to perform their duties safely. With the recent announcement of the new funding to our police services, I am proud to stand here knowing our government has kept another one of its promises for the people.

Again to the minister: How will this new funding allow our government to tackle the problem of gang-and-gun-related violence?

**Hon. Michael A. Tibollo:** I thank the member again for his question. Prior to announcing our government’s new investment of \$25 million in our police services, we consulted with the Toronto Police Service, including Chief Mark Saunders, on how best to invest the money to make a substantial improvement to public safety. We

believe that our community safety partners know where the resources are needed and know how best to utilize them.

Over the coming weeks, I will continue to meet with our community safety partners to ensure that we're able to identify the best possible strategies to combat gun-and-gang-related violence within this great province. Ontarians deserve to feel confident in their own safety and the safety of their families. Too many Ontarians and too many communities are living in fear of gang and gun violence. Our government is listening, and we will continue to take real action to keep our neighbourhoods safe.

### CURRICULUM

**Ms. Marit Stiles:** My question is for the Premier. School starts across this province in just a few weeks. Does the Premier believe that kids should learn about consent, same-sex families and cyberbullying?

**Hon. Doug Ford:** Minister of Education.

**Hon. Lisa M. Thompson:** Speaker, back through you to the member opposite, I appreciate the question. I, again, have every assurance that teachers are going to be very responsible and utilize the curriculum last used in 2014 to put students on the proper path.

In addition to that, in tandem, while teachers are utilizing the curriculum last used in 2014, we're going to be focusing in on other promises and focuses of our campaign. We are committed to improving math scores. We are improving and addressing EQAO.

Speaker, I must say, it's a new week, so I'll remind the party in opposition that even their former deputy leader said that parents need to be respected. That's a promise that we're going to keep.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary.

**Ms. Marit Stiles:** Mr. Speaker, this really shouldn't be so difficult. It's a pretty straightforward question that I asked of the Premier.

The Premier is sending a message to young people that making Charles McVety and Tanya Granic Allen happy is more important than their safety and health. This is pandering, it's disgusting, and it is potentially dangerous.

Will the Premier stop pandering to conservative radicals and ensure that young people are taught about consent and inclusion, about cyberbullying, and have the tools they need to be safe in our province?

**Hon. Lisa M. Thompson:** Speaker, what I find disgusting is all the fear-mongering and spinning that's coming from that party opposite. It's absolutely ridiculous what they're trying to do.

I have every confidence that teachers are going to be coming forward, utilizing the curriculum last used in 2014, and they're going to get it right for the students.

Speaker, I might add that I hear the member from Waterloo. Maybe she should read the Kitchener-Waterloo Record from last week, where even the former Liberal House leader, John Milloy, said that the Liberal Party did not get the curriculum right in 2015. Speaker, we're going to do that.

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Stop the clock. The House will come to order, please.

Start the clock.

Next question.

### SOCIAL ASSISTANCE

**Ms. Mitzie Hunter:** My question is to the Premier. This government inherited from the Liberals an economy in Ontario that is doing well. The last Liberal government—

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Stop the clock. The government side will come to order.

The member for Scarborough–Guildwood has a right to ask a question just like any other member of this House. The Speaker needs to be able to hear the member for Scarborough–Guildwood. I would ask the government side again to please respect that.

Start the clock. The member for Scarborough–Guildwood.

**Ms. Mitzie Hunter:** The last Liberal government left Ontario with unemployment at a 20-year historic low. Just in July, the number was at 5.5%.

At a time when Ontario is doing economically well, why is this government taking us backwards at high speed and cancelling programs like the Basic Income Pilot and the planned increases to social assistance? A stable social safety net is essential to safe, healthy and strong neighbourhoods. Don't you think that this is the time to invest, and not make cuts, in people's lives?

Premier, could you live on \$721 a month?

1110

**Hon. Victor Fedeli:** She covered about five ministries there.

**Hon. Doug Ford:** Well, Mr. Speaker, I wasn't too sure where the member was going. She covered so many different ministries.

I'll tell the people of Ontario what we inherited. We inherited the highest subnational debt in the entire world. We inherited the highest hydro costs in all of North America. We inherited scandal after scandal after scandal under the Liberal government. We inherited people losing 300,000 manufacturing jobs right here in Ontario. We inherited a financial mess—we had to get an inquiry going. We're doing a line-item-by-line-item audit to find out who was getting rich off the taxpayers' money from the Liberals.

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Stop the clock. The government side will please come to order.

Start the clock. Supplementary question?

**Ms. Mitzie Hunter:** Speaker, again to the Premier: My question is relating to the people of Ontario. There are 4,000 people participating in the Basic Income Pilot. In my riding of Scarborough–Guildwood, 38,000 people live on OW and ODSP daily. I am asking this Premier to look Alana, Hardy and Coady in the eye and say, "You don't deserve an education. You don't deserve proper

nutrition. In fact, you deserve to have your kids taken away from you because you can't afford to make the rent. You are just a few dollars short."

I met with Hardy, Coady and Alana, who are devastated by this government's callous, mean-spirited decision to kill the Basic Income Pilot and to cut OW and ODSP supports. This hurts the 38,000 people in my riding who rely on these supports each and every day.

The Ford government says that the best solution is a job. So, through you, Speaker, will this Premier commit today to saving the \$400 basic income exemption for people on ODSP and OW, and keep this incentive in place for—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you. Premier?

**Hon. Doug Ford:** Through you, Mr. Speaker: I'll tell the member from Scarborough–Guildwood what the people of Scarborough want. They want a three-stop subway that the government of the Liberals changed eight times. The member from Scarborough–Guildwood was a big streetcar champion when the election started, jumped over to subways, and back to the streetcars. The member for Scarborough–Guildwood scraped through the election with 60 votes to win—barely scraped through.

But I'll tell you what the people of Scarborough–Guildwood gave us and the people of Ontario gave us: They gave us a majority government and the Premier's office. That's what the people of Ontario gave us.

#### TAXATION

**Mr. Dave Smith:** My question is for the Minister of the Environment, Conservation and Parks. In a recent National Post article, the question was posed: "Why are carbon taxes so unpopular?" Surveys from around the world outlined the top five reasons why carbon taxes fail: Carbon taxes are regressive, actually hitting the lower-income households the most; people are worried about competitiveness and employment effects; people view the high personal costs as too high; carbon taxes are believed to be ineffective in reducing emissions—they're nothing more than a tax grab; and finally and most importantly, they don't believe governments can be trusted.

The people of Ontario feel the same way. I've heard these concerns over and over again. Can the Minister of the Environment explain what the plan is to rebuild that trust and help those who have been most impacted?

**Hon. Rod Phillips:** Mr. Speaker, through you to the member from Peterborough–Kawartha: Thank you for that question. I know that you work very hard on behalf of your constituents.

This is an issue that all of us face in this Legislature, which is the loss of trust among Ontarians. That loss of trust came from a government that didn't listen. Our government has taken the time to listen. That is why we were elected. We have promised to restore accountability and trust, and we're doing that by putting money back in people's pockets by scrapping the cap-and-trade carbon

tax, reducing gas prices and helping job creators to employ Ontarians.

In addition, we're going to be creating jobs which are good for families. Our plan, including the 10-cent gas reduction, will create 14,000 jobs in Ontario—good for Ontario families and good for the economy. The elimination of cap-and-trade will eliminate billions of dollars of costs for families. It will bring quality jobs back to Ontario by lowering the cost of competition, stabilizing hydro rates and cutting job-killing red tape.

The carbon tax era is over. Ontario is open for business. Our plan is to put people first—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you.

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Stop the clock.

Start the clock.

Supplementary?

**Mr. Dave Smith:** Through you, Mr. Speaker: I'd like to thank the minister for his answer. It's clear that this government has the people in mind and understands what actions need to be taken in order to rebuild the trust that the people of this province lost over the last 15 years. This government has kept more promises in the last month than the previous Liberal government did in the last 10 years.

With the continuous slip-ups by the federal Minister of the Environment, it appears that there is uncertainty toward the approach of the federal government on the carbon tax. The people are concerned that they will in turn invoke a tax that will replace the one that our government is clearly fighting so strongly to eliminate. Can the minister assure Ontario residents that we'll do everything in our power to ensure that the federal government is not able to impose this carbon tax on us?

**Hon. Rod Phillips:** Mr. Speaker, through you to the member: The short answer is yes. We have committed to taking every step possible, to using all the means at our disposal to fight the Trudeau carbon tax. We didn't get elected by Ontarians to eliminate the last Liberal government's carbon tax—which was killing jobs and bad for families—just to have the federal government impose it. So yes to the member. We are taking every step possible. My colleague the Attorney General, as you know, is following this through the courts. We will continue to fight in the interests of Ontario families. We did not get elected, we did not make one of our first bills in the Legislature to eliminate the cap-and-trade carbon tax, just to have another one imposed.

#### COMMUNITY SAFETY

**Mr. Chris Glover:** My question is for the Premier. Increased gun violence in the GTA has devastated families and shaken our communities. In the wake of the horrific shooting on the Danforth last month, Toronto city council has taken action, bringing forward a motion to ban handguns in the city.

It is obvious that in a city of 2.8 million people, these are the types of measures we need to consider as legislators to protect our communities. But the Premier's refusal

to even consider this policy is astonishing and shows a lack of leadership. Why does the Premier refuse to consider a policy that could save lives?

**Hon. Doug Ford:** Minister of Community Safety.

**Hon. Michael A. Tibollo:** Thank you for the question. As we've always said, the safety of the public is of paramount concern to this government. Our concern must be to ensure that guns do not get into the hands of criminals. Gun violence has no place in Ontario, and these brazen, indiscriminate acts have to stop.

Illegal guns cross the border into our province every single day. This needs to stop as well. We will look to work with the federal government to ensure that sentencing is tougher for criminals who have committed these acts and ensure that the bail system is doing its job to keep our communities safe.

We also remain committed to providing our front-line officers with the tools and resources they need so desperately to do their jobs. That is our commitment and that is what we intend to do.

1120

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary?

**Mr. Chris Glover:** Last week, community members from the Zero Gun Violence Movement came to Queen's Park. Many of them have lost children and loved ones to gun violence, and they know that poverty is the root cause of this issue in their communities. Yet the Premier has slashed social assistance increases, cut \$330 million in annual mental health funding and squashed the Basic Income Pilot, pushing vulnerable people deeper into poverty.

Will the Premier show real leadership in addressing the root causes of gun violence?

**Hon. Michael A. Tibollo:** Mr. Speaker, as we've stated over and over again, gun violence has no place in Toronto or anywhere else in the province of Ontario. Gun violence destroys lives and is a menace to our communities. With the rise in gun violence on our streets, it's clear that the strategies that have been used up to date have not worked.

We remain committed to our police services across the province and to providing our officers with the tools they need to do their jobs. In addition to that, as part of our strategy, we will be continuing our consultations with communities to determine what other tools are needed.

We understand that the root cause of gun violence is more than just the use of guns on the street. Those are the issues that will be addressed through an integrated approach through our health, housing and other ministries as we develop a total strategy.

#### MUNICIPAL ELECTIONS

**Mr. Aris Babikian:** Good morning, Speaker. My question is to the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing.

Minister, Premier Ford spoke to thousands of Ontarians in Toronto and right across the province during the recent provincial campaign. They told him they were sick

and tired of big government that wastes their tax dollars and fails to fix the problems in their day-to-day lives.

Our broad consultation gives us confidence we are on the right track with our plan to reduce the size and the cost of Toronto council and to make it work for the people of this great city. Minister, who was consulted on the decision to increase the city council to 47 members?

**Hon. Steve Clark:** I want to thank the member for Scarborough–Agincourt for that excellent question.

The idea that the boundary review had tremendous public support is a myth. In the OMB appeal, expert witness Professor Andrew Sancton noted that no record was kept of the 192 people who appeared at public meetings or the 600 who filled out an online survey. Did the same 10 people attend meetings and count as 100 participants? We actually don't know.

He said, being charitable, they heard from 2,000 people. That's 0.1% of the city's electors—in Sancton's words, "a tiny and self-selecting group of engaged citizens and ... councillors." Speaker, that's not consultation; that's an echo chamber.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary?

**Mr. Aris Babikian:** Thank you, Minister. It helps explain how the review could have come up with the ridiculous recommendation to make council bigger when it was already dysfunctional. Certainly, it was a very surprising outcome for Torontonians because for years many people, including some councillors, tried to cut the size of council in half. But, like the NDP, councillors who love big government always voted to put their interests ahead of creating a smaller, more effective council.

Minister, can you tell us how the lack of public participation affected the outcome of the boundary review?

**Hon. Steve Clark:** Thank you to the member for that question. With so few public members being involved, the loudest voices during the boundary review were the incumbent councillors. The result, said Professor Sancton, is "the interests the consultants ended up advancing were those of incumbent councillors and not the public interest." He concluded that there is absolutely no evidence of broad public support for a larger council.

When you speak to politicians, you get bigger government. But when you speak to real people, like Premier Ford did, you understand they want a smaller, more effective government that puts people first, and that's exactly what we're doing with Bill 5, the Better Local Government Act. That's what we're doing.

#### AUTOMOBILE INSURANCE

**Mr. Gurratan Singh:** My question is for the Premier. Auto insurance postal code discrimination is a shameful practice that is hurting Ontario drivers. In the last year alone, my community of Brampton has seen premiums increase at a rate that is nearly five times higher than the provincial average.

Will the Premier today, in this House, commit to ending the unjust practice of postal code discrimination,

and if so, when can Ontarians expect this change to happen?

**Hon. Doug Ford:** Minister of Finance.

**Hon. Victor Fedeli:** I want to thank the member for the question. Speaker, there are nearly 10 million drivers in Ontario who expect this province to do everything we can to lower auto insurance rates and make travel more affordable.

What we know so far is that the deal the official opposition brokered with the Liberals on auto insurance has been an abject failure—an absolute failure. Rates are nowhere near the 15% reduction that was promised by the Liberals in a deal brokered by the NDP in nothing more than a photo op—absolutely nothing more than a photo op.

Meanwhile, we will continue to work with the industry and the regulators to do everything we can to lower insurance rates in a responsible manner.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary?

**Mr. Gurratan Singh:** Mr. Speaker, I am frankly shocked by this answer. I expected this to be an easy answer from the Premier. Just four days ago, the Premier told members of the Punjabi media that they would expect to see postal code discrimination ended before Christmas.

Why is the Premier immediately breaking his promise and putting the interests of private auto insurance companies ahead of the people of Ontario?

**Hon. Victor Fedeli:** Once again, Speaker, the official opposition now has absolutely nothing whatsoever to show for that politically motivated deal that they made, except for the fact that Ontario drivers are continuing to pay amounts which are amongst the highest premiums in Canada. Quite frankly, the NDP should be absolutely ashamed that they brokered a deal that was nothing at all—nothing at all other than an absolute photo op back in that day. Auto insurance rates are indeed linked to claims costs in a deal that once again only exists because of this brokered deal.

Speaker, we will continue to work with industry and regulators to do everything we can to make a real difference in auto insurance rates, not another photo op.

#### SIR JOHN A. MACDONALD STATUE

**Ms. Goldie Ghamari:** My question is for the Minister of Tourism, Culture and Sport. Last week, I was shocked to read that the city of Victoria intended to take down a statue of Sir John A. Macdonald. These attempts to erase parts of our history do nothing to educate people and are only political correctness run amok.

Can the minister inform the House what our government intends to do to preserve John A. Macdonald's legacy and encourage a more fulsome teaching of Canadian history?

**Hon. Sylvia Jones:** Thank you to the member from Carleton for her question. It's an important one. Sir John A. Macdonald plays a central role in our national story. He did more to found our nation than any other Father of

Confederation. In fact, we would not be debating here today without Sir John A. That's why our government wrote to the mayor of Victoria to say we'd be happy to give Sir John A. a new home here in Ontario.

Members will note that when they depart this chamber, the first portrait you see is of course the Fathers of Confederation and a statue of our first Prime Minister stands proudly at the southern end of the grounds of Queen's Park. History matters, and we need to acknowledge the important role that Sir John A. Macdonald played in Canada's and Ontario's history.

1130

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary?

**Ms. Goldie Ghamari:** Back to the minister: I thank the minister for her answer; 1867 was a different time, and we should not judge our founding fathers solely on the knowledge we possess today.

As the famous saying goes, those who do not learn from history are doomed to repeat it. To quote Minister Smith's letter, he says that we should be treating John A. Macdonald's legacy as a better way to learn our own history. Can the minister tell the House how bringing the statue of John A. Macdonald to Ontario would help Ontarians with our complicated history?

**Hon. Sylvia Jones:** Again, through the Speaker, thank you to the member for her question. There's no denying that Sir John A.'s role in our history is a cause for much discussion, because history is complicated. People are complicated. But there is no doubt that 125 years ago—after his death, our first Prime Minister stands as an important Canadian within the creation of our country. We encourage Ontarians to learn more about our first Prime Minister by visiting statues like the ones at historic sites throughout Ontario, including at the front of Queen's Park.

#### SOCIAL ASSISTANCE

**Mr. Jamie West:** My question is for the Premier. Sarah is a constituent of mine, and she's worried that the announced 1.5% cut to social assistance will return us to the deprivation of the Harris years. Sarah recalls how as a child, when the former Conservative government cuts came, her family was evicted, how they had to move onto campgrounds and how they slept on relatives' floors. Sarah describes these cuts as "cruel and unnecessary."

Speaker, Sarah wants to know what the Premier has to say to the people who will lose their homes, be unable to eat or be unable to buy medication because of his cuts.

**Hon. Doug Ford:** Minister of Health.

**Hon. Christine Elliott:** I thank the member very much for his question. There is no question that there's more that we need to do for people who are receiving social assistance in Ontario. In fact, what has been done is that there is a 1.5% increase for both people on Ontario Works as well as people on ODSP. That is an increase.

Of course, that's not the end of it. There is more work to be done. The minister is already working on that. She has 100 days—about 90 days now—in order to complete

her review to make sure that we can provide people with the support they need to move forward in their lives, not to sit where they are. We want to make sure that people can find jobs, those who are able to work and are able to move forward to get themselves out of poverty. That is what the minister is concentrating on. That is what we want to do for the people of Ontario.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary?

**Mr. Jamie West:** Speaker, the poorest citizens of this province—many of them are unable to work like you and I are—were expecting the rates to go up by 3% this year; 1.5% is less than that by half. Since I suspect that the extent of the consultation we'll see is only whatever has been discussed at the cabinet table, will the Premier tell Ontarians today what further cuts on the backs of social assistance recipients are already planned?

**Hon. Christine Elliott:** In fact, what we want to do is to help all people receiving social assistance: those people who are temporarily out of work and those people who are not going to be able to work because of their disabilities. We want to make sure that we can help them move forward. The 1.5% increase that is happening is helping people. Is it all that we intend to do? No.

Our government for the people wants to make sure that we can help everyone across Ontario. The guaranteed income pilot was a pilot and evidence indicated that it wasn't working, and it was only for a very small number of people. We want to make sure that everyone who needs assistance in the province of Ontario is going to do it. That is why the minister is undergoing a thorough consultation to make sure that we get it right and that we can help people move forward and get a job, which is the best social assistance program.

## TAXATION

**Mrs. Belinda Karahalios:** My question is for the Attorney General. On June 7, the people of Ontario elected a government for the people that promised to deliver tax relief for families and small businesses. The commitment was simple but important: put an end to the cap-and-trade scheme and fight the costly federal carbon tax.

I'm pleased to see that this government has already begun to take steps to achieve that with the introduction of Bill 4, the Cap and Trade Cancellation Act; the Premier's announcement that Ontario will be participating in Saskatchewan's challenge of the federal carbon tax in the Saskatchewan Court of Appeal; and that our government will be launching its own challenge in the Ontario Court of Appeal.

While we know that the Trudeau Liberals' carbon tax will drive up the costs of goods and services Ontarians rely on every day, some have wondered about the rationale of participating in two challenges. Mr. Speaker, can the Attorney General highlight how challenging the federal carbon tax will make a real difference in the lives of Ontarians?

**Hon. Caroline Mulroney:** Thank you to the member from Cambridge for her question. Our government did

campaign on a promise to the people that we would work hard to put money back in taxpayers' pockets, reduce the price of gas by 10 cents a litre and bring real tax relief to families. Challenging the federal carbon tax is one of the ways we are keeping the promise and standing up for the hard-working people of Ontario.

On June 7, the voice of the people rang out loud and clear across this province. Over the past 15 years, the cost of living has become too high and too many people were struggling to keep up with paying their bills, Mr. Speaker. They wanted change and a government that could deliver it. That's why we are here today, on this side of the House, with a mandate to challenge the costly federal carbon tax in court.

We made a promise, and today I'm proud to say we are keeping that promise.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary?

**Mrs. Belinda Karahalios:** I would like to thank the Attorney General for that answer. I know in my riding too many people have struggled with the high costs brought on by the previous government's misguided policies. It's reassuring to know that this government is taking swift action to bring relief to Ontarians and making life more affordable once again.

I know the federal government recently announced that they have scaled back on the scope of their plans with regard to the federal carbon tax, a move that can be understood as acknowledgement that this tax is overly burdensome and will not achieve environmental objectives. Can the Attorney General outline what this means for the Ontario government's strategy, moving forward, and if this changes anything with respect to the province's challenge in the Ontario Court of Appeal?

**Hon. Caroline Mulroney:** Mr. Speaker, through you, I'm happy to respond to the member's follow-up question. As I said, our government was given a clear mandate to stand up for hard-working Ontarians and to oppose the costly federal carbon tax, which is why our government remains committed to challenging the constitutionality of the federal Greenhouse Gas Pollution Pricing Act. While the federal government has announced upcoming changes to the act that will scale back its scope, Ontario's position is that this act imposes an unconstitutional tax on Ontarians and is outside of federal jurisdiction.

Our government knows that a strategy on climate change is important, but we also know that we can be good environmental stewards without digging into people's pockets. Mr. Speaker, our government stands firm in its commitment to use all available resources to challenge the federal carbon tax. I have full confidence in the soundness of our legal position, but it is ultimately up to the courts to decide the issue.

## NORTHERN TRANSPORTATION

**Mr. Guy Bourgouin:** Ma question est pour le premier ministre.

People in my riding of Mushkegowuk—James Bay have been struggling with the Northland bus service that

just isn't good enough. For one of my constituents, a recent change to the bus means a 26-hour bus trip to get from Barrie to Kapuskasing. It now takes two days for those travelling from Sudbury—which is only a six-hour drive away—because of the lack of coordination with transfers. This is unfair and just not good enough.

What does this government have to say to my constituents who have settled for second-class bus service for far too long?

**Hon. Doug Ford:** Minister of Transportation.

**Hon. John Yakabuski:** Thank you to the member for his question. The challenge of transportation in remote areas is not a new one but is one that we take very seriously. When we see situations where people are not getting to the destinations that they require, it's of great concern to us. Along with the Minister of Northern Development and Mines and Ontario Northland, we are continuing to wrestle with the challenges that were faced with transportation in remote areas. It is something that we are continuously trying to improve. We are committed to better transportation for the people of Ontario to ensure that their needs are met. We recognize there are challenges, but as a government, we are committed to try to face them in the best way we can.

1140

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Supplementary.

**Mr. Guy Bourgouin:** Mr. Speaker, to the minister: He knows how hard it is for people to move around the north. Whether it's due to poor maintenance of roads or limited or no access to public transportation, communities across the north are struggling. This is not new. First the train to Cochrane was cut. Next came cuts to Greyhound.

Mr. Speaker, to the minister: Will the government commit today to restore the Ontario Northlander?

**Hon. John Yakabuski:** I thank the member for his supplementary. What I do not thank is his party for supporting the Liberals in the cancellation of the Northlander. They worked hand in glove with the previous Liberal government to deny the people of the north the transportation that they so badly needed. And when it was cancelled—now we're hearing about the problems that are resulting from that cancellation. But let's be perfectly clear. Let's be crystal clear. It was the NDP that supported the Liberals in the cancellation of the Northlander.

I say to the member—and I recognize that you're only a new member in this Legislature, so you haven't been here for the history—that we are committed to better transportation throughout this province, but it's not going to happen overnight. To undo the damage of a government that ran this—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you. Take your seat.

*Interjections.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Stop the clock.

**Hon. John Yakabuski:** Well, I'm prepared to stand here today—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The member will take his seat.

**Hon. John Yakabuski:** Well, I'm prepared to sit down.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** As the former Speaker used to say, when the Speaker stands, you sit. Thank you.

Start the clock. Next question.

## MUNICIPAL ELECTIONS

**Mr. Stephen Lecce:** My question is to the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing. Mr. Speaker, hard-working, taxpaying, law-abiding people in this province support our plan to do more with less and to reduce the size of government. We are doing what the opposition could not conceive of doing, which is putting the public interest over political self-interest.

Through you, Mr. Speaker, can the minister outline why we must pass this legislation without delay and get the fifth-largest economy of this country back on track?

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing.

**Hon. Steve Clark:** Thank you again, Speaker, and through you, I want to thank the member for King–Vaughan for his tremendous advocacy on this issue. He's absolutely right: Bill 5, the Better Local Government Act, does something that I think many Ontarians and certainly many Torontonians have wanted for a long time, and that's a council that isn't dysfunctional, a council that is streamlined and that uses the same boundaries that federal MPs and provincial MPPs use, so that when that election takes place on October 22, they'll have a streamlined council that's ready to work and to make those very important decisions.

People in Toronto don't want a dysfunctional council. They don't want a council that—for goodness' sake, Speaker, their last council meeting took six days, six days for a council meeting. This is exactly what Bill 5 is going to remedy. It's going to have a council that is ready and willing to work and to make those important decisions on October 22. I again ask the—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you. Supplementary.

**Mr. Stephen Lecce:** Thank you, Minister, for having the courage to fight for taxpayers in this House.

Mr. Speaker, the people in my riding of King–Vaughan want this legislation passed. They want to see improvement to the efficacy of government. They want to see taxpayers save money. And they want to make the largest city in this province and country accountable.

Minister, could you outline how the Better Local Government Act will improve the effectiveness of government and enhance accountability of city government?

**Hon. Steve Clark:** Again, Speaker, through you to the member for King–Vaughan, having a council that's very clear—and to the citizens of Toronto, it will be very clear. They will know who their federal MP is; it's the

same boundary. They know who their provincial MPP is; it's the same boundary. It's going to be very clear to them who to call, after October 22, to represent them at city hall. I think there are a tremendous amount of Torontonians who have been waiting for this for a long, long time.

If we left it to the NDP, they're always going to stand up for more politicians, and they're always going to stand up for bigger government. We ran on a very, very, very distinct platform to reduce the size and cost of government. There were no questions for us, but I have to say there were a few questions for the NDP: They wanted to know, why didn't Andrea Horwath stand up against the anti-veteran element of her party? Why didn't Andrea Horwath stand up to the—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Thank you.

That concludes the time that we have for question period today.

#### VISITORS

**Ms. Catherine Fife:** Point of order.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Point of order: the member for Waterloo.

**Ms. Catherine Fife:** I just wanted to welcome my high school teachers Pat and Sam Pileggi from Harbord Collegiate, visiting me here today at Queen's Park. I was a model student.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Point of order: the government House leader.

**Hon. Todd Smith:** On a point of order, Speaker, I just wanted to welcome Jennifer Yee. She is the owner-operator of Medical Laboratories of Windsor. This is her first visit to Queen's Park today, and we welcome her.

#### ATTACK IN FREDERICTON

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** I recognize the government House leader on a second point of order.

**Hon. Todd Smith:** On a second point of order, Mr. Speaker, I believe you will find that we have unanimous consent for a moment of silence to honour the two Fredericton police officers and the two residents of Fredericton who were shot and killed in the gun violence in the New Brunswick capital on Friday night.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The government House leader is seeking unanimous consent of the House to honour the—

**Interjections:** Agreed.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Will the members please rise.

*The House observed a moment's silence.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Our thoughts and prayers are with their families.

There being no deferred votes, this House stands in recess until 1 o'clock this afternoon.

*The House recessed from 1148 to 1300.*

#### MEMBERS' STATEMENTS

##### PAT NOONAN

**Mr. Percy Hatfield:** We lost a community champion in Windsor yesterday. Pat Noonan was a social activist, a true warrior right to the end. She was a former nun who left the convent after 20 years because her progressive views conflicted with the teachings of the Catholic church and because women weren't treated as equals.

She started Windsor's feminist movement in 1970, protesting against the statue of a bikini-clad woman being used to sell tires at a gas station. She opened a drop-in centre that became a sanctuary for battered wives. She co-founded the Windsor Feminist Theatre, now the longest-running feminist theatre in Canada. She was a teacher and a principal.

Pat Noonan was married then divorced and worked in a factory putting chrome on bumpers because she felt she was too insulated from ordinary life.

Pat certainly was no ordinary person: an environmentalist, peace activist and our local voice of social conscience. Three years ago, she was honoured by the Council of Canadians as Activist of the Year.

Pat was a child of the Depression. And before she knew the word, she was a feminist because she couldn't accept the fact that her brothers never had to wash the dishes. She had an intense understanding of right and wrong and social responsibility. She was bold and outspoken, always had a shoulder to cry on, and at times was hilariously cheeky.

They made a movie about her life a few years ago called *This is What a Feminist Sounds Like*.

Speaker, we in Windsor and Essex county mourn the loss of Pat Noonan, a role model for us all.

##### MARKHAM-MILLIKEN CHILDREN'S FESTIVAL

**Mr. Logan Kanapathi:** Each summer, Markham welcomes the annual Markham-Milliken Children's Festival. It has become Ontario's largest children's festival. It is an event that children and young families wait for all summer long. This festival started because of a vision and a need to bring affordable local fun to families in Markham and throughout York region.

As the past chair of the Markham-Milliken Children's Festival for over 10 years, I'm proud to have led the largest children's festival in Ontario. Together with my committee, we ground up this festival from 500 participants to over 20,000 participants, with the help of 300 young volunteers.

This event is an opportunity to bring together residents and families of one of the most ethnically diverse ridings in Canada.

This year is an important year for the festival because it is the festival's homecoming. Finally, it's coming back to the heart of the southeast part of Markham this August

25, at the newly opened Aaniin Community Centre and Library in the riding of Markham–Thornhill.

Mr. Speaker, this is a true community celebration, and I welcome and encourage all members of the Legislative Assembly to attend this wonderful festival.

#### BEVERAGE ALCOHOL SALES

**Mr. Terence Kernaghan:** I think I can speak for the official opposition when I say that over here we're not opposed to a good beer—excepting those who abstain for cultural and/or other reasons.

While there are many problems with providing subsidies for wealthy multinational beer makers, including substance abuse, addictions, mental health, violence against women and more, today I'm going to solely focus on the manufacture of beer.

A fantastic business in my riding, London Brewing Co-op, source their ingredients from nearby Ontario farms, have created good jobs, and money flows back into the local Ontario economy.

Craft brewers deserve support and recognition from our government instead of a challenge to lower standards and sell at a loss. If this government stood on the side of Ontario businesses, they would create subsidies for brewers buying and farms selling local produce. Instead, we see this government subsidizing multinational corporations and sending money overseas by offering prime shelf, advertising and promotional space, all of which have an associated value regardless of claims to the contrary.

Craft beer makers across Ontario have responded to this rich-get-richer, insider-driven challenge in a more Canadian way by investing in local communities. Storm Stayed brewery in London is donating \$1 from certain sales to Anova, the merger of Women's Community House and the Sexual Assault Centre London.

This government challenges brewers to lose money so they can make good on a promise. Why is this Conservative government making life harder for businesses just so they can save face?

#### BURL'S CREEK EVENT GROUNDS

**Mr. Doug Downey:** I rise to talk about Burl's Creek Event Grounds. The property has been used for over 30 years for cultural, entertainment, sports and community events. It's the pride of Simcoe county, and people from all over North America come to celebrate and enjoy the property and its use. Most recently, this past weekend, we had Boots and Hearts. Some 45,000 people attended from all over Canada—every province and territory—over 20 US states and people beyond North America.

It's just unbelievable how many people show up and enjoy the grounds. It's a pop-up city of sorts. People bring their trailers, they bring their tents, but it's a very responsible type of event. Most people who drive in are not allowed to drive out. You are there for the weekend. It's very controlled. They check rigorously as people

come in and they check rigorously as you leave, but, boy, there's a lot of fun to be had.

This year they had Ferris wheels and all sorts of things. They had tents to help with the sun and the rain and whatnot. The acts are just second to none. Alan Jackson was a headliner on Saturday night. I can tell you, as you looked out over those fields, Mr. Speaker, you couldn't see the end of them. It was like looking out into the ocean. People had good, clean fun, and it's such a great—

**Hon. Todd Smith:** Chattahoochee.

**Mr. Doug Downey:** Chattahoochee; there you go. Country and western, Mr. Speaker. It was the seventh edition this past weekend.

#### SOCIAL ASSISTANCE

**Ms. Laura Mae Lindo:** Today I rise to speak about one issue that has been troubling people in Kitchener Centre. Though it's not the fault of the Ford government that a promise was made to people on ODSP and OW to increase their payments by 3% and double the amount of money that they're allowed to take home before those payments are taken back, it's the responsibility of a government to run with moral integrity and empathy for those whom they are governing.

I'm also completely astonished that we're now finding more tropes around people who are poor that are problematic; for instance, implying that they are manipulating the system, that they're dishonest, that they're uneducated. So what I'd like to do is introduce a few of the people on ODSP and OW from my riding of Kitchener Centre.

For Kate, this cut means that she will get \$18 more each month while her rent has gone up by \$27 and food has increased by 2.5% in Kitchener. Kate works diligently in the community. She supports those who are less fortunate. But I guess this form of compassion means that she will have to do that on an empty stomach.

#### OPIOID ABUSE

**Mr. John Fraser:** I'd like to say a few words about safe injection sites. I want to start off by saying that I was really pleased last week when the Minister of Health talked about extending the funding for the London safe injection site. It's the right thing to do.

I was disappointed when I heard this morning that there is a pause on the other sites in Ontario that are ready to go and that the government wanted to look at evidence on either side. The evidence is there. Safe injection sites save lives. They save sons' and daughters' lives. They save mums and dads. They save lives of people who are loved.

Our obligation is to try to save lives. Safe injection sites do that by ensuring that if someone has an overdose they get naloxone right away and treatment right away. You can't cure someone's addiction if they are not alive. So I would urge the minister to look at the expert

evidence from people like Dr. Jeffrey Turnbull in Ottawa, who is actually heading up our efforts in Ottawa at the Shepherds of Good Hope. He's the former chief of staff at the Ottawa Hospital and the former president of the Canadian Medical Association.

1310

The evidence is very clear, and I ask the minister not to delay any longer in opening up those other safe injection sites.

#### SINDHI COMMUNITY

**Ms. Natalia Kusendova:** Last weekend, I had the privilege of attending the Sindhi Association of North America's annual gala.

SANA Canada is a non-profit organization that works to unite Sindhis throughout North America and around the world. The goal of this organization is to preserve the tradition and historic national rights of Sindhi people while maintaining strong relationships with other ethnic communities.

I was thrilled to see such vibrant and enthusiastic youth participation at SANA Canada. These young people understand the importance of celebrating and preserving their cultural heritage essential to our great Canadian mosaic.

Mr. Speaker, I commend the important work of this organization in supporting new Canadians. My riding of Mississauga Centre is home to many members of the Sindhi community, and I'm proud of their many contributions to our city and our province.

Lastly, I'd like to take this opportunity to express my heartfelt gratitude to Jam Muneer, president of SANA Canada, for his gracious hospitality this past weekend.

#### SIR JOHN A. MACDONALD STATUE

**Mr. Sol Mamakwa:** I just want to quickly speak about the bringing of the Sir John A. Macdonald statue from Victoria to Ontario.

I want to let the House know that I went to residential schools and that it's very important to me to express my voice and many survivors' like me about this matter. In 1987, I was quite aware of the strapping that happened, and this is 1987. It's sometimes very difficult to listen to some of the approaches, especially today when I heard that this was happening.

What First Nations people didn't hear previously, when this House came in, was about reconciliation in the throne speech, or anything from the Minister of Indigenous Affairs.

A question that I have is, how was the decision to bring this statue made without any First Nations leadership in Ontario? Further, the government also pressed pause on the TRC curriculum writing. How much will it cost for the statue to be brought here?

One of the things I want to say is that I applaud the city of Victoria for making such a strong statement in favour of reconciliation for our people. When will this

government make theirs, and where is the humanity in that?

#### PETER VAN LOAN

**Ms. Andrea Khanjin:** I'm honoured to be able to welcome someone that I look up to, as a role model and mentor, in the Legislature today.

Peter Van Loan, who is sitting up in the gallery with us today, was elected as member of Parliament for York-Simcoe in 2004 and has been delivering change for the better ever since. He has been a dedicated and loyal servant to not only his constituents but for all of Canada. He has always treated his position with respect and with dignity, and I applaud him for the work that he has done over the years. He has the best voting record of any MP in the entire House of Commons, having attended 637 out of 639 votes. His dedication to protecting and restoring Lake Simcoe has led to our beautiful lake being the jewel of our community once again.

Peter Van Loan—or PVL, as he is commonly known—is a true patriot. He looks up to Sir John A. Macdonald and even named his son after the leader of our Confederation.

When he announced his retirement, I know a lot of us in the area were really humbled and saddened to see him go but know he will always make our country and Ontario a better place.

As a minister, he improved our corrections system, he enhanced our national security and he played a critical role in expanding Canada's free trade with many countries worldwide. Thank you, Honourable Peter Van Loan.

#### CHALLENGER BASEBALL IN WHITBY

**Mr. Lorne Coe:** Baseball should be a field of dreams for all who want to be involved in the game. That's why it's so important that a dream comes to fruition to construct a fully accessible diamond in Whitby for all special-needs children in Durham, to showcase their abilities.

What started out as the Whitby Challenger Baseball league, with about a dozen players four years ago, has grown into a Durham-wide league that now has more than 70 players from the ages of five to 20, with some exceptions, turning out and playing the game they love. Challenger baseball allows children with cognitive or physical disabilities to enjoy the benefits of participation in baseball at a level that is structured to their abilities.

The town of Whitby has been most accommodating to the needs of Challenger baseball. That's to the credit of Mayor Mitchell and his council offering the league a parcel of land at Willow Park in the northeast side of the town for its diamond. The diamond project is expected to cost about \$350,000. With the support of town council, a target date for the opening of the baseball diamond is late 2019.

This diamond will provide the type of opportunity to help these young men and young women fulfill their aspirations. It's to the credit of all those involved with Whitby Challenger Baseball that this is happening.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** That concludes our time for members' statements this afternoon.

## INTRODUCTION OF BILLS

### ALTERNATE LAND USE AND SERVICES PROGRAM FOR AGRICULTURAL LAND ACT, 2018

### LOI DE 2018 SUR UN PROGRAMME DE DIVERSIFICATION DES MODES D'UTILISATION DES TERRES AGRICOLES ET DES SERVICES PRODUITS SUR CES TERRES

Mr. Barrett moved first reading of the following bill:

Bill 28, An Act respecting a voluntary program for the alternate use of agricultural land and the production of ecosystem services on that land / Projet de loi 28, Loi concernant un programme volontaire pour la diversification des modes d'utilisation des terres agricoles et la production de services écosystémiques sur ces terres.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Is it the pleasure of the House that the motion carry? Carried.

*First reading agreed to.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The member for Haldimand-Norfolk can give a brief explanation of his bill.

**Mr. Toby Barrett:** Sometimes the terms "alternate" and "alternative" can be synonymous in this use. The alternate land use services program is also known in short form as the ALUS program. It recognizes the rights of owners of agricultural land to set aside any part of the land as fallow for either of the following two purposes: to establish, restore or preserve a natural ecosystem, and to establish and maintain projects that produce services for natural ecosystems.

The Minister of Natural Resources and Forestry has 12 months to develop a provincial framework and action plan that does such things as the following: It can provide guidelines on how agricultural land can be used for those purposes, provide for the government to create and distribute standardized educational materials on those guidelines, promote research into those uses of agricultural land, promote the holding of international symposia on those uses, and encourage fundraising for those uses and those symposia.

The minister can amend the provincial framework and action plan to update it as the minister considers advisable.

I want to stress it's a voluntary program.

## AN ACT TO REQUIRE THE MINISTER OF THE ENVIRONMENT, CONSERVATION AND PARKS TO DISCHARGE THE RESPONSIBILITIES UNDER SUBSECTION 15(1) OF THE ONTARIO WATER RESOURCES ACT

Mr. Bisson moved first reading of the following bill:

An Act to require the Minister of the Environment, Conservation and Parks to discharge the responsibilities under subsection 15(1) of the Ontario Water Resources Act to determine the the zebra mussel content of Glassy Lake, Glay Lake, Glaze Lake, Gleason Brook, Gleason Lake, Gleave Lake, Gledhill Lake, Gleeson Lake, Glen Creek, Glendening Lake, Glen Erin Brook, Glenfield Creek, Glen Lake, Glenney Creek, Glenney Lake, Glenn Lake, Gillies Creek, Gillies Lake, Gilligan Creek, Gillin Lake, Gill Lake, Gillmor Lake, Gillnet Lake, Gill's Bay, Gilman Bay, Gilman Lake, Gilmour Bay, Gilmour Creek, Gilmour Lake, Gilroy Lake, Gilson Lake, Gilt Lake, Gimby Lake, Gimlet Lake, Gina Lake, Gin Creek, Ginger Lake, Gin Lake, Ginn Lake, Ginozhe Bay, Gipsy Lake, Giraffe Creek, Giraffe Lake, Girardin Pond, Girard Lake, Girdlestone Bay, Giroux Creek, Giroux Lake, Giroux River, Girty Lake, Girvan Creek, Girvan Lake, Girvin Lake, Gitche Lake, Gitche River, Gittins Lake, Giunta Lake, Giving Lake, Giwshkwebi Bay, Glabb Lake, Glacier Creek, Glacier Lake, Glade Lake, Gladstone Lake, Gladwin Creek, Gladwin Lake, Gladys Lake, Glaister Creek, Glaister Lake, Gilmor Lake, Glanmire Creek, Glanmire Lake, Glasford Lake, Glasgow Lake, Glasgow Pond, Glass By, Glasser Lake, Gessie Lake, Ghee Lake, Ghost Bay, Ghost Creek, Ghost Lake, Ghost River, Giacomo Lake, Gibbery Lake, Gibb Lake, Gibboney Lake, Gibbons Lake, Gibbons Lake, Gibi Lake.

1320

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Is it the pleasure of the House that the motion carry?

All those in favour of the motion will please say "aye."

All those opposed will please say "nay."

In my opinion, the ayes have it.

Call in the members. This will be a five-minute bell.

*The division bells rang from 1326 to 1331.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** All those in favour of the motion will please rise one at a time and be counted by the Clerk.

### Ayes

Bisson, Gilles	Hatfield, Percy	Singh, Sara
Bourgouin, Guy	Kernaghan, Terence	Stevens, Jennifer (Jennie)
Fife, Catherine	Lindo, Laura Mae	Stiles, Marit
French, Jennifer K.	Mamakwa, Sol	Vanthof, John
Gates, Wayne	Monteith-Farrell, Judith	
Gélinas, France	Schreiner, Mike	

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** All those opposed to the motion will please rise one at a time and be counted by the Clerk.

**Nays**

Anand, Deepak	Fee, Amy	Pettapiece, Randy
Baber, Roman	Fullerton, Merrilee	Rasheed, Kaleed
Babikian, Aris	Ghamari, Goldie	Roberts, Jeremy
Bailey, Robert	Gill, Parm	Sabawy, Sheref
Bouma, Will	Kanapathi, Logan	Sandhu, Amarjot
Cho, Stan	Karahalios, Belinda	Scott, Laurie
Clark, Steve	McDonnell, Jim	Simard, Amanda
Coe, Lorne	McKenna, Jane	Smith, Dave
Crawford, Stephen	McNaughton, Monte	Smith, Todd
Cuzzetto, Rudy	Mulroney, Caroline	Tangri, Nina
Downey, Doug	Nicholls, Rick	Wai, Daisy
Dunlop, Jill	Park, Lindsey	Walker, Bill

**The Clerk of the Assembly (Mr. Todd Decker):** The ayes are 16; the nays are 36.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** I declare the motion lost.

*First reading negatived.*

PROTECTING WATERWAYS  
FROM ZEBRA MUSSELS ACT, 2018

LOI DE 2018

SUR LA PROTECTION DES COURS D'EAU  
CONTRE LES MOULES ZÉBRÉES

Mr. Bisson moved first reading of the following bill:

Bill 29, An Act to require the Minister of the Environment, Conservation and Parks to discharge the responsibilities under subsection 15 (1) of the Ontario Water Resources Act to determine the zebra mussel content of Gibraltar Bay, Gibraltar Lake, Gibson Creek, Gibson Lake, Gibson River, Gibsons Bay, Gibsorns Lake, Gids Harbour, Giffins Lake, Gifford Bay, Gifford Lake, Gignac Lake, Giguere Lake, Gilbert Creek, Gilbert Lake, Gilboe Lake, Gilby Lake; Gilchrist Bay, Gilchrist Creek, Gilchrist Lake, Gilden Lake, Gills Bay, Gilhuly Lake, Gillard Lake, Gilleach Lake, Gilleran Lake, Genessee Bay, Genessee Lake, Geneva Creek, Geneva Lake, Genier Creek, Genier Lake, Gennis Lake, Genoa Creek, Genoa Lake, Genricks Lake, Gentian Creek, Gentian Lake, Gentleman Creek, Geoffrey Lake, Geoffrion Lake, Geometry Lake, Geordie Lake, Geordies Lake, George Creek, George Lake, Georges Bay, George's Lake, Georgia Lake, Georgian Bay, Georgie Creek, Georgina Lake, Geraldine Lake, Gerald Lake, Gerber Lake, Gerloch Creek, German Bay, German Lake, German Mills Creek, Gerow Lake, Gerrard Lake, Gerry Creek, Gerry Lake, Gertrude Lake, Gervais Lake and Gervis Lake / Projet de loi 29, Loi visant à exiger que le ministre de l'Environnement, de la Protection de la nature et des Parcs assume ses responsabilités en application du paragraphe 15 (1) de la Loi sur les ressources en eau de l'Ontario pour établir la quantité de moules zébrées dans les cours d'eau suivants : Gibraltar Bay, Gibraltar Lake, Gibson Creek, Gibson Lake, Gibson River, Gibsons Bay, Gibsorns Lake, Gids Harbour, Giffins Lake, Gifford Bay, Gifford Lake, Gignac Lake, Giguere Lake, Gilbert Creek, Gilbert Lake, Gilboe Lake, Gilby Lake; Gilchrist Bay, Gilchrist Creek, Gilchrist Lake, Gilden Lake, Gills Bay, Gilhuly Lake, Gillard Lake, Gilleach Lake, Gilleran Lake, Genessee Bay,

Genessee Lake, Geneva Creek, Geneva Lake, Genier Creek, Genier Lake, Gennis Lake, Genoa Creek, Genoa Lake, Genricks Lake, Gentian Creek, Gentian Lake, Gentleman Creek, Geoffrey Lake, Geoffrion Lake, Geometry Lake, Geordie Lake, Geordies Lake, George Creek, George Lake, Georges Bay, George's Lake, Georgia Lake, Georgian Bay, Georgie Creek, Georgina Lake, Geraldine Lake, Gerald Lake, Gerber Lake, Gerloch Creek, German Bay, German Lake, German Mills Creek, Gerow Lake, Gerrard Lake, Gerry Creek, Gerry Lake, Gertrude Lake, Gervais Lake et Gervis Lake.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** It is the pleasure of the House that the motion carry?

All those in favour of the motion will please say "aye."

All those opposed will please say "nay."

In my opinion, the nays have it.

Call in the members. This will be another five-minute bell.

*The division bells rang from 1340 to 1345.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** I ask the members to please take their seats. Are we ready to vote?

All those in favour of the motion will please rise one at a time and be recognized by the Clerk.

**Ayes**

Bisson, Gilles	Kernaghan, Terence	Singh, Sara
French, Jennifer K.	Lindo, Laura Mae	Stevens, Jennifer (Jennie)
Gélinas, France	Mamakwa, Sol	Stiles, Marit
Hatfield, Percy	Rakocevic, Tom	Vanthof, John

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** All those opposed to the motion will please rise one at a time and be counted by the Clerk.

**The Clerk of the Assembly (Mr. Todd Decker):** The ayes are 12; the nays are 0.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** I declare the motion carried.

*First reading agreed to.*

**1350**

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Would the member for Timmins like to offer an explanation of his bill?

**Mr. Gilles Bisson:** Yes, Mr. Speaker. The purpose of the bill is to require the Minister of the Environment, Conservation and Parks to discharge the responsibilities under subsection 15(1) of the Ontario Resources Act to determine the zebra mussel content of those specific waterways.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Pursuant to standing order 33(f), the time allocated for introduction of bills has now expired.

**MOTIONS****HOUSE SITTINGS**

**Hon. Todd Smith:** Speaker, I move that the meeting schedule of the House for Tuesday August 14, 2018, as

set out in standing order 8(a), be revised by substituting “1 p.m.” and “1:05 p.m.” for “3 p.m.” and “3:05 p.m.,” respectively.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** The government House leader has moved that the meeting schedule for the House for Tuesday, August 14, 2018, as set out in standing order 8(a), be revised by substituting “1 p.m.” and “1:05 p.m.” for “3 p.m.” and “3:05 p.m.,” respectively.

**Mr. Gilles Bisson:** Point of order.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** We're in a vote.

Is it the pleasure of the House that the motion carry? Carried.

*Motion agreed to.*

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** Point of order, member for Timmins.

**Mr. Gilles Bisson:** Mr. Speaker, I understand, in the standing orders, what it says and what the intent is. The difficulty I have with this is that if you read the standing order under standing order 2 in regard to what is a routine motion, it reads, “‘Routine motion’ means any motion, including motions under standing order 6....”

So if you're trying to do something that is contained within the existing standing order, which is standing order 6, that's one thing. But the minute you start to amend times of the House, when we meet, it's an amendment to the standing order—and I'm not going to get into a long debate. I'm going to give some writings on this, as I've already indicated to the Clerks, but my point is this: It's an amendment to the standing order, what essentially we're doing here. And if it becomes an amendment to the standing order, then it's substantive. If you're doing a routine motion and the routine motion says “as per” what's in 6 or 9, then I think this goes beyond. I will put that in writing—

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** I look forward to the member's written submission, but the House has already passed the motion.

## PETITIONS

### EMPLOYMENT STANDARDS

**Ms. Marit Stiles:** It's a great pleasure to introduce a petition that was provided to me by one of my constituents, Trisha Keyes-Bevan. This petition to the Ontario Legislative Assembly is entitled “Don't Take Away Our \$15 Minimum Wage and Fairer Labour Laws.”

“Whereas the vast majority of Ontarians support a \$15 minimum wage and better laws to protect workers; and

“Whereas last year, in response to overwhelming popular demand by the people of Ontario, the provincial government brought in legislation and regulations that:

“Deliver 10 personal emergency leave days for all workers, the first two of which are paid;

“Make it illegal to pay part-time, temporary, casual or contract workers less than their full-time or directly hired

co-workers, including equal public holiday pay and vacation pay;

“Raised the adult general minimum wage to \$14 per hour and further raises it to a \$15 minimum wage on January 1, 2019, with annual adjustments by Ontario's consumer price index;

“Make it easier to join unions, especially for workers in the temporary help, home care, community services and building services sectors;

“Make client companies responsible for workplace health and safety for temporary agency employees;

“Provide strong enforcement through the hiring of an additional 175 employment standards officers;

“Will ensure workers have modest improvements in the scheduling of their hours, including:

—three hours' pay when workers are expected to be on call all day, but are not called into work;

—three hours' pay for any employee whose shift is cancelled with less than two days' notice; and

—the right to refuse shifts without penalty if the shift is scheduled with fewer than four days' notice;

“We, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to honour these commitments, including the \$15 minimum wage and fairer scheduling rules set to take effect on January 1, 2019. We further call on the assembly to take all necessary steps to enforce these laws and extend them to ensure no worker is left without protection.”

I support this petition. I'm happy to affix my signature, and then I'm going to hand it over to page Ryan Michael to table it for us.

### SOCIAL ASSISTANCE

**Ms. Laura Mae Lindo:** I would like to submit the following petition:

“Reverse Doug Ford's Cuts to Low-Income Families.

“To the Legislative Assembly of Ontario:

“Whereas Doug Ford eliminated the Basic Income Pilot project and slashed the new social assistance rates by 1.5%, and did so without warning;

“Whereas cuts to already-meagre social assistance rates will disproportionately impact children, those with mental health challenges, persons with disabilities, and people struggling in poverty;

“Whereas the decision to cancel the Basic Income Pilot project was made without any evidence, and leaves thousands of Ontarians without details about whether they will be able to access other forms of income assistance;

“Whereas the independently authored Income Security: A Roadmap for Change report, presented to the government last fall, recommends both increases to rates and the continuation of the Basic Income Pilot project as key steps towards income adequacy and poverty reduction;

“Whereas the failure to address poverty—and the homelessness, hunger, health crises, and desperation that

can result from poverty—hurts people, families and Ontario’s communities;

“Therefore we, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to immediately reverse Doug Ford’s callous decision to slash increases to social assistance rates by 50%, and reverse his decision to cancel the Basic Income Pilot project, decisions that will undoubtedly hurt thousands of vulnerable people and drag Ontario backwards when it comes to homelessness reduction and anti-poverty efforts.”

I fully support this petition, will affix my name to it, and provide it to page Emmanuel.

#### CELIAC DISEASE

**M<sup>me</sup> France Gélinas:** I would like to thank the Canadian Celiac Association for sending me these petitions. They read as follows:

“Whereas the IgA TTG blood screening is the internationally recognized standard as the first step in diagnosing a person with celiac disease;

“Whereas celiac disease is an autoimmune disease that can strike people with a genetic predisposition at any time of life and presents with a large variety of non-specific signs and symptoms;

“Whereas many individuals, such as family members of diagnosed celiacs, are at higher risk and pre-symptomatic screening is advised;

“Whereas covering the cost of the simple test would dramatically reduce wait times to diagnosis, save millions to the health care system due to misdiagnoses, unnecessary testing and serious complications from untreated celiac disease and reduce the painful suffering and health decline of thousands of individuals;

“Whereas Ontario is the only province in Canada not to cover this blood test;”

They petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario “to cover the cost of the diagnostic blood test ... for celiac disease for those who show symptoms, are a first-degree relative or have an associated condition.”

I support this petition, will affix my name to it, and ask page Jamie to bring it to the Clerk.

#### EMPLOYMENT STANDARDS

**Ms. Sara Singh:** I’d like to thank Sean Kean of Brampton for this petition and the Workers’ Action Centre for all their work in putting this together.

This is a petition entitled “Don’t Take Away Our \$15 Minimum Wage and Fairer Labour Laws.”

“Whereas the vast majority of Ontarians support a \$15 minimum wage and better laws to protect workers; and

“Whereas last year, in response to overwhelming popular demand by the people of Ontario, the provincial government brought in legislation and regulations that:

“Deliver 10 personal emergency leave days for all workers, the first two of which are paid;

“Make it illegal to pay part-time, temporary, casual or contract workers less than their full-time or directly hired

co-workers, including equal public holiday pay and vacation pay;

“Raised the adult general minimum wage to \$14 per hour and further raises it to a \$15 minimum wage on January 1, 2019, with annual adjustments by Ontario’s consumer price index;

“Make it easier to join unions, especially for workers in the temporary help, home care, community services and building services sectors;

“Make client companies responsible for workplace health and safety for temporary agency employees;

“Provide strong enforcement through the hiring of an additional 175 employment standards officers;

“Will ensure workers have modest improvements in the scheduling of their hours, including:

“—three hours’ pay when workers are expected to be on call all day, but are not called into work;

#### 1400

“—three hours’ pay for any employee whose shift is cancelled with less than two days’ notice; and

“—the right to refuse shifts without penalty if the shift is scheduled with fewer than four days’ notice;

“We, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to honour these commitments, including the \$15 minimum wage and fairer scheduling rules set to take effect on January 1, 2019. We further call on the assembly to take all necessary steps to enforce these laws and extend them to ensure no worker is left without protection.”

I am happy to sign my name and support this petition, and I’ll be sending this off with page Emmanuel.

#### CORRECTIONAL SERVICES

**Ms. Jennifer K. French:** I have a petition to the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to resolve the crisis in Ontario corrections.

“To the Legislative Assembly of Ontario:

“Whereas the Ontario government has faced serious criticism by OPSEU, offender advocacy groups, media, the general public, the Ombudsman, the Ontario Human Rights Commission, the MCSCS independent auditor ... and the Auditor General as a result of significant deficiencies in the correctional system; and

“Whereas the rates of assaults on correctional workers continues to increase exponentially; and

“Whereas Ontario probation and parole officers have the highest workloads in the nation; and

“Whereas Ontario has one of the highest recidivism rates in Canada; and

“Whereas the current working conditions of correctional staff, coupled with the comparatively low rates of investment across Canada has resulted in difficulties with staff retention and recruitment;

“We, the undersigned correctional workers, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario as follows:

“That the Ontario government significantly increase expenditures to resolve the crisis in corrections by hiring full-time correctional workers, increasing funding for

adequate offender services and increasing investments to recruit and retain skilled professionals and reduce recidivism.”

I wholeheartedly support this, will affix my name to it and send it with page Jamie.

### CURRICULUM

**Ms. Laura Mae Lindo:** I would like to submit the following petition: “Protecting Children: Forward, Not Backward, on Sex Ed.

“To the Legislative Assembly of Ontario:

“Whereas the health and physical education curriculum empowers young people to make informed decisions about relationships and their bodies;

“Whereas gender-based violence, gender inequality, unintended pregnancies, ‘sexting,’ and HIV and other sexually transmitted infections (STIs) pose serious risks to the safety and well-being of young people;

“Whereas one in three women and one in six men experience sexual violence in Canada, and a lack of age-appropriate education about sexual health and healthy relationships leaves children and youth vulnerable to exploitation;

“Whereas one in five parents reported their own child being a victim of cyberbullying; and

“Whereas Doug Ford and the Conservative government is dragging Ontario backward, requiring students to learn an outdated sex ed curriculum that excludes information about consent, sexual orientation, gender identity, sexting, cyberbullying and safe and healthy relationships;

“We, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to direct the Ministry of Education to continue the use of the 2015 health and physical education curriculum in schools and move Ontario forward, not backward.”

I fully support this petition, will affix my name to it and provide it again to page Emmanuel.

### PHARMACARE

**Mr. Terence Kernaghan:** It’s my honour today to rise with a petition for universal pharmacare. It reads:

“To the Legislative Assembly of Ontario:

“Whereas prescription medications are a part of health care and people shouldn’t have to empty their wallets or rack up credit card bills to get the medicines they need;

“Whereas over 2.2 million Ontarians don’t have any prescription drug coverage and one in four Ontarians don’t take their medications as prescribed because they cannot afford the cost;

“Whereas taking medications as prescribed can save lives and help people live better; and

“Whereas Canada urgently needs universal and comprehensive national pharmacare;

“We, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to support a universal provincial pharmacare plan for all Ontarians.”

I wholeheartedly support this petition and will affix my signature in the corner and give it to page Jamie.

### CURRICULUM

**M<sup>me</sup> France Gélinas:** I’m glad to read this petition from the Islington United Church of Toronto. I won’t need any glasses to read that one, Speaker.

“In light of the Ministry of Education’s cancellation of two writing weeks with Indigenous educators and elders for the revision of Ontario’s kindergarten through grade 12 curriculum to address residential schools, treaties and Indigenous peoples’ historical and contemporary contribution to Canada, we are compelled to urge the completion of the work according to the original plan and timetable.

“To the Legislative Assembly of Ontario:

“Whereas for six years the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada (TRC) listened to thousands of former students of residential schools and their families testify to the devastating legacy of this national policy of assimilation;

“Whereas the TRC called upon ‘the federal, provincial and territorial governments, in consultation and collaboration with survivors, Aboriginal peoples and educators, to make age-appropriate curriculum on residential schools, treaties and Aboriginal peoples’ historical and contemporary contributions to Canada a mandatory education requirement for kindergarten to grade 12 students (CA62.i);

“Whereas on July 15, 2015, Canada’s Premiers indicated their support for all 94 Truth and Reconciliation Commission calls to action and said they would act on them in their own provinces and territories;

“We, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario as follows:

“That the Legislative Assembly of Ontario urge the government of Ontario to fully implement such a curriculum for kindergarten through grade 12; and

“Whereas, in 2017, the government of Ontario had taken first steps to fulfill this action with a planned completion date of fall 2018;”

They ask “that the Ministry of Education immediately complete and implement the comprehensive revision of history, social studies, civics and other curriculum for kindergarten through grade 12 to fulfill the goal cited in call to action 62.i from the Truth and Reconciliation Commission report.”

I support this petition, will affix my name to it and ask my good page Bavan to bring it to the Clerk.

### PHARMACARE

**Mr. Tom Rakocevic:** The petition is entitled “Universal Pharmacare for All Ontarians.”

“To the Legislative Assembly of Ontario:

“Whereas prescription medications are a part of health care, and people shouldn’t have to empty their wallets or rack up credit card bills to get the medicines they need;

“Whereas over 2.2 million Ontarians don’t have any prescription drug coverage and one in four Ontarians don’t take their medications as prescribed because they cannot afford the cost;

“Whereas taking medications as prescribed can save lives and help people live better; and

“Whereas Canada urgently needs universal and comprehensive national pharmacare;

“We, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to support a universal provincial pharmacare plan for all Ontarians.”

I wholeheartedly support this and will be affixing my signature and giving it to page Emmanuel.

### CURRICULUM

**Ms. Laura Mae Lindo:** This petition is entitled “Protecting Children: Forward, Not Backward, on Sex Ed.”

“To the Legislative Assembly of Ontario:

“Whereas the health and physical education curriculum empowers young people to make informed decisions about relationships and their bodies;

“Whereas gender-based violence, gender inequality, unintended pregnancies, ‘sexting,’ and HIV and other sexually transmitted infections (STIs) pose serious risks to the safety and well-being of young people;

“Whereas one in three women and one in six men experience sexual violence in Canada, and a lack of age-appropriate education about sexual health and healthy relationships leaves children and youth vulnerable to exploitation;

“Whereas one in five parents reported their own child being a victim of cyberbullying; and

“Whereas Doug Ford and the Conservative government is dragging Ontario backward, requiring students to learn an outdated sex ed curriculum that excludes information about consent, sexual orientation, gender identity, sexting, cyberbullying and safe and healthy relationships;

“We, the undersigned, petition the Legislative Assembly of Ontario to direct the Ministry of Education to continue the use of the 2015 health and physical education curriculum in schools and move Ontario forward, not backward.”

I fully support this petition, affix my name to it and provide it to page Bavan.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** That concludes the time we have available for petitions this afternoon.

### ORDERS OF THE DAY

#### TIME ALLOCATION

Resuming the debate adjourned on August 9, 2018, on the amendment to the motion for allocation of time on Bill 5, An Act to amend the City of Toronto Act, 2006,

the Municipal Act, 2001 and the Municipal Elections Act, 1996.

**The Speaker (Hon. Ted Arnott):** When we last debated this motion the member for Timiskaming–Cochrane had the floor. I recognize the member for Timiskaming–Cochrane.

**Mr. John Vanthof:** Thank you, Speaker. As you have probably noticed, in the last few days we’ve been doing our best to try and make this government reconsider and to actually consult the people who they are impacting with this. You won a mandate to govern; you didn’t win a mandate to forget about the people, and that’s what you’re doing here. You’re totally forgetting about the people.

The committee process is extremely, extremely important. Several of your current ministers have spoken eloquently in this House against time allocation, and yet as soon as you’re elected, within the very—actually, you haven’t not time-allocated a bill. You don’t need the opposition; you have a majority. You keep crowing about it. Yet you also have the responsibility to govern, I guess, responsibly. Again—

**Hon. Steve Clark:** We are.

**Mr. John Vanthof:** No, you’re not—

**The Acting Speaker (Ms. Jennifer K. French):** Pursuant to standing order 47(b), I am now required to put the question.

Mr. Bisson has moved an amendment to government notice of motion number 4, relating to allocation of time on Bill 5, An Act to amend the City of Toronto Act, 2006, the Municipal Act, 2001 and the Municipal Elections Act, 1996. Is it the pleasure of the House that Mr. Bisson’s motion carry? I heard a no.

All those in favour of the motion will please say “aye.”

All those opposed to the motion will please say “nay.”

In my opinion, the nays have it.

Call in the members. This will be a 10-minute bell.

*Interjection.*

**The Acting Speaker (Ms. Jennifer K. French):** I’ve received a deferral slip which reads as follows:

“To the Speaker of the Legislative Assembly:

“Pursuant to standing order 28(h), I request that the vote on the amendment to government notice of motion number 4 by Mr. Smith be deferred until after question period on Tuesday, August 14, 2018.”

**Mr. John Vanthof:** No, it’s not Mr. Smith’s. We’re voting on the amendment. We’re not voting on the—

**The Acting Speaker (Ms. Jennifer K. French):** If I could confer with the Clerks, because these appear to be—

*Interjections.*

**The Acting Speaker (Ms. Jennifer K. French):** It’s been confirmed by the Clerks that, indeed, that was the right deferral.

*Interjections.*

**The Acting Speaker (Ms. Jennifer K. French):** I’m happy to read the text of the deferral again. I will read the text again: “Pursuant to standing order 28(h), I request that the vote on the amendment to government notice of

motion number 4 by Mr. Smith be deferred until after question period on Tuesday, August 14, 2018.”

*Vote deferred.*

**The Acting Speaker (Ms. Jennifer K. French):** Orders of the day?

**Hon. Steve Clark:** No further business.

*Interjections.*

**The Acting Speaker (Ms. Jennifer K. French):** I would have recognized you, but—so no further business?

**Hon. Steve Clark:** I move adjournment of the House.

**The Acting Speaker (Ms. Jennifer K. French):** Mr. Clark moves adjournment of the House. Is it the pleasure of the House that the motion carry? I heard a no.

All those in favour will please say “aye.”

All those opposed will please say “nay.”

In my opinion, the ayes have it.

Call in all members. This will be a 30-minute bell.

*The division bells rang from 1414 to 1444.*

**The Acting Speaker (Ms. Jennifer K. French):** All members will please take their seats.

Mr. Clark has moved the adjournment of the House. All those in favour, please rise and remain standing until counted by the Clerks.

All those opposed, please rise and remain standing until counted by the Clerks.

**The Clerk of the Assembly (Mr. Todd Decker):** The ayes are 67; the nays are 17.

**The Acting Speaker (Ms. Jennifer K. French):** I declare the motion carried.

This House stands adjourned until 9 a.m. tomorrow morning.

*The House adjourned at 1446.*







**LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY OF ONTARIO**  
**ASSEMBLÉE LÉGISLATIVE DE L'ONTARIO**

Lieutenant Governor / Lieutenante-gouverneure: Hon. / L'hon. Elizabeth Dowdeswell, OC, OOnt.  
Speaker / Président: Hon. / L'hon. Ted Arnott  
Clerk / Greffier: Todd Decker  
Deputy Clerk / Sous-greffier: Trevor Day  
Clerks-at-the-Table / Greffiers parlementaires: Tonia Grannum, Valerie Quioc Lim, William Short  
Sergeant-at-Arms / Sergente d'armes: Jacquelyn Gordon

Member and Party / Député(e) et parti	Constituency / Circonscription	Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités
Anand, Deepak (PC)	Mississauga—Malton	
Andrew, Jill (NDP)	Toronto—St. Paul's	
Armstrong, Teresa J. (NDP)	London—Fanshawe	
<b>Arnott, Hon. / L'hon. Ted (PC)</b>	Wellington—Halton Hills	Speaker / Président de l'Assemblée législative
Arthur, Ian (NDP)	Kingston and the Islands / Kingston et les Îles	
Baber, Roman (PC)	York Centre / York-Centre	
Babikian, Aris (PC)	Scarborough—Agincourt	
Bailey, Robert (PC)	Sarnia—Lambton	
Barrett, Toby (PC)	Haldimand—Norfolk	
Begum, Doly (NDP)	Scarborough Southwest / Scarborough-Sud-Ouest	
Bell, Jessica (NDP)	University—Rosedale	
Berns-McGown, Rima (NDP)	Beaches—East York / Beaches—East York	
<b>Bethlenfalvy, Hon. / L'hon. Peter (PC)</b>	Pickering—Uxbridge	President of the Treasury Board / Président du Conseil du Trésor
Bisson, Gilles (NDP)	Timmins	Opposition House Leader / Leader parlementaire de l'opposition officielle
Bouma, Will (PC)	Brantford—Brant	
Bourgouin, Guy (NDP)	Mushkegowuk—James Bay / Mushkegowuk—Baie James	
Burch, Jeff (NDP)	Niagara Centre / Niagara-Centre	
Calandra, Paul (PC)	Markham—Stouffville	
<b>Cho, Hon. / L'hon. Raymond Sung Joon (PC)</b>	Scarborough North / Scarborough-Nord	Minister for Seniors and Accessibility / Ministre des Services aux aînés et de l'Accessibilité
Cho, Stan (PC)	Willowdale	
<b>Clark, Hon. / L'hon. Steve (PC)</b>	Leeds—Grenville—Thousand Islands and Rideau Lakes / Leeds—Grenville—Thousand Islands et Rideau Lakes	Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing / Ministre des Affaires municipales et du Logement
Coe, Lorne (PC)	Whitby	
Coteau, Michael (LIB)	Don Valley East / Don Valley-Est	
Crawford, Stephen (PC)	Oakville	
Cuzzetto, Rudy (PC)	Mississauga—Lakeshore	
Des Rosiers, Nathalie (LIB)	Ottawa—Vanier	
Downey, Doug (PC)	Barrie—Springwater—Oro-Medonte	
Dunlop, Jill (PC)	Simcoe North / Simcoe-Nord	
<b>Elliott, Hon. / L'hon. Christine (PC)</b>	Newmarket—Aurora	Deputy Premier / Vice-première ministre Minister of Health and Long-Term Care / Ministre de la Santé et des Soins de longue durée
<b>Fedeli, Hon. / L'hon. Victor (PC)</b>	Nipissing	Chair of Cabinet / Président du Conseil des ministres Minister of Finance / Ministre des Finances
Fee, Amy (PC)	Kitchener South—Hespeler / Kitchener-Sud—Hespeler	
Fife, Catherine (NDP)	Waterloo	
<b>Ford, Hon. / L'hon. Doug (PC)</b>	Etobicoke North / Etobicoke-Nord	Minister of Intergovernmental Affairs / Ministre des Affaires intergouvernementales Premier / Premier ministre
Fraser, John (LIB)	Ottawa South / Ottawa-Sud	
<b>French, Jennifer K. (NDP)</b>	Oshawa	Third Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Troisième vice-présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée législative

<b>Member and Party / Député(e) et parti</b>	<b>Constituency / Circonscription</b>	<b>Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités</b>
<b>Fullerton, Hon. / L'hon. Merrilee (PC)</b>	Kanata—Carleton	Minister of Training, Colleges and Universities / Ministre de la Formation et des Collèges et Universités
Gates, Wayne (NDP)	Niagara Falls	Deputy Opposition House Leader / Leader parlementaire adjointe de l'opposition officielle
Gélinas, France (NDP)	Nickel Belt	
Ghamari, Goldie (PC)	Carleton	First Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Première vice-présidente du comité plénier de l'Assemblée
Gill, Parm (PC)	Milton	
Glover, Chris (NDP)	Spadina—Fort York	
Gravelle, Michael (LIB)	Thunder Bay—Superior North / Thunder Bay—Supérieur-Nord	
<b>Gretzky, Lisa (NDP)</b>	Windsor West / Windsor-Ouest	
<b>Hardeman, Hon. / L'hon. Ernie (PC)</b>	Oxford	Minister of Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs / Ministre de l'Agriculture, de l'Alimentation et des Affaires rurales
Harden, Joel (NDP)	Ottawa Centre / Ottawa-Centre	Second Deputy Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Deuxième vice-président du comité plénier de l'Assemblée législative
Harris, Mike (PC)	Kitchener—Conestoga	
Hassan, Faisal (NDP)	York South—Weston / York-Sud— Weston	
<b>Hatfield, Percy (NDP)</b>	Windsor—Tecumseh	Leader, Official Opposition / Chef de l'opposition officielle
Hillier, Randy (PC)	Lanark—Frontenac—Kingston	
Hogarth, Christine (PC)	Etobicoke—Lakeshore	
Horwath, Andrea (NDP)	Hamilton Centre / Hamilton-Centre	
Hunter, Mitzie (LIB)	Scarborough—Guildwood	
<b>Jones, Hon. / L'hon. Sylvia (PC)</b>	Dufferin—Caledon	Minister of Tourism, Culture and Sport / Ministre du Tourisme, de la Culture et du Sport
Kanapathi, Logan (PC)	Markham—Thornhill	Deputy Government House Leader / Leader parlementaire adjoint du gouvernement
Karahalios, Belinda (PC)	Cambridge	
Karpoche, Bhutla (NDP)	Parkdale—High Park	
Ke, Vincent (PC)	Don Valley North / Don Valley-Nord	
Kernaghan, Terence (NDP)	London North Centre / London- Centre-Nord	
Khanjin, Andrea (PC)	Barrie—Innisfil	
Kramp, Daryl (PC)	Hastings—Lennox and Addington	
Kusendova, Natalia (PC)	Mississauga Centre / Mississauga- Centre	
Lalonde, Marie-France (LIB)	Orléans	
Lecce, Stephen (PC)	King—Vaughan	
Lindo, Laura Mae (NDP)	Kitchener Centre / Kitchener-Centre	Minister of Children, Community and Social Services / Ministre des Services à l'enfance et des Services sociaux et communautaires
<b>MacLeod, Hon. / L'hon. Lisa (PC)</b>	Nepean	
Mamakwa, Sol (NDP)	Kiiwetinoong	Minister Responsible for Women's Issues / Ministre déléguée à la Condition féminine
Mantha, Michael (NDP)	Algoma—Manitoulin	
Martin, Robin (PC)	Eglinton—Lawrence	
Martow, Gila (PC)	Thornhill	
McDonell, Jim (PC)	Stormont—Dundas—South Glengarry	
McKenna, Jane (PC)	Burlington	
<b>McNaughton, Hon. / L'hon. Monte (PC)</b>	Lambton—Kent—Middlesex	
Miller, Norman (PC)	Parry Sound—Muskoka	
Miller, Paul (NDP)	Hamilton East—Stoney Creek / Hamilton-Est—Stoney Creek	
Mitas, Christina Maria (PC)	Scarborough Centre / Scarborough- Centre	
Monteith-Farrell, Judith (NDP)	Thunder Bay—Atikokan	Attorney General / Procureure générale
Morrison, Suze (NDP)	Toronto Centre / Toronto-Centre	
<b>Mulroney, Hon. / L'hon. Caroline (PC)</b>	York—Simcoe	
Natyshak, Taras (NDP)	Essex	Minister Responsible for Francophone Affairs / Ministre déléguée aux Affaires francophones

<b>Member and Party / Député(e) et parti</b>	<b>Constituency / Circonscription</b>	<b>Other responsibilities / Autres responsabilités</b>
<b>Nicholls, Rick (PC)</b>	Chatham-Kent—Leamington	Chair of the Committee of the Whole House / Président du comité plénier de l'Assemblée Deputy Speaker / Vice-président
Oosterhoff, Sam (PC)	Niagara West / Niagara-Ouest	
Pang, Billy (PC)	Markham—Unionville	
Park, Lindsey (PC)	Durham	
Parsa, Michael (PC)	Aurora—Oak Ridges—Richmond Hill	
Pettapiece, Randy (PC)	Perth—Wellington	
<b>Phillips, Hon. / L'hon. Rod (PC)</b>	Ajax	Minister of the Environment, Conservation and Parks / Ministre de l'Environnement, de la Protection de la nature et des Parcs
Piccini, David (PC)	Northumberland—Peterborough South / Northumberland—Peterborough-Sud	
Rakocevic, Tom (NDP)	Humber River—Black Creek	
Rasheed, Kaleed (PC)	Mississauga East—Cooksville / Mississauga-Est—Cooksville	
<b>Rickford, Hon. / L'hon. Greg (PC)</b>	Kenora—Rainy River	Minister of Energy, Northern Development and Mines / Ministre de l'Énergie, du Développement du Nord et des Mines Minister of Indigenous Affairs / Ministre des Affaires autochtones
Roberts, Jeremy (PC)	Ottawa West—Nepean / Ottawa- Ouest—Nepean	
Romano, Ross (PC)	Sault Ste. Marie	
Sabawy, Sheref (PC)	Mississauga—Erin Mills	
Sandhu, Amarjot (PC)	Brampton West / Brampton-Ouest	
Sarkaria, Prabmeet Singh (PC)	Brampton South / Brampton-Sud	
Sattler, Peggy (NDP)	London West / London-Ouest	
Schreiner, Mike (GRN)	Guelph	
<b>Scott, Hon. / L'hon. Laurie (PC)</b>	Haliburton—Kawartha Lakes—Brock	Minister of Labour / Ministre du Travail
Shaw, Sandy (NDP)	Hamilton West—Ancaster—Dundas / Hamilton-Ouest—Ancaster—Dundas	
Simard, Amanda (PC)	Glengarry—Prescott—Russell	
Singh, Gurratan (NDP)	Brampton East / Brampton-Est	
Singh, Sara (NDP)	Brampton Centre / Brampton-Centre	
Skelly, Donna (PC)	Flamborough—Glanbrook	
Smith, Dave (PC)	Peterborough—Kawartha	
<b>Smith, Hon. / L'hon. Todd (PC)</b>	Bay of Quinte / Baie de Quinte	Minister of Government and Consumer Services Government House Leader / Leader parlementaire du gouvernement
Stevens, Jennifer (Jennie) (NDP)	St. Catharines	
Stiles, Marit (NDP)	Davenport	
Surma, Kinga (PC)	Etobicoke Centre / Etobicoke-Centre	
Tabuns, Peter (NDP)	Toronto—Danforth	
Tangri, Nina (PC)	Mississauga—Streetsville	
Taylor, Monique (NDP)	Hamilton Mountain	
Thanigasalam, Vijay (PC)	Scarborough—Rouge Park	
<b>Thompson, Hon. / L'hon. Lisa M. (PC)</b>	Huron—Bruce	Minister of Education / Ministre de l'Éducation
<b>Tibollo, Hon. / L'hon. Michael A. (PC)</b>	Vaughan—Woodbridge	Minister of Community Safety and Correctional Services / Ministre de la Sécurité communautaire et des Services correctionnels
Triantafilopoulos, Effie J. (PC)	Oakville North—Burlington / Oakville-Nord—Burlington	
Vanthof, John (NDP)	Timiskaming—Cochrane	
Wai, Daisy (PC)	Richmond Hill	
Walker, Bill (PC)	Bruce—Grey—Owen Sound	
West, Jamie (NDP)	Sudbury	
<b>Wilson, Hon. / L'hon. Jim (PC)</b>	Simcoe—Grey	Minister of Economic Development, Job Creation and Trade / Ministre du Développement économique, de la Création d'emplois et du Commerce
Wynne, Kathleen O. (LIB)	Don Valley West / Don Valley-Ouest	
<b>Yakabuski, Hon. / L'hon. John (PC)</b>	Renfrew—Nipissing—Pembroke	Minister of Transportation / Ministre des Transports
Yarde, Kevin (NDP)	Brampton North / Brampton-Nord	
<b>Yurek, Hon. / L'hon. Jeff (PC)</b>	Elgin—Middlesex—London	Minister of Natural Resources and Forestry

**STANDING COMMITTEES OF THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY  
COMITÉS PERMANENTS DE L'ASSEMBLÉE LÉGISLATIVE**

**Standing Committee on Estimates / Comité permanent des budgets des dépenses**

Chair / Président: Peter Tabuns  
Vice-Chair / Vice-président: Wayne Gates  
Stan Cho, Jill Dunlop  
John Fraser, Wayne Gates  
Stephen Lecce, Gila Martow  
Jane McKenna, Judith Monteith-Farrell  
Lindsey Park, Randy Pettapiece  
Peter Tabuns  
Committee Clerk / Greffier: Timothy Bryan

**Standing Committee on Finance and Economic Affairs / Comité permanent des finances et des affaires économiques**

Chair / Président: Stephen Crawford  
Vice-Chair / Vice-président: Jeremy Roberts  
Ian Arthur, Stan Cho  
Stephen Crawford, Doug Downey  
Sol Mamakwa, David Piccini  
Jeremy Roberts, Sandy Shaw  
Donna Skelly  
Committee Clerk / Greffier: Timothy Bryan

**Standing Committee on General Government / Comité permanent des affaires gouvernementales**

Chair / Président: Dave Smith  
Vice-Chair / Vice-présidente: Natalia Kusendova  
Jessica Bell, Lorne Coe  
Chris Glover, Christine Hogarth  
Logan Kanapathi, Daryl Kramp  
Natalia Kusendova, Amarjot Sandhu  
Mike Schreiner, Dave Smith  
Jennifer (Jennie) Stevens  
Committee Clerk / Greffier: William Short

**Standing Committee on Government Agencies / Comité permanent des organismes gouvernementaux**

Chair / Président: John Vanthof  
Vice-Chair / Vice-président: Taras Natyshak  
Roman Baber, Rudy Cuzzetto  
Amy Fee, Vincent Ke  
Andrea Khanjin, Marie-France Lalonde  
Taras Natyshak, Rick Nicholls  
Jeremy Roberts, Marit Stiles  
John Vanthof  
Committee Clerk / Greffière: Jocelyn McCauley

**Standing Committee on Justice Policy / Comité permanent de la justice**

Chair / Président: Parm Gill  
Vice-Chair / Vice-président: Aris Babikian  
Roman Baber, Aris Babikian  
Nathalie Des Rosiers, Jill Dunlop  
Parm Gill, Lindsey Park  
Ross Romano, Prabmeet Singh Sarkaria  
Sara Singh, Monique Taylor  
Kevin Yarde  
Committee Clerk / Greffière: Jocelyn McCauley

**Standing Committee on the Legislative Assembly / Comité permanent de l'Assemblée législative**

Chair / Présidente: Jane McKenna  
Vice-Chair / Vice-président: Vijay Thanigasalam  
Robert Bailey, Rima Berns-McGown  
Michael Coteau, Mike Harris  
Faisal Hassan, Jane McKenna  
Christina Maria Mitas, Sam Oosterhoff  
Amanda Simard, Gurratan Singh  
Vijay Thanigasalam  
Committee Clerk / Greffière: Valerie Quioc Lim

**Standing Committee on Public Accounts / Comité permanent des comptes publics**

Chair / Présidente: Catherine Fife  
Vice-Chair / Vice-présidente: Peggy Sattler  
Catherine Fife, Goldie Ghamari  
Jim McDonnell, Norman Miller  
Suze Morrison, Michael Parsa  
Peggy Sattler, Kinga Surma  
Daisy Wai  
Committee Clerk / Greffier: Christopher Tyrell

**Standing Committee on Regulations and Private Bills / Comité permanent des règlements et des projets de loi d'intérêt privé**

Chair / Président: Randy Hillier  
Vice-Chair / Vice-président: Kaleed Rasheed  
Toby Barrett, Will Bouma  
Mike Harris, Randy Hillier  
Mitzie Hunter, Laura Mae Lindo  
Paul Miller, Billy Pang  
Kaleed Rasheed, Amarjot Sandhu  
Jamie West  
Committee Clerk / Greffier: Eric Rennie

**Standing Committee on Social Policy / Comité permanent de la politique sociale**

Chair / Présidente: Nina Tangri  
Vice-Chair / Vice-président: Deepak Anand  
Deepak Anand, Doly Begum  
Jeff Burch, Amy Fee  
Michael Gravelle, Joel Harden  
Belinda Karahalios, Robin Martin  
Sheref Sabawy, Nina Tangri  
Effie J. Triantafilopoulos  
Committee Clerk / Greffier: Eric Rennie